



**Minutes  
Forsyth County  
Historic Resources Commission  
July 1, 2020  
4:00 P.M.  
Benton Convention Center, Ballroom #2  
301 W 5<sup>th</sup> St., Winston-Salem**

MEMBERS PRESENT: Kaky Berry, Chad Gadberry, Ted Guenther, Emma Haney, C.J. Idol, Kevin Owen (Chair), LeAnn Pegram, Janet Shill

MEMBERS ABSENT: Donna Abernethy, Alanna Meltzer-Holderfield, Sunny Stewart, Tina Thacker

STAFF PRESENT: Heather Bratland; Michelle McCullough; David Reed;  
Jerry Kontos (Attorney)

**I. APPROVAL OF MINUTES**

A. Approval of March 4, 2020 Minutes

Motion: Ms. Pegram moved approval of the March 4, 2020 minutes.

Second: Mr. Idol

Vote: Unanimous

**II. CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS APPLICATIONS**

A. Spear Cherry Street Holdings LLC  
118 South Cherry Street, Winston-Salem  
Conrad-Starbuck House  
Local Historic Landmark #68

**Request: After-the-fact installation of windows and siding on rear addition,  
mailbox, and exterior lighting and the installation of metal balconies  
COA2020-030**

Staff Comments: Ms. McCullough presented the staff report. She also presented a map showing the location of the property and photographs of the property.

**STAFF FINDINGS**

Commission staff finds that the proposed project is not incongruous with the character of the Landmark because:

- 1) The windows in the main body of the historic building have been retained and preserved. The proposed windows are installed in the rear additions of the historic building. The proposed windows replaced nonoriginal wood and vinyl windows. The windows were not listed as a significant feature when the Landmark was designated. The new windows are wood with four-over-four interior grids. The original grid pattern of the windows in the additions is not known. The design, location, material, size, scale, and proportions are compatible with the historic

building. However, the grids are internal and have no external muntin profile. (*Windows and Doors*, Landmark Guidelines 1, 2, 5, and 6)

- 2) The proposed black metal mailbox is located adjacent to the north elevation of one of the rear additions and facilitates the multiple tenants of the building. The mailbox is freestanding and does not obscure or block any historic features. The mailbox is in a location that does not compromise the overall historic character of the Landmark building and site. (*Site Features and Planting*, Landmark Guideline 8)
- 3) The front elevation lighting was not original and was stolen off the site during renovations. The proposed lights are a simple, black, lantern style and will be located on the front and side entrances. The lights do not diminish or compromise the historic character of the Landmark building or the site. (*Exterior Lighting*, Landmark Guidelines 6)
- 4) The proposed replacement siding was added to the rear additions of the historic building. The siding is a painted composite material. The building siding on the additions was either missing or severely deteriorated. The new siding is compatible with the historic building in size, scale, color, and detail. (*Exterior Walls and Trim*, Landmark Guidelines 5 and 6)
- 5) The front elevation of the historic building has been altered with various porches and architectural features throughout time. At this time, it is proposed to add two faux black metal balconies at the second story windows over the front entrance. The house is an Italianate style and this style may have such a feature on second story balconies. There is physical evidence that such a feature may have existed at one time. The balcony feature that is missing is being replaced with a new feature that is compatible with the historic building in style, scale, size, dimension, detail, texture, pattern, design, color, and material. (*Porches, Terraces, Balconies, and Enclosures*, Landmark Guidelines 6 and 10)

#### STAFF RECOMMENDATION

Based on the preceding findings, staff recommends that the Commission approve COA2020-030 at the Conrad-Starbuck House, located at 118 South Cherry Street, Local Historic Landmark #68 (PIN# 6835-15-6289.00), with the following conditions:

- 1) The applicant shall permanently apply wood grids to the exterior of the windows to create the appropriate muntin profile to match the depth and width of the original building's muntins;
- 2) The applicant shall receive, prior to commencement of the work, all other required permits or permissions from governmental agencies;
- 3) Commission staff shall review and approve any revisions or deviations to any portion of the as-submitted work, that qualifies as a minor work, prior to commencement of that portion of the project; and,
- 4) The applicant shall submit the Certificate of Appropriateness Request for Certification of Completed Work form and photo documentation of the completed project to HRC staff within ten (10) days of its completion.

#### PUBLIC COMMENT

Speaking in Favor of the Application: Adam Spear, 118 South Cherry Street, Winston-Salem, NC, Owner, was affirmed for testimony and spoke in support of the application.

Speaking in Opposition of the Application: None

## COMMISSION DISCUSSION

The Commission discussed the application.

## FINDINGS OF FACT

Ms. Shill moved that based upon the evidence presented in the application and during the hearing, the Forsyth County Historic Resources Commission finds that the proposed project is not incongruous with the character of the Local Historic Landmark because:

- 1) The windows in the main body of the historic building have been retained and preserved. The proposed windows are installed in the rear additions of the historic building. The proposed windows replaced nonoriginal wood and vinyl windows. The windows were not listed as a significant feature when the Landmark was designated. The new windows are wood with four-over-four interior grids. The original grid pattern of the windows in the additions is not known. The design, location, material, size, scale, and proportions are compatible with the historic building. However, the grids are internal and have no external muntin profile. (*Windows and Doors*, Landmark Guidelines 1, 2, 5, and 6)
- 2) The proposed black metal mailbox is located adjacent to the north elevation of one of the rear additions and facilitates the multiple tenants of the building. The mailbox is freestanding and does not obscure or block any historic features. The mailbox is in a location that does not compromise the overall historic character of the Landmark building and site. (*Site Features and Planting*, Landmark Guideline 8)
- 3) The front elevation lighting was not original and was stolen off the site during renovations. The proposed lights are a simple, black, lantern style and will be located on the front and side entrances. The lights do not diminish or compromise the historic character of the Landmark building or the site. (*Exterior Lighting*, Landmark Guidelines 6)
- 4) The proposed replacement siding was added to the rear additions of the historic building. The siding is a painted composite material. The building siding on the additions was either missing or severely deteriorated. The new siding is compatible with the historic building in size, scale, color, and detail. (*Exterior Walls and Trim*, Landmark Guidelines 5 and 6)
- 5) The front elevation of the historic building has been altered with various porches and architectural features throughout time. At this time, it is proposed to add two faux black metal balconies at the second story windows over the front entrance. The house is an Italianate style and this style may have such a feature on second story balconies. There is physical evidence that such a feature may have existed at one time. The balcony feature that is missing is being replaced with a new feature that is compatible with the historic building in style, scale, size, dimension, detail, texture, pattern, design, color, and material. (*Porches, Terraces, Balconies, and Enclosures*, Landmark Guidelines 6 and 10)

