



**Minutes
Forsyth County
Historic Resources Commission**

January 2, 2020

4:00 P.M.

**Bryce A. Stuart Municipal Building
Arnold G. King Public Meeting Room,
100 East First Street, Winston-Salem**

MEMBERS PRESENT: Kaky Berry, Chad Gadberry, Emma Haney, C.J. Idol, Alanna Meltzer-Holderfield, Kevin Owen (Chair), LeAnn Pegram, Janet Shill, Tina Thacker

MEMBERS ABSENT: Donna Abernethy, Ted Guenther, Sunny Stewart

STAFF PRESENT: Heather Bratland; Michelle McCullough; David Reed
Attorney Jerry Kontos

I. ELECTION OF OFFICERS

Chair

Motion: Mr. Gadberry nominated Mr. Owen as Chair.

Second: Ms. Berry

Vote: Unanimous

Vice-Chair

Motion: Mr. Idol nominated Ms. Stewart as Vice-Chair.

Second: Mr. Gadberry

Vote: Unanimous

II. APPROVAL OF MINUTES

A. Approval of December 4, 2019 Minutes

Motion: Ms. Thacker moved approval of the December 4, 2020 minutes with the following change: George Bryan speaking in opposition to COA2019-112 was affirmed, not sworn.

Second: Mr. Idol

Vote: Unanimous

III. CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS APPLICATIONS

- A. Melinda Grey
Burchette Sign Company
424 West Fourth Street
The Gilmer Building
Local Historic Landmark #37
Request: Installation of signage
COA2020-002

Staff Comments: Ms. McCullough presented the staff report. She also presented a map showing the location of the property and photographs of the property.

Staff Findings

Commission staff finds that the application is not incongruous with the character of the Landmark because:

- 1) The proposed new signage is limited to one sign and the size is a 24" high x 48" wide x 3" thick. The sign has minimal impact on the overall historic character of the Landmark building. (*Signage*, Landmarks Guideline 4)
- 2) The proposed new signage is compatible with the Landmark building and site in terms of style, time period, materials, design, scale, and color. The proposed signage is a blade sign located on the second pilaster from the corner that is installed 114" above ground. The proposed sign is made of High Density Urethane and will have an aluminum frame. The sign will be CNC grain cut, wood grain background with raised routed V-grooved letters. (*Signage*, Landmarks Guideline 5)
- 3) The proposed new signage is introduced in locations that do not diminish or compromise the historic character of the Landmark building or site. The proposed sign is installed with four, 3/8" x 5" L stainless steel lags into the mortar joints and does not obscure, damage, or conceal significant architectural features or details. (*Signage*, Landmarks Guideline 6)
- 4) The proposed new signage is removable. (*Signage*, Landmarks Guideline 7)

Staff Recommendation

Based on the preceding findings, staff recommends that the Commission approve COA2020-002 at the Gilmer Building, located at 424 West Fourth Street, Local Historic Landmark #37 (PIN#6835-16-1850.00), with the following conditions:

- 1) The applicant shall receive, prior to commencement of the work, all other required permits or permissions from governmental agencies;
- 2) Commission staff shall review and approve any revisions or deviations to any portion of the as-submitted work, that qualifies as a minor work, prior to commencement of that portion of the project; and
- 3) The applicant shall submit the Certificate of Appropriateness Request for Certification of Completed Work form and photo documentation of the completed project to HRC staff within ten (10) days of its completion.

Public Comment

Speaking in Favor of the Application: Adam Andrews, 424 West Fourth Street, Winston-Salem, NC, business owner, was sworn for testimony and spoke in support of the application.

Speaking in Opposition to the Application: None

Commission Discussion

The Commission discussed the application.

Finding of Fact

Ms. Thacker moved that based upon the evidence presented in the application and during the hearing, the Forsyth County Historic Resources Commission finds that the proposed project is not incongruous with the Local Historic Landmark because:

- 1) The proposed new signage is limited to one sign and the size is a 24" high x 48" wide x 3" thick. The sign has minimal impact on the overall historic character of the Landmark building. (*Signage*, Landmarks Guideline 4)
- 2) The proposed new signage is compatible with the Landmark building and site in terms of style, time period, materials, design, scale, and color. The proposed signage is a blade sign located on the second pilaster from the corner that is installed 114" above ground. The proposed sign is made of High Density Urethane and will have an aluminum frame. The sign will be CNC grain cut, wood grain background with raised routed V-grooved letters. (*Signage*, Landmarks Guideline 5)
- 3) The proposed new signage is introduced in locations that do not diminish or compromise the historic character of the Landmark building or site. The proposed sign is installed with four, 3/8" x 5" L stainless steel lags into the mortar joints and does not obscure, damage, or conceal significant architectural features or details. (*Signage*, Landmarks Guideline 6)
- 4) The proposed new signage is removable. (*Signage*, Landmarks Guideline 7)

