



Minutes
Forsyth County
Historic Resources Commission
September 2, 2020
4:00 P.M.
City Hall Council Chamber, Room 230
101 North Main Street, Winston-Salem

MEMBERS PRESENT: Kaky Berry, Chad Gadberry, Ted Guenther, C.J. Idol, Kevin Owen (Chair),
LeAnn Pegram, Tina Thacker

MEMBERS ABSENT: Donna Abernethy, Emma Haney, Alanna Meltzer-Holderfield, Janet Shill,
Sunny Stewart

STAFF PRESENT: Heather Bratland; Michelle McCullough; David Reed
Attorney Jerry Kontos

I. APPROVAL OF MINUTES

A. Approval of August 5, 2020 Minutes

Motion: Ms. Thacker moved approval of the August 5, 2020 minutes.

Second: Mr. Idol

Vote: Unanimous

II. CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS APPLICATIONS

- A. Jeff Soriano
923 West End Boulevard, Winston-Salem
James House
West End Historic Overlay District #390
Contributing
Request: Fence installation
COA2020-091

Staff Comments: Ms. Bratland presented the staff report. She also presented a map showing the location of the property and photographs of the property.

Staff Finding

Commission staff finds that the project is not incongruous with the character of the West End Historic Overlay District because:

- 1) The fence is located in an area of high visibility, along First Street in the side yard in front of the rear plane of the house. The fence minimizes its impact on the District and property by being set

back from First Street, behind a broad strip of vegetation. It is, nevertheless, low enough that it does not block the view of the James House from First Street. The topography of the site ensures that the house remains visible, as it sits significantly higher than the First Street sidewalk. The unarticulated design of the fence is incongruous with the West End. However, the applicant proposed to add two bands of 1"x4" horizontal boards to the First Street side of the fence. This will give the fence additional depth and break up the large, flat expanse of fence into smaller components. (*Fences, West End Standards 2-5*)

Staff Recommendation

Based on the preceding finding, staff recommends that the Commission approve COA2020-091 at the James House, located at 923 West End Boulevard, within the West End Historic Overlay District (PIN 6825-75-1244.00), with the following conditions:

- 1) The applicant shall complete the modifications and paint or stain the fence within six (6) months of issuance of this COA;
- 2) The applicant shall receive, prior to commencement of the work, all other required permits or permissions from governmental agencies;
- 3) Commission staff shall review and approve any revisions or deviations to any portion of the as submitted work, that qualifies as a minor work, prior to commencement of that portion of the project; and,
- 4) The applicant shall submit the Certificate of Appropriateness Request for Certification of Completed Work form and photo documentation of the completed project to HRC staff within ten (10) days of its completion.

Public Comment

Speaking in Favor of the Application: None.

Speaking in Opposition to the Application: John Merschel, 675 North Main Street, Winston-Salem, NC, Citizen, was sworn for testimony and spoke in opposition of the application.

Commission Discussion

The Commission discussed the application and whether it represented a substantial change from COA2019-062 for a fence installation, which was denied on September 4, 2019. C.J. Idol moved that COA2020-091 does represent a substantial change from COA2019-062 and, therefore, should be considered by the Commission.

Second: Mr. Gadberry

Vote: Aye: Ms. Berry; Mr. Gadberry; Mr. Guenther; Mr. Idol; Mr. Owen; Ms. Pegram

Nay: Ms. Thacker

Finding of Fact

Mr. Gadberry moved that based upon the evidence presented in the application and during the hearing, the Forsyth County Historic Resources Commission find that the proposed project is incongruous with the character of the West End Historic Overlay District because:

- 1) Standard 5 has not been met since the fence, as proposed, is not sufficiently articulated, and, therefore, inappropriate given that it is in a side yard adjacent to the street; and
- 2) Standard 3 has not been met since the fence design is not an appropriate style because it is a solid fence, and its level of transparency is not sufficient.

Second: Ms. Berry
Vote: Unanimous

Certificate of Appropriateness

Mr. Idol moved that based on the preceding findings, the Forsyth County Historic Resources Commission not approve application number COA2020-091 and deny a certificate of appropriateness for work at the James House, located 923 West End Boulevard, within the West End Historic Overlay District (PIN 6825-75-1244.00).

Second: Ms. Pegram
Vote: Unanimous

- B. Ash Miller, MLA Design Group
1404 West Northwest Boulevard, Winston-Salem
Hanes Park
West End Historic Overlay District #276
Contributing
Request: Park improvements
COA2020-092

Staff Comments: Ms. Bratland presented the staff report. She also presented a map showing the location of the property and photographs of the property.

