

MINUTES
FORSYTH COUNTY HISTORIC RESOURCES COMMISSION
JULY 1, 2009
4:00 P.M.
BRYCE A. STUART MUNICIPAL BUILDING
PUBLIC MEETING ROOM, ROOM 530
100 EAST FIRST STREET, WINSTON-SALEM

MEMBERS PRESENT: Janet Banzhof, Seth Brown, Jeff Harbinson, Mark Maxwell,
Laura Phillips, Michael Phillips, Sharon Richmond, Jeff
Sowers

MEMBERS ABSENT: Norris Hutchins, Jamie Moore, Rick Pender, Julie Poplin

STAFF PRESENT: Kelly Bennett, Michelle McCullough, LeAnn Pegram

PRESIDING: Michael Phillips, Chairman

Mr. Phillips called the meeting to order. Commission members stated their names for the record. Mr. Phillips welcomed those present.

I. APPROVAL OF JUNE 3, 2009 MINUTES

Motion: Ms. Phillips
Second: Mr. Maxwell
Vote: Unanimous

II. CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS APPLICATIONS

A. West End Historic Overlay District

1. Gayle Goldsmith Tuch, Applicant
Apartment House (Inventory #329)
1407 Clover Street
Request: Comprehensive Window Replacement
Case #: W007-09

Ms. Pegram, Ms. McCullough, and Mr. Bennett were sworn for testimony. Ms. Pegram presented the staff report, describing the application in detail. She presented a map showing the location of the property and photographs of the property.

Staff Comments: Ms. Pegram stated that Commission staff, in most cases, did not recommend the replacement of original windows within the West End Historic Overlay

District. In that particular instance staff found that window replacement, in selected locations, might not be incongruous with the character of the District because:

- 1) Certain windows appeared to be in a deteriorated condition; and,
- 2) The apartment building was a noncontributing building within the District as it had been, according to the West End Historic District National Register Nomination: “so drastically remodeled that its original appearance and construction date were no longer easy to determine.”

However, the predominance of the window sashes appeared to be original and were in various configurations including, 6/1, 12/1, 9/1, 8/1, and Craftsman-style 4/1. Those windows were typical of the Craftsman style, when a variety of window styles were often used in the same house. Sanborn Maps indicated that the building may have been built by 1917, and the window styles found on the house were indicative of that date. Also found on the house were basement level metal casement windows. Those windows lent character to an otherwise severely altered residential structure within the West End Historic Overlay District.

Due to the noncontributing status of the property and the windows' condition, staff found that the replacement of windows on all elevations of the house, with the exception of the front elevation, was appropriate with conditions. The applicant proposed replacing all the window sashes with windows in a six-over-one configuration. That was not in keeping with the *Guidelines*, which stated that replacement windows might be considered in secondary locations if the appearance of the window components would match those of the original.

Staff Recommendation: Ms. Pegram stated that based on the preceding comments, staff recommended that the Commission grant a Certificate of Appropriateness to Gayle Goldsmith Tuch/Tuch Properties, LLC for the replacement of windows at the Apartment House at 1407 Clover Street in the West End Historic Overlay District, with the following conditions:

- 1) that all windows on the front elevation of the house be repaired and remain in their existing locations;
- 2) that all the window casings and sills on the structure remain and not be covered in artificial surrounds;
- 3) that all window sashes, except for the front elevation (as referenced in number 1, above) be replaced with windows matching the existing in design, location, size, pane configuration and profile, and style; and,
- 4) that Commission staff review and approve any revisions or deviations to any portion of the as-submitted work prior to commencement of that portion of the project.

Regulations

- 1) If a Certificate of Appropriateness (COA) was issued for the application, it would expire July 1, 2010. If a building permit was required to perform the approved work, such permit had to be obtained within one year from the date of COA issuance. Failure to comply with the one-year time limit would expire the COA. Commission staff could renew the COA within twelve months of original issuance. All other renewals of an expired COA could only be made by the Commission.
- 2) The applicant had to note that the scope of work for the project had to meet all other applicable building codes and ordinances. Any additional approvals or permits from the City had to be obtained prior to initiating work. The applicant needed to consult with the City Inspections Division at 336-727-2628 prior to beginning the project.
- 3) It was the applicant's responsibility to contact Commission staff regarding any and all conditions to which a COA was subject. That was a requirement of COA issuance. Additionally, the applicant had to contact Commission staff if, in the process of commencing the project, unknown circumstances arose, which could result in changes, alterations, or modifications.

Public Comment

Speaking in Favor of the Application: Gayle Tuch, 7901 Fair Oaks Court, Clemmons was sworn for testimony, and spoke in favor of the application.

Speaking in Opposition to the Application: None

Commission Discussion

The Commission discussed the application.

