

**STAFF REPORT**  
**for**  
**MAY 1, 2019 HRC MEETING**

**Case #:** COA2019-015  
**Staff:** Heather M. Bratland

**Applicant:** Teresa Drummond  
**Owner:** Teresa Drummond

**LOCATION**

District: West End Historic Overlay District #10  
Building: Apartment Building, Non-contributing  
Street: 109-115 West End Boulevard  
Local Historic  
Landmark#: N/A

**REQUEST(S)**

- Exterior porch, stair, and patio replacements

**APPLICABLE SECTIONS OF DESIGN REVIEW GUIDELINES**

*West End Historic Overlay District Design Review Guidelines*  
**(Please refer to the applicable sections of the *Guidelines*, as detailed in the staff comments.)**

**PROJECT DESCRIPTION/ELEMENTS**

*Please refer to the information provided with the application.*

**STAFF COMMENTS**

The property at 109-115 West End Boulevard is described, in the *West End Historic Overlay District Report*, as a “low two-story brick veneer quadraplex [that] ... is architecturally out of character with the West End.” The quadraplex was constructed after 1945, outside of the period of significance for the West End Historic Overlay District.

All structures built after 1930 with no individual or historical or architectural significance should follow the Guidelines in the Changes to the Building Exterior section. However, work that is proposed for this type of non-contributing building is reviewed somewhat differently .... The effect that a building alteration has on surrounding historic buildings and on the character of the area is the primary factor considered rather than the effect on the subject building itself. Such a perspective results in a higher level of latitude for change ....

- *Noncontributing Structures, West End Guidelines*

The application requests approval for the following items:

- 1) Repair the existing brick foundation for the main entry porch on the front of the building. Replace the concrete-and-brick entry stair with a new stair constructed with composite risers and treads. Replace the metal posts and railings at the porch with painted wood columns and railings designed in a Craftsman style. Replace the metal railings at the stairs with painted wood railings. Clad the walls below the stairs with painted Hardie Board and trim with a smooth finish.
- 2) Repour the existing concrete walkways leading to the lower level front entry doors, and construct new brick stairs and brick retaining walls to navigate the slope from the public sidewalk down to the lower level entries.

- 3) Remove the concrete side patios behind the front elevation of the building, as well as the associated stair stoops and metal railings. Construct 8' wide x 21' deep porches with painted wood railings and composite decking at the location of the side patios. The railings and pickets are designed in a simplified Craftsman style. The footings for these porches will be placed inside the existing stone retaining walls on either side of the property, which will be repaired and maintained.
- 4) Replace the existing side, second-story entrance porches with 8' wide x 5' deep porches, which will extend to the edges of the ground-floor porches. The new porches and replacement stairs will be constructed with painted wood columns, railings, and stringers, and composite decking and stair treads. The railings and columns are designed in a simplified Craftsman style. The porches will be covered by 9' wide x 7' deep hipped roofs, matching the form of the existing roof on the main block of the building.

## **STAFF FINDINGS**

Commission staff finds that the work is not incongruous with the character of the West End Historic Overlay District because:

- 1) The current entry porch and concrete stair on the street façade are structurally failing. The stair has dropped and is pushing into the brick foundation of the porch. This is evident in the large horizontal crack in the concrete above the top stair and in the damage to the brickwork at the top of the stair. The brick foundation for the porch will be repaired, and the brick and concrete stair will be removed. Wooden porches and entry stairs are a very common feature of the West End. The houses on either side of this property both have wooden porches, with wooden steps, columns, railings, and floors. Reconstructing this entry porch with painted wood columns and railings, smooth Hardie Board cladding of the stair sidewalls, and composite stair treads and porch flooring will connect the property visually to neighboring homes and the West End as a whole. The new porch and stair designs are compatible in design, style, dimension, and detail with the property and District. The new hipped roof form is consistent with the form of the roof on the main block of the building. (*Noncontributing Structures*, West End Guidelines 1 and 3; *Entrances, Porches, Enclosures, and Balconies*, West End Guidelines 4 and 5)
- 2) The repoured concrete walkways, brick landscape stairs, and brick retaining walls are appropriate hardscape treatments for the property and West End, being compatible in material, location, configuration, dimension, scale, and materials with the property and District. Concrete and brick are preferred materials for West End steps and walkways. The new brick retaining walls will make possible the creation of a flat yard surface at the lower level of the building, where the foundation of the new front entry stairs will be located. The retaining walls will hold back the higher elevation of the yard at the sidewalk. The new retaining walls do not impact the historic fabric of the building, and they are compatible in size, setback, and scale with other retaining walls in the West End. Brick is a preferred material for retaining walls. (*Noncontributing Structures*, West End Guideline 3; *Walkways, Steps, and Railings*, West End Guidelines 5, 7, 9; *Walls*, West End Guidelines 4 and 5)
- 3) Neither the first-floor concrete patios nor the metal railings are character-defining features of the site. The stone retaining walls are one of the few features of the property that are characteristic of the West End. Retention of the stone walls will maintain this property's visual connection to the District. The structure of the first floor porches will be placed inside the stone retaining walls, screening the support posts from view. The porch columns and railings are compatible in design, style, dimension, detail, texture, and material with the property and District. The composite wood porch floor is permissible for West End structures built after 1930, and substitute materials are advisable for areas of frequent, reoccurring deterioration. (*Noncontributing Structures*, West End Guideline 1 and 3; *Walls*, West End Guideline 1; *Entrances, Porches, Enclosures, and Balconies*, West End Guideline 4)

- 4) The 8' width of the second-floor side porches maintains the limits of the original outdoor living space of the property. It is not uncommon for houses in the West End to include porches that extend beyond the plane of sidewalls. The stairs will be reconstructed in their current location. The porches and stairs will be constructed with painted wood and composite decking. The proposed porches are compatible in style, design, dimension, and material with the property and the District. The use of composite material for the stair and porch floors is permissible for West End structures built after 1930, and substitute materials are advisable for areas of frequent, reoccurring deterioration. (*Noncontributing Structures*, West End Guidelines 1 and 3; *Entrances, Porches, Enclosures, and Balconies*, West End Guidelines 3, 4 and 7)

### **STAFF RECOMMENDATION**

Based on the preceding findings, staff recommends that the Commission approve COA2019-015 at the Apartment Building located at 109-115 West End Boulevard, within the West End Historic Overlay District (PIN#: 6835-08-0198.00), with the following conditions:

- 1) The applicant shall receive, prior to commencement of the work, all other required permits or permissions from governmental agencies;
- 2) Commission staff shall review and approve any revisions or deviations to any portion of the as-submitted work, that qualifies as a minor work, prior to commencement of that portion of the project; and
- 3) The applicant shall submit the *Certificate of Appropriateness Request for Certification of Completed Work* and photo documentation of the completed project to HRC staff within ten (10) days of its completion.