Second: Ms. Berry

Vote: Unanimous

## CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS

Ms. Berry moved that based on the preceding findings, the Forsyth County Historic Resources Commission hereby approves COA2020-030 at the Conrad-Starbuck House, located at 118 South Cherry Street, Local Historic Landmark #68 (PIN# 6835-15-6289.00), with the following conditions:

- 1) The applicant shall permanently apply wood grids to the exterior of the windows to create the appropriate muntin profile to match the depth and width of the original building's muntins;

- 2) The applicant shall receive, prior to commencement of the work, all other required permits or permissions from governmental agencies;
- 3) Commission staff shall review and approve any revisions or deviations to any portion of the as-submitted work, that qualifies as a minor work, prior to commencement of that portion of the project; and,
- 4) The applicant shall submit the Certificate of Appropriateness Request for Certification of Completed Work form and photo documentation of the completed project to HRC staff within ten (10) days of its completion.

Second: Ms. Shill

Vote: Unanimous

B. Mary Hannon Reid  
112 North Stratford Road, Winston-Salem  
Thurmond and Lucy Chatham House  
Local Historic Landmark #132  
**Request: Interior renovation**  
**COA2020-058**  
**WITHDRAWN**

C. Hayes Wauford  
508 Salt Street, Winston-Salem  
Salt-Flax House  
Old Salem Historic District #73  
Contributing  
**Request: Installation of fencing, stone retaining wall, and patio**  
**COA2020-031**

Staff Comments: Ms. McCullough presented the staff report. She also presented a map showing the location of the property and photographs of the property.

#### STAFF FINDINGS

Commission staff finds that the project is not incongruous with the character of the District because:

- 1) The proposed fencing is a band/straight sawn wood, 40" high, 4"-4 1/8" wide, double-picket style fence with galvanized common cut nails to be installed along the sidewalk in front of the property and as a surround to the existing mechanical unit. There will be a gate at the left side of the home 3'-0' wide with wrought strap hinges mounted with a pintle to the gate post and anchored with screws that will be hammered to mimic nails. The Salt Flax House was built in 1816, and the 2014 work was to rehabilitate the house to its appearance in 1850. The fence is appropriate for a structure built between 1800 and 1850. (*Fences*, Old Salem Guidelines 5, 6, 8, 9, and 10)
- 2) The proposed retaining wall is faced with majestic brown stone with lime-based mortar to match the foundation of the house and the existing retaining wall at the rear of the property. The proposed wall will go south from the southwest corner of the house for 3', and then turn west to the same point that the existing wall terminates and it will then turn back north for approximately 7' to create a 6' opening between the two walls. The proposed retaining wall is compatible with the property and District in regard to location, size, scale, and material. The retaining wall will be constructed to avoid any known archaeology sites on the property. (*Walls*, Old Salem Guideline 4)

- 3) The proposed patio addition will be constructed of a historically appropriate material, brick. The Pine Hall Rumbled Autumn bricks will match the existing patio bricks. The bricks will be installed in a running bond on a granite dust bed. The additional patio is compatible in location, pattern, spacing, configuration, dimension, scale, texture, and material with the character of the structure and the District. (*Walkways and Steps*, Old Salem Guideline 3)

### STAFF RECOMMENDATION

Based on the preceding findings, staff recommends that the Commission approve COA2020-031 at the Salt-Flax House, located at 508 Salt Street, within the Old Salem Historic District (PIN# 6835-23-6400.00), with the following conditions:

- 1) The applicant shall receive, prior to commencement of the work, all other required permits or permissions from governmental agencies;
- 2) Commission staff shall review and approve any revisions or deviations to any portion of the as-submitted work, that qualifies as a minor work, prior to commencement of that portion of the project; and,
- 3) The applicant shall submit the Certificate of Appropriateness Request for Certification of Completed Work form and photo documentation of the completed project to HRC staff within ten (10) days of its completion.

### PUBLIC COMMENT

Speaking in Favor of the Application: Hayes Wauford, Wilson-Covington, 2700 Boulder Park Court, Winston-Salem, NC, was affirmed for testimony and spoke in support of the application.

Speaking in Opposition of the Application: None

### COMMISSION DISCUSSION

The Commission discussed the application.

