Minutes
Forsyth County
Historic Resources Commission
Action Sheet
June 6, 2018
4:00 P.M.
Bryce A. Stuart Municipal Building
Public Meeting Room, Room 530
100 East First Street, Winston-Salem

MEMBERS PRESENT: Donna J. Abernethy, Jeff Allen, Mary Berry, Jim Davis, Chad Gadberry, David Hauser, Langdon Oppermann, Kevin Owen, Michael Ryden, Janet Shill, and Tina Thacker

MEMBERS ABSENT: Kristen McManus

STAFF PRESENT: April Johnson, Michelle McCullough, David Reed, and Jerry Kontos

PRESIDING: Kevin Owen, Chair

I. APPROVAL OF MINUTES

A. Approval of May 2, 2018 Minutes

MOTION: Jeff Allen moved approval of the May 2, 2018 Minutes.

SECOND: David Hauser

VOTE: Unanimous

II. CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS APPLICATIONS

Preservation staff was sworn for testimony.

A. Continued from the May 2, 2018 and June 6, 2018 meetings
Request to Continue until August 1, 2018 HRC meeting
City of Winston-Salem-Keith Finch, Applicant
Intersection of West End Boulevard and Reynolda Road
Daniel Boone Memorial Marker, WE Inv. #610
Noncontributing
West End Historic Overlay District
Request: Alteration of Landscaping
Case #: COA2018-023
Mr. Allen moved that COA2018-023 be continued to the August 1, 2018 per the applicant’s request with submissions due July 11, 2018 to staff.

Second: Ms. Abernethy
Vote: Unanimous

B. Elizabeth Doten, Applicant
156 West End Blvd
Roland C. Taylor House, WE Inv. #37
Contributing
West End Historic Overlay District

Request: After-the-Fact Installation of Walkway Hand Rails
Case #: COA2018-026

Staff Comments: Ms. Johnson presented the staff report. She also presented a map showing the location of the property and photographs of the property.

Commission staff finds the application is incongruous with the character of the District because:

1) The proposed project does not design new railings to be compatible in pattern, dimensions, and color with existing railings that contribute to the overall historic character of the District. The proposed railings include a pair of railings for two sets of walkway steps. There are four, box-shaped newel posts for each set of stairs with a round finial cap. The handrails will be painted white, yellow, and purple. Walkway handrails in the District are metal, thin, and painted black. Wood handrails in the District are not ornate and have thinner posts. (Walkways, Steps, and Railings, West End Guideline 8)

Based on the preceding findings, staff recommends that the Commission deny COA2018-026 for the after-the-fact installation of walkway hand rails, at 156 West End Blvd, (PIN#: 6825-98-7387.00), Roland C. Taylor House, located in the West End Historic Overlay District.

If the HRC approves COA2018-026, staff recommends the following conditions:

1) The applicant shall receive, prior to commencement of the work, all other required permits or permissions from governmental agencies;

2) The applicant shall submit the Certificate of Appropriateness Request for Certification of Completed Work form and photo documentation of the completed project to HRC staff within ten (10) days of its completion.

Public Comment

Speaking in Favor of the Application: John Merschel, 3400 Paddington Lane, Winston-Salem, West End Association- Committee, was sworn for testimony and spoke in support of the application.

Speaking in Opposition to the Application: None

Commission Discussion

The Commission discussed the application.

Finding of Fact
Mr. Allen moved that, based upon the evidence presented in the application and during the public hearing, the Commission find that the proposed project is incongruous with the character of the West End Historic Overlay District as detailed in staff findings 1 and incorporated herein.

Second: Mr. Ryden  
Vote: Unanimous

Certificate of Appropriateness

Mr. Allen moved that based on the preceding findings of fact, the Commission deny application number COA2018-026 and deny a certificate of appropriateness for work at 156 West End Blvd.

Second: Ms. Berry  
Vote: Unanimous

C. Ellen Blancato, Applicant  
817 S. Church Street  
Philip Reich Shop, LHL #27  
Contributing  
Old Salem Historic District  
Request: Installation of Gutters and Downspouts  
Case #: COA2018-043

Staff Comments: Ms. McCullough presented the staff report. She also presented a map showing the location of the property and photographs of the property.

