

**STAFF REPORT**  
for  
**SEPTEMBER 4, 2019 HRC MEETING**

**Case #:** COA2019-083  
**Staff:** Heather M. Bratland

**Applicant:** Patrick Foley, T2pm  
**Owner:** Augsburg Evangelical Lutheran Church of Winston-Salem, North Carolina Inc.

**LOCATION**

District: West End Historic Overlay District #167  
Street: 823 West Fifth Street  
Building: Frank L. Matthews House  
Local Historic  
Landmark#: n/a

**REQUEST(S)**

- Demolition of the Frank L. Matthews House

**APPLICABLE SECTIONS OF DESIGN REVIEW GUIDELINES**

*West End Historic Overlay District Design Review Guidelines*  
**(Please refer to the applicable sections of the *Guidelines*, as detailed in the staff comments.)**

**PROJECT DESCRIPTION/ELEMENTS**

*Please refer to the information provided with the application.*

**STAFF COMMENTS**

The Inventory for the West End Historic Overlay District, dated October 12, 1992, classifies the ca. 1907 Frank L. Matthews House as a contributing structure to the West End Historic Overlay District. From the Inventory, Site 167:

*The Matthews House is a two-story frame Colonial Revival dwelling characterized by a pyramidal roof with cross gables, interior end chimneys, paired sash windows, two front bay windows, and a front porch with pedimented entrance bay, Tuscan columns and a plain balustrade. Because its early twentieth century construction date can still be seen clearly in its form and basic detailing, the house continues to contribute to the architectural character of the West End. Nevertheless, alterations which probably date from the late 1970s when the house served as a funeral home have diminished its original level of significance. These changes include one-story additions on the west side and rear, handicap ramps, and vinyl siding.*

Per the NC General Statutes §160A-400.14:

*An application for a certificate of appropriateness authorizing the relocation, demolition or destruction of a designated ... building, structure or site within the district may not be denied .... However, the effective date of such a certificate may be delayed for a period of up to 365 days from the date of approval. The maximum period of delay authorized by this section shall be reduced by the commission where it finds that the owner would suffer extreme hardship or be permanently deprived of all beneficial use of or return from such property by virtue of the delay. During such period the preservation commission shall negotiate with the owner and with any other parties in an effort to find a means of preserving the building or site.*

## **STAFF FINDINGS**

Commission staff finds that the work is incongruous with the character of the West End Historic Overlay District because:

- 1) The West End “embodies the distinctive characteristics of the architecture of the late nineteenth and early twentieth centuries, with well-detailed examples of styles such as ... Colonial Revival ....” The Frank L. Matthews House is a Colonial Revival frame house and was classified as a contributing structure to the West End Historic Overlay District at the time of designation in 1992, despite the additions and alterations made during the last quarter of the twentieth century. The Frank L. Matthews House has value toward maintaining the character of the West End Historic Overlay District. (N.C.G.S. §160A-400.14)
- 2) The applicant has not demonstrated that all possibilities for saving the Frank L. Matthews House have been exhausted. (*Demolition*, West End Guideline 1)

## **STAFF RECOMMENDATION**

Based on the preceding findings, staff recommends that the Commission approve COA2019-083 at the Frank L. Matthews House, located at 823 West Fifth Street, within the West End Historic Overlay District (PIN# 6825-97-2361.00), with the following conditions:

- 1) Demolition of the Frank L. Matthews House shall be delayed for a period of 365 days from the date of approval. During such delay, Historic Resources Staff will direct the owner and applicant to organizations that may assist with efforts to save the structure;
- 2) Prior to demolition or relocation, the applicant shall provide Historic Resources Staff with a comprehensive set of digital interior and exterior photographs, one printed set of interior and exterior photographs, dimensioned floor plan and elevation drawings, and a dimensioned site plan;
- 3) If the Frank L. Matthews House is relocated within the West End Historic Overlay District, the *Guidelines for New Construction* shall be followed. If the Frank L. Matthews House is relocated outside of the West End Historic Overlay District, the applicant shall inform staff of its new location;
- 4) Prior to issuance of a demolition permit, the applicant shall document in writing to the Historic Resources Commission all efforts the owner has made to save the Frank L. Matthews House;
- 5) Prior to issuance of a demolition permit, all distinctive architectural elements and usable building materials shall be offered for salvage;
- 6) Following demolition or relocation, the lot shall be immediately cleared of construction debris and shall be replanted or otherwise maintained;
- 7) The applicant shall receive, prior to commencement of the work, all other required permits or permissions from governmental agencies; and
- 8) The applicant shall submit photo documentation of the completed project to HRC staff within ten (10) days of its completion.