



**Minutes
Forsyth County
Historic Resources Commission
February 5, 2020
4:00 P.M.
Bryce A. Stuart Municipal Building
Arnold G. King Public Meeting Room
100 East First Street, Winston-Salem**

MEMBERS PRESENT: Donna Abernethy, Kaky Berry, Chad Gadberry, Emma Haney, C.J. Idol, Kevin Owen (Chair), LeAnn Pegram, Janet Shill, Tina Thacker

MEMBERS ABSENT: Ted Guenther, Sunny Stewart, Alanna Meltzer-Holderfield

STAFF PRESENT: Heather Bratland; Michelle McCullough; David Reed
Attorney Jerry Kontos

I. APPROVAL OF MINUTES

A. Approval of January 2, 2020 Minutes

Motion: Mr. Gadberry moved approval of the January 2, 2020 minutes.

Second: Mr. Idol

Vote: Unanimous

II. CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS APPLICATIONS

A. Samantha Smith
2147 Bethabara Road
Gemeinhaus
Local Historic Landmark #96
Bethabara Historic District
Contributing
Request: Installation of railings
COA2020-005

[Ms. Pegram, a member of the Historic Bethabara Park Board, was recused from consideration of this request at 4:05 p.m.]

Staff Comments: Ms. McCullough presented the staff report. She also presented a map showing the location of the property and photographs of the property.

Staff Findings

Commission staff finds that the project is not incongruous with the character of the Landmark and District because:

- 1) The proposed railings will be located at the front door of the Gemeinhaus, a typical location for railings. The railing is patterned off examples constructed in Salem. It will be metal painted flat black, in a simple design at human scale to the building and steps. The design, configuration, dimension, scale, materials, color and finish are compatible with the historic character of the structure and the District. (*Railings*, Bethabara Guideline 3 and *Architectural Metals*, Landmark Guideline 6)

Staff Recommendation

Based on the preceding findings, staff recommends that the Commission approve COA2020-005 at the Gemeinhaus, located at 2147 Bethabara Road, Local Historic Landmark #96, within the Bethabara Historic District (PIN# 6817-77-0736.00), with the following conditions:

- 1) The applicant shall receive, prior to commencement of the work, all other required permits or permissions from governmental agencies;
- 2) Commission staff shall review and approve any revisions or deviations to any portion of the as-submitted work, that qualifies as a minor work, prior to commencement of that portion of the project; and
- 3) The applicant shall submit the Certificate of Appropriateness Request for Certification of Completed Work form and photo documentation of the completed project to HRC staff within ten (10) days of its completion.

Public Comment

Speaking in Favor of Application: None

Speaking in Opposition to the Application: None

Commission Discussion

The Commission discussed the application.

Finding of Fact

Ms. Thacker moved that based upon the evidence presented in the application and during the hearing, the Commission finds that the proposed project is not incongruous with the character of the Local Historic Landmark or the Bethabara Historic District because:

- 1) The proposed railings will be located at the front door of the Gemeinhaus, a typical location for railings. The railing is patterned off examples constructed in Salem. It will be metal painted flat black, in a simple design at human scale to the building and steps. The design, configuration, dimension, scale, materials, color and finish are compatible with the historic character of the structure and the District. (*Railings*, Bethabara Guideline 3 and *Architectural Metals*, Landmark Guideline 6)

Second: Mr. Gadberry
Vote: Unanimous

Certificate of Appropriateness

Ms. Shill moved that based on the preceding findings, the Forsyth County Historic Resources Commission hereby approves COA2020-005 at the Gemeinhaus, located at 2147 Bethabara Road, Local

Historic Landmark #96, within the Bethabara Historic District (PIN# 6817-77-0736.00), with the following conditions:

- 1) The applicant shall receive, prior to commencement of the work, all other required permits or permissions from governmental agencies;
- 2) Commission staff shall review and approve any revisions or deviations to any portion of the as-submitted work, that qualifies as a minor work, prior to commencement of that portion of the project; and
- 3) The applicant shall submit the Certificate of Appropriateness Request for Certification of Completed Work form and photo documentation of the completed project to HRC staff within ten (10) days of its completion.