Second: Ms. Shill
Vote: Unanimous

Certificate of Appropriateness

Ms. Shill moved that based on the preceding findings, the Forsyth County Historic Resources Commission hereby approves COA2020-002 at the Gilmer Building, located at 424 West Fourth Street, Local Historic Landmark #37 (PIN#6835-16-1850.00), with the following conditions:

- 1) The applicant shall receive, prior to commencement of the work, all other required permits or permissions from governmental agencies;
- 2) Commission staff shall review and approve any revisions or deviations to any portion of the as-submitted work, that qualifies as a minor work, prior to commencement of that portion of the project; and
- 3) The applicant shall submit the Certificate of Appropriateness Request for Certification of Completed Work form and photo documentation of the completed project to HRC staff within ten (10) days of its completion.

Second: Ms. Berry
Vote: Unanimous

- B. Lori & John Cernak
1124 West Fourth Street, Winston-Salem
Joseph R. Fletcher House
West End Historic Overlay District #361
Contributing
Request: Construction of a 1-story rear addition
COA2020-003

Staff Comments: Ms. Bratland presented the staff report. She also presented a map showing the location of the property and photographs of the property.

Staff Finding

Commission staff finds that the project is not incongruous with the character of the West End Historic Overlay District because:

- 1) The proposed addition will be attached to the rear of the house at the locations of the earlier porch enclosure and the 1940s addition. The 1940s addition and porch enclosure are not identified as contributing features in the *West End Historic Overlay District Report*. The addition will be minimally visible from the street, in the context of earlier rear additions. It will not impact the ca. 1906 original structure or any significant site features. No character-defining features of the building will be destroyed, obscured, or radically changed. If this addition were removed in the future, the essential form of the original structure would be preserved and maintained. (*Additions*, West End Guidelines 1, 2, 5, and 6)
- 2) The design of the addition clearly is subordinate to the historic house and compatible with it. At 50 square feet and 1 story in height, it will not diminish or visually overpower the house. The roof of the existing 1940s addition will extend to become the roof of the proposed addition. New wooden clapboards and a modern window that matches the size and mutnin pattern of the original 1/1 windows will be installed at the rear. (*Additions*, West End Guidelines 3 and 4)

Staff Recommendation

Based on the preceding findings, staff recommends that the Commission approve COA2020-003 at the Joseph R. Fletcher House, located at 1124 West Fourth Street, within the West End Historic Overlay District (PIN#6825-75-6533.00), with the following conditions:

- 1) The applicant shall receive, prior to commencement of the work, all other required permits or permissions from governmental agencies;
- 2) Commission staff shall review and approve any revisions or deviations to any portion of the as-submitted work, that qualifies as a minor work, prior to commencement of that portion of the project; and
- 3) The applicant shall submit the Certificate of Appropriateness Request for Certification of Completed Work form and photo documentation of the completed project to HRC staff within ten (10) days of its completion.

Public Comment

Speaking in Favor of the Application: John Cernak, 1124 West Fourth Street, Winston-Salem, NC, owner, was sworn for testimony and spoke in support of the application. Lori Cernak, 1124 West Fourth Street, Winston-Salem, NC, owner, was sworn for testimony and spoke in support of the application.

Speaking in Opposition to the Application. None

Commission Discussion

The Commission discussed the application.

Finding of Fact

Mr. Idol moved that based upon the evidence presented in the application and during the hearing, the Forsyth County Historic Resources Commission finds that the proposed project is not incongruous with the West End Historic Overlay District because:

- 1) The proposed addition will be attached to the rear of the house at the locations of the earlier porch enclosure and the 1940s addition. The 1940s addition and porch enclosure are not identified as contributing features in the *West End Historic Overlay District Report*. It will not be visible from the street. It will not impact the ca. 1906 original structure or any significant site features. No character-defining features of the building will be destroyed, obscured, or radically changed. If this addition were removed in the future, the essential form of the original structure would be preserved and maintained. (*Additions*, West End Guidelines 1, 2, 5, and 6)
- 2) The design of the addition clearly is subordinate to the historic house and compatible with it. At 50 square feet and 1 story in height, it will not diminish or visually overpower the house. The roof of the existing 1940s addition will extend to become the roof of the proposed addition. New wooden clapboards and a modern window that matches the size and muntin pattern of the original 1/1 windows will be installed at the rear. (*Additions*, West End Guidelines 3 and 4)

Second: Ms. Meltzer-Holderfield

Vote: Unanimous

Certificate of Appropriateness

Ms. Meltzer-Holderfield moved that based on the preceding findings, the Forsyth County Historic Resources Commission hereby approves COA2020-003 at the Joseph R. Fletcher House, located at 1124 West Fourth Street, within the West End Historic Overlay District (PIN#6825-75-6533.00), with the following conditions:

- 1) The applicant shall receive, prior to commencement of the work, all other required permits or permissions from governmental agencies;
- 2) Commission staff shall review and approve any revisions or deviations to any portion of the as-submitted work, that qualifies as a minor work, prior to commencement of that portion of the project; and
- 3) The applicant shall submit the Certificate of Appropriateness Request for Certification of Completed Work form and photo documentation of the completed project to HRC staff within ten (10) days of its completion.