### FINDINGS OF FACT

Ms. Pegram moved that based upon the evidence presented in the application and during the hearing, the Forsyth County Historic Resources Commission finds that the proposed project is not incongruous with the character of the Old Salem Historic District because:

- 1) The proposed fencing is a band/straight sawn wood, 40" high, 4"-4 1/8" wide, double-picket style fence with galvanized common cut nails to be installed along the sidewalk in front of the property and as a surround to the existing mechanical unit. There will be a gate at the left side of the home 3'-0' wide with wrought strap hinges mounted with a pintle to the gate post and anchored with screws that will be hammered to mimic nails. The Salt Flax House was built in 1816, and the 2014 work was to rehabilitate the house to its appearance in 1850. The fence is appropriate for a structure built between 1800 and 1850. (*Fences*, Old Salem Guidelines 5, 6, 8, 9, and 10)
- 2) The proposed retaining wall is faced with majestic brown stone with lime-based mortar to match the foundation of the house and the existing retaining wall at the rear of the property. The proposed wall will go south from the southwest corner of the house for 3', and then turn west to the same point that the existing wall terminates and it will then turn back north for approximately 7' to create a 6' opening between the two walls. The proposed retaining wall is compatible with the property and District in regard to location, size, scale, and material. The retaining wall will be

constructed to avoid any known archaeology sites on the property. (*Walls*, Old Salem Guideline 4)

- 3) The proposed patio addition will be constructed of a historically appropriate material, brick. The Pine Hall 'Rumbled Autumn' bricks will match the existing patio bricks. The bricks will be installed in a running bond on a granite dust bed. The additional patio is compatible in location, pattern, spacing, configuration, dimension, scale, texture, and material with the character of the structure and the District. (*Walkways and Steps*, Old Salem Guideline 3)

Second: Mr. Idol

Vote: Unanimous

### CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS

Mr. Idol moved that based on the preceding findings, the Forsyth County Historic Resources Commission hereby approves COA2020-031 at the Salt-Flax House, located at 508 Salt Street, within the Old Salem Historic District (PIN# 6835-23-6400.00), with the following conditions:

- 1) The applicant shall receive, prior to commencement of the work, all other required permits or permissions from governmental agencies;
- 2) Commission staff shall review and approve any revisions or deviations to any portion of the as-submitted work, that qualifies as a minor work, prior to commencement of that portion of the project; and,
- 3) The applicant shall submit the Certificate of Appropriateness Request for Certification of Completed Work form and photo documentation of the completed project to HRC staff within ten (10) days of its completion.

Second: Ms. Shill

Vote: Unanimous

D. Jeff Fansler  
Old Salem Road, Winston-Salem  
Old Salem Historic District  
Noncontributing  
**Request: Installation of wayfinding signs**  
**COA2020-060**

[Ms. Berry was recused from consideration of this request at 4:41 p.m.]

Staff Comments: Ms. McCullough presented the staff report. She also presented a map showing the location of the property and photographs of the property.

### STAFF FINDINGS

Commission staff finds that the project is not incongruous with the character of the District because:

- 1) The proposed wayfinding signage will replace existing, outdated wayfinding signage on Old Salem Road. Old Salem Road is a major thoroughfare that runs along the edge of the Old Salem Historic District, and it has no structures facing it. The signs are metal, and range in size from 45" to 90" on posts that range in size from 14' to 17.5'. The sheen to be applied to each sign meets the North Carolina Department of Transportation, Division of Highways, Transportation Mobility and Safety Standards for retroreflective sign sheeting. The material, size, scale, typeface and character are appropriate for the major thoroughfare. The signage is not obtrusive, and it does not cover any building facades, significant architectural features, or

block streetscape views. The signage is removable, and the posts relate to the sign and type of street. (*Signage*, Old Salem Guidelines 2, 3, 4, 5, and 9).

### STAFF RECOMMENDATION

Based on the preceding findings, staff recommends that the Commission approve COA2020-060 on Old Salem Road, located in the Old Salem Historic District, with the following conditions:

- 1) The applicant shall receive, prior to commencement of the work, all other required permits or permissions from governmental agencies;
- 2) Commission staff shall review and approve any revisions or deviations to any portion of the as-submitted work, that qualifies as a minor work, prior to commencement of that portion of the project; and,
- 3) The applicant shall submit the Certificate of Appropriateness Request for Certification of Completed Work form and photo documentation of the completed project to HRC staff within ten (10) days of its completion.

### PUBLIC COMMENT

Speaking in Favor of the Application: Jeff Fansler, Deputy Director, WS-DOT, 100 East First Street, Winston-Salem, NC, was affirmed for testimony and spoke in support of the application.

Speaking in Opposition of the Application: None

### COMMISSION DISCUSSION

The Commission discussed the application.

### FINDINGS OF FACT

Ms. Haney moved that based upon the evidence presented in the application and during the hearing, the Forsyth County Historic Resources Commission finds that the proposed project is not incongruous with the character of the Old Salem Historic District because:

- 1) The proposed wayfinding signage will replace existing, outdated wayfinding signage on Old Salem Road. Old Salem Road is a major thoroughfare that runs along the edge of the Old Salem Historic District, and it has no structures facing it. The signs are metal, and range in size from 45" to 90" on posts that range in size from 14' to 17.5'. The sheen to be applied to each sign meets the North Carolina Department of Transportation, Division of Highways, Transportation Mobility and Safety Standards for retroreflective sign sheeting. The material, size, scale, typeface and character are appropriate for the major thoroughfare. The signage is not obtrusive, and it does not cover any building facades, significant architectural features, or block streetscape views. The signage is removable, and the posts relate to the sign and type of street. (*Signage*, Old Salem Guidelines 2, 3, 4, 5, and 9).

Second: Mr. Gadberry

Vote: Unanimous

## CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS

Ms. Shill moved that based on the preceding findings, the Forsyth County Historic Resources Commission hereby approves COA2020-060 on Old Salem Road, located in the Old Salem Historic District, with the following conditions:

- 1) The applicant shall receive, prior to commencement of the work, all other required permits or permissions from governmental agencies;
- 2) Commission staff shall review and approve any revisions or deviations to any portion of the as-submitted work, that qualifies as a minor work, prior to commencement of that portion of the project; and,
- 3) The applicant shall submit the Certificate of Appropriateness Request for Certification of Completed Work form and photo documentation of the completed project to HRC staff within ten (10) days of its completion.

