

STAFF REPORT
for
JULY 1, 2020 HRC MEETING

Case #: COA2020-070
Staff: Heather M. Bratland

Applicant: Carroll Consortium LLC c/o Katy Carroll

LOCATION

District: West End Historic Overlay District #399
Street: 240 North Sunset Drive
Building: Harry L. Shaner House
Status: Contributing
Local Historic
Landmark#: n/a

REQUEST(S)

- After-the-fact exterior rehabilitation

APPLICABLE SECTIONS OF DESIGN REVIEW GUIDELINES

West End Historic Overlay District Design Review Guidelines

(Please refer to the applicable sections of the *Guidelines*, as detailed in the staff comments.)

PROJECT DESCRIPTION/ELEMENTS

1. *Remove and replace all siding and damaged fascia, rake and trim boards with wood-grain fiber cement products; remove and replace shakes with fiber cement shakes; remove and replace bead board porch ceiling with tongue-and-grove spruce bead board.*
2. *Replace two side doors and main entry door*
3. *Replace exterior stairs to second floor with Code-compliant stairs*
4. *Construct new exterior stairs to connect basement/rear yard level with front porch*
5. *Remove existing asphalt shingles and replace with CertainTeed Landmark architectural shingles, to include repairs to framing and sheathing*
6. *Remove nonoriginal addition to front porch roof and reframe porch roof to match original shape*
7. *Remove upper level rear deck and access door*
8. *Repair cracked and broken chimney masonry, add chimney cap, and install cricket at chimney to shed water*

STAFF FINDINGS

Commission staff finds that the project is not incongruous with the character of the West End Historic Overlay District because:

- 1) The exterior cladding on the house was a mix of wooden weatherboards and T1-11 plywood sheathing, with wooden shakes on the bay projecting over the entry porch. The cladding and trim elements were water damaged and rotten in areas. Termites had also damaged the cladding and structural members. The wooden cladding was replaced with wood-grain, fiber-cement lapped siding with fiber-cement shakes at the projecting bay. Damaged trim pieces were replaced with composite and fiber cement trim to match the existing dimensions and profiles. The bead board ceiling was replaced in-kind. All siding and trim was painted, consistent with the original exterior finish. (*Wood*, Guidelines 2, 3, and 5)
- 2) Two side doors were replaced, one at the second floor on the left side and one at the first floor on the right side. The main entry door, which was installed in the 1980s and is damaged on the

interior from cigarette smoke and resident cats, was also replaced. The single-leaf replacement doors are simple – two recessed panels surmounted by six lights. The replacement doors are consistent in design, location, size, pane and panel configuration, trim, detail, style and material with the building and West End. (*Fenestration: Windows and Doors*, Guidelines 5 and 9)

- 3) The replacement stairs to the second floor and new stairs to the rear yard are both designed to allow safe access to areas of the building for tenants. Both sets of painted, pressure-treated wood stairs are located inconspicuously on side facades, and neither obscures or damages any character defining features. The stairs are compatible in scale, materials, detail, and finish with the building. They are a reversible installation and could be removed without damage to the building or porch. (*Safety, Accessibility, and Code Requirements*, Guidelines 2-5)
- 4) The roof shape, lines, and pitch were retained and restored, including the removal of the addition that sat on top of the entry porch roof. The roof was repaired by reinforcing undersized and damaged rafters and replacing rotten sheathing. The dark gray architectural shingles are an appropriate material with which to clad the roof. (*Roofs*, Guidelines 1, 2, and 4)
- 5) The removal of a nonoriginal deck and access door on the rear of the building has no impact on its historic character. Further, the roof on which the deck sat was not designed or constructed to support such a load, so its removal aids in the preservation of the building. (*Decks and Patios*, Guideline 1; *Fenestration: Windows and Doors*, Guideline 15)
- 6) The existing chimney masonry was repaired, and a solid cap was placed over it to prevent water infiltration. A small cricket was constructed behind the chimney to encourage water runoff and decrease the damaging impact of water infiltration. (*Roofs*, Guideline 5)

STAFF RECOMMENDATION

Based on the preceding findings, staff recommends that the Commission approve COA2020-070 at the Harry L. Shaner House, located at 240 North Sunset Drive, within the West End Historic Overlay District (PIN 6825-65-5998.00).