Staff Finding

Commission staff finds that the project is not incongruous with the character of the West End Historic Overlay District because:

- 1) The pedestrian light fixtures, bollards, and trash receptacles match the features installed elsewhere in Hanes Park during Phase 1. The designs are compatible with the special character of Hanes Park and the West End. (*Parks, West End Standard 6*)
- 2) The mulch pathways and concrete steps will create formal yet picturesque pedestrian spaces in a section of the park that is currently crossed by dirt pathways worn by vehicular and pedestrian traffic. The curvilinear layout of the pathways is consistent with the historic design of Hanes Park. The pathways will connect the sidewalks outside the park with the bridge across Peters Creek, strengthening a historic connection between the neighborhood and park. The concrete will be tinted to blend it visually with the natural setting and historic concrete in the West End. The mulch and concrete are compatible in appearance and materiality with materials that contribute to the special character of the West End. (*Parks, West End Standards 6 and 7*)
- 3) The stone retaining walls will be constructed of Winding River rounds with a pre-cast concrete cap. The design, colors, and construction methods will match the stone entrance walls that were constructed at other park entrances during Phase 1. The 24"+ high stone retaining walls will mark the pedestrian entrances to the new mulch paths and direct pedestrians to those paths. The new

entrance walls are compatible with the special character of Hanes Park and the West End. (*Parks, West End Standard 6*)

- 4) The new planting beds at the sanitary sewer manholes will improve the character of Hanes Park by screening a modern, incongruous feature of the quadrant. The boundary plantings will work in tandem with the stone walls to reinforce the park's edges and discourage cut-through traffic. The plantings selected are typical for this part of North Carolina and the West End. (*Parks, West End Standard 8*)

Staff Recommendation

Based on the preceding findings, staff recommends that the Commission approve COA2020-092 at Hanes Park, located at 1404 West Northwest Boulevard, within the West End Historic Overlay District (PIN 6825-67-7398.00), with the following conditions:

- 1) The applicant shall receive, prior to commencement of the work, all other required permits or permissions from governmental agencies;
- 2) Commission staff shall review and approve any revisions or deviations to any portion of the submitted work, that qualifies as a minor work, prior to commencement of that portion of the project; and,
- 3) The applicant shall submit the Certificate of Appropriateness Request for Certification of Completed Work form and photo documentation of the completed project to HRC staff within ten (10) days of its completion.

Public Comment

Speaking in Favor of the Application: Scott Miller, MLA Design Group, 120 Club Oaks Court, Winston-Salem, NC, Landscape Architect, was sworn for testimony and spoke in favor of the application.

Speaking in Opposition to the Application: None.

Commission Discussion

The Commission discussed the application.

Finding of Fact

Ms. Thacker moved that based upon the evidence presented in the application and during the hearing, the Forsyth County Historic Resources Commission finds that the proposed project is not incongruous with the character of the West End Historic Overlay District because:

- 1) The pedestrian light fixtures, bollards, and trash receptacles match the features installed elsewhere in Hanes Park during Phase 1. The designs are compatible with the special character of Hanes Park and the West End. (*Parks, West End Standard 6*)
- 2) The mulch pathways and concrete steps will create formal yet picturesque pedestrian spaces in a section of the park that is currently crossed by dirt pathways worn by vehicular and pedestrian traffic. The curvilinear layout of the pathways is consistent with the historic design of Hanes Park. The pathways will connect the sidewalks outside the park with the bridge across Peters Creek, strengthening a historic connection between the neighborhood and park. The concrete will be tinted to blend it visually with the natural setting and historic concrete in the West End. The mulch

and concrete are compatible in appearance and materiality with materials that contribute to the special character of the West End. (*Parks, West End Standards 6 and 7*)

- 3) The stone retaining walls will be constructed of Winding River rounds with a pre-cast concrete cap. The design, colors, and construction methods will match the stone entrance walls that were constructed at other park entrances during Phase 1. The 24"+ high stone retaining walls will mark the pedestrian entrances to the new mulch paths and direct pedestrians to those paths. The new entrance walls are compatible with the special character of Hanes Park and the West End. (*Parks, West End Standard 6*)
- 4) The new planting beds at the sanitary sewer manholes will improve the character of Hanes Park by screening a modern, incongruous feature of the quadrant. The boundary plantings will work in tandem with the stone walls to reinforce the park's edges and discourage cut-through traffic. The plantings selected are typical for this part of North Carolina and the West End. (*Parks, West End Standard 8*)

