

STAFF REPORT for DECEMBER 4, 2019 HRC MEETING

Case #: COA2019-112
Staff: Heather M. Bratland

Applicant: Darrell Walker, Winston-Salem/Forsyth County Schools

LOCATION

District: West End Historic Overlay District #276
Street: 1404 Northwest Boulevard
Building: Hanes Park
Status: Contributing
Local Historic
Landmark#: n/a

REQUEST(S)

- Improvements to the South Quad softball field

APPLICABLE SECTIONS OF DESIGN REVIEW GUIDELINES

West End Historic Overlay District Design Review Guidelines
(Please refer to the applicable sections of the *Guidelines*, as detailed in the staff comments.)

PROJECT DESCRIPTION/ELEMENTS

Please refer to the information provided with the application.

STAFF COMMENTS

Hanes Park was developed on 47 acres donated to the City by P.H. Hanes in 1919. Plans for the Park, designed by Louis L. Miller of Buckenham and Miller, included a football field, a running track, a baseball field, and tennis courts interspersed with naturalistic areas, and grand entrance on the southeast side of Peters Creek. By 1921, two baseball diamonds and six tennis courts had been built and were open for community use. The entrance stonework was added in the 1930s as a New Deal construction project. In 1963, the City deeded to the school system approximately twelve acres of the original park, on which Wiley Elementary (now Middle) School and Reynolds Gym were located. School teams continue to use the Park facilities, and the City and WS/FCS signed an agreement regarding such use in 1999.

In 2016, the City's Recreation and Parks Department proposed to the HRC a comprehensive plan of restoration and improvements in Hanes Park, which was funded with \$2.2 million in bond funds. Phase I construction per those plans is essentially complete. In the South Quad, metal bleachers were removed from the tennis courts and stone seat walls were constructed for spectators. In the ball field area, the chain link outfield fence, metal bleachers, team benches, and chain link backstop fences were removed. The softball field has been reconstructed in a new location. Its features include a stone equipment storage building, covered dugouts with stone seat walls, a stone seat wall for spectators behind the backstop, and new black chain link backstop fencing.

In October 2019, WS/FCS submitted an application to add 60' lights, a batting cage, a semi-permanent outfield fence, bleachers, and a permanent scoreboard to the South Quad. After consultation with staff regarding compliance with the Guidelines, WS/FCS withdrew the application and revised their plans. In November 2019, WS/FCS submitted a new application for COA2019-112, which proposed the addition of 32' lights, a batting cage as a component of a stone and wood pavilion, a temporary outfield fence, a stone seat wall, and a permanent scoreboard. The Commission heard the case on November 6, 2019, and continued it until December 4, 2019, pending submission of additional details on the impact of the lights,

construction and material details for the pavilion, and the potential to use a portable scoreboard. This staff report addresses the revised application for the December 4, 2019 Commission meeting.

STAFF FINDINGS

Commission staff finds that the improvements to the South Quad softball field are not incongruous with the character of the West End Historic Overlay District because:

- 1) The lights are 60' tall with metal halide bulbs; the poles will be black-painted metal. Two poles will be located outside the baselines, midway between home plate and the bases. Two additional poles will be located at the ends of the foul lines. The field is located below the elevation of sidewalks at the perimeter of the park, at levels ranging from 15-30'. The lights will rise 30-45' above the level of the sidewalk, which is the approximate height of the tallest trees growing along the slopes leading into Hanes Park. The visual impact of the lights will be diminished for those on the sidewalks by the significant vegetation on the slopes, even during winter when the trees are bare. The black finish of the fixtures will diminish the visual impact of the lights for users of Hanes Park. The installation of lighting for recreational purposes is compatible with the historic patterns of use in Hanes Park, which have included baseball fields, a football field, tennis courts, and other areas programmed for organized sports since establishment of the park.

The use of 60' poles, as compared to the 32' poles proposed in November 2019, will allow better control of the direction of the lights and require fewer bulbs to achieve the same level of on-field lighting. The requirements of the UDO must be met in order for WS/FCS to obtain permits to install the lights. The UDO requires the following: (1) a lighting plan that shows the max candela per fixture does not exceed 7500 candela at a distance 150 feet from the edge of the playing field; and (2) installation of the manufacturer's glare control package. (*Lighting*, West End Guideline 3; *Parks*, West End Guideline 4)

- 2) The new seat wall will match the design, scale, size, and materials of the existing stone seat wall. It will be located between the existing seat wall and the stone storage building. The design of the new seat wall enhances and blends with the surroundings. The location does not compromise the historic character of the West End or obstruct the streetscape. (*Parks*, West End Guidelines 2 and 4)
- 3) The Commission shall take no action "except to prevent the construction, reconstruction, alteration, restoration, moving, or demolition of buildings, structures, appurtenant fixtures, outdoor advertising signs, or other significant features in the district which would be incongruous with the special character of the [West End]." The 36" x 15" x 2.5" scoreboard is portable and is not a significant feature that will be permanently installed in Hanes Park, therefore no Certificate of Appropriateness is required. (N.C.G.S. §160A-400.9(a))
- 4) The temporary outfield fence will define the line beyond which a hit is a home run. The fence will be installed using sockets sunk into the turf so that it can be removed. The temporary fence will have forest green mesh panels and bright yellow edging along its top. Use of a removable fence will preserve and maintain the open and naturalistic qualities of the South Quad, characteristics of its 1919 original design. (*Parks*, West End Guideline 1)
- 5) The net batting cage will be sited within a 14' wide x 55' long x 12' high pavilion on the third base line. Historic photographs document similar pavilions in Hanes Park from the 1920s through the 1940s. The pavilion will have a concrete floor and stone base wall that will match the stone seat walls in the dugouts. The pavilion roof will be supported by 8" x 8" pressure-treated, black-painted wood posts. The posts will be separated by approximately 7'. Interior roof trusses will be black-painted wood; fluorescent lighting will be mounted between the trusses to reduce light spillover. The wooden siding in the gable ends will be painted forest green, and the gable roof will be clad with black asphalt shingles. The floor will be concrete. The mesh batting cage will be installed in

the pavilion seasonally, and the pavilion will be available for public use during the off-season. The pavilion will enhance and blend with its surroundings. (*Parks, West End Guideline 2*)

STAFF RECOMMENDATION

Based on the preceding findings, staff recommends that the Commission approve COA2019-112 at Hanes Park, located at 1404 Northwest Boulevard, within the West End Historic Overlay District (PIN# 6825-67-7398.00), with the following conditions:

- 1) The lights shall only be on during WS/FCS practices and games;
- 2) The outfield fence and portable scoreboard shall be removed and stored in the stone storage building, or offsite, at all times unless a WS/FCS team is actively using the field for an official practice or game;
- 3) The net batting cage shall be removed and stored in the stone storage building, or offsite, during the weeks of the year that WS/FCS softball is not in season;
- 4) The applicant shall receive, prior to commencement of the work, all other required permits or permissions from governmental agencies, including, but not limited to, all approvals required under the June 10, 1999 Agreement between the Recreation and Parks Commission of the City of Winston-Salem and the Winston-Salem/Forsyth County Board of Education;
- 5) Commission staff shall review and approve any revisions or deviations to any portion of the as-submitted work, that qualifies as a minor work, prior to commencement of that portion of the project; and
- 6) The applicant shall submit the Certificate of Appropriateness Request for Certification of Completed Work form and photo documentation of the completed project to HRC staff within ten (10) days of its completion.