Second: Ms. Abernethy
Vote: Unanimous

B. Samantha Smith
2147 Bethabara Road
The Palisade, the Foundations, and the Village
Bethabara Historic District
Contributing
**Request: Installation of outdoor interpretive signs
COA2020-006**

[Ms. Pegram, a member of the Historic Bethabara Park Board, was recused from consideration of this request.]

Staff Comments: Ms. McCullough presented the staff report. She also presented a map showing the location of the property and photographs of the property.

Staff Findings

Commission staff finds that the work is not incongruous with the character of the Bethabara Historic District because:

- 1) The new signage will be 24" high x 36" wide, constructed of a black, textured, powder-coated metal pedestal with a six square foot, single sided, ½" matte finish laminated panel that is compatible with the District in terms of style, time period, materials, design, scale, and color. (*Signage*, Bethabara Guideline 2)
- 2) The new signage will be in an appropriate location that does not diminish or compromise the historic character of the District. The locations are not obtrusive and do not cover large portions of a building façade, any significant architectural features or block streetscape views. (*Signage*, Bethabara Guideline 4)
- 3) The new signage is not attached to a building; it is installed into the ground and is removable. (*Signage*, Bethabara Guideline 5)

Staff Recommendation

Based on the preceding findings, staff recommends that the Commission approve COA2020-006 at the Palisade, the Foundations, and the Village, located at 2147 Bethabara Road, within the Bethabara Historic District (PIN# 6817-67-4983.00), with the following conditions:

- 4) The applicant shall receive, prior to commencement of the work, all other required permits or permissions from governmental agencies;
- 5) Commission staff shall review and approve any revisions or deviations to any portion of the as-submitted work, that qualifies as a minor work, prior to commencement of that portion of the project; and
- 6) The applicant shall submit the Certificate of Appropriateness Request for Certification of Completed Work form and photo documentation of the completed project to HRC staff within ten (10) days of its completion.

Public Comment

Speaking in Favor of the Application: None

Speaking in Opposition to the Application: None

Commission Discussion

The Commission discussed the application.

Finding of Fact

Ms. Shill moved that based upon the evidence presented in the application and during the hearing, the Commission finds that the proposed project is not incongruous with the character of the Bethabara Historic District because:

- 1) The new signage will be 24" high x 36" wide, constructed of a black, textured, powder-coated metal pedestal with a six square foot, single sided, 1/2" matte finish laminated panel that is compatible with the District in terms of style, time period, materials, design, scale, and color. (*Signage*, Bethabara Guideline 2)
- 2) The new signage will be in an appropriate location that does not diminish or compromise the historic character of the District. The locations are not obtrusive and do not cover large portions of a building façade, any significant architectural features or block streetscape views. (*Signage*, Bethabara Guideline 4)
- 3) The new signage is not attached to a building; it is installed into the ground and is removable. (*Signage*, Bethabara Guideline 5)

Second: Mr. Idol

Vote: Unanimous

Certificate of Appropriateness

Ms. Abernethy moved that based on the preceding findings, the Forsyth County Historic Resources Commission hereby approves COA2020-006 at the Palisade, the Foundations, and the Village, located at 2147 Bethabara Road, within the Bethabara Historic District (PIN# 6817-67-4983.00), with the following conditions:

- 1) The applicant shall receive, prior to commencement of the work, all other required permits or permissions from governmental agencies;

- 2) Commission staff shall review and approve any revisions or deviations to any portion of the as-submitted work, that qualifies as a minor work, prior to commencement of that portion of the project; and
- 3) The applicant shall submit the Certificate of Appropriateness Request for Certification of Completed Work form and photo documentation of the completed project to HRC staff within ten (10) days of its completion.

Second: Ms. Berry
Vote: Unanimous

[Ms. Pegram rejoined the meeting at 4:15 p.m.]

