

**STAFF REPORT
for
JULY 1, 2020 HRC MEETING**

Case #: COA2020-053
Staff: Heather M. Bratland

Applicant: Craig Shoe, CSI Custom Homes

LOCATION

District: West End Historic Overlay District #253
Street: 908 Carolina Avenue
Building: Duplex
Status: Noncontributing
Local Historic
Landmark#: n/a

REQUEST(S)

- After-the-fact façade redesign and rear addition

APPLICABLE SECTIONS OF DESIGN REVIEW GUIDELINES

West End Historic Overlay District Design Review Guidelines

(Please refer to the applicable sections of the *Guidelines*, as detailed in the staff comments.)

PROJECT DESCRIPTION/ELEMENTS

1. *Replacement of existing windows with casements*
2. *Replacement of entry doors*
3. *Rearrangement of door and window openings on the sidewalls*
4. *Replacement of black metal handrails with cable railings*
5. *Reframing of the roof to create a pedimented end gable roof and porch*
6. *Painting of the modern brickwork*
7. *Construction of a 1-story rear addition to span the full width of the building*
8. *Construction of a horizontal board fence along the right side property line*

The *West End Historic Overlay District Report* calls the duplex “intrusive”, “ignoring the scale and landscaping of the surrounding houses.”

STAFF FINDINGS

Commission staff finds that the project is not incongruous with the character of the West End Historic Overlay District because:

- 1) The replacement windows and doors are a modern Craftsman style that will make the building more compatible with the character of the District. The rearrangement of door and window openings on the sidewalls of the duplex will not impact its architectural character, as the arrangement is utilitarian and not stylistic. (*Noncontributing Structures*, Guideline 3)
- 2) The proposed horizontal cable railings are an updated version of the utilitarian square bar metal railings that exist. They are consistent with the utilitarian style of the structure. (*Noncontributing Structures*, Guideline 3)
- 3) The roof will be reframed to create a traditional end gable roof, instead of the existing hip-on-gable roof. As part of the reframing, the ridge of the roof will be brought forward, creating a pediment in the space above the roof return. The pediment will be infilled with board and batten

HardiePanel. The gable roof will be covered with architectural shingles, and the street-facing roof return in standing seam metal. Four square fiberglass posts will support the roof over the entry porch. The reframed roof, the materials selected for the roof and pediment, and the creation of a front porch reference the Craftsman style of architecture, and materials and building features traditionally used in West End. The will help the building become more compatible with the character of West End. (*Noncontributing Structures*, Guideline 3)

- 4) Painting the brickwork will not damage it, as it is hard-fired modern brick. Painting will also assist in visually masking repairs and areas of infill. (*Noncontributing Structures*, Guideline 3)
- 5) The one-story, rear addition will not be visible from the street, and it is quite modest in size. The materials used on the addition will match the materials used elsewhere on the Duplex. (*Additions*, Guidelines 3, 4, and 5)
- 6) The proposed 72"-high fence on the right-side property line will run perpendicular to the street and be set high off the sidewalk, so it will not be highly visible. The horizontal board fence is consistent with the horizontal cable railing and simplified Craftsman style of the Duplex; it will be constructed of metal and wood. (*New Fences in Areas of Low Visibility from Street Level*, Guidelines 1 and 2)

STAFF RECOMMENDATION

Based on the preceding findings, staff recommends that the Commission approve COA2020-053 at the Duplex, located at 908 Carolina Avenue, within the West End Historic Overlay District (PIN 6825-77-8428.00), with the following conditions:

- 1) The applicant shall receive, prior to commencement of the work, all other required permits or permissions from governmental agencies;
- 2) Commission staff shall review and approve any revisions or deviations to any portion of the as-submitted work, that qualifies as a minor work, prior to commencement of that portion of the project; and
- 3) The applicant shall submit the *Certificate of Appropriateness Request for Certification of Completed Work* and photo documentation of the completed project to HRC staff within ten (10) days of its completion.