Second: Mr. Idol
Vote: Unanimous

Certificate of Appropriateness

Mr. Guenther moved that based on the preceding findings, the Forsyth County Historic Resources Commission hereby approves COA2020-092 at Hanes Park, located at 1404 West Northwest Boulevard, within the West End Historic Overlay District (PIN 6825-67-7398.00), with the following conditions:

- 1) The applicant shall receive, prior to commencement of the work, all other required permits or permissions from governmental agencies;
- 2) Commission staff shall review and approve any revisions or deviations to any portion of the as submitted work, that qualifies as a minor work, prior to commencement of that portion of the project; and,
- 3) The applicant shall submit the Certificate of Appropriateness Request for Certification of Completed Work form and photo documentation of the completed project to HRC staff within ten (10) days of its completion.

Second: Mr. Berry
Vote: Unanimous

C. Michelle Mitchell LLC
Northeast corner of Spring and Sixth Streets, Winston-Salem
Greenspace
West End Historic Overlay District #41
Noncontributing
**Request: Construction of a duplex
COA2020-093**

Staff Comments: Ms. Bratland presented the staff report. She also presented a map showing the location of the property and photographs of the property.

Staff Finding

Commission staff finds that the project is not incongruous with the character of the West End Historic Overlay District because:

- 1) The duplex is sited with a covered porch and single, central entrance facing Spring Street. It is located in the center of the lot with a standard setback. These aspects of its siting are consistent with the lot development pattern along Spring Street. A one-car wide, integrally-tinted concrete driveway will lead straight to the rear of the lot, where an asphalt residential parking lot will be located in an area of low visibility. The parking lot will be screened around three sides with vegetation. The lot slopes down toward the rear, which will be addressed with a taller foundation toward the rear of the duplex, rather than significant grading. A stone retaining wall that runs parallel to the southern property line will remain as is. (*New Construction, West End Standards 1 and 2; Driveways and Parking Areas, West End Standards 4-7*)
- 2) The two-story, five-bay rectilinear street façade of the duplex is consistent with Spring Street's contributing buildings in terms of its height, form, size, scale, massing, proportion, and roof form. All but two of the contributing houses in this block of Spring Street are two stories in height. Its simple rectangular form, size, scale, and proportions are similar to other Colonial Revival buildings on the block. The eclectic combination of Colonial Revival forms and fenestration patterns with Craftsman porch details is demonstrated in the neighboring J.J. Gentry House. Hipped roofs are found commonly throughout the West End. The use of historic forms and details is compatible with the District, while the use of modern materials differentiates the building as a new feature. (*New Construction, West End Standards 4 and 8*)
- 3) The wooden, six-panel door with sidelights and the six-over-six, simulated divided light wood windows with permanently applied exterior muntins and wooden shutters are compatible in material, proportion, pattern, and detail with the windows and doors of contributing buildings in the West End. The symmetrical fenestration pattern also follows traditional Colonial Revival patterns in terms of spacing, placement, scale, orientation, proportion, and size. (*New Construction, West End Standards 5 and 6*)
- 4) The roof will be clad with architectural shingles in Estate Gray. The walls will be clad with smooth-finished HardiePlank lap siding, with staggered edge HardieShingles in the porch pediment. The foundation will be clad with standard modular bricks. Porch lattice, sawn balustrades, tongue-and-groove flooring, and posts will be constructed of wood, as will the windows, doors, and shutters. The materials and finishes are consistent with surrounding buildings in composition, scale, module, pattern, detail, texture, and finish. (*New Construction, West End Standard 7*)

Staff Recommendation

Based on the preceding findings, staff recommends that the Commission approve COA2020-093 at the Greenspace located at the northeast corner of Spring and West Sixth Streets, within the West End Historic Overlay District (PIN 6825-97-8806.00), with the following conditions:

- 1) The applicant shall receive, prior to commencement of the work, all other required permits or permissions from governmental agencies;
- 2) Commission staff shall review and approve any revisions or deviations to any portion of the as submitted work, that qualifies as a minor work, prior to commencement of that portion of the project; and,
- 3) The applicant shall submit the Certificate of Appropriateness Request for Certification of Completed Work form and photo documentation of the completed project to HRC staff within ten (10) days of its completion.