Commission staff finds the application is not incongruous with the character of the Local Historic Landmark and the Old Salem Historic District because:

1) The property is having continued and extensive water damage and intrusion to the window sills and around the interior of the windows. The project installs new gutters and downspouts to the north and south elevations of the shop. The proposed gutters are six-inch round copper gutters with four-inch soldered copper downspouts. The proposed gutters and downspout styles, profile and material are in keeping with the style of the shop. The new gutters and downspouts are proposed to be installed so that no architectural features will be lost, damaged, or obstructed. The proposed gutters and downspouts will be located in the most inconspicuous location possible and will be made of copper. (Roofs, Landmark Guideline 8 and Gutters, Old Salem Guidelines 1 and 2.)

Based on the preceding findings, the Forsyth County Historic Resources Commission hereby grants a certificate of appropriateness for the installation of gutters and downspouts for Local Historic Landmark #27, the Philip Reich Shop located at 817 S. Church Street, in the Old Salem Historic District (PIN#:6835-324144), with the following conditions:

1) The applicant shall receive, prior to commencement of the work, all other required permits or permissions from governmental agencies;

2) Commission staff shall review and approve any revisions or deviations to any portion of the as-submitted work, that qualifies as a minor work, prior to commencement of that portion of the project; and

3) The applicant shall submit the Certificate of Appropriateness Request for Certification of Completed Work form and photo documentation of the completed project to HRC staff within ten (10) days of its completion.
Public Comment

Speaking in Favor of the Application:  None

Speaking in Opposition to the Application:  None

Commission Discussion

The Commission discussed the application.

Finding of Fact

Ms. Berry moved that, based upon the evidence presented in the application and during the public hearing, the Commission find that the proposed project is not incongruous with the Local Historic Landmark and the Old Salem Historic District as detailed in staff finding 1 and incorporated herein subject to the 3 conditions recommended by staff and incorporated herein.

Second:  Ms. Oppermann
Vote:  For:  Donna J. Abernethy, Jeff Allen, Mary Berry, Jim Davis, Chad Gadberry, David Hauser, Langdon Oppermann, Kevin Owen, Michael Ryden, and Janet Shill
Abstained:  Ms. Thacker

Certificate of Appropriateness

Ms. Shill moved that based on the preceding findings of fact, the Commission approve application number COA2018-043 and grant a certificate of appropriateness for work at 817 S. Church Street; subject to the conditions detailed in the findings of fact.

Second:  Mr. Gladberry
Vote:  For:  Donna J. Abernethy, Jeff Allen, Mary Berry, Jim Davis, Chad Gadberry, David Hauser, Langdon Oppermann, Kevin Owen, Michael Ryden, and Janet Shill
Abstained:  Ms. Thacker

D. James Mattox, Applicant
136 Piedmont Avenue
Lamb House, WE Inv. #502
Contributing
West End Historic Overlay District
Request: After-the-Fact Tree Pruning and Tree Removal
Case #: COA2018-044

Staff Comments:  Ms. Johnson presented the staff report. She also presented a map showing the location of the property and photographs of the property.

1) The proposed project retains and preserves the relationship between buildings and landscape features of the District setting. The project prunes rather than removes a healthy Red Maple tree. (Vegetation, West End Guideline 2)
2) The proposed project removes a tree that is dead, diseased, or dangerous. The project removes a Red Maple tree with extensive decay, tree loss, and increased susceptibility to property damage or personal harm. (Vegetation, West End Guideline 5)

Based on the preceding findings, the Forsyth County Historic Resources Commission hereby grants a certificate of appropriateness for the after-the-fact tree pruning and tree removal, at 136 Piedmont Avenue, (PIN#: 6825-74-4766.00), Lamb House, located in the West End Historic Overlay District with the following conditions:

1) The applicant shall replace the removed tree with a canopy tree of at least 2.5 inches in caliper. The tree must be approved by Commission staff and the City's Urban Forester, and be planted between October 2018 and February 2019;

2) The applicant shall receive, prior to commencement of the work, all other required permits or permissions from governmental agencies;

3) Commission staff shall review and approve any revisions or deviations to any portion of the as-submitted work, that qualifies as a minor work, prior to commencement of that portion of the project; and

Public Comment

Speaking in Favor of the Application: James Mattox, 1546 Overbrook Ave, Winston-Salem, owner, was sworn for testimony and spoke in support of the application. Derek Reneger, 6929 Barkwood Drive, Lewisville, Urban Forester, was sworn for testimony and spoke in support of the application.