C. Matthew Giegengack
644 North Spring Street, Winston-Salem
Thomas J. Wilson House
West End Historic Overlay District #56
Contributing
Request: Installation of solar panels
COA2020-008

[Mr. Gadberry was recused from consideration of this request at 4:15 p.m. The proximity of his house to the property makes him an interested party]

Staff Comments: Ms. Bratland presented the staff report. She also presented a map showing the location of the property and photographs of the property.

Staff Findings

Commission staff finds that the project is incongruous with the character of the West End Historic Overlay District because:

- 1) The proposed solar collectors will be located, in part, on the south-facing side of the end gable roof that prominently projects toward the sidewalk. This portion of the roof is only one story above the ground. Per the designation report, the steep roof is a character-defining feature of the cottage. Unlike the other locations proposed for installation of solar collectors in this application, this section of roof is not an area of low visibility. (*Structural and Mechanical Systems*, West End Guideline 4)

Staff Recommendation

Based on the preceding finding, staff recommends that the Commission deny COA2020-008 at the Thomas J. Wilson House, located at 644 North Spring Street, within the West End Historic Overlay District (PIN#, 6825-98-4239.00). If the Commission approves COA2020-008, staff recommends the following conditions:

- 1) The applicant shall amend the application to remove the four solar panels on the south-facing end gable roof closest to Spring Street;
- 2) The applicant shall receive, prior to commencement of the work, all other required permits or permissions from governmental agencies;

- 3) Commission staff shall review and approve and revisions or deviations to any portion of the as-submitted work, that qualifies as a minor work, prior to commencement of that portion of the project; and
- 4) The applicant shall submit the Certificate of Appropriateness Request for Certification of Completed Work form and photo documentation of the completed project to HRC staff within the (10) days of its completion.

Public Comment

Speaking in Favor of the Application: Hunter Layman, 530 North Patterson Avenue, Winston-Salem, NC, Solar Consultant, was sworn for testimony and spoke in support of the application.

Speaking in Opposition to the Application: John Merschel, 3400 Paddington Lane, Winston-Salem, NC, Full Board of West End Association, was sworn for testimony and spoke in opposition to the application.

Commission Discussion

The Commission discussed the application.

Finding of Fact

Mr. Idol moved that based upon the evidence presented in the application and during the hearing, the Commission finds that the proposed project is incongruous with the character of the West End Historic Overlay District because:

- 1) The proposed solar collectors will be located, in part, on the south-facing side of the end gable roof that prominently projects toward the sidewalk. This portion of the roof is only one story above the ground. Per the designation report, the steep roof is a character-defining feature of the cottage. Unlike the other locations proposed for installation of solar collectors in this application, this section of roof is not an area of low visibility. (*Structural and Mechanical Systems*, West End Guideline 4)

Second: Ms. Berry
Vote: Unanimous

Certificate of Appropriateness

Ms. Berry moved that based on the preceding findings, the Forsyth County Historic Resources Commission hereby denies COA2020-008 at the Thomas J. Wilson House, located at 644 North Spring Street, within the West End Historic Overlay District (PIN#, 6825-98-4239.00)

Second: Ms. Shill
Vote: Unanimous

[Mr. Gadberry rejoined the meeting at 4:28 p.m.]

D. Teresa Grossi
1001 West Fifth Street, Winston-Salem
James B. Easley House
West End Historic Overlay District #183
Contributing
Request: Construction of a screened porch
COA2020-009

Staff Comments: Ms. Bratland presented the staff report. She also presented a map showing the location of the property and photographs of the property.