Second: Ms. Pegram

Vote: Unanimous

[Ms. Berry rejoined the meeting at 4:49 p.m.]

E. Lisa Aiken  
319 South Main Street, Winston-Salem  
Peter Fetter House  
Old Salem Historic District #83  
Contributing  
**Request: Installation of a car charger  
COA2020-063**

Staff Comments: Ms. McCullough presented the staff report. She also presented a map showing the location of the property and photographs of the property.

### STAFF FINDING

Commission staff finds that the project is not incongruous with the character of the District because:

- 1) The proposed car charger will be placed by an existing electrical box on the northeast corner of the house, in an area of very low visibility. The car charger is 14" tall by 4" wide and is a size and scale that will not detract from the character of the building or District. The car charger has a silver-white finish, which will blend with the gray paint of the house. (*Accessory Features*, Old Salem Guidelines 1 and 9).

### STAFF RECOMMENDATION

Based on the preceding findings, staff recommends that the Commission approve COA2020-063 at the Peter Fetter House, located at 319 South Main Street, within the Old Salem Historic District (PIN# 6835-24-9526.00), with the following conditions:

- 1) The applicant shall receive, prior to commencement of the work, all other required permits or permissions from governmental agencies;
- 2) Commission staff shall review and approve any revisions or deviations to any portion of the as-submitted work, that qualifies as a minor work, prior to commencement of that portion of the project; and,



- 3) The applicant shall submit the Certificate of Appropriateness Request for Certification of Completed Work form and photo documentation of the completed project to HRC staff within ten (10) days of its completion.

### PUBLIC COMMENT

Speaking in Favor of the Application: Lisa Aiken, 319 South Main Street, Winston-Salem, NC, Owner, was affirmed for testimony and spoke in support of the application.

Speaking in Opposition of the Application: None

### COMMISSION DISCUSSION

The Commission discussed the application.

### FINDING OF FACT

Mr. Idol moved that based upon the evidence presented in the application and during the hearing, the Forsyth County Historic Resources Commission finds that the proposed project, Option 1, is not incongruous with the character of the Old Salem Historic District because:

- 1) The proposed car charger will be placed by an existing electrical box on the northeast corner of the house, in an area of very low visibility. The car charger is 14" tall by 4" wide and is a size and scale that will not detract from the character of the building or District. The car charger has a silver-white finish, which will blend with the gray paint of the house. (*Accessory Features*, Old Salem Guidelines 1 and 9).

Second: Mr. Gadberry

Vote: Unanimous

### CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS

Mr. Guenther moved that based on the preceding findings, the Forsyth County Historic Resources Commission hereby approves COA2020-063 at the Peter Fetter House, located at 319 South Main Street, within the Old Salem Historic District (PIN# 6835-24-9526.00), with the following conditions:

- 1) The applicant shall receive, prior to commencement of the work, all other required permits or permissions from governmental agencies;
- 2) Commission staff shall review and approve any revisions or deviations to any portion of the as-submitted work, that qualifies as a minor work, prior to commencement of that portion of the project; and,
- 3) The applicant shall submit the Certificate of Appropriateness Request for Certification of Completed Work form and photo documentation of the completed project to HRC staff within ten (10) days of its completion.

Second: Ms. Berry

Vote: Unanimous

- F. Craig Shoe, CSI Custom Homes  
908 Carolina Avenue, Winston-Salem  
Duplex  
West End Historic Overlay District #253  
**Request: After-the-fact façade redesign and rear addition**  
**COA2020-053**

Staff Comments: Ms. Bratland presented the staff report. She also presented a map showing the location of the property and photographs of the property.

### STAFF FINDINGS

Commission staff finds that the project is not incongruous with the character of the West End Historic Overlay District because:

- 1) The replacement windows and doors are a modern Craftsman style that will make the building more compatible with the character of the District. The rearrangement of door and window openings on the sidewalls of the duplex will not impact its architectural character, as the arrangement is utilitarian and not stylistic. (*Noncontributing Structures*, Guideline 3)
- 2) The proposed horizontal cable railings are an updated version of the utilitarian square bar metal railings that exist. They are consistent with the utilitarian style of the structure. (*Noncontributing Structures*, Guideline 3)
- 3) The roof will be reframed to create a traditional end gable roof, instead of the existing hip-on-gable roof. As part of the reframing, the ridge of the roof will be brought forward, creating a pediment in the space above the roof return. The pediment will be infilled with board and batten HardiePanel. The gable roof will be covered with architectural shingles, and the street-facing roof return in standing seam metal. Four square fiberglass posts will support the roof over the entry porch. The reframed roof, the materials selected for the roof and pediment, and the creation of a front porch reference the Craftsman style of architecture, and materials and building features traditionally used in West End. The will help the building become more compatible with the character of West End. (*Noncontributing Structures*, Guideline 3)
- 4) Painting the brickwork will not damage it, as it is hard-fired modern brick. Painting will also assist in visually masking repairs and areas of infill. (*Noncontributing Structures*, Guideline 3)
- 5) Applying stone veneer to the garage surround and retaining walls adjacent the driveway will blend the building with the District by visually referencing a material found throughout the West End on foundations and retaining walls. (*Noncontributing Structures*, Guideline 3)
- 6) The one-story, rear addition will not be visible from the street, and it is quite modest in size. The materials used on the addition will match the materials used elsewhere on the Duplex. (*Additions*, Guidelines 3, 4, and 5)
- 7) The proposed 72"-high fence on the right-side property line will run perpendicular to the street and be set high off the sidewalk, so it will not be highly visible. The horizontal board fence is consistent with the horizontal cable railing and simplified Craftsman style of the Duplex; it will be constructed of metal and wood. (*New Fences in Areas of Low Visibility from Street Level*, Guidelines 1 and 2)

### STAFF RECOMMENDATION

Based on the preceding findings, staff recommends that the Commission approve COA2020-053 at the Duplex, located at 908 Carolina Avenue, within the West End Historic Overlay District (PIN 6825-77-8428.00), with the following conditions:

- 1) The applicant shall receive, prior to commencement of the work, all other required permits or permissions from governmental agencies;
- 2) Commission staff shall review and approve any revisions or deviations to any portion of the as-submitted work, that qualifies as a minor work, prior to commencement of that portion of the project; and
- 3) The applicant shall submit the *Certificate of Appropriateness Request for Certification of Completed Work* and photo documentation of the completed project to HRC staff within ten (10) days of its completion.