Public Comment

Speaking in Favor of the Application: Henneh Kahn, Michelle Mitchell LLC, Post Office Box 21387, Winston-Salem, NC, Project Manager, was sworn for testimony and spoke in support of the application. John Merschel, 675 North Main Street, Winston-Salem, NC, West End Association, was sworn for testimony and spoke in support of the application.

Speaking in Opposition to the Application: None

Commission Discussion

The Commission discussed the application.

Finding of Fact

Mr. Idol moved that based upon the evidence presented in the application and during the hearing, the Forsyth County Historic Resources Commission finds that the proposed project is not incongruous with the character of the West End Historic Overlay District because:

- 1) The duplex is sited with a covered porch and single, central entrance facing Spring Street. It is located in the center of the lot with a standard setback. These aspects of its siting are consistent with the lot development pattern along Spring Street. A one-car wide, integrally-tinted concrete driveway will lead straight to the rear of the lot, where an asphalt residential parking lot will be located in an area of low visibility. The parking lot will be screened around three sides with vegetation. The lot slopes down toward the rear, which will be addressed with a taller foundation toward the rear of the duplex, rather than significant grading. A stone retaining wall that runs parallel to the southern property line will remain as is. (*New Construction*, West End Standards 1 and 2; *Driveways and Parking Areas*, West End Standards 4-7)
- 2) The two-story, five-bay rectilinear street façade of the duplex is consistent with Spring Street's contributing buildings in terms of its height, form, size, scale, massing, proportion, and roof form. All but two of the contributing houses in this block of Spring Street are two stories in height. Its simple rectangular form, size, scale, and proportions are similar to other Colonial Revival buildings on the block. The eclectic combination of Colonial Revival forms and fenestration patterns with Craftsman porch details is demonstrated in the neighboring J.J. Gentry House. Hipped roofs are found commonly throughout the West End. The use of historic forms and details is compatible with the District, while the use of modern materials differentiates the building as a new feature. (*New Construction*, West End Standards 4 and 8)
- 3) The wooden, six-panel door with sidelights and the six-over-six, simulated divided light wood windows with permanently applied exterior muntins and wooden shutters are compatible in material, proportion, pattern, and detail with the windows and doors of contributing buildings in the West End. The symmetrical fenestration pattern also follows traditional Colonial Revival patterns in terms of spacing, placement, scale, orientation, proportion, and size. (*New Construction*, West End Standards 5 and 6)
- 4) The roof will be clad with architectural shingles in Estate Gray. The walls will be clad with smooth-finished HardiePlank lap siding, with staggered edge HardieShingles in the porch pediment. The foundation will be clad with standard modular bricks. Porch lattice, sawn balustrades, tongue-and-groove flooring, and posts will be constructed of wood, as will the windows, doors, and shutters. The materials and finishes are consistent with surrounding buildings in composition, scale, module, pattern, detail, texture, and finish. (*New Construction*, West End Standard 7)

Second: Mr. Gadberry

Vote: Unanimous

Certificate of Appropriateness

Ms. Berry moved that based on the preceding findings, the Forsyth County Historic Resources Commission hereby approves COA2020-093 at the Greenspace, located at the northeast corner of Spring and West Sixth Streets, within the West End Historic Overlay District (PIN 6825-97-8806.00), with the following conditions:

- 1) The applicant shall receive, prior to commencement of the work, all other required permits or permissions from governmental agencies;
- 2) Commission staff shall review and approve any revisions or deviations to any portion of the submitted work, that qualifies as a minor work, prior to commencement of that portion of the project; and,
- 3) The applicant shall submit the Certificate of Appropriateness Request for Certification of Completed Work form and photo documentation of the completed project to HRC staff within ten (10) days of its completion.

Second: Mr. Guenther

Vote: Unanimous

D. Robert Falkowski
1519 Jarvis Street, Winston-Salem
House
West End Historic Overlay District #572
Noncontributing
**Request: After-the-fact vinyl window and siding installation
COA2020-094**

Staff Comments: Ms. Bratland presented the staff report. She also presented a map showing the location of the property and photographs of the property.