Speaking in Opposition to the Application: Margaret Hermann, 122 Piedmont Ave, Winston-Salem, NC, was sworn for testimony and spoke in opposition of the application. John Merschel, 3400 Paddington, Winston-Salem, West End Association- Committee, was sworn for testimony and spoke in opposition of the application.

Commission Discussion

The Commission discussed the application.

Finding of Fact

Mr. Allen moved that, based upon the evidence presented in the application and during the public hearing, the Commission find that the proposed project is not incongruous with the character of the West End Historic Overlay District as detailed in staff findings 1-2 and incorporated herein, subjects to the 4 conditions with a revision of condition 1 to read as The applicant shall replace removed tree with a minimum 2 ½ inch suitable canopy tree as selected by working through the Urban Forester Derek Renegar and staff to be planted between October 2018 to February 2019.

Second: Ms. Abernethy

Vote:
For: Donna J. Abernethy, Jeff Allen, Mary Berry, Jim Davis, David Hauser, Langdon Oppermann, Kevin Owen, Michael Ryden, Janet Shill, and Tina Thacker
Against: Chad Gadberry

Certificate of Appropriateness
Michael Ryden moved that based on the preceding findings of fact, the Commission approve application number COA2018-44 and grant a certificate of appropriateness for work at 136 Piedmont Avenue; subject to the conditions detailed in the findings of fact.

Second: Mr. Davis
Vote:
  For: Donna J. Abernethy, Jeff Allen, Mary Berry, Jim Davis, David Hauser, Langdon Oppermann, Kevin Owen, Michael Ryden, Janet Shill, and Tina Thacker
  Against: Chad Gadberry

E. Jeff Harbinson, Applicant
  1311 Brookstown Avenue
  Pleasant-Lorraine House, WE Inv. #303
  Contributing
  West End Historic Overlay District
  Request: Removal of Sugar Maple Tree
  Case #: COA2018-045

Staff Comments: Ms. Johnson presented the staff report. She also presented a map showing the location of the property and photographs of the property.

Commission staff finds the application is incongruous with the character of the District because:

1) The proposed project does not remove a tree that is dead, diseased, or dangerous. The October 2017 City Urban Forester assessment states that the tree is healthy. (Vegetation, West End Guideline 5)

Based on the preceding findings, staff recommends that the Commission deny COA2018-045 for the removal of a Sugar Maple tree, at 1311 Brookstown Avenue, (PIN#: 6825-77-7247.00), Pleasant-Lorraine House, located in the West End Historic Overlay District.

If the HRC approves COA2018-045, staff recommends the following conditions:

1) The applicant shall grind the tree stump to the ground;
2) The applicant shall receive, prior to commencement of the work, all other required permits or permissions from governmental agencies;
3) Commission staff shall review and approve any revisions or deviations to any portion of the as-submitted work, that qualifies as a minor work, prior to commencement of that portion of the project; and
4) The applicant shall submit the Certificate of Appropriateness Request for Certification of Completed Work form and photo documentation of the completed project to HRC staff within ten (10) days of its completion.

Public Comment

Bill Gibson, 1315 Brookstown Avenue asked if the case can be continued.
Speaking in Favor of the Application: Jeff Harbinson, 1311 Brookstown Ave, owner, applicant, was sworn for testimony and spoke in support of the application. Derek Reneger, 6929 Barkwood Drive, Lewisville, NC, Urban Forester, was sworn for testimony and spoke in support of the application.

Speaking in Opposition to the Application: Bill Gibson, 1315 Brookstown Avenue was sworn for testimony and spoke in opposition of the application. John Merschel, 3400 Paddington, Winston-Salem, West End Association- Committee, was sworn for testimony and spoke in opposition of the application.

Commission Discussion

The Commission discussed the application.

Finding of Fact

Mr. Allen moved that, based upon the evidence presented in the application and during the public hearing, the Commission find that the proposed project is incongruous with the character of the West End Historic Overlay District as detailed in staff finding 1 and incorporated herein.

Second: Ms. Berry
Vote:

For: Jeff Allen, Mary Berry, Jim Davis, Chad Gadberry, David Hauser, Langdon Oppermann, Kevin Owen, Michael Ryden, Janet Shill, and Tina Thacker

Abstained: Ms. Abernethy

Certificate of Appropriateness

Ms. Berry moved that based on the preceding findings of fact, the Commission deny application number COA2018-045 and deny the certificate of appropriateness for work at 1311 Brookstown Avenue.