Finding of Fact

Ms. Phillips moved that based upon the evidence that had been presented in the application and during the public meeting, the Commission find that the application was not incongruous with the character of the West End Historic Overlay District for the reasons stated in the staff report, with conditions one through four also listed in the staff report and the standard regulations one, two, and three.

Second: Ms. Richmond

Vote: Unanimous

Certificate of Appropriateness

Mr. Maxwell moved that based on the preceding Finding of Fact, the Commission grant a COA to Gayle Goldsmith Tuch, applicant, for comprehensive window replacement at the Apartment House (Inventory #329), located at 1407 Clover Street in the West End Historic Overlay District for the reasons specified and the conditions expressed in the Finding of Fact made previously.

Second: Ms. Richmond
Vote: Unanimous

III. MINOR WORK COA APPROVALS

A. West End Historic Overlay District

1. Thomas Holland, Applicant
Porter-Guin House (Inventory #231)
601 Jersey Avenue
Request: Wood Shingle, Molding, Soffit, Fascia, Screen Porch Repair
Case #: MWW015-09
2. Augsburg Lutheran Church, Applicant
Frank L. Matthews House (Inventory #167)
823 West Fifth Street
Request: Installation of Front Porch Railing
Case #: MWW016-09
3. Charles L. Morris, Applicant
Stockton-Tatum House (Inventory #373)
1149 West Fourth Street
Request: Replacement of Two Exterior Doors
Case #: MWW017-09
4. Geordie MacMinn, Applicant
Lambe House (Inventory #502)
136 Piedmont Avenue
Request: Construction of Fencing in Rear Yard
Case #: MWW018-09
5. City of Winston-Salem, Applicant
Right-of-Way Adjacent to 114 Crafton Street
Request: Removal of Dangerous Maple Tree
Case #: MWW019-09

6. Bruce & Margaret Hermann, Applicants
Jones-Maddy-McIver House (Inventory #500)
122 Piedmont Avenue
Request: Front Porch Roof Replacement & Selected Siding, Corner Board, Soffit,
Skirt Board, & Sill Replacement
Case #: MWW020-09

B. Old Salem Historic District

1. City of Winston-Salem, Applicant
Right-of-Way Adjacent to 919 South Main Street
Request: Removal of Diseased Sycamore Tree
Case #: MWS006-09
2. City of Winston-Salem, Applicant
Right-of-Way, 500 Block Old Salem Road
Request: Removal of Dangerous Willow Oak Tree
Case #: MWS007-09

C. Local Historic Landmarks

1. Barbara B. Millhouse, Applicant
Hagen House (Landmark #51)
520 Salt Street, Winston-Salem
Request: Front Porch Repair
Case #: MWL004-09

IV. COMMITTEE REPORTS

A. Education Committee

1. Letters of Recognition

Ms. McCullough requested the following properties be recognized for rehabilitation efforts: Lloyd Presbyterian Church, 209 Vintage Avenue in the Washington Park Historic District, and 800 North Cameron Avenue in the Reynoldstown Historic District.

The request was approved by consensus.

B. Historic Marker Committee

Ms. Pegram stated that the West Salem neighborhood was the recipient of the second historic marker for 2009. She stated that the neighborhood planned to have an unveiling ceremony in September.

C. Old Salem/Bethabara Design Review Guidelines Revision Committee

Mr. Bennett distributed and reviewed the proposed timeline for completion of the project.

V. UNFINISHED BUSINESS

A. Proposed Bethania Historic Overlay District Discussion

Ms. Pegram stated that staff had hoped to present a schedule, but it would not be finalized until after a meeting with the Planning Department and Town officials. Once that occurred, the timetable would be presented to the Commission.

B. Update on After-the-Fact COA Denials

1. Sosnik House
1224 West First Street, West End Historic Overlay District
Painting of Decorative Stone Retaining Wall and Concrete Walkway

Information and notification was sent to the property owner, along with information on how to properly remove paint from masonry surfaces. Commission staff had heard nothing. Staff stated that later in the week a letter would be sent out giving the owner until July 15 to submit a Major Work application. If an application was not submitted by July 15, Inspections would be asked to proceed with a Notice of Violation.

2. House
1251 West Fourth Street, West End Historic Overlay District
Window Replacement

The property owner had been working with staff on submittal of a new application. It was anticipated that application would be submitted for review at the Commission's August meeting.

Also, Ms. Pegram stated that in August, the public hearing for the revocation of the River John Conrad House as a Local Historic Landmark would be held.

VI. NEW BUSINESS

A. 2009-2010 HRC-Sponsored Proposed Projects

The City passed the 2009-2010 budget, and the money available for HRC-sponsored projects was not cut. In the Commission's packets was a proposal of staff's suggestions for how that money could be spent over the year. The Commission agreed by consensus to support the proposed staff suggestions.

VII. OTHER BUSINESS

The following Tuesday at 7:00 pm, the Forsyth County Historical Association would hold a meeting, and Commission members were encouraged to attend.

With no further business, the meeting was adjourned.