Second: Mr. Idol
Vote: Unanimous

C. Hayes Wauford
Wilson-Covington Construction Company
508 Salt Street
Salt Flax House
Old Salem Historic District #73
Request: Removal of the after-the-fact timber retaining wall and installation of stone faced retaining wall
COA2020-004

Staff Comments: Ms. McCullough presented the staff report. She also presented a map showing the location of the property and photographs of the property.

Staff Finding

Commission staff finds that the removal of the after-the-fact timber retaining wall and installation of a stone faced retaining wall is not incongruous with the character of the Old Salem Historic District because:

- 1) The new retaining wall is compatible with the property and District in regard to location, size, scale, and material. The new retaining wall will be faced with stone to match the foundation of the house and is constructed to retain the higher elevations of the site to the north and west of the patio area. The retaining wall was constructed to avoid any known archaeology sites on the property. (*Walls*, Old Salem Guideline 4)

Staff Recommendation

Based on the preceding findings, staff recommends that the Commission approve COA2020-004 at the Salt Flax House, located at 508 Salt Street, within the Old Salem Historic District (PIN# 6835-23-6400), with the following conditions:

- 1) The applicant shall receive, prior to commencement of the work, all other required permits or permissions from governmental agencies;
- 2) Commission staff shall review and approve any revisions or deviations to any portion of the as-submitted work, that qualifies as a minor work, prior to commencement of that portion of the project; and
- 3) The applicant shall submit the Certificate of Appropriateness Request for Certification of Completed Work form and photo documentation of the completed project to HRC staff within ten (10) days of its completion.

Public Comment

Speaking in Favor of the Application: Hayes Wauford, Wilson-Covington Construction Company, 2700 Boulder Park Court, Winston-Salem, NC, contractor, was sworn for testimony and spoke in support of the application.

Speaking in Opposition to the Application: None

Commission Discussion

The Commission discussed the application.

Finding of Fact

Ms. Thacker moved that based upon the evidence presented in the application and during the hearing, the Forsyth County Historic Resources Commission finds that the proposed project is not incongruous with the Old Salem Historic District because:

- 1) The new retaining wall is compatible with the property and District in regard to location, size, scale, and material. The new retaining wall will be faced with stone to match the foundation of the house and is constructed to retain the higher elevations of the site to the north and west of the patio area. The retaining wall was constructed to avoid any known archaeology sites on the property. (*Walls*, Old Salem Guideline 4)

Second: Ms. Shill

Vote: Unanimous

Certificate of Appropriateness

Ms. Berry moved that based on the preceding findings, the Forsyth County Historic Resources Commission hereby approves COA2020-004 at the Salt Flax House, located at 508 Salt Street, within the Old Salem Historic District (PIN# 6835-23-6400), with the following conditions:

- 1) The applicant shall receive, prior to commencement of the work, all other required permits or permissions from governmental agencies;
- 2) Commission staff shall review and approve any revisions or deviations to any portion of the as-submitted work, that qualifies as a minor work, prior to commencement of that portion of the project; and
- 3) The applicant shall submit the Certificate of Appropriateness Request for Certification of Completed Work form and photo documentation of the completed project to HRC staff within ten (10) days of its completion.

Second: Ms. Pegram

Vote: Unanimous

IV. MINOR WORK REPORT (Enclosed in Commission Member Packets)

V. SPECIAL PRESENTATION REQUESTS

A. Augsburg Lutheran Church Update

II. OTHER APPLICATIONS AND NOMINATIONS

A. Bethania Historic Overlay District Update

B. West End Historic Overlay Design Review Guidelines

1. Update on the approval calendar

III. COMMITTEE REPORTS

A. Historic Marker Committee

1. Hanes Knitting Site unveiling in May 2020 for Preservation Month
2. New HRC Committee Members
 - a. Alanna Meltzer-Holderfield
 - b. LeAnn Pegram
3. New At-large Committee Members
Mr. Owen appointed Artie Sparrow and Sarah Thompson to the Committee as At-Large members.

B. Education Committee

1. Preservation Month Activities
 - a. C.J. and Tina representing HRC at planning meetings
 - b. Landmark owners event

IV. STAFF REPORT

A. New Commissioner

V. FOR THE GOOD OF THE ORDER

NEXT MEETING: February 5, 2020

This agenda is available in alternative media forms for people with disabilities. Individuals with disabilities who require assistance or special arrangements to participate in programs and activities of the Historic Resources Commission are encouraged to contact the Planning Department at least 72 hours in advance so that proper accommodations can be arranged. For information, call 336-727-8000 (727-8319 TTY).