### PUBLIC COMMENT

Speaking in Favor of the Application: Craig Shoe, PO Box 5962, High Point, NC, Applicant, was affirmed for testimony and spoke in support of the application.

Speaking in Opposition of the Application: None

### COMMISSION DISCUSSION

The Commission discussed the application.

### FINDINGS OF FACT

Ms. Pegram moved that based upon the evidence presented in the application and during the hearing, the Forsyth County Historic Resources Commission finds that the proposed project is not incongruous with the character of the West End Historic Overlay District because:

- 1) The replacement windows and doors are a modern Craftsman style that will make the building more compatible with the character of the District. The rearrangement of door and window openings on the sidewalls of the duplex will not impact its architectural character, as the arrangement is utilitarian and not stylistic. (*Noncontributing Structures*, Guideline 3)
- 2) The proposed horizontal cable railings are an updated version of the utilitarian square bar metal railings that exist. They are consistent with the utilitarian style of the structure. (*Noncontributing Structures*, Guideline 3)
- 3) The roof will be reframed to create a traditional end gable roof, instead of the existing hip-on-gable roof. As part of the reframing, the ridge of the roof will be brought forward, creating a pediment in the space above the roof return. The pediment will be infilled with board and batten HardiePanel. The gable roof will be covered with architectural shingles, and the street-facing roof return in standing seam metal. Four square fiberglass posts will support the roof over the entry porch. The reframed roof, the materials selected for the roof and pediment, and the creation of a front porch reference the Craftsman style of architecture, and materials and building features traditionally used in West End. This will help the building become more compatible with the character of West End. (*Noncontributing Structures*, Guideline 3)
- 4) Painting the brickwork will not damage it, as it is hard-fired modern brick. Painting will also assist in visually masking repairs and areas of infill. (*Noncontributing Structures*, Guideline 3)
- 5) Applying stone veneer to the garage surround and retaining walls adjacent the driveway will blend the building with the District by visually referencing a material found throughout the West End on foundations and retaining walls. (*Noncontributing Structures*, Guideline 3)

- 6) The one-story, rear addition will not be visible from the street, and it is quite modest in size. The materials used on the addition will match the materials used elsewhere on the Duplex. (*Additions, Guidelines 3, 4, and 5*)
- 7) The proposed 72"-high fence on the right-side property line will run perpendicular to the street and be set high off the sidewalk, so it will not be highly visible. The horizontal board fence is consistent with the horizontal cable railing and simplified Craftsman style of the Duplex; it will be constructed of metal and wood. (*New Fences in Areas of Low Visibility from Street Level, Guidelines 1 and 2*)

Second: Ms. Haney

Vote:

For: Ms. Berry, Mr. Guenther, Ms. Haney, Mr. Idol, Mr. Owen, Ms. Pegram, Ms. Shill

Against: Mr. Gadberry

### CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS

Mr. Idol moved that based on the preceding findings, the Forsyth County Historic Resources Commission hereby approves COA2020-053 at the Duplex, located at 908 Carolina Avenue, within the West End Historic Overlay District (PIN 6825-77-8428.00), with the following conditions:

- 1) The applicant shall receive, prior to commencement of the work, all other required permits or permissions from governmental agencies;
- 2) Commission staff shall review and approve any revisions or deviations to any portion of the as-submitted work, that qualifies as a minor work, prior to commencement of that portion of the project; and
- 3) The applicant shall submit the *Certificate of Appropriateness Request for Certification of Completed Work* and photo documentation of the completed project to HRC staff within ten (10) days of its completion.

Second: Ms. Berry

Vote:

For: Ms. Berry, Mr. Guenther, Ms. Haney, Mr. Idol, Mr. Owen, Ms. Pegram, Ms. Shill

Against: Mr. Gadberry

- G. Hessamedin Alimohammadi  
1000 Carolina Avenue, Winston-Salem  
House  
West End Historic Overlay District #263  
Noncontributing  
**Request: After-the-fact construction of a deck  
COA2020-068**

Staff Comments: Ms. Bratland presented the staff report. She also presented a map showing the location of the property and photographs of the property.

### STAFF FINDING

Commission staff finds that the project is not incongruous with the character of the West End Historic Overlay District because:

- 1) The house has traditionally had a deck in this location, as evidenced by earlier photos of the house and the location of a door, providing access from the second floor to the deck. The deck was removed to permit the movement of heavy equipment during construction on an adjoining property. The deck is located on the rear of the house. It is structurally self-supporting, and it is constructed of wood. (*Decks and Patios*, Guidelines 2 and 4)

### STAFF RECOMMENDATION

Based on the preceding finding, staff recommends that the Commission approve COA2020-068 at the House, located at 1000 Carolina Avenue, within the West End Historic Overlay District (PIN 6825-77-5163.00).

### PUBLIC COMMENT

Speaking in Favor of the Application: Hessamedin Alimohammadi, 1000 Carolina Avenue, Winston-Salem, NC, Owner, was affirmed for testimony and spoke in support of the application.

Speaking in Opposition of the Application: None

### COMMISSION DISCUSSION

The Commission discussed the application.