Staff Finding

Commission staff finds that the project is not incongruous with the character of the West End Historic Overlay District because:

- 1) The proposed screened porch is located on the west façade, a secondary façade that has already been altered somewhat by installation of a double-leaf, modern glazed door and construction of a deck, which this screened porch will replace. The primary character-defining facades are the street-facing north and east facades. The new porch will not obscure, damage, or destroy any character-defining features. Its design includes a hipped roof, shingled to match the house. The porch will be constructed of painted wood with a wood floor, wooden deck guardrails, and stairs facing away from the street. Painted wooden lattice will enclose and screen the area beneath the porch and painted barge boards and soffits will finish the roof at the porch perimeter. The design preserves the historic character of the building and is compatible with it. (*Entrances, Porches, Enclosures, and Balconies, West End Guideline 7*)

Staff Recommendation

Based on the preceding finding, staff recommends that the Commission approve COA2020-009 at the James S. Easley House, located at 1001 West Fifth Street, within the West End Historic Overlay District (PIN# 6825-86-1766.00), with the following conditions:

- 1) The applicant shall receive, prior to commencement of the work, all other required permits or permissions from governmental agencies;
- 2) Commission staff shall review and approve any revisions or deviations to any portion of the as-submitted work, that qualifies as a minor work, prior to commencement of that portion of the project; and
- 3) The applicant shall submit the Certificate of Appropriateness Request for Certification of Completed Work form and photo documentation of the completed project to HRC staff within ten (10) days of its completion.

Public Comment

Speaking in Favor of the Application: Teresa Grossi, 1001 West 5th Street, Winston-Salem, NC, Owner, was sworn for testimony and spoke in opposition of the application. John Merschel, 3400 Paddington Lane, Full Board WEA, was sworn for testimony and spoke in support of the application.

Speaking in Opposition to the Application: None

Commission Discussion

The Commission discussed the application.

Finding of Fact

Mr. Idol moved that based upon the evidence presented in the application and during the hearing, the Commission finds that the proposed project is not incongruous with the character of the West End Historic Overlay District because:

- 1) The proposed screened porch is located on the west façade, a secondary façade that has already been altered somewhat by installation of a double-leaf, modern glazed door and construction of a deck, which this screened porch will replace. The primary character-defining facades are the street-facing north and east facades. The new porch will not obscure, damage, or destroy any character-defining features. Its design includes a hipped roof, shingled to match the house. The porch will be constructed of painted wood with a wood floor, wooden deck guardrails, and stairs facing away from the street. Painted wooden lattice will enclose and screen the area beneath the porch and painted barge boards and soffits will finish the roof at the porch perimeter. The design preserves the historic character of the building and is compatible with it. (*Entrances, Porches, Enclosures, and Balconies, West End Guideline 7*)

Second: Ms. Abernethy
Vote: Unanimous

Certificate of Appropriateness

Ms. Abernethy moved that based on the preceding finding, the Forsyth County Historic Resources Commission hereby approves COA2020-009 at the James S. Easley House, located at 1001 West Fifth Street, within the West End Historic Overlay District (PIN# 6825-86-1766.00), with the following conditions:

- 1) The applicant shall receive, prior to commencement of the work, all other required permits or permissions from governmental agencies;
- 2) Commission staff shall review and approve any revisions or deviations to any portion of the as-submitted work, that qualifies as a minor work, prior to commencement of that portion of the project; and
- 3) The applicant shall submit the Certificate of Appropriateness Request for Certification of Completed Work form and photo documentation of the completed project to HRC staff within ten (10) days of its completion.

Second: Ms. Berry
Vote: Unanimous

E. Keith Wales, AIA, Studio Wales
421 Summit Street, Winston-Salem
Office Building
West End Historic Overlay District #104
Noncontributing
**Request: Building rehabilitation and rooftop addition
COA2020-012**

Staff Comments: Ms. Bratland presented the staff report. She also presented a map showing the location of the property and photographs of the property.

