



Minutes
Forsyth County Historic Resources Commission
November 1, 2023
4:00 p.m.
Bryce A. Stuart Municipal Building
Arnold G. King Public Meeting Room, 5th Floor
100 East First Street, Winston-Salem

MEMBERS PRESENT: Kaky Berry, Chair; Scott Binkley; Edwin Bouldin; Chad Gadberry; Jon Hanna; Chenita Johnson; Veronica Kromm; Spencer McCall; Noah Reynolds

MEMBERS ABSENT: C.J. Idol, Vice-Chair; Nicole Townsend-Green

STAFF PRESENT: Heather Bratland; Michelle McCullough; Deputy City Attorney Jerry Kontos

Chair Berry called the meeting to order at 4:00 p.m.

I. APPROVAL OF MINUTES

A. Approval of October 4, 2023, Meeting Minutes

MOTION by Mr. Bouldin to approve the October 4, 2023, minutes.

SECOND: Ms. Johnson

Vote: Unanimous

II. CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS APPLICATIONS

A. Brittany McGee, Applicant
1003 Brookstown Avenue, Winston-Salem
Commercial Building
West End Historic Overlay District #285
Noncontributing
Request: After-the-fact installation of signage
COA2023-111

Staff Comments

Ms. Bratland presented the staff report. She also presented a map showing the location of the property and photographs of the property.

Staff Findings

Commission staff finds that the project is not incongruous with the character of the West End Historic Overlay District because:

- 1) The noncontributing building was built by contractor I.L. Long in 1948 for W.H. Dillon, owner of the Toddle House Restaurant on the corner of Brookstown Avenue and West Fourth Street. It has no special architectural or historical significance. (*Noncontributing Structures*, West End Standard 3)
- 2) The applicant proposes to paint a sign that says "THE humble bee SHOPPE" with flanking stars and macarons above the first-floor storefront. The letters and images will be painted onto the building in multiple colors. The masonry building is stucco-coated and painted. Painted wall signs are appropriate on purpose-built commercial buildings. The design of the sign will be integral to the building and site. The sign will be compatible with the size, scale, and design of the building. It will not conceal, obscure, damage, or destroy any significant architectural features, and it will not block streetscape views. The sign will be removable. (*Signage*, West End Standards 1, 2, 4, 11, 15)

Staff Recommendation

Based on the preceding findings, staff recommends that the Commission approve COA2023-111 at 1003 Brookstown Avenue (PIN 6825-86-7501) within the West End Historic Overlay District.

Public Comment

Speaking in Favor of the Application: Brittany McGee, 1003 Brookstown Avenue, Winston-Salem, owner of the business.

Speaking in Opposition to the Application: None.

Commission Discussion

Chair Berry closed the public hearing. The Commission discussed the application.

Commission Motion

Ms. Kromm moved that the following Order be entered in COA2023-111:

On November 1, 2023, the Forsyth County Historic Resources Commission (“Commission”) conducted, in the above referenced matter, a public hearing in accordance with the statutes and case law pertaining to quasi-judicial proceedings for the issuance of certificates of appropriateness. During the hearing, Heather Bratland, Historic Resources Officer, presented the staff report, findings, and recommendation. Brittany McGee, applicant, appeared to present testimony and evidence in support of the application. No one appeared to present testimony and evidence in opposition to the application.

After presentation of all testimony and evidence, the Forsyth County Historic Resources Commission, based upon the evidence presented in the application and during the hearing, finds that the proposed work is not incongruous with the character of the West End Historic Overlay District because:

- 1) The noncontributing building was built by contractor I.L. Long in 1948 for W.H. Dillon, owner of the Toddle House Restaurant on the corner of Brookstown Avenue and West Fourth Street. It has no special architectural or historical significance. (*Noncontributing Structures*, West End Standard 3)
- 2) The applicant proposes to paint a sign that says “THE humble bee SHOPPE” with flanking stars and macarons above the first-floor storefront. The letters and images will be painted onto the building in multiple colors. The masonry building is stucco-coated and painted. Painted wall signs are appropriate on purpose-built commercial buildings. The design of the sign will be integral to the building and site. The sign will be compatible with the size, scale, and design of the building. It will not conceal, obscure, damage, or destroy any significant architectural features, and it will not block streetscape views. The sign will be removable. (*Signage*, West End Standards 1, 2, 4, 11, 15)

Based on the preceding findings, the Forsyth County Historic Resources Commission hereby approves COA2023-111 at 1003 Brookstown Avenue (PIN 6825-86-7501) within the West End Historic Overlay District.