### FINDING OF FACT

Ms. Shill moved that based upon the evidence presented in the application and during the hearing, the Forsyth County Historic Resources Commission finds that the proposed project is not incongruous with the character of the West End Historic Overlay District because:

- 1) The house has traditionally had a deck in this location, as evidenced by earlier photos of the house and the location of a door, providing access from the second floor to the deck. The deck was removed to permit the movement of heavy equipment during construction on an adjoining property. The deck is located on the rear of the house. It is structurally self-supporting, and it is constructed of wood. (*Decks and Patios*, Guidelines 2 and 4)

Second: Ms. Haney  
Vote: Unanimous

### CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS

Mr. Guenther moved that based on the preceding finding, the Forsyth County Historic Resources Commission hereby approves COA2020-068 at the House, located at 1000 Carolina Avenue, within the West End Historic Overlay District (PIN 6825-77-5163.00).

Second: Ms. Pegram  
Vote: Unanimous

H. Patrick Welsh, T2pm  
851-855 West Fifth Street, Winston-Salem  
Site of the JJ Easley House  
West End Historic Overlay District #170  
Contributing  
**Request: Master landscape plan**  
**COA2020-069**

Staff Comments: Ms. Bratland presented the staff report. She also presented a map showing the location of the property and photographs of the property.

### STAFF FINDINGS

Commission staff finds that the project is not incongruous with the character of the West End Historic Overlay District because:

- 1) The existing downslope from West Fifth Street to Pilot View Street will be filled and regraded to create a smooth safe surface for use of the space. Nevertheless, the overall site topography will not be altered. Mature trees will be retained. With the creation of a drainage swale and the use of pervious pavers, the ability of the property to remove excess water will be improved, increasing soil stability and the potential of the space to support the growth of vegetation. Stone and landscape boulders are appropriate ground covers for West End. (*Vegetation*, Guidelines 1, 2, 3 and 10)
- 2) The granite seatwalls and retaining wall at the western property line will not impact any historic fabric. The walls are compatible with the site in setback, size, and scale. Stone is a preferred material for new walls. (*Walls*, Guidelines 4 and 5)
- 3) The plaza will be paved with square pavers that have water permeable joints. The pavers will be set within an area defined by an 8" wide band of concrete. Pavers are an appropriate material for patios. (*Decks and Patios*, Guideline 5)
- 4) A 42" high steel picket fence with steel and granite posts will surround the amphitheater on all sides except where it abuts the existing addition to the church. The fence will have a double gate that can be accessed from the West Fifth Street sidewalk, and a single gate at the plaza. The new fence will not impact any historic fabric. It is compatible with the site in setback, size, and scale. The design of the fence is compatible with the style and character of the church and is appropriate for an institutional building in West End. Steel is a preferred fence material. (*New Fences in Highly Visible Areas from Street Level*, Guidelines 1, 2, 4, and 6)
- 5) Four posts with overhead string lighting will light the plaza. String lighting was invented in 1884 and was fairly affordable by 1914. The string lighting is compatible with the human scale and historic character of the West End. The footlights in the granite steps are in an unobtrusive location, as are the directional lights aimed at the trees. Lighting three trees in the new amphitheater will not detract from overall historic character of the site or streetscape. (*Lighting*, Guidelines 3, 4, and 6)
- 6) The following trees have been selected for installation: river birch, American sycamore, willow oak, eastern red cedar, eastern redbud, Carolina cherry laurel, and Nellie Stevens holly. The following shrubs have been selected: gardenia, inkberry, Otto Luyken laurel, George Tabor azalea. The following grasses, groundcovers, and perennials have been selected: silver sceptre sedge, pink muhlygrass, dwarf fountain grass, mooncreeper cotoneaster, big blue lily turf, blue pacific shore juniper, purple coneflower, bloody cranesbill, and catmint. All of the selected trees are native to North Carolina or commonly found in the state. The scales of the materials are appropriate for the site and the specific locations selected for each plant type. (*Vegetation*, Guideline 4)

### STAFF RECOMMENDATION

Based on the preceding findings, staff recommends that the Commission approve COA2020-069 at the site of the J.J. Easley House, located at 851-855 West Fifth Street, within the West End Historic Overlay District (PIN 6825-97-0223.00), with the following conditions:

- 1) The applicant shall receive, prior to commencement of the work, all other required permits or permissions from governmental agencies;
- 2) Commission staff shall review and approve any revisions or deviations to any portion of the as-submitted work, that qualifies as a minor work, prior to commencement of that portion of the project; and
- 3) The applicant shall submit the *Certificate of Appropriateness Request for Certification of Completed Work* and photo documentation of the completed project to HRC staff within ten (10) days of its completion.

### PUBLIC COMMENT

Speaking in Favor of the Application: Brett Oliver, 600 Archer Road, Winston-Salem, NC, Consulting Landscape Architect, was affirmed for testimony and spoke in support of the application. Paul Wollner, 845 W. Fifth Avenue, Winston-Salem, NC, Senior Pastor, was affirmed for testimony and spoke in support of the application.

Speaking in Opposition of the Application: Sarah Remey, 833 Pilot View Street, Winston-Salem, NC, Neighbor was affirmed for testimony and spoke in opposition to the application. Robert Hegarty, 835 Pilot View Street, Winston-Salem, NC, Neighbor, was affirmed for testimony and spoke in opposition of the application. George Bryan, 1326 Glade Street, Winston-Salem, NC, West End resident, was affirmed for testimony and spoke in opposition of the application.

### COMMISSION DISCUSSION

The Commission discussed the application.