Staff Finding

Commission staff finds that the project is not incongruous with the character of the West End Historic Overlay District because:

- 1) The addition of windows, fixed and operable, to the second floor of the building will better integrate the building with the West End, where large expanses of masonry unbroken by windows are

uncommon and vertical louvers screening windows are unprecedented. Instead of the upper floors of the building turning away from the street as a private retreat, they will address the street and bring the building into conversation with the neighborhood. The simple, rectilinear, aluminum and glass windows, arranged asymmetrically without any surrounding trim or embellishment, are compatible with and characteristic of the midcentury Modern style of the building. Replacement of the existing windows and storefront will maintain its appearance and architectural integrity. (*Noncontributing Structures*, West End Guidelines 1 and 3)

- 2) Although the Guidelines do not permit painting of historic brick because of the great potential to harm or destroy soft, historic brick, the same concerns do not apply to the modern, hard-fired brick of which this building is comprised. Painting the brick is a treatment compatible with the style and character of the building. (*Noncontributing Structures*, West End Guideline 3)
- 3) The third floor addition is differentiated from the existing building but compatible with it in style and character. The flat-roofed addition replicates the rectilinear massing of the existing structure and uses the same brick on its west and north facades, where it will continue the existing building line vertically. However, on the east and south facades, where the building is adjacent to Summit and 4 ½ Streets, the addition is stepped back to recede from public view, reducing its visual impact from the corner. These facades are clad in a mixture of flush fiber cement panels and fixed storefront windows and doors that replicate those on the floor below. This addition will read as a contemporary alteration to the office building because of its footprint, extensive use of glazing, and the use of fiber cement panels. Nevertheless, it will blend with it stylistically through the repetition of rectilinear forms, the use of brickwork, aluminum framed windows, and the flat roof. (*Noncontributing Structures*, West End Guideline 3)
- 4) Removal of the sidewalk and curb inside the private parking area will have no impact on the character of the property. Planting of a dogwood tree will bring welcome vegetation to the parking area and visually break up the expanses of hard surfaces behind the building. (*Parking – Nonresidential*, West End Guideline 3)
- 5) The bike racks that will be installed in the parking lot and on the east façade are small accessory features that do not compromise the integrity of the building or lot. (*Trash Containers, Dumpsters, and Recreational Facilities*, West End Guideline 3)

Staff Recommendation

Based on the preceding findings, staff recommends that the Commission approve COA2020-012 at the Office Building, located at 421 Summit Street, within the West End Historic Overlay District (PIN# 6825-86-7809.00), with the following conditions:

- 1) The applicant shall receive, prior to commencement of the work, all other required permits or permissions from governmental agencies;
- 2) Commission staff shall review and approve any revisions or deviations to any portion of the as-submitted work, that qualifies as a minor work, prior to commencement of that portion of the project; and
- 3) The applicant shall submit the Certificate of Appropriateness Request for Certification of Completed Work form and photo documentation of the completed project to HRC staff within ten (10) days of its completion.

Public Comment

Speaking in Favor of the Application: Keith Wales, Jr., 12 Stump Tree Lane, Winston-Salem, NC, Architect, was sworn for testimony and spoke in support of the application. John Merschel, 3400

Paddington Lane, Winston-Salem, NC, Full Board West End Association, was sworn for testimony and spoke in support of the application.

Speaking in Opposition to the Application: None

Commission Discussion

The Commission discussed the application.

Finding of Fact

Ms. Pegram moved that based upon the evidence presented in the application and during the hearing, the Commission finds that the proposed project is not incongruous with the character of the West End Historic Overlay District because:

