



Minutes
Forsyth County
Historic Resources Commission
October 7, 2020
4:00 P.M.
City Hall Council Chamber, Room 230
101 North Main Street, Winston-Salem

MEMBERS PRESENT: Kaky Berry, Chad Gadberry, Emma Haney, C.J. Idol, LeAnn Pegram, Janet Shill, Tina Thacker

MEMBERS ABSENT: Donna Abernethy, Ted Guenther, Alanna Meltzer-Holderfield, Kevin Owen, Sunny Stewart

STAFF PRESENT: Heather Bratland; Michelle McCullough; David Reed
Attorney Jerry Kontos

The meeting was opened by staff member Michelle McCullough who asked for a nomination for acting chair for the October 7, 2020 meeting.

Motion: Ms. Thacker moved to nominate Kaky Berry as acting chair for the October 7 meeting.

Second: Mr. Idol

Vote: Unanimous

Ms. Berry called the meeting to order at approximately 4:05 p.m.

I. APPROVAL OF MINUTES

A. Approval of September 2, 2020 Minutes

Motion: Ms. Pegram moved approval of the September 2, 2020 minutes.

Second: Mr. Idol

Vote: Unanimous

II. CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS APPLICATIONS

A. Jerome Charles, Gabella Real Estate Holdings LLC
146 Piedmont Avenue, Winston-Salem
W.R. James House
West End Historic Overlay District #504
Contributing
Request: After-the-fact fence installation
COA2020-100

Staff Comments: Ms. Bratland presented the staff report. She also presented a map showing the location of the property and photographs of the property.

STAFF FINDING

Commission staff finds that the project is incongruous with the character of the West End Historic Overlay District because:

- 1) The fence is located in an area of low visibility, a rear yard not adjacent to the street. The fence is a 6'-high, articulated solid fence. The fence is constructed of PVC, which is not included in the list of appropriate materials for fences located in areas of low visibility. The fence is incongruous with the special character of the property and District. The fence does not minimize its impact on the special character of the property and District. (*Fences*, West End Standards 2, 4, and 5)

STAFF RECOMMENDATION

Based on the preceding finding, staff recommends that the Commission deny COA2020-100 at the W.R. James House located at 146 Piedmont Avenue, within the West End Historic Overlay District (PIN 6825-74-6601.00).

PUBLIC COMMENT

Speaking in Favor of the Application: Jerome Charles, 1330 Kendallwood Drive, Kernersville, NC, Owner, was affirmed for testimony and spoke in favor of the application. Antoinette Charles, 1330 Kendallwood Drive, Kernersville, NC, Owner, was affirmed for testimony and spoke in favor of the application.

Speaking in Opposition to the Application: John Merschel, 675 North Main Street, Winston-Salem, NC, West End Association Full Board, was affirmed for testimony and spoke in opposition of the application.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION

The Commission discussed the application.

FINDING OF FACT

Ms. Thacker, moved that based upon the evidence presented in the application and during the hearing, the Forsyth County Historic Resources Commission finds that the proposed project is incongruous with the character of the West End Historic Overlay District because:

- 1) The fence is located in an area of low visibility, a rear yard not adjacent to the street. The fence is a 6'-high, articulated solid fence. The fence is constructed of PVC, which is not included in the list of appropriate materials for fences located in areas of low visibility. The fence is incongruous with the special character of the property and District. The fence does not minimize its impact on the special character of the property and District. (*Fences*, West End Standards 2, 4, and 5)

Second: Ms. Shill

Vote:

For: Kaky Berry, Emma Haney, LeAnn Pegram, Janet Shill, Tina Thacker

Against: Chad Gadberry, CJ Idol

CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS

Ms. Shill moved that based on the preceding finding, the Forsyth County Historic Resources Commission hereby denies COA2020-100 at the W.R. James House located at 146 Piedmont Avenue, within the West End Historic Overlay District (PIN 6825-74-6601.00).

Second: Ms. Pegram

Vote:

For: Kaky Berry, Emma Haney, LeAnn Pegram, Janet Shill, Tina Thacker

Against: Chad Gadberry, CJ Idol
B. Michael Steuart
901 West Fourth Street, Winston-Salem
Zevely House
Local Historic Landmark #13
West End Historic Overlay District #153
Contributing
**Request: Enclosure of attached patio
COA2020-103**

Staff Comments: Ms. McCullough presented the staff report. She also presented a map showing the location of the property and photographs of the property.

STAFF FINDINGS

Commission staff finds that the work is not incongruous with the character of the Landmark and District because:

- 1) The proposed work includes enclosing the existing covered 60'x 80' patio with wood 10-lite French doors with transoms which will act as walls, and 1'x 6' cedar planks at the two fireplace locations on the west elevation to match the gable ends. The wood will be painted to match the historic building. The patio is attached to the historic building at the kitchen addition by a covered connector. This connector is open-air and will not be altered during this project. The enclosure will not destroy any historic materials, features, or spatial relationships that characterize the property. The new work is differentiated from the historic building because it is physically separated by a connector that connects the noncontributing kitchen addition to the covered patio. The proposed enclosure walls are built to be transparent, with 10-lite French doors. The enclosure is compatible with the historic materials, features, size scale, and proportions of the Landmark, protecting the integrity of the property and its environment. (*Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation, Standard #9*)
- 2) The proposed work is not specifically addressed in any of the Standards in the Entrances, Porches, Enclosures, and Balconies section of the *West End Historic Overlay District Design Review Standards*. However, the enclosure of the existing porch is not incongruous with the special character of the District. (*Entrances, Porches, Enclosures, and Balconies, West End Standard 14*)
- 3) The proposed project encloses an existing covered patio that is connected to the kitchen addition of the Zevely House. The work will not affect or cover any features that contribute to the overall historic character of the building, nor will it remove any historic detail or feature. (*Porches, Entrances, Balconies, and Enclosures, Landmark Guidelines 1 and 2; Entrances, Porches, Enclosures, and Balconies, West End Standards 1, 9, 10, and 11*)