### FINDINGS OF FACT

Mr. Gadberry moved that based upon the evidence presented in the application and during the hearing, the Forsyth County Historic Resources Commission finds that the proposed project is not incongruous with the character of the West End Historic Overlay District because:

- 1) The existing downslope from West Fifth Street to Pilot View Street will be filled and regraded to create a smooth safe surface for use of the space. Nevertheless, the overall site topography will not be altered. Mature trees will be retained. With the creation of a drainage swale and the use of pervious pavers, the ability of the property to remove excess water will be improved, increasing soil stability and the potential of the space to support the growth of vegetation. Stone and landscape boulders are appropriate ground covers for West End. (*Vegetation*, Guidelines 1, 2, 3 and 10)
- 2) The granite seatwalls and retaining wall at the western property line will not impact any historic fabric. The walls are compatible with the site in setback, size, and scale. Stone is a preferred material for new walls. (*Walls*, Guidelines 4 and 5)
- 3) The plaza will be paved with square pavers that have water permeable joints. The pavers will be set within an area defined by an 8" wide band of concrete. Pavers are an appropriate material for patios. (*Decks and Patios*, Guideline 5)
- 4) A 42" high steel picket fence with steel and granite posts will surround the amphitheater on all sides except where it abuts the existing addition to the church. The fence will have a double gate that can be accessed from the West Fifth Street sidewalk, and a single gate at the plaza. The new fence will not impact any historic fabric. It is compatible with the site in setback, size, and scale. The design of the fence is compatible with the style and character of the church and

is appropriate for an institutional building in West End. Steel is a preferred fence material. (*New Fences in Highly Visible Areas from Street Level*, Guidelines 1, 2, 4, and 6)

- 5) Four posts with overhead string lighting will light the plaza. String lighting was invented in 1884 and was fairly affordable by 1914. The string lighting is compatible with the human scale and historic character of the West End. The footlights in the granite steps are in an unobtrusive location, as are the directional lights aimed at the trees. Lighting three trees in the new amphitheater will not detract from the overall historic character of the site or streetscape. (*Lighting*, Guidelines 3, 4, and 6)
- 6) The following trees have been selected for installation: river birch, American sycamore, willow oak, eastern red cedar, eastern redbud, Carolina cherry laurel, and Nellie Stevens holly. The following shrubs have been selected: gardenia, inkberry, Otto Luyken laurel, George Tabor azalea. The following grasses, groundcovers, and perennials have been selected: silver sceptre sedge, pink muhlygrass, dwarf fountain grass, mooncreeper cotoneaster, big blue lily turf, blue pacific shore juniper, purple coneflower, bloody cranesbill, and catmint. All of the selected trees are native to North Carolina or commonly found in the state. The scales of the materials are appropriate for the site and the specific locations selected for each plant type. (*Vegetation*, Guideline 4)

Second: Ms. Shill

Vote:

For: Ms. Berry, Mr. Gadberry, Mr. Guenther, Ms. Haney, Mr. Idol, Mr. Owen, Ms. Shill

Against: Ms. Pegram

#### CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS

Mr. Idol moved that based on the preceding findings, the Forsyth County Historic Resources Commission hereby approves COA2020-069 at the site of the J.J. Easley House, located at 851-855 West Fifth Street, within the West End Historic Overlay District (PIN 6825-97-0223.00), with the following conditions:

- 1) The applicant shall receive, prior to commencement of the work, all other required permits or permissions from governmental agencies;
- 2) Commission staff shall review and approve any revisions or deviations to any portion of the as-submitted work, that qualifies as a minor work, prior to commencement of that portion of the project; and
- 3) The applicant shall submit the Certificate of Appropriateness Request for Certification of Completed Work and photo documentation of the completed project to HRC staff within ten (10) days of its completion.

Second: Mr. Gadberry

Vote:

For: Ms. Berry, Mr. Gadberry, Mr. Guenther, Ms. Haney, Mr. Idol, Mr. Owen, Ms. Shill

Against: Ms. Pegram



- I. John Edwards, John Edwards Signature Homes  
240 North Sunset Drive, Winston-Salem  
Harry L. Shaner House  
West End Historic Overlay District #399  
Contributing  
**Request: After-the-fact exterior rehabilitation**  
**COA2020-070**

Staff Comments: Ms. Bratland presented the staff report. She also presented a map showing the location of the property and photographs of the property.

### STAFF FINDINGS

Commission staff finds that the project is not incongruous with the character of the West End Historic Overlay District because:

- 1) The exterior cladding on the house was a mix of wooden weatherboards and T1-11 plywood sheathing, with wooden shakes on the bay projecting over the entry porch. The cladding and trim elements were water damaged and rotten in areas. Termites had also damaged the cladding and structural members. The wooden cladding was replaced with wood-grain, fiber-cement lapped siding with fiber-cement shakes at the projecting bay. Damaged trim pieces were replaced with composite and fiber cement trim to match the existing dimensions and profiles. The bead board ceiling was replaced in-kind. All siding and trim was painted, consistent with the original exterior finish. (*Wood, Guidelines 2, 3, and 5*)
- 2) Two side doors were replaced, one at the second floor on the left side and one at the first floor on the right side. The main entry door, which was installed in the 1980s and is damaged on the interior from cigarette smoke and resident cats, was also replaced. The single-leaf replacement doors are simple – two recessed panels surmounted by six lights. The replacement doors are consistent in design, location, size, pane and panel configuration, trim, detail, style and material with the building and West End. (*Fenestration: Windows and Doors, Guidelines 5 and 9*)
- 3) The replacement stairs to the second floor and new stairs to the rear yard are both designed to allow safe access to areas of the building for tenants. Both sets of painted, pressure-treated wood stairs are located inconspicuously on side facades, and neither obscures or damages any character defining features. The stairs are compatible in scale, materials, detail, and finish with the building. They are a reversible installation and could be removed without damage to the building or porch. (*Safety, Accessibility, and Code Requirements, Guidelines 2-5*)
- 4) The roof shape, lines, and pitch were retained and restored, including the removal of the addition that sat on top of the entry porch roof. The roof was repaired by reinforcing undersized and damaged rafters and replacing rotten sheathing. The dark gray architectural shingles are an appropriate material with which to clad the roof. (*Roofs, Guidelines 1, 2, and 4*)
- 5) The removal of a nonoriginal deck and access door on the rear of the building has no impact on its historic character. Further, the roof on which the deck sat was not designed or constructed to support such a load, so its removal aids in the preservation of the building. (*Decks and Patios, Guideline 1; Fenestration: Windows and Doors, Guideline 15*)
- 6) The existing chimney masonry was repaired, and a solid cap was placed over it to prevent water infiltration. A small cricket was constructed behind the chimney to encourage water runoff and decrease the damaging impact of water infiltration. (*Roofs, Guideline 5*)

