



Minutes
Forsyth County
Historic Resources Commission
March 3, 2021
4:00 P.M.
City Hall Council Chamber, Room 230
101 North Main Street, Winston-Salem

Chair Owen called the meeting to order at 4:00 p.m.

MEMBERS PRESENT: Kaky Berry, Chad Gadberry, Emma Haney, C.J. Idol, Kevin Owen, LeAnn Pegram, Janet Shill, Tina Thacker

MEMBERS ABSENT: Donna Abernethy, Ted Guenther, Alanna Meltzer-Holderfield, Sunny Stewart

STAFF PRESENT: Heather Bratland, Michelle McCullough, David Reed
Attorney Jerry Kontos

PRESIDING: Kevin Owen, Chair

I. APPROVAL OF MINUTES

A. Approval of February 3, 2021 Minutes

Motion: Ms. Thacker moved approval of the February 3, 2021 minutes.

Second: Ms. Berry

Vote: Unanimous

II. CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS APPLICATIONS

Preservation staff was sworn for testimony.

- A. Sue Family Investments c/o Melissa Sue Vaughan
1101 West Fourth Street, Winston-Salem
O'Hanlon-Joyce House
West End Historic Overlay District #366
Request: Replacement of the slate roof with CertainTeed Grand Manor shingles
COA2021-010

Staff Comments: Ms. Bratland presented the staff report. She also presented a map showing the location of the property and photographs of the property.

Staff Findings

Commission staff finds that the project is not incongruous with the character of the West End Historic Overlay District because:

- 1) The applicant has provided evidence to show that it is not feasible to repair the slate roof or replace it with slate because of the "unavailability of skilled craftsmen." Per the applicant:

After a series of serious leaks, in 2017 ... trying to get a local roofing company ... to return a phone call was next to impossible. Every company we spoke with refused to deal with a slate roof. We hired a contractor out of Greensboro who claimed to have experience working with slate roof repair and replacement to do the partial roof on the right side in 2018-2019. We were able to locate slate from the Virginia Slate Company in Richmond, Va. Pennsylvania slate was no longer available The job was not done properly, the slate was improperly installed is now not salvageable. After firing the incompetent contractor, I learned that Preferred Roofing might handle slate roofs. I attempted to contact Preferred Roofing on numerous occasions, leaving several messages in November and December 2020. My calls were not returned. I also reached out to Angie's List which was a complete joke. I specifically indicated that I needed a roofing company with slate experience. Despite being told that "We've matched pros to your Natural Slate Roof Install project," that was not the case. The first company I called wanted me to file an insurance claim before they would talk to me. (J.W. Arnold Commercial and Residential Roofing LLC.) I left messages with three additional companies asking for someone to call me about a slate roof replacement and never got a return phone call. It is clear that there are very few, if any, roofers who want to work on a slate roof replacement. Under the circumstances, it is not feasible for us to find a skilled craftsman who could replace the slate roof. I have no confidence that there are any reputable roofing contractors with slate experience that will be willing tackle this job. A significant portion of the underlying sheeting, the valleys, hips and all flashing will need to be replaced. In addition, we need to repair the eaves on the left side and in the front of the house. Moving to an alternative material will provide us with more options for reputable roofing contractor and ease of repairs as we head into the future.

(Roofs, West End Standard 4; Appendix A-Glossary of Terms, West End Feasibility Circumstance 2)

- 2) The applicant proposes to replace the slate with CertainTeed Grand Manor shingles and install new copper flashing at the valleys, chimneys, and drip edges. The multi-layered asphalt shingles create shadows and convey the three-dimensional appearance of slate. The Restoration Branch of the State Historic Preservation Office has approved the use of these shingles on a state-owned historic house, and the National Park Service has approved their use at a rehabilitation tax credit project in Raleigh. The deteriorated metal ridgeline details and finials will be recreated in copper to match the existing features. (Roofs, West End Standards 1, 3, and 4)

Staff Recommendation

Based on the preceding findings, staff recommends that the Commission approve COA2021-010 at the O'Hanlon-Joyce House, located at 1101 West Fourth Street, within the West End Historic Overlay District (PIN 6825-75-6920.00), with the following conditions:

- 1) The applicant shall receive, prior to commencement of the work, all other required permits or permissions from governmental agencies;
- 2) Commission staff shall review and approve any revisions or deviations to any portion of the as-submitted work, that qualifies as a minor work, prior to commencement of that portion of the project; and,
- 3) The applicant shall submit the *Certificate of Appropriateness Request for Certification of Completed Work* and photo documentation of the completed project to HRC staff within ten (10) days of its completion.

