

STAFF REPORT
for
JULY 1, 2020 HRC MEETING

Case #: COA2020-030
Staff: Michelle M. McCullough

Applicant: Spear Cherry St. Holdings LLC
Adam Spear

LOCATION

District: N/A
Street: 118 South Cherry Street
Building: Conrad-Starbuck House
Status: N/A
Local Historic
Landmark#: 68

REQUEST(S)

- After-the-fact installation of windows and siding on rear addition, mailbox, and exterior lighting and the installation of metal balconies

APPLICABLE SECTIONS OF DESIGN REVIEW GUIDELINES

Forsyth County Design Review Guidelines for Local Historic Landmarks **(Please refer to the applicable sections of the *Guidelines*, as detailed in the staff comments.)**

PROJECT DESCRIPTION/ELEMENTS

Please refer to the information provided with the application.

STAFF COMMENTS

On November 15, 1993, the Winston-Salem City Council approved the ordinance designating the following portions of the Conrad-Starbuck House, located at 118 South Cherry Street: the exterior, second floor interior, and interior staircase from the second to the first floor.

The landmark application states as an answer to what is the significance of this property: *“Also, of historic significance are the following: the common bond brick used to build the house and the brick rear ell, the front door fan light and sidelights, and a heavy turned newel post at the stairwell.”* The application does not mention the windows in the addition or the siding portion of the addition.

The application also describes the front of the building as follows: *“There was a porch on the original building that had a tower in the center of it that was three stories high. The original porch was replaced in 1924 and removed in 1946.”*

The porch that was added in 1924 and removed in 1946 was a one story, columned porch with a balustrade on the roof.

STAFF FINDINGS

Commission staff finds that the proposed project is not incongruous with the character of the Landmark because:

- 1) The windows in the main body of the historic building have been retained and preserved. The proposed windows are installed in the rear additions of the historic building. The proposed windows

replaced nonoriginal wood and vinyl windows. The windows were not listed as a significant feature when the Landmark was designated. The new windows are wood with four-over-four interior grids. The original grid pattern of the windows in the additions is not known. The design, location, material, size, scale, and proportions are compatible with the historic building. However, the grids are internal and have no external muntin profile. (*Windows and Doors*, Landmark Guidelines 1, 2, 5, and 6)

- 2) The proposed black metal mailbox is located adjacent to the north elevation of one of the rear additions and facilitates the multiple tenants of the building. The mailbox is freestanding and does not obscure or block any historic features. The mailbox is in a location that does not compromise the overall historic character of the Landmark building and site. (*Site Features and Planting*, Landmark Guideline 8)
- 3) The front elevation lighting was not original and was stolen off the site during renovations. The proposed lights are a simple, black, lantern style and will be located on the front and side entrances. The lights do not diminish or compromise the historic character of the Landmark building or the site. (*Exterior Lighting*, Landmark Guidelines 6)
- 4) The proposed replacement siding was added to the rear additions of the historic building. The siding is a painted composite material. The building siding on the additions was either missing or severely deteriorated. The new siding is compatible with the historic building in size, scale, color, and detail. (*Exterior Walls and Trim*, Landmark Guidelines 5 and 6)
- 5) The front elevation of the historic building has been altered with various porches and architectural features throughout time. At this time, it is proposed to add two faux black metal balconies at the second story windows over the front entrance. The house is an Italianate style and this style may have such a feature on second story balconies. There is physical evidence that such a feature may have existed at one time. The balcony feature that is missing is being replaced with a new feature that is compatible with the historic building in style, scale, size, dimension, detail, texture, pattern, design, color, and material. (*Porches, Terraces, Balconies, and Enclosures*, Landmark Guidelines 6 and 10)

STAFF RECOMMENDATION

Based on the preceding findings, staff recommends that the Commission approve COA2020-030 at the Conrad-Starbuck House, located at 118 South Cherry Street, Local Historic Landmark #68 (PIN# 6835-15-6289.00), with the following conditions:

- 1) The applicant shall permanently apply wood grids to the exterior of the windows to create the appropriate muntin profile to match the depth and width of the original building's muntins;
- 2) The applicant shall receive, prior to commencement of the work, all other required permits or permissions from governmental agencies;
- 3) Commission staff shall review and approve any revisions or deviations to any portion of the as-submitted work, that qualifies as a minor work, prior to commencement of that portion of the project; and,
- 4) The applicant shall submit the Certificate of Appropriateness Request for Certification of Completed Work form and photo documentation of the completed project to HRC staff within ten (10) days of its completion.