- 1) The addition of windows, fixed and operable, to the second floor of the building will better integrate the building with the West End, where large expanses of masonry unbroken by windows are uncommon and vertical louvers screening windows are unprecedented. Instead of the upper floors of the building turning away from the street as a private retreat, they will address the street and bring the building into conversation with the neighborhood. The simple, rectilinear, aluminum and glass windows, arranged asymmetrically without any surrounding trim or embellishment, are compatible with and characteristic of the midcentury Modern style of the building. Replacement of the existing windows and storefront will maintain its appearance and architectural integrity. (*Noncontributing Structures*, West End Guidelines 1 and 3)
- 2) Although the Guidelines do not permit painting of historic brick because of the great potential to harm or destroy soft, historic brick, the same concerns do not apply to the modern, hard-fired brick of which this building is comprised. Painting the brick is a treatment compatible with the style and character of the building. (*Noncontributing Structures*, West End Guideline 3)
- 3) The third floor addition is differentiated from the existing building but compatible with it in style and character. The flat-roofed addition replicates the rectilinear massing of the existing structure and uses the same brick on its west and north facades, where it will continue the existing building line vertically. However, on the east and south facades, where the building is adjacent to Summit and 4 ½ Streets, the addition is stepped back to recede from public view, reducing its visual impact from the corner. These facades are clad in a mixture of flush fiber cement panels and fixed storefront windows and doors that replicate those on the floor below. This addition will read as a contemporary alteration to the office building because of its footprint, extensive use of glazing, and the use of fiber cement panels. Nevertheless, it will blend with it stylistically through the repetition of rectilinear forms, the use of brickwork, aluminum framed windows, and the flat roof. (*Noncontributing Structures*, West End Guideline 3)
- 4) Removal of the sidewalk and curb inside the private parking area will have no impact on the character of the property. Planting of a dogwood tree will bring welcome vegetation to the parking area and visually break up the expanses of hard surfaces behind the building. (*Parking – Nonresidential*, West End Guideline 3)
- 5) The bike racks that will be installed in the parking lot and on the east façade are small accessory features that do not compromise the integrity of the building or lot. (*Trash Containers, Dumpsters, and Recreational Facilities*, West End Guideline 3)

Second: Ms. Shill
Vote: Unanimous

Certificate of Appropriateness

Ms. Abernethy moved that based on the preceding findings, the Forsyth County Historic Resources Commission hereby approves COA2020-012 at the Office Building, located at 421 Summit Street, within the West End Historic Overlay District (PIN# 6825-86-7809.00), with the following conditions:

- 1) The applicant shall receive, prior to commencement of the work, all other required permits or permissions from governmental agencies;
- 2) Commission staff shall review and approve any revisions or deviations to any portion of the as-submitted work, that qualifies as a minor work, prior to commencement of that portion of the project; and
- 3) The applicant shall submit the Certificate of Appropriateness Request for Certification of Completed Work form and photo documentation of the completed project to HRC staff within ten (10) days of its completion.

Second: Mr. Idol
Vote: Unanimous

III. **MINOR WORK REPORT (Enclosed in Commission Member Packets)**

IV. **OTHER APPLICATIONS AND NOMINATIONS**

A. West End Historic Overlay District Design Review Standards

Motion: Ms. Abernethy moved to set the Public Hearing Date for April 1, 2020.
Second: Ms. Shill
Vote: Unanimous

V. **COMMITTEE REPORTS**

A. Historic Marker Committee

1. P.H. Hanes Knitting Co. Text Review & Approval
2. Bowen Park Community Text Review & Approval
3. Salem Cemetery Text Review & Approval

Motion: Ms. Haney, moved to accept the text presented by staff, as edited by the Commission.
Second: Mr. Gadberry
Vote: Unanimous

4. County Marker Consideration and Text

Motion: Ms. Shill moved to approve the "Y" Camps of Salem Chapel Township as the County Marker and text as presented by staff.
Second: Mr. Idol
Vote: Unanimous

B. Education Committee

1. Update on Historic Preservation Month Activities
2. Update on Local Historic Landmark Event

VI. **STAFF REPORT**

- A. Forsyth County Architectural Survey Update: Phase II
Unincorporated portions of the King, Rural Hall, Walnut Cove, and Walkertown
USGS Quads, and the Towns of Bethania, Rural Hall, and Walkertown
- B. 2020-2021 Certified Local Government (CLG) Grants
- C. Black History Month Social Media Content

VII. FOR THE GOOD OF THE ORDER

NEXT MEETING: March 4, 2020

This agenda is available in alternative media forms for people with disabilities. Individuals with disabilities who require assistance or special arrangements to participate in programs and activities of the Historic Resources Commission are encouraged to contact the Planning Department at least 72 hours in advance so that proper accommodations can be arranged. For information, call 336-727-8000 (727-8319 TTY).