SECOND: Mr. McCall
Vote: Unanimous

- B. Adam Spear, Applicant
102 South Cherry Street, Winston-Salem
Rogers House
Local Historic Landmark #40
Request: Installation of signage, lighting, and landscape
COA2023-113

Staff Comments

Ms. McCullough presented the staff report. She also presented a map showing the location of the property and photographs of the property.

Staff Findings

Commission staff finds that the application is not incongruous with the character of the Landmark because:

- 1) The proposed project introduces signage on the new brick wall at the corner of Cherry and First Streets. The signage will be made from a mixed metal alloy in a polished brass color. The signage will read “The Crest – Weddings & Events” including a shield between the “The” and “Crest”. The letters for the words “The Crest” will be 16” high and ½” wide, and the letters for the words “Weddings & Events” will be 7” high by a ¼” wide. The font will be Baskerville. The letters will be attached to the wall with 2” metal rods connecting the back of the letters to the brick wall. The signage is limited to one sign, and it is compatible with the Landmark building and site in terms of

style, time period, design, scale, and color. The sign does not conceal significant architectural features or details. The new sign does not shadow or overpower adjacent structures. (*Signage*, Landmark Standards 4, 5, and 6)

- 2) The proposed project introduces new signage that is removable. (*Signage*, Landmark Standard 7)
- 3) The proposed project introduces three landscape up lights in front of the brick wall to illuminate the signage. The lights are aluminum in a black finish with a 3W, 2700K 38 degree MR 16 LED. The lights are 7.5" high and 2.4" wide. The lighting is compatible with the landmark building and site in terms of materials, design, scale, color, and lighting brightness. Due to the location, quantity, and size of the lights, the impact on the historic character of the landmark building and site is minimized and the historic character of the landmark building and site is not diminished or compromised. (*Signage*, Landmark Standard 7)
- 4) The proposed project introduces 2"- 4" rough cut river rock in the area in front of the brick wall along with a large Tennessee rock that is 3' x 3'. The purpose of the rock is to be an obstacle for vehicles and trucks that run off the road, in an effort to protect the retaining wall. The addition of this landscape material is in a location and configuration that is compatible with the visual, special, and associative characteristics of the landmark's setting. (*Setting*, Landmark Standard 3 and *Site Features and Plantings*, Landmark Standard 8)

Staff Recommendation

Based on the preceding findings, staff recommends that the Commission approve COA2023-113 at 102 South Cherry Street, Winston-Salem (PIN 6835-15-6438) Local Historic Landmark #40 with the following conditions:

- 1) The applicant shall receive, prior to commencement of the work, all other required permits or permissions from governmental agencies;
- 2) Commission staff shall review and approve any revisions or deviations to any portion of the as-submitted work prior to commencement of that portion of the project; and,
- 3) The applicant shall submit the Certificate of Appropriateness Request for Certification of Completed Work form and photo documentation of the completed project to HRC staff within ten (10) days of its completion.

Public Comment

Speaking in Favor of the Application: None.

Speaking in Opposition to the Application: None.

Commission Discussion

Chair Berry closed the public hearing. The Commission discussed the application.

Commission Motion

Mr. Reynolds moved that the following Order be entered in COA2023-113:

On November 1, 2023, the Forsyth County Historic Resources Commission ("Commission") conducted, in the above referenced matter, a public hearing in accordance with the statutes and case law pertaining to quasi-judicial proceedings for the issuance of certificates of appropriateness. During the hearing, Michelle McCullough, Historic Resources Officer, presented the staff report, findings, and recommendation. No one appeared to present testimony and evidence in support of the application. No one appeared to present testimony and evidence in opposition to the application.

After presentation of all testimony and evidence, the Forsyth County Historic Resources Commission, based upon the evidence presented in the application and during the hearing, finds that the proposed work is not incongruous with the character of the Local Historic Landmark because:

- 1) The proposed project introduces signage on the new brick wall at the corner of Cherry and First Streets. The signage will be made from a mixed metal alloy in a polished brass color. The signage will read "The Crest – Weddings & Events" including a shield between the "The" and "Crest". The letters for the words "The Crest" will be 16" high and ½" wide, and the letters for the words "Weddings & Events" will be 7" high by a ¼" wide. The font will be Baskerville. The letters will be attached to the wall with 2" metal rods connecting the back of the letters to the brick wall. The signage is limited to one sign, and it is compatible with the Landmark building and site in terms of style, time period, design, scale, and color. The sign does not conceal significant architectural features or details. The new sign does not shadow or overpower adjacent structures. (*Signage*, Landmark Standards 4, 5, and 6)
- 2) The proposed project introduces new signage that is removable. (*Signage*, Landmark Standard 7)