Staff Finding

Commission staff finds that the project is incongruous with the character of the West End Historic Overlay District because:

- 1) Vinyl windows with grids between the glass are not appropriate in areas of high visibility. The windows in areas of high visibility must be either true divided light windows or simulated divided light windows with permanently applied interior and exterior muntins. (*Noncontributing Structures*, West End Standard 1; *Windows and Doors*, West End Standard 6)
- 2) While it is possible that asbestos shingle was the original exterior cladding material, the boxed in eaves and enclosure of the left side porch indicate that the House had been re-clad sometime prior to the 1980s. Given the prevalence and relatively low cost of wooden clapboards, they were most likely originally used to clad the House. Removal of the vinyl siding and asbestos shingle to expose the clapboard is appropriate. The applicant has not shown that this is not feasible. Moreover, the applicant has not shown that using new wood clapboard is not feasible, which is necessary for the Commission to consider the use of a substitute material. (*Noncontributing Structures*, West End Standard 1; *Wood*, West End Standards 4 and 5)

Staff Recommendation

Based on the preceding findings, staff recommends that the Commission deny COA2020-094 at the House located at 1519 Jarvis Street, within the West End Historic Overlay District (PIN 6825-64-9591.00).

Public Comment

Speaking in Favor of the Application: Robert Falkowski, 1383 Glen Oaks, Clemmons, NC, Owner, was sworn for testimony and spoke in support of the application. Michael Falkowski, 3710 Ashlawn Court, Apartment J, Winston-Salem, NC, Property Manager, was sworn for testimony and spoke in support of the application.

Speaking in Opposition to the Application: John Merschel, 675 North Main Street, Winston-Salem, NC, West End Association, was sworn for testimony and spoke in opposition of the application.

Commission Discussion

The Commission discussed the application.

Finding of Fact

Ms. Thacker moved that based upon the evidence presented in the application and during the hearing, the Forsyth County Historic Resources Commission finds that the proposed project is incongruous with the character of the West End Historic Overlay District because:

- 1) Vinyl windows with grids between the glass are not appropriate in areas of high visibility. The windows in areas of high visibility must be either true divided light windows or simulated divided light windows with permanently applied interior and exterior muntins. (*Noncontributing Structures*, West End Standard 1; *Windows and Doors*, West End Standard 6)
- 2) While it is possible that asbestos shingle was the original exterior cladding material, the boxed in eaves and enclosure of the left side porch indicate that the House had been re-clad sometime prior to the 1980s. Given the prevalence and relatively low cost of wooden clapboards, they were most likely originally used to clad the House. Removal of the vinyl siding and asbestos shingle to expose the clapboard is appropriate. The applicant has not shown that this is not feasible. Moreover, the applicant has not shown that using new wood clapboard is not feasible, which is necessary for the Commission to consider the use of a substitute material. (*Noncontributing Structures*, West End Standard 1; *Wood*, West End Standards 4 and 5)

Second: Mr. Idol

Vote: Unanimous

Certificate of Appropriateness

Ms. Thacker moved that based on the preceding findings, the Forsyth County Historic Resources Commission hereby denies COA2020-094 at the House located at 1519 Jarvis Street, within the West End Historic Overlay District (PIN 6825-64-9591.00).

Second: Mr. Idol

Vote: Unanimous

III. **MINOR WORK REPORT (Enclosed in Commission Member Packets)**

IV. **OTHER APPLICATIONS AND NOMINATIONS**

A. Local Historic Landmark Application
1. Bowman and Elizabeth Gray House

Staff Comments: Ms. McCullough presented the staff report. She also presented a map showing the location of the property and photographs of the property.

Motion: Ms. Pegram moved to recommend the Bowman and Elizabeth Gray House for designation as a Local Historic Landmark.

Second: Ms. Berry

Vote: Unanimous

V. **COMMITTEE REPORTS**

- A. Historic Marker Committee – No New Business
- B. Education Committee – No New Business

VI. **STAFF REPORT**

Michelle reminded the Commission to send emails notifying her when trainings have been completed as CLG reports will be sent out this month.

Michelle received notice from the State Historic Preservation Office that a CLG grant was received to complete the third phase of the architectural survey in the county and small towns. Staff is working with state and county to get the contracts completed. The second phase has been delayed due to COVID.

The director of Bethabara Park has taken a position at Old Salem, and Bethabara Park is going through the interview process to find a new director. Bethabara did not receive the grant they had applied for because there is no executive director in place.

Michelle stated that HRC is going all digital and that the Commission has received their last mail packet this month.

VII. **FOR THE GOOD OF THE ORDER**

NEXT MEETING: October 7, 2020

This agenda is available in alternative media forms for people with disabilities. Individuals with disabilities who require assistance or special arrangements to participate in programs and activities of the Historic Resources Commission are encouraged to contact the Planning Department at least 72 hours in advance so that proper accommodations can be arranged. For information, call 336-727-8000 (727-8319 TTY).