

**STAFF REPORT  
for  
NOVEMBER 6, 2019 HRC MEETING**

**Case #:** COA2019-111  
**Staff:** Heather M. Bratland

**Applicant:** John Newman for William G. White, Jr. Family YMCA

**LOCATION**

District: West End Historic Overlay District #281  
Street: 775 West End Boulevard  
Building: Y.M.C.A.  
Local Historic  
Landmark#: n/a

**REQUEST(S)**

- Removal of a Red maple and a Boxelder

**APPLICABLE SECTIONS OF DESIGN REVIEW GUIDELINES**

*West End Historic Overlay District Design Review Guidelines*  
**(Please refer to the applicable sections of the *Guidelines*, as detailed in the staff comments.)**

**PROJECT DESCRIPTION/ELEMENTS**

*Please refer to the information provided with the application.*

**STAFF COMMENTS**

From the *Designation Report*, the Y.M.C.A. is one of the largest intrusions in West End. Built in 1976, the massive and nearly windowless block-like building occupies the site of the West End Greenhouses. This application proposes the removal of a Red maple and a Boxelder, both on the east side of the building near West End Boulevard.

**STAFF FINDING**

Commission staff finds that removal of the Boxelder and Red maple is incongruous with the character of the West End Historic Overlay District because:

- 1) It is not appropriate to remove large, healthy, mature trees. The report of the Urban Forester states, "One [tree] was an 18" dbh Boxelder (*Acer negundo*), the other a 12.5" Red maple (*Acer rubrum*). The Boxelder had already dropped its leaves, most likely due to heat and drought stress. There were a few dead limbs in the crown but nothing excessive or enough to indicate the tree was in a state of obvious decline. Sounding with a mallet revealed no obvious structural anomalies nor were any observed visually. I would rate the health of this tree as moderate. The Red Maple is healthy and growing with vigor. Both trees are living beneath the canopy of an impressive Red oak, which has influenced the growth patterns of both smaller trees as they are "reaching for sunlight". Even so, they are adapting as trees do and do not appear to be hazardous or in a state of decline, which would necessitate removal at this time." (*Vegetation*, West End Guideline 5)

**STAFF RECOMMENDATION**

Based on the preceding finding, staff recommends that the Commission deny COA2019-111 at the Y.M.C.A. located at 775 West End Boulevard, within the West End Historic Overlay District (PIN# 6825-76-0319.00). If the Commission approves COA2019-111, staff recommends the following conditions:

- 1) The trees shall be removed in their entirety, including the stumps, which shall be removed below existing grade;
- 2) The applicant shall receive, prior to commencement of the work, all other required permits or permissions from governmental agencies;
- 3) Commission staff shall review and approve any revisions or deviations to any portion of the as-submitted work, that qualifies as a minor work, prior to commencement of that portion of the project; and
- 4) The applicant shall submit the Certificate of Appropriateness Request for Certification of Completed Work form and photo documentation of the completed project to HRC staff within ten (10) days of its completion.