- 3) The proposed project introduces three landscape up lights in front of the brick wall to illuminate the signage. The lights are aluminum in a black finish with a 3W, 2700K 38 degree MR 16 LED. The lights are 7.5" high and 2.4" wide. The lighting is compatible with the landmark building and site in terms of materials, design, scale, color, and lighting brightness. Due to the location, quantity, and size of the lights, the impact on the historic character of the landmark building and site is minimized and the historic character of the landmark building and site is not diminished or compromised. (*Signage*, Landmark Standard 7)
- 4) The proposed project introduces 2"- 4" rough cut river rock in the area in front of the brick wall along with a large Tennessee rock that is 3' x 3'. The purpose of the rock is to be an obstacle for vehicles and trucks that run off the road, in an effort to protect the retaining wall. The addition of this landscape material is in a location and configuration that is compatible with the visual, special, and associative characteristics of the landmark's setting. (*Setting*, Landmark Standard 3 and *Site Features and Plantings*, Landmark Standard 8)

Based on the preceding findings, the Forsyth County Historic Resources Commission hereby approves COA2023-113 at 102 South Cherry Street, Winston-Salem (PIN 6835-15-6438) Local Historic Landmark #40 with the following conditions:

- 1) The applicant shall receive, prior to commencement of the work, all other required permits or permissions from governmental agencies;
- 2) Commission staff shall review and approve any revisions or deviations to any portion of the as-submitted work prior to commencement of that portion of the project; and,
- 3) The applicant shall submit the Certificate of Appropriateness Request for Certification of Completed Work form and photo documentation of the completed project to HRC staff within ten (10) days of its completion.

SECOND: Mr. McCall
Vote: Unanimous

III. MINOR WORK REPORT

There were no comments on the Minor Work Report.

IV. OTHER NOMINATIONS/PUBLIC HEARINGS

A. Local Historic Landmark nomination review

1. Peter Fetter House
319 South Main Street, Winston-Salem

Ms. McCullough presented the application and report, a map, and photographs of the property.

Staff Comments

Staff has reservations about whether the building holds the requisite special local significance for local historic landmark designation. The application and report detail the history of the site and buildings constructed and changed on the site. However, it does not demonstrate how this 1920 duplex holds special significance over the other duplexes found in the city at that time. Nor does it demonstrate how it being one of the only buildings in Old Salem not to be restored to the period of significance (1766-1856) gives it special significance.

- 1) The changes made in 1920 make the building lack special significance for its 1840 original construction and architecture.

The Old Salem Historic District National Historic Landmark that was updated and approved on December 23, 2016 states:

The Peter Fetter House, Lot 83, ca. 1840 is a contributing building. The ca. 1920 purchase of this house by Walter Hege and his conversion of it into a duplex concealed and modified the original center hall, two-room deep single-family house. Located at the south end of Lot 83 and against the sidewalk, the two-story frame (weatherboard) building with side gable roof (asphalt shingle) has returned eaves and is on a high stuccoed stone foundation. The symmetrically arranged three-bay façade has wide cornice and corner boards and paired four-over-one sash windows with wide casings. Side porches (north and south) have low hip roofs supported by square posts with shingled balustrade. A two-story frame (weatherboard) centered rear ell has a hip roof with an interior chimney.

The remodeling of the house removed front and rear porches, altered fenestration, and adjusted the interior to accommodate two housing units. The house was split in half and a two-story rear ell was added to accommodate a kitchen/pantry and additional bedroom for each unit. With the front entry removed, side porches were added to shelter new entrances. The roof retains interior end brick chimneys (south has lost its corbelled cap), and each upper gable end retains the two six-over-six sash windows at the third floor/attic level.