STAFF RECOMMENDATION

Based on the preceding findings, staff recommends that the Commission approve COA2020-103 at the Zevely House, located at 901 West Fourth Street, Local Historic Landmark #13, in the West End Historic Overlay District (PIN# 6825-86-5790.00), with the following conditions:

- 1) The applicant shall receive, prior to commencement of the work, all other required permits or permissions from governmental agencies;
- 2) Commission staff shall review and approve any revisions or deviations to any portion of the as-submitted work, that qualifies as a minor work, prior to commencement of that portion of the project; and,
- 3) The applicant shall submit the Certificate of Appropriateness Request for Certification of Completed Work form and photo documentation of the completed project to HRC staff within ten (10) days of its completion.

PUBLIC COMMENT

Speaking in Favor of the Application: Freddy Lee, 901 West Fourth Street, Winston-Salem, NC, owner, was affirmed for testimony and spoke in support of the application.

Speaking in Opposition to the Application: None

COMMISSION DISCUSSION

The Commission discussed the application.

FINDINGS OF FACT

Ms. Haney moved that based upon the evidence presented in the application and during the hearing, the Forsyth County Historic Resources Commission finds that the proposed project is not incongruous with the character of the West End Historic Overlay District and the Local Historic Landmark because:

- 1) The proposed work includes enclosing the existing covered 60'x 80' patio with wood 10-lite French doors with transoms which will act as walls, and 1'x 6' cedar planks at the two fireplace locations on the west elevation to match the gable ends. The wood will be painted to match the historic building. The patio is attached to the historic building at the kitchen addition by a covered connector. This connector is open-air and will not be altered during this project. The enclosure will not destroy any historic materials, features, or spatial relationships that characterize the property. The new work is differentiated from the historic building because it is physically separated by a connector that connects the noncontributing kitchen addition to the covered patio. The proposed enclosure walls are built to be transparent, with 10-lite French doors. The enclosure is compatible with the historic materials, features, size scale, and proportions of the Landmark, protecting the integrity of the property and its environment. (*Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation*, Standard #9)
- 2) The proposed work is not specifically addressed in any of the Standards in the Entrances, Porches, Enclosures, and Balconies section of the *West End Historic Overlay District Design Review Standards*. However, the enclosure of the existing porch is not incongruous with the special character of the District. (*Entrances, Porches, Enclosures, and Balconies*, West End Standard 14)
- 3) The proposed project encloses an existing covered patio that is connected to the kitchen addition of the Zevely House. The work will not affect or cover any features that contribute to the overall historic character of the building, nor will it remove any historic detail or feature. (Porches, Entrances, Balconies, and Enclosures, Landmark Guidelines 1 and 2; Entrances, Porches, Enclosures, and Balconies, West End Standards 1, 9, 10, and 11)

Second: Mr. Gadberry
Vote: Unanimous

CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS

Ms. Shill moved that based on the preceding findings, the Forsyth County Historic Resources Commission hereby approves COA2020-103 at the Zevely House, located at 901 West Fourth Street, Local Historic Landmark #13, in the West End Historic Overlay District (PIN# 6825-86-5790.00), with the following conditions:

- 1) The applicant shall receive, prior to commencement of the work, all other required permits or permissions from governmental agencies;

- 2) Commission staff shall review and approve any revisions or deviations to any portion of the as submitted work, that qualifies as a minor work, prior to commencement of that portion of the project; and,
- 3) The applicant shall submit the Certificate of Appropriateness Request for Certification of Completed Work form and photo documentation of the completed project to HRC staff within ten (10) days of its completion.

Second: Mr. Idol
Vote: Unanimous

III. MINOR WORK REPORT

IV. COMMITTEE REPORTS

- A. Historic Marker Committee
 1. Fall marker social media campaign
 2. Marker application deadline – October 31, 2020

- B. Education Committee – No New Business

Motion: Mr. Idol moved to recess the meeting until 5:00 p.m.
Second: Mr. Gadberry
Vote: Unanimous

(Recess taken until 5:00 p.m.)

V. OTHER APPLICATIONS AND NOMINATIONS

- A. Environmental Review Public Hearing
 1. First Street Bridge Replacement

The following staff and consultants presented plans for the First Street Bridge Replacement:
Alan Temple, City of Winston-Salem Engineering Department
Anne Lenart-Redmond, STV Senior Planner
Jason Griscom, STV Project Manager/Designer
Debbie Bevin, RGA Architectural Historian

Members of the Commission made comments on the proposed plans for the First Street Bridge.

Judy Baylin and Mark Hibbett, affected property owners, asked questions and supplied comments on the proposed bridge plans.

The Consultants will take the comments and include them in their final report to the North Carolina State Historic Preservation Office as part of the Section 106 Review of the First Street Bridge Project.

II. STAFF REPORT

III. FOR THE GOOD OF THE ORDER

The homes of the Kernersville History Museum is open for tours. If anyone wants to go, please contact Mr. Idol so that he can get a head count of how many the museum could expect.

NEXT MEETING: November 4, 2020

This agenda is available in alternative media forms for people with disabilities. Individuals with disabilities who require assistance or special arrangements to participate in programs and activities of the Historic Resources Commission are encouraged to contact the Planning Department at least 72 hours in advance so that proper accommodations can be arranged. For information, call 336-727-8000 (727-8319 TTY).