

STAFF REPORT
for
JANUARY 2, 2020 HRC MEETING

Case #: COA2020-003
Staff: Heather M. Bratland

Applicant: Lori and John Cernak

LOCATION

District: West End Historic Overlay District #361
Street: 1124 West Fourth Street
Building: Joseph R. Fletcher House
Status: Contributing
Local Historic
Landmark#: n/a

REQUEST(S)

- Construction of a 1-story rear addition

APPLICABLE SECTIONS OF DESIGN REVIEW GUIDELINES

West End Historic Overlay District Design Review Guidelines
(Please refer to the applicable sections of the *Guidelines*, as detailed in the staff comments.)

PROJECT DESCRIPTION/ELEMENTS

Please refer to the information provided with the application.

STAFF COMMENTS

The Joseph R. Fletcher House is a ca. 1906 “unusual Colonial Revival dwelling which contributes visual variety to the streetscape. It is a two-story frame house with a weatherboarded first story and fishscale-cut wood shingle second story.” The 1912 Sanborn shows that the house originally ended immediately behind the bay window on the north side of the house, and that a 1-story, open porch extended across the rear (east side) of the house. At some point, this porch was enclosed and a bathroom was installed. In the 1940s, a 1-story rear addition was added to the house.

STAFF FINDINGS

Commission staff finds that the project is not incongruous with the character of the West End Historic Overlay District because:

- 1) The proposed addition will be attached to the rear of the house at the locations of the earlier porch enclosure and the 1940s addition. The 1940s addition and porch enclosure are not identified as contributing features in the *West End Historic Overlay District Report*. The addition will be minimally visible from the street, in the context of earlier rear additions. It will not impact the ca. 1906 original structure or any significant site features. No character-defining features of the building will be destroyed, obscured, or radically changed. If this addition were removed in the future, the essential form of the original structure would be preserved and maintained. (*Additions*, West End Guidelines 1, 2, 5, and 6)
- 2) The design of the addition clearly is subordinate to the historic house and compatible with it. At 50 square feet and 1 story in height, it will not diminish or visually overpower the house. The roof of the existing 1940s addition will extend to become the roof of the proposed addition. New wooden

clapboards and a modern window that matches the size and mutnin pattern of the original 1/1 windows will be installed at the rear. (*Additions*, West End Guidelines 3 and 4)

STAFF RECOMMENDATION

Based on the preceding findings, staff recommends that the Commission approve COA2020-003 at the Joseph R. Fletcher House, located at 1124 West Fourth Street, within the West End Historic Overlay District (PIN#6825-75-6533.00), with the following conditions:

- 1) The applicant shall receive, prior to commencement of the work, all other required permits or permissions from governmental agencies;
- 2) Commission staff shall review and approve any revisions or deviations to any portion of the as-submitted work, that qualifies as a minor work, prior to commencement of that portion of the project; and
- 3) The applicant shall submit the Certificate of Appropriateness Request for Certification of Completed Work form and photo documentation of the completed project to HRC staff within ten (10) days of its completion.