Public Comment

Speaking in Favor of the Application: Jim Vaughn, 1101 West 4th Street, Winston-Salem, NC, Owner's husband, was affirmed for testimony and spoke in support of the application.

Speaking in Opposition to the Application: None.

Commission Discussion

The Commission discussed the application.

Findings of Fact

Ms. Shill moved that based upon the evidence presented in the application and during the hearing, the Forsyth County Historic Resources Commission finds that the proposed project is not incongruous with the character of the West End Historic Overlay District because:

- 1) The applicant has provided evidence to show that it is not feasible to repair the slate roof or replace it with slate because of the “unavailability of skilled craftsmen.” Per the applicant:

After a series of serious leaks, in 2017 ... trying to get a local roofing company ... to return a phone call was next to impossible. Every company we spoke with refused to deal with a slate roof. We hired a contractor out of Greensboro who claimed to have experience working with slate roof repair and replacement to do the partial roof on the right side in 2018-2019. We were able to locate slate from the Virginia Slate Company in Richmond, Va. Pennsylvania slate was no longer available The job was not done properly, the slate was improperly installed is now not salvageable. After firing the incompetent contractor, I learned that Preferred Roofing might handle slate roofs. I attempted to contact Preferred Roofing on numerous occasions, leaving several messages in November and December 2020. My calls were not returned. I also reached out to Angie's List which was a complete joke. I specifically indicated that I needed a roofing company with slate experience. Despite being told that “We've matched pros to your Natural Slate Roof Install project,” that was not the case. The first company I called wanted me to file an insurance claim before they would talk to me. (J.W. Arnold Commercial and Residential Roofing LLC.) I left messages with three additional companies asking for someone to call me about a slate roof replacement and never got a return phone call. It is clear that there are very few, if any, roofers who want to work on a slate roof replacement. Under the circumstances, it is not feasible for us to find a skilled craftsman who could replace the slate roof. I have no confidence that there are any reputable roofing contractors with slate experience that will be willing tackle this job. A significant portion of the underlying sheeting, the valleys, hips and all flashing will need to be replaced. In addition, we need to repair the eaves on the left side and in the front of the house. Moving to an alternative material will provide us with more options for reputable roofing contractor and ease of repairs as we head into the future.

(Roofs, West End Standard 4; Appendix A-Glossary of Terms, West End Feasibility Circumstance)

- 2) The applicant proposes to replace the slate with CertainTeed Grand Manor shingles and install new copper flashing at the valleys, chimneys, and drip edges. The multi-layered asphalt shingles create shadows and convey the three-dimensional appearance of slate. The Restoration Branch of the State Historic Preservation Office has approved the use of these shingles on a state-owned historic house, and the National Park Service has approved their use at a rehabilitation tax credit project in Raleigh. The deteriorated metal ridgeline details and finials will be recreated to match the existing features. (Roofs, West End Standards 1, 3, and 4)

Second: Mr. Gadberry
Vote:

For: Kaky Berry, Chad Gadberry, Emma Haney, C.J. Idol, Kevin Owen, LeAnn Pegram, Janet Shill
Against: Tina Thacker

Certificate of Appropriateness

Ms. Pegram moved that based on the preceding findings, the Forsyth County Historic Resources Commission hereby approves COA2021-010 at 1101 West Fourth Street, within the West End Historic Overlay District (PIN 6825-75-6920.00), with the following conditions:

- 1) The applicant shall receive, prior to commencement of the work, all other required permits or permissions from governmental agencies;
- 2) Commission staff shall review and approve any revisions or deviations to any portion of the as-submitted work, that qualifies as a minor work, prior to commencement of that portion of the project; and
- 3) The applicant shall submit the Certificate of Appropriateness Request for Certification of Completed Work and photo documentation of the completed project to HRC staff within ten (10) days of its completion.

Second: Mr. Idol
Vote:

For: Kaky Berry, Chad Gadberry, Emma Haney, C.J. Idol, Kevin Owen, LeAnn Pegram, Janet Shill
Against: Tina Thacker

B. Chris Sandman
1404 Clover Street, Winston-Salem
Charles P. Johnston House
West End Historic Overlay District #332
**Request: After-the-fact porch deck replacement with Azek composite boards
COA2021-012**

Staff Comments: Ms. Bratland presented the staff report. She also presented a map showing the location of the property and photographs of the property.

