

STAFF REPORT
for
SEPTEMBER 4, 2019 HRC MEETING

Case #: COA2019-082
Staff: Heather M. Bratland

Applicant: Patrick Foley, T2pm
Owner: Augsburg Evangelical Lutheran Church of Winston-Salem, North Carolina Inc.

LOCATION

District: West End Historic Overlay District #170
Street: 851-855 West Fifth Street
Building: J. J. Easley House
Local Historic
Landmark#: n/a

REQUEST(S)

- Demolition of the J. J. Easley House

APPLICABLE SECTIONS OF DESIGN REVIEW GUIDELINES

West End Historic Overlay District Design Review Guidelines
(Please refer to the applicable sections of the *Guidelines*, as detailed in the staff comments.)

PROJECT DESCRIPTION/ELEMENTS

Please refer to the information provided with the application.

STAFF COMMENTS

The Inventory for the West End Historic Overlay District, dated October 12, 1992, classifies the ca. 1900 J. J. Easley House as a contributing structure to the West End Historic Overlay District. From the Inventory, Site 170:

The Easley House is a simple late Victorian two-story frame dwelling with weatherboard siding, clipped gables, and a left front projecting bay with a nicely detailed bay window. The 1907-1917 Sanborn Maps show that the house originally had a wrap-around porch, but it has been reduced or replaced (probably between 1925-1950) with two smaller right front and left side porches, each simply detailed with paneled Classical posts.

Per NC General Statutes §160A-400.14:

An application for a certificate of appropriateness authorizing the relocation, demolition or destruction of a designated ... building, structure or site within the district may not be denied However, the effective date of such a certificate may be delayed for a period of up to 365 days from the date of approval. The maximum period of delay authorized by this section shall be reduced by the commission where it finds that the owner would suffer extreme hardship or be permanently deprived of all beneficial use of or return from such property by virtue of the delay. During such period the preservation commission shall negotiate with the owner and with any other parties in an effort to find a means of preserving the building or site.

STAFF FINDINGS

Commission staff finds that the work is incongruous with the character of the West End Historic Overlay District because:

- 1) The West End “embodies the distinctive characteristics of the architecture of the late nineteenth and early twentieth centuries.” The J. J. Easley House is a late Victorian frame house and was classified as a contributing structure to the West End Historic Overlay District at the time of designation in 1992. Although the original windows were replaced prior to 2012, the clipped gables, porches, projecting bay window, and overall form of the J. J. Easley House remain unchanged from the time of designation. The J. J. Easley House has value toward maintaining the character of the West End Historic Overlay District. (N.C.G.S. §160A-400.14)
- 2) The applicant has not demonstrated that all possibilities for saving the J. J. Easley House have been exhausted. (*Demolition*, West End Guideline 1)

STAFF RECOMMENDATION

Based on the preceding findings, staff recommends that the Commission approve COA2019-082 at the J. J. Easley House, located at 851-855 West Fifth Street, within the West End Historic Overlay District (PIN# 6825-97-0223.00), with the following conditions:

- 1) Demolition of the J. J. Easley House shall be delayed for a period of 365 days from the date of approval. During such delay, Historic Resources Staff will direct the owner and applicant to organizations that may assist with efforts to save the structure;
- 2) Prior to demolition or relocation, the applicant shall provide Historic Resources Staff with a comprehensive set of digital interior and exterior photographs, one printed set of interior and exterior photographs, dimensioned floor plan and elevation drawings, and a dimensioned site plan;
- 3) If the J. J. Easley House is relocated within the West End Historic Overlay District, the *Guidelines for New Construction* shall be followed. If the J. J. Easley House is relocated outside of the West End Historic Overlay District, the applicant shall inform staff of its new location;
- 4) Prior to issuance of a demolition permit, the applicant shall document in writing to the Historic Resources Commission all efforts the owner has made to save the structure;
- 5) Prior to issuance of a demolition permit, all distinctive architectural elements and usable building materials shall be offered for salvage;
- 6) Following demolition or relocation, the lot shall be immediately cleared of construction debris and shall be replanted or otherwise maintained;
- 7) The applicant shall receive, prior to commencement of the work, all other required permits or permissions from governmental agencies; and
- 8) The applicant shall submit photo documentation of the completed project to HRC staff within ten (10) days of its completion.