

STAFF REPORT
for
AUGUST 5, 2020 HRC MEETING

Case #: COA2020-084
Staff: Michelle M. McCullough

Applicant: Max and Amy McCabe

LOCATION

District: N/A
Streets: 2770 Chatham Farm Road
Buildings: Middleton House
Status: N/A
Local Historic
Landmark#: 111

REQUEST(S)

- Construction of an addition and interior alterations

APPLICABLE SECTIONS OF DESIGN REVIEW GUIDELINES

Forsyth County Design Review Guidelines for Local Historic Landmarks **(Please refer to the applicable sections of the *Guidelines*, as detailed in the staff comments.)**

PROJECT DESCRIPTION/ELEMENTS

Please refer to the information provided with the application.

STAFF FINDINGS

Commission staff finds that the work is not incongruous with the character of the Landmark because:

- 1) The proposed addition is to be constructed on the south elevation, a non-character defining elevation, at the rear portion of that side of the building. Due to the circular drive and architectural features on the rear (west) elevation and the existing garage to the north of the historic building, this is the location that will least compromise the historic building and site. (*Additions*, Landmark Guideline 3)
- 2) The proposed addition is set back from the front elevation 16'; the addition is 1 ½ stories with a 1 story garage section; the addition expands to the rear (west) of the property; the roof shape is a side gable with one front gable accent on the front (east) elevation and two front gable accents on the south elevation, the area of solids to voids in the addition are similar to the historic building; and the massing and proportion of the addition are similar to the historic structure. The addition does not visually overpower the historic Landmark from the front elevation. (*Additions*, Landmark Guidelines 4-5)
- 3) The proposed windows and doors for the addition are compatible in location, spacing, scale, proportion, color, size, configuration, material, and detail with the windows and doors of the Landmark building. (*Additions*, Landmark Guideline 6)
- 4) The proposed addition incorporates a Vermont slate roof, Hardiplank lap siding with a smooth finish and seven inch exposure painted white; simulated divided lite, aluminum clad double hung and picture windows; aluminum clad exterior, wood interior exterior doors; solid core wood interior doors; painted wood veneered insulated garage doors; brick foundation; wood molding and trim; and brick exterior steps and landing. The proposed materials to be used in the addition are compatible with the historic material of the Landmark building with regard to scale, size, shape, pattern, texture, detail, color, and surface finish. (*Additions*, Landmark Guideline 7)

- 5) The proposed addition is differentiated from the historic house by the design incorporating a front gable, no shutters, a pedimented dormer, and different but compatible materials. It does not attempt to appear as part of the original building or to portray a false historic appearance. (*Additions*, Landmark Guideline 8)
- 6) The addition is proposed in a location that will cause minimal loss of historic building fabric. There are four existing windows that will be removed, wrapped, and stored on-site. If in the future the addition is removed the windows could be returned. (*Additions*, Landmark Guideline 9)
- 7) The new addition will not require the removal of any trees and, since this building was moved to this site there are no archaeological resources relating to the current building. The addition will be located where at one time a garden designed by Ellen Biddle Shipman existed. After reviewing Shipman's original plan for the area, it is unclear what exactly was installed. The plan of the garden that exists does not show what materials were planted, which makes it impossible to recreate the garden. The garden has deteriorated. Specifically, the existing boxwoods surrounding the garden have been diagnosed with boxwood blight and require removal. The blight most likely spread from the boxwoods that were removed in the front of the property because of the blight. (*Additions*, Landmark Guidelines 2 and 10)
- 8) The wallpaper and faux painting of inside house were selected by Ellen Biddle Shipman and installed after the house was moved from South Carolina. Due to moisture problems in the past, the plaster on the walls and the wood paneling is severely deteriorated and in need of repair, which will require large expanses of the wallpaper to be removed and paint to be removed. The application includes that a section of wallpaper will be retained in place for historic reference. The dining room with the faux painted wood paneling will be photo documented. The surfaces will be painted since the wallpaper design is no longer in production. The wood paneling will be painted to match the other paneling of like design throughout the house. (*Building Interiors*, Landmark Guideline 5)

STAFF RECOMMENDATION

Based on the preceding findings, staff recommends that the Commission approve COA2020-084 at the Middleton House, located at 2770 Chatham Farm Road, Local Historic Landmark #111 (PIN# 6816-84-4257.00), with the following conditions:

- 1) The applicant shall work with staff to select a location in the living room and hallway to preserve a section of the existing wallpaper, and to salvage a section of the removed wallpaper for the Commission's Landmark file;
- 2) Prior to commencing the work, the applicant shall photo document the exterior and interior portions of the house that will be altered and submit the photos to staff to be part of the record;
- 3) The applicant shall receive, prior to commencement of the work, all other required permits or permissions from governmental agencies;
- 4) Commission staff shall review and approve any revisions or deviations to any portion of the as-submitted work, that qualifies as a minor work, prior to commencement of that portion of the project; and,
- 5) The applicant shall submit the Certificate of Appropriateness Request for Certification of Completed Work form and photo documentation of the completed project to HRC staff within ten (10) days of its completion.