Second: Ms. Shill
Vote:

For: Jeff Allen, Mary Berry, Jim Davis, Chad Gadberry, David Hauser, Langdon Oppermann, Kevin Owen, Michael Ryden, Janet Shill, and Tina Thacker

Abstained: Ms. Abernethy

F. Melissa Smith, Applicant
114 S. Sunset Drive
House, WE Inv. #564
Noncontributing
West End Historic Overlay District
Request: Installation of Rear Accessory Structure
Case #: COA2018-046

Staff Comments: Ms. Johnson presented the staff report. She also presented a map showing the location of the property and photographs of the property.

Commission staff finds the application is not incongruous with the character of the District because:

1) The proposed project designs new accessory structures to noncontributing buildings to be simple in design and compatible in form, scale, height, and size with the main building and to other accessory buildings in the District. The project installs a simple wood frame, one-story shed with a front gable. The shed dimensions are 12 feet by 20 feet and 6.75 feet (81 inches) in height. The front entrance doors are fiberglass with a nine-lite and panel design. The shed is located at the rear of the property, behind the main building similar to other accessory structures in the District.
The proposed roof material is architectural shingle. (Garages and Accessory Structures, West End Guideline 9).

Based on the preceding findings, staff recommends that the Commission approve COA2018-046 for the installation of a rear accessory structure, at 114 South Sunset Drive, (PIN#: 6825-64-6794.00), noncontributing House, located in the West End Historic Overlay District with the following conditions:

1) The applicant shall receive, prior to commencement of the work, all other required permits or permissions from governmental agencies;

2) Commission staff shall review and approve any revisions or deviations to any portion of the as-submitted work, that qualifies as a minor work, prior to commencement of that portion of the project; and

3) The applicant shall submit the Certificate of Appropriateness Request for Certification of Completed Work form and photo documentation of the completed project to HRC staff within ten (10) days of its completion.

Public Comment

Speaking in Favor of the Application: John Merschel, 3400 Paddington Lane, Winston-Salem, NC, West End Association- Committee, was sworn for testimony and spoke in support of the application.

Speaking in Opposition to the Application: None

Commission Discussion

The Commission discussed the application.

Finding of Fact

Ms. Oppermann moved that, based upon the evidence presented in the application and during the public hearing, the Commission find that the proposed project is not incongruous with the character of the West End Historic Overlay District as detailed in staff findings 1 and incorporated herein, subject to the 3 conditions recommended by staff and incorporated herein.

Second: Mr. Gadberry
Vote: Unanimous

Certificate of Appropriateness

Mr. Hauser moved that based on the preceding findings of fact, the Commission approve application number COA2018-46 and grant a certificate of appropriateness for work at 114 S. Sunset Drive.

Second: Ms. Abernethy
Vote: Unanimous

G. Actors Group/Burgess Jenkins, Applicant
492 West End Blvd
Summit Street Pharmacy, WE Inv. #99
Contributing
West End Historic Overlay District
Request: Installation of Exterior Wall Signage on North Elevation
Case #: COA2018-047
Staff Comments: Ms. Johnson presented the staff report. She also presented a map showing the location of the property and photographs of the property.

Commission staff finds the application is not incongruous with the character of the District because:

1) The proposed project introduces new signage that is compatible in material, size, scale and character with the building or the District. The proposed wall sign is appropriate because it is made of metal, aluminum, and is 20 inches in height and eight feet in width. The wall sign is located on the side elevation of the building facing north. (Signage-General, West End Guideline 2)

2) The proposed project constructs new signage of traditional sign material, such as metal or plastic or vinyl signs that are study and of high quality materials. The proposed exterior wall sign material is aluminum. (Signage-General, West End Guideline 3)

3) The proposed project designs new signage to be unobtrusive. The proposed exterior wall sign does not cover large portions of the façade, nor any significant architectural features, nor do they block pedestrian views along the street. The sign will be located on a side elevation wall with minimal architectural details. (Signage-General, West End Guideline 5 and Signage-Nonresidential, West End Guideline 1)