## STAFF RECOMMENDATION

Based on the preceding findings, staff recommends that the Commission approve COA2020-070 at the Harry L. Shaner House, located at 240 North Sunset Drive, within the West End Historic Overlay District (PIN 6825-65-5998.00).

## PUBLIC COMMENT

Speaking in Favor of the Application: Katy Carroll, 1657 BlaMor Lane, Lewisville, NC, Owner, was affirmed for testimony and spoke in support of the application. George Bryan, 1326 Glade Street, Winston-Salem, NC, Neighbor, was affirmed for testimony and spoke in support of the application.

Speaking in Opposition of the Application: None.

## COMMISSION DISCUSSION

The Commission discussed the application.

## FINDINGS OF FACT

Ms. Haney moved that based upon the evidence presented in the application and during the hearing, the Forsyth County Historic Resources Commission finds that the proposed project is not incongruous with the character of the West End Historic Overlay District because:

- 1) The exterior cladding on the house was a mix of wooden weatherboards and T1-11 plywood sheeting, with wooden shakes on the bay projecting over the entry porch. The cladding and trim elements were water damaged and rotten in areas. Termites had also damaged the cladding and structural members. The wooden cladding was replaced with wood-grain, fiber-cement lapped siding with fiber-cement shakes at the projecting bay. Damaged trim pieces were replaced with composite and fiber cement trim to match the existing dimensions and profiles. The bead board ceiling was replaced in-kind. All siding and trim was painted, consistent with the original exterior finish. (*Wood, Guidelines 2, 3, and 5*)
- 2) Two side doors were replaced, one at the second floor on the left side and one at the first floor on the right side. The main entry door, which was installed in the 1980s and is damaged on the interior from cigarette smoke and resident cats, was also replaced. The single-leaf replacement doors are simple – two recessed panels surmounted by six lights. The replacement doors are consistent in design, location, size, pane and panel configuration, trim, detail, style and material with the building and West End. (*Fenestration: Windows and Doors, Guidelines 5 and 9*)
- 3) The replacement stairs to the second floor and new stairs to the rear yard are both designed to allow safe access to areas of the building for tenants. Both sets of painted, pressure-treated wood stairs are located inconspicuously on side facades, and neither obscures or damages any character defining features. The stairs are compatible in scale, materials, detail, and finish with the building. They are a reversible installation and could be removed without damage to the building or porch. (*Safety, Accessibility, and Code Requirements, Guidelines 2-5*)
- 4) The roof shape, lines, and pitch were retained and restored, including the removal of the addition that sat on top of the entry porch roof. The roof was repaired by reinforcing undersized and damaged rafters and replacing rotten sheeting. The dark gray architectural shingles are an appropriate material with which to clad the roof. (*Roofs, Guidelines 1, 2, and 4*)
- 5) The removal of a nonoriginal deck and access door on the rear of the building has no impact on its historic character. Further, the roof on which the deck sat was not designed or constructed to support such a load, so its removal aids in the preservation of the building. (*Decks and Patios, Guideline 1; Fenestration: Windows and Doors, Guideline 15*)

- 6) The existing chimney masonry was repaired, and a solid cap was placed over it to prevent water infiltration. A small cricket was constructed behind the chimney to encourage water runoff and decrease the damaging impact of water infiltration. (*Roofs, Guideline 5*)

Second: Mr. Idol  
Vote: Unanimous

### CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS

Mr. Idol moved that based on the preceding findings, the Forsyth County Historic Resources Commission hereby approves COA2020-070 at the Harry L. Shaner House, located at 240 North Sunset Drive, within the West End Historic Overlay District (PIN 6825-65-5998.00).

Second: Ms. Pegram  
Vote: Unanimous

### III. **MINOR WORK REPORT (Enclosed in Commission Member Packets)**

### IV. **OTHER APPLICATIONS AND NOMINATIONS**

- A. Public Hearing for West End Historic Overlay Design Review Standards

### PUBLIC COMMENT

Victoria Roemer, 821 West End Boulevard, Neighbor, Winston-Salem, NC

John Merschel, 675 North Main Street, West End Association, Winston-Salem, NC

Ms. Berry moved that the Commission adopt the revised West End Historic Overlay District Design Review Standards effective July 2, 2020, as presented with the staff revisions stated during the meeting except for adding artificial mulch to Standard 2 in the Landscape Features section.

Second: Mr. Idol  
Vote: Unanimous

### V. **COMMITTEE REPORTS**

- A. Historic Marker Committee – No New Business
- B. Education Committee – No New Business

### VI. **STAFF REPORT**

### VII. **FOR THE GOOD OF THE ORDER**

***NEXT MEETING: August 5, 2020***

This agenda is available in alternative media forms for people with disabilities. Individuals with disabilities who require assistance or special arrangements to participate in programs and activities of the Historic Resources Commission are encouraged to contact the Planning Department at least 72 hours in advance so that proper accommodations can be arranged. For information, call 336-727-8000 (727-8319 TTY).