- 2) Considering the evidence provided that the Peter Fetter House holds special significance because "...it is equally important as one of the most fully realized and intact examples of a 1920s duplex in Winston-Salem, a period character by broader urbanization and growth of duplexes and multifamily housing in the city," staff believes this argument lacks substance and evidence in the report. By 1920 the young city of Winston-Salem was bustling with industrial growth and a variety of housing styles were being constructed to accommodate the influx of new workers in the tobacco, textile, and furniture industries. The duplex, quadruplex, and other multi-family buildings and conversions were found throughout the city at this time. There is no evidence supplied in the report that most or all of these are no longer extant. The current Forsyth County Architectural Survey lists several duplexes in Winston-Salem built in 1920 as still existing. Even if one considers that this maybe the only duplex conversion from an 1840 home in the 1920s, staff does not believe that this creates special significance on the property.
- 3) The application and report state that the Peter Fetter House's special significance is derived from "the unrestored nature of this house therefore its intact early 20th century alteration, represents what was a rather common situation in Salem before the Old Salem, Inc. restoration project began in the 1950s. Few buildings showing this kind of process now remain in this condition in Salem." Unlike many other buildings in the Old Salem Historic District, it is correct the Peter Fetter House was not restored nor planned to be restored by Old Salem Inc., which was established in the 1950s. Old Salem Inc.'s original mission was to preserve and restore Old Salem "as closely as possible to the way it appeared in the early 1800s." (*An Adventure in Historic Preservation* by Frances Griffin, page 21.) The original 1840 Peter Fetter House did fall into the period of significance 1766-1856. Why it was not selected for restoration is unknown at this time, but it may have been because of the large number of changes that were made in the 1920s by Walter Hege and his conversion of it into a duplex, which included concealing and modifying the original center hall, two-room deep single-family house. The remodeling of the house removed front and rear porches, altered fenestration, and adjusted the interior to accommodate two housing units. The house was split in half and a two-story rear ell was added to accommodate a kitchen/pantry and additional bedroom for each unit. The front entry was removed, and side porches were added to shelter new entrances.

Considering that the mission of Old Salem Inc. and the local historic district is still to maintain and encourage restoration of the buildings to the 1766-1856 period of significance, designating a property as a local historic landmark that has not met that goal would contradict the mission of both programs. There are a large number of landmarks in the Old Salem District, most of which were designated because of their restoration or reconstruction to the period of significance, or because of their exceptional architectural style at the time of construction, such as the John Francis Shaffner House.

Also, the Peter Fetter House is currently not a duplex. The interior of the duplex was compromised in 2017 when the interior walls were removed to join the two spaces as one again and installing a new kitchen area. Evidence still exists of how the building was converted into a duplex, however, the return to a single-family house reduces the case for special significance of an intact 1920 duplex.

Staff Recommendation

Staff does not recommend local historic landmark designation of the entire exterior and interior of the Peter Fetter House, along with the entire tax block and lot upon which they sit of Tax Block 0558 Lots 109 and 110 (PIN 6835-24-9526).

Public Comment

Speaking in Favor of the Application: Howard Kelly, 319 South Main Street, Winston-Salem, owner/applicant.

Speaking in Opposition to the Application: None.

Commission Discussion

Chair Berry closed the public hearing. The Commission discussed the application.

Commission Motion

Mr. Reynolds moved that the Commission, having reviewed and discussed the application and report, find that the Peter Fetter House, 319 South Main Street, Winston-Salem, does not meet the criteria for designation as a local historic

landmark and does not have the special significance in terms of its architectural importance; and does not recommend to the Winston-Salem City Council designation of the Peter Fetter House as a Local Historic Landmark.

SECOND: Mr. Gadberry
Vote: Unanimous

V. COMMITTEE REPORTS

A. Historic Marker Committee

1. Next meeting is November 15 at 5:00 p.m.
2. St. Benedict the Moor Catholic Church marker unveiling on November 18 at 10:00 a.m.
1625 East 12th Street, Winston-Salem

Ms. Johnson volunteered to be the HRC speaker at the marker unveiling event. Ms. Berry, Mr. Hanna, and Mr. McCall volunteered to pass out programs and assist with hosting the event.

3. Marker selection at Commission meeting on January 3, 2024

B. Education Committee

1. 75th Anniversary update
 - a. Event date: November 4 at 10:00 a.m. at Home Moravian Church

C. Diversity, Equity, and Inclusion Committee

1. Heritage neighborhoods program proposal
 - a. CD/H/GG Committee meeting on November 13 at 4:00 p.m.

2. Research assignments

<u>HRC Member</u>	<u>Research Topic</u>
Ed Bouldin	Black architects from Forsyth County
C.J. Idol	Coppedge family
Spencer McCall	Black fairs
Chenita Johnson	Murrell family
Nicole Townsend-Green	Contractors from Fries, <i>County on the March</i>

VI. STAFF REPORT

- A. Election of Commission officers on January 3, 2024

VII. FOR THE GOOD OF THE ORDER

NEXT MEETING: December 6, 2023