Based on the preceding findings, the Forsyth County Historic Resources Commission hereby grants a certificate of appropriateness for the installation of a exterior wall signage on the north elevation, at the Summit Street Pharmacy building, 492 West End Boulevard (490 West End Blvd, WE Inv. #99) (PIN#: 6825-78-5091.00), located in the West End Historic Overlay District with the following conditions:

1) The applicant shall only install one (1) of the two (2) approved signs (COA2018-011 or COA2018-047) on the north elevation at any given time;

2) The applicant shall receive, prior to commencement of the work, all other required permits or permissions from governmental agencies;

3) Commission staff shall review and approve any revisions or deviations to any portion of the as-submitted work, that qualifies as a minor work, prior to commencement of that portion of the project; and

4) The applicant shall submit the Certificate of Appropriateness Request for Certification of Completed Work form and photo documentation of the completed project to HRC staff within ten (10) days of its completion.

Public Comment

Speaking in Favor of the Application: None.

Speaking in Opposition to the Application: None

Commission Discussion

The Commission discussed the application.

Finding of Fact
Ms. Oppermann moved that, based upon the evidence presented in the application and during the public hearing, the Commission find that the proposed project is not incongruous with the character of the West End Historic Overlay District as detailed in staff findings 1-3 and incorporated herein, subject to the full conditions recommended by staff and incorporated herein.

Second: Mr. Allen
Vote:
   For: Donna J. Abernethy, Jeff Allen, Mary Berry, Jim Davis, Chad Gadberry, David Hauser, Langdon Oppermann, Kevin Owen, Janet Shill, and Tina Thacker
   Against: Michael Ryden

Certificate of Appropriateness

Mr. Hauser moved that based on the preceding findings of fact, the Commission approve application number COA2018-47 and grant a certificate of appropriateness for work at 492 West End Blvd; subject to the conditions detailed in the findings of fact.

Second: Ms. Berry
Vote:
   For: Donna J. Abernethy, Jeff Allen, Mary Berry, Jim Davis, Chad Gadberry, David Hauser, Langdon Oppermann, Kevin Owen, Janet Shill, and Tina Thacker
   Against: Michael Ryden

III. OTHER APPLICATIONS AND NOMINATIONS

A. Boundary Amendment
   Middleton House
   Matt McChesney, Applicant
   Local Historic Landmark #101
   2770 Chatham Farm Road
   Winston-Salem, NC

Mr. Allen recused himself for the Boundary Amendment Middleton House.

Public Comment

Staff Comments: Ms. McCullough presented the staff report.

Speaking in Favor of the Application: Matt McChesney, 2529 Buena Vista Road, Winston-Salem, NC, full board was sworn for testimony and spoke in support of the application. Jeff Allen, 2398 Warwick Road, full board was sworn for testimony and spoke in support of the application.

Speaking in Opposition to the Application: None

Commission Discussion

The Commission discussed the application.

Motion: Ms. Thacker moved approval of the Boundary Amendment Middle House.

Second: Mr. Hauser
Vote:
   For: Donna J. Abernethy, Mary Berry, Jim Davis, Chad Gadberry, David Hauser, Langdon Oppermann, Kevin Owen, Michael Ryden, Janet Shill, and Tina Thacker
IV. MINOR WORK REPORT (Enclosed in Commission Members Packet)

V. COMMITTEE REPORTS

A. Education Committee
   1. Recap Historic Preservation Month

B. Historic Marker Committee
   1. Recap of Silver Hill Historic Marker Unveiling
   2. Double Springs AME Church Historic Marker Update

VI. STAFF REPORTS

A. West End Historic Overlay Design Guideline Update Public Input Opportunities
   1. Online Civic Engagement
      http://WestEnd.civicomment.org
   2. Wednesday, June 13, 2018
      St. Paul’s Episcopal Church, Calhoun Room
      520 Summit Street, Winston-Salem
      6pm – 8pm
   3. Wednesday, June 27, 2018
      YMCA, West End Room
      775 West End Blvd
      6pm – 8pm

VII. FOR THE GOOD OF THE ORDER

NEXT MEETING: August 1, 2018

This agenda is available in alternative media forms for people with disabilities. Individuals with disabilities who require assistance or special arrangements to participate in programs and activities of the Historic Resources Commission are encouraged to contact the Planning Department at least 72 hours in advance so that proper accommodations can be arranged. For information, call 336-727-8000 (727-8319 TTY).