

STAFF REPORT
for
MARCH 6, 2019 HRC MEETING

Case #: COA2019-013
Staff: Heather M. Bratland

Applicant: Hayes Wauford, Wilson-Covington
Owner: H. Kenneth Land

LOCATION

District: West End Historic Overlay District #107
Building: Jacob Lott Ludlow House, Contributing
Street: 434 Summit Street
Local Historic
Landmark#: N/A

REQUEST(S)

- Exterior rehabilitation and stabilization

APPLICABLE SECTIONS OF DESIGN REVIEW GUIDELINES

West End Historic Overlay District Design Review Guidelines
(Please refer to the applicable sections of the *Guidelines*, as detailed in the staff comments.)

PROJECT DESCRIPTION/ELEMENTS

Please refer to the information provided with the application.

STAFF COMMENTS

The property at 434 Summit Street, the Jacob Lott Ludlow House, was individually listed in the National Register of Historic Places in 1983. The *West End Historic Overlay District Report* describes the house as “one of the best-preserved examples of late nineteenth century, Queen Anne style-influenced domestic architecture in Winston-Salem.” The exterior is clad in weatherboards with a decorative wrap-around porch. In recent years the condition of the house has deteriorated, and it is now in need of significant repair.

The application requests approval for the following items:

- 1) Replacement of missing and rotten wooden siding at the rear and left side of the building with siding milled to match the existing profile and exposure, to include replacement of sheeting, installation of house wrap, and priming;
- 2) Replacement of missing corner boards and trim at one door and one window to match the existing trim in size and profile;
- 3) Stabilization of the front porch foundation by cutting back the bank under the porch to create a flat floor and underpinning the foundation with a concrete footing reinforced with rebar;
- 4) Stabilization of the porch on the right side of the building by installing concrete footings and 6' x 6' pressure-treated posts to support the outer band of the leveled porch;
- 5) Replacement of damaged framing under the right-side porch floor, to match the existing framing in material;
- 6) Replacement of damaged and missing porch floor decking at the right-side porch with new boards milled to match the size and profile of the existing;
- 7) Replacement of the stairs providing access to the main-level rear door with a new pressure-treated lumber stair, matching the existing stair in style and size;
- 8) Restoration of the ground-floor rear porch by removing the plywood enclosure, installing a porch floor comprising wooden boards milled to match those on the front porch; a painted, tongue-and-

- groove wooden ceiling; a painted-wood post and handrail system; a simple wooden stair; and a ceiling light; and
- 9) Reinstalling an original window at the main floor with trim to match the size and profiles of original trim elsewhere on the building.

STAFF FINDINGS

Commission staff finds that the work is not incongruous with the character of the West End Historic Overlay District because:

- 1) The exterior cladding on the side and rear of the building is missing in areas and deteriorated and damaged from vine growth, lack of paint, and exposure to moisture. Wooden trim – in the form of corner boards and door and window surrounds – is also missing. The new wood siding will be milled to duplicate, as closely as possible, the original wooden siding in size, shape, and texture. It will be primed to protect it from moisture. The new wood trim will be milled to match the original elements in design, detail, dimension, texture, finish, scale, and material. (*Wood*, West End Guidelines 2-4)
- 2) The replacement stairs providing access to the main floor will match the existing stairs in style and size, but the stair will be properly supported and meet code. The simple design of the stair will maintain the utilitarian character of the rear entrance. (*Walkways, Steps, and Railings*, West End Guideline 5; *Entrances, Porches, Enclosures, and Balconies*, West End Guidelines 4 and 11)
- 3) Reinstalling an original ground-floor window that has been removed, with trim milled to match the size and profiles of the original trim, will restore the original arrangement of historic windows in the wall. (*Fenestration: Windows and Doors*, West End Guidelines 3 and 5)
- 4) Stabilization of the porch foundations with concrete footers supporting pressure-treated posts, on the right side, and concrete underpinning at the front porch preserves the existing historic fabric of the porches by supporting the leveled porch floors and ensuring they remain structurally sound. (*Entrances, Porches, Enclosures, and Balconies*, West End Guideline 1)
- 5) Preservation of the right-side porch will be accomplished by replacing rotten and damaged floor framing and decking with wooden materials. The new decking will match the existing decking in size and profile. (*Entrances, Porches, Enclosures, and Balconies*, West End Guidelines 1-3)
- 6) Restoration of the rear, ground-floor porch will be achieved by removing its plywood enclosure, rebuilding a wooden floor with decking that matches decking on the front porch, installing a utilitarian railing, a tongue-and-groove wooden ceiling, a stair, and light. The new porch is compatible in design, style, dimension, detail and material with the building and the West End. (*Entrances, Porches, Enclosures, and Balconies*, West End Guidelines 4 and 6)

STAFF RECOMMENDATION

Based on the preceding findings, staff recommends that the Commission approve COA2019-013 at the Jacob Lott Ludlow House located at 434 Summit Street, within the West End Historic Overlay District (PIN#: 6825-86-5939.00), with the following conditions:

- 1) The applicant shall prime and paint any replacement wooden elements that would have been painted historically;
- 2) The applicant shall receive, prior to commencement of the work, all other required permits or permissions from governmental agencies;

- 3) Commission staff shall review and approve any revisions or deviations to any portion of the as-submitted work, that qualifies as a minor work, prior to commencement of that portion of the project; and
- 4) The applicant shall submit the *Certificate of Appropriateness Request for Certification of Completed Work* and photo documentation of the completed project to HRC staff within ten (10) days of its completion.