Staff Findings

Commission staff finds that the project is incongruous with the character of the West End Historic Overlay District because:

- 1) The Azek composite boards do not match the historic floor in-kind, and the applicant has not provided evidence to show that repair of the porch floor is not feasible. A basement extends under the existing porch. Previously, the wooden tongue-and-groove porch floor was the only roof for this space. A home inspection identified mold on the building materials and wood frame in the basement under the porch, potentially caused by water infiltration through the porch floor. A floor joist pocketed into the brick foundation was found to be rotted out from water infiltration. The applicant has not provided sufficient information to demonstrate that the use of a substitute material on top of a waterproof membrane is necessary to address the water infiltration.

(Entrances, Porches, Enclosures, and Balconies, West End Standards 3 and 5; Appendix A-Glossary of Terms, West End Feasibility Circumstance 3)

Staff Recommendation

Based on the preceding findings, staff recommends that the Commission deny COA2021-012 at the Charles P. Johnston House, located at 1404 Clover Street, within the West End Historic Overlay District (PIN 6825-76-1898.00).

Public Comment

Speaking in Favor of the Application: Michael Sandman, 1216 Tangle Lane, High Point, NC, Contractor, was affirmed for testimony and spoke in support of the application. Christine Richardson, 1404 Clover Street, Winston-Salem, NC, Owner, was affirmed for testimony and spoke in support of the application.

Speaking in Opposition to the Application: None

Commission Discussion

The Commission discussed the application.

Finding of Fact

Mr. Idol moved that based upon all testimony and evidence, the Forsyth County Historic Resources Commission, based upon the evidence presented in the application and during the hearing, finds that the proposed project is incongruous with the character of the West End Historic Overlay District because:

- 1) The Azek composite boards do not match the historic floor in-kind, and the applicant has not provided evidence to show that repair of the porch floor is not feasible. A basement extends under the existing porch. Previously, the wooden tongue-and-groove porch floor was the only roof for this space. A home inspection identified mold on the building materials and wood frame in the basement under the porch, potentially caused by water infiltration through the porch floor. A floor joist pocketed into the brick foundation was found to be rotted out from water infiltration. The applicant has not provided sufficient information to demonstrate that the use of a substitute material on top of a waterproof membrane is necessary to address the water infiltration. *(Entrances, Porches, Enclosures, and Balconies, West End Standards 3 and 5; Appendix A-Glossary of Terms, West End Feasibility Circumstance 3)*

Second: Ms. Berry

Vote: Unanimous

Certificate of Appropriateness

Ms. Shill moved that based on the preceding findings, the Forsyth County Historic Resources Commission hereby denies COA2021-012 at the Charles P. Johnston House, located at 1404 Clover Street, within the West End Historic Overlay District (PIN 6825-76-1898.00).

Second: Mr. Gadberry

Vote: Unanimous

III. **MINOR WORK REPORT**

IV. OTHER APPLICATIONS AND NOMINATIONS

- A. Local Historic Landmark Designation
Twin City Motor Company Building
633 North Liberty Street, Winston-Salem
Local Historic Landmark #142

Motion: Ms. Berry moved that the Forsyth County Historic Resources Commission recommends that the Winston-Salem City Council designate the Twin City Motor Company building as a local historic landmark.

Second: Mr. Gadberry

Vote: Unanimous

V. COMMITTEE REPORTS

- A. Historic Marker Committee
- B. Education Committee

Ms. Bratland stated that all markers have been ordered and can be expected in 10-12 weeks.

VI. STAFF REPORT

Ms. McCullough commended Heather Bratland on a great job of sharing articles on social media of the many contributions made by African Americans to the healthcare community during Black History Month. We have received good response from citizens.

VII. FOR THE GOOD OF THE ORDER

NEXT MEETING: April 7, 2021

This agenda is available in alternative media forms for people with disabilities. Individuals with disabilities who require assistance or special arrangements to participate in programs and activities of the Historic Resources Commission are encouraged to contact the Planning Department at least 72 hours in advance so that proper accommodations can be arranged. For information, call 336-727-8000 (727-8319 TTY).