

# FINAL STAFF REPORT

## February 6, 2019 HRC MEETING

**Case #:** COA2019-007  
**Staff:** Michelle M. McCullough

**Applicant:** James W. Lester and Judy R. Lester  
**Owner:** Same

### **LOCATION**

**Landmark:** Local Historic Landmark #35  
**District:** Old Salem Historic District  
**Building:** Anna Johanna Vogler House  
**Street:** 823 South Church Street

### **REQUEST(S)**

- Replacement of an existing fence in the rear yard with a new fence.

### **APPLICABLE SECTIONS OF DESIGN REVIEW GUIDELINES**

*Forsyth County Design Review Guidelines for Local Historic Landmarks and Old Salem Historic District Guide to the Certificate of Appropriateness (COA) Process Design Review Guidelines*  
**(Please refer to the applicable sections of the *Guidelines* as detailed in the staff comments.)**

### **PROJECT DESCRIPTION/ELEMENTS**

*Please refer to the information provided with the application.*

### **STAFF COMMENTS**

Commission staff finds that the application is not incongruous with the character of the Landmark or District because:

- 1) The proposed plan includes replacing a wood post with wire fence that is installed at the north rear corner of the house extending to the rear of the yard with a wood picket fence similar in design to the existing fence on the south side of the property. This fence is an appropriate style for the rear of the property along the perimeter of the lot. The house was originally next to a commercial shop and would have been considered in the center of town. In the center of Salem, fence styles tended to be more decorative. Picket and board fences tended to be used along the front lot lines along the street while vertical board fencing was used to separate one lot from another. Due to the lack of agriculture at this time and the vacant lot next to the Vogler House, this decorative picket fence is not incongruous with the Landmark or District. (*Fences, Old Salem Guidelines 5 and 6*)
- 2) The Vogler House dates from 1827. The proposed fence will be painted wood, 40" in height,  $\frac{3}{4}$ " thick for pickets, and 2" wide and will be band sawn. It will be properly dimensioned – no less than  $\frac{3}{4}$  inch thick for pickets and no less than 1 inch thick for other fencing boards. The boards and pickets will be affixed with cut nails of the appropriate material. The proposed fence is not incongruous with the building or District. (*Fences, Old Salem Guidelines 8-10*)

- 3) The proposed plan includes replacing a wood post with wire fence that is installed at the north rear corner of the house extending to the rear of the yard with a wood picket fence similar in design to the existing fence on the south side of the property. The location and configuration are compatible with the landmark building and site. The new fence will not obscure, damage, or destroy any original or significant building or structural feature. (*Fences and Walls*, Landmark Guideline 7)
- 4) The proposed new rear fence is wood picket style. The proposed fence will be painted wood, 40" in height, 3/4" thick for pickets, and 2" wide. The design is of traditional materials and a height that is consistent with the heights of other historic fences or walls on the landmark site. (*Fences and Walls*, Landmark Guidelines 8-10)

### **STAFF RECOMMENDATION**

Based on the preceding comments, staff recommends that the Commission grant a COA for the replacement of an existing fence in the rear yard with a new fence at the Anna Johanna Vogler House, Local Historic Landmark #35, located in the Old Salem Historic District, at 823 South Church Street (PIN#: 6835-32-4072), with the following conditions:

- 1) The applicant shall receive, prior to commencement of the work, all other required permits or permissions from governmental agencies;
- 2) Commission staff shall review and approve any revisions or deviations to any portion of the as-submitted work, that qualifies as a minor work, prior to commencement of that portion of the project; and
- 3) The applicant shall submit the *Certificate of Appropriateness Request for Certification of Completed Work* and photo documentation of the completed project to HRC staff within ten (10) days of its completion.