

**CITY-COUNTY PLANNING BOARD  
STAFF REPORT**

<b>PETITION INFORMATION</b>			
<b>Docket</b>	F-1309		
<b>Staff</b>	<a href="#">Gary Roberts, Jr. AICP</a>		
<b>Petitioner(s)</b>	Carolina Development Services		
<b>Owner(s)</b>	BHR Land Holdings, LLC		
<b>Subject Property</b>	Portion of PIN 6809-96-6493		
<b>Address</b>	Addresses will be assigned during the platting/permitting stage(s).		
<b>Type of Request</b>	Final Development Plan for single-family and multifamily development in a MU-S (Two Phase) zoning district		
<b>GENERAL SITE INFORMATION</b>			
<b>Location</b>	South side of Mizpah Church Road, across from Ridge Bluff Drive and Bannockburn Road		
<b>Jurisdiction</b>	Winston-Salem		
<b>Ward(s)</b>	Northeast		
<b>Site Acreage</b>	± 25.69		
<b>Current Land Use</b>	The subject property is currently undeveloped.		
<b>Surrounding Property Zoning and Use</b>	<b>Direction</b>	<b>Zoning District</b>	<b>Use</b>
	North	AG and RS9	Undeveloped property and single-family homes
	East	RS20	Single-family homes
	South	MU-S (Two Phase)	Undeveloped property
	West	MU-S (Two Phase)	Undeveloped property
<b>Physical Characteristics</b>	The site is heavily wooded. The topography generally slopes downward, away from Mizpah Church Road and toward a tributary of Muddy Creek that forms the southern boundary of the site.		
<b>Proximity to Water and Sewer</b>	Public water is available within the right-of-way for Mizpah Church Road. A public sewer main is located approximately 1,100 feet west of the site. The proposed site plan shows an extension of this line.		
<b>Stormwater/ Drainage</b>	A stormwater control measure is proposed for each of the development areas, but a stormwater management study will be required.		
<b>Watershed and Overlay Districts</b>	The site is not located within a water supply watershed.		
<b>Analysis of General Site Information</b>	The undeveloped property consists of 25.69 acres and was recently annexed into the corporate limits of Winston-Salem. While it does not include any regulatory floodplain or watershed areas, the site includes some steep topography, a stream, and limited public sewer access. To provide sewer service to the proposed residential units, the developer will be responsible for obtaining the necessary public sewer easements from adjacent property owners.		

RELEVANT ZONING HISTORIES						
Case	Request	Decision & Date	Direction from Site	Acreage	Recommendation	
					Staff	CCPB
F-1309	AG, RM12, and RS20 to MU-S (Two Phase)	Approved 7/10/2000	Included current site	342.48	Approval	Approval
SITE ACCESS AND TRANSPORTATION INFORMATION						
Street Name	Classification	Frontage	Average Daily Trip Count	Capacity at Level of Service D		
Mizpah Church Road	Minor Thoroughfare	917 feet	1,400	15,300		
Martha Avenue	Local Street	60 feet	N/A	N/A		
<b>Proposed Access Point(s)</b>	Where detached single-family development is proposed, access is provided from Mizpah Church Road, across from Ridge Bluff Drive. The portion of the site proposed for multifamily development will have its primary access from Mizpah Church Road, with secondary access from Martha Avenue.					
<b>Trip Generation - Existing/Proposed</b>	The associated transportation impact analysis (TIA) projects approximately 800 trips per day (see TIA analysis below).					
<b>Sidewalks</b>	Sidewalks are proposed along both sides of all proposed streets, including the parking lot drive aisles associated with the multifamily development.					
<b>Transit</b>	Transit service is not available in this area.					
<b>Transportation Impact Analysis (TIA)</b>	<p>A revised TIA was submitted with this request.</p> <p>The entire portion of Long Creek Village north of the future Northern Beltway (known as Tract II) is approved for up to 349 single-family homes and 180 apartments and/or townhomes. At full buildout, Tract II will have four points of access:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• <b>Access 1</b> – Mizpah Church Road at its intersection with Ridge Bluff Drive (included in the current request)</li> <li>• <b>Access 2</b> – Mizpah Church Road, approximately 1,275 feet east of Access 1 (included in the current request)</li> <li>• <b>Access 3</b> – Martha Avenue (included in the current request)</li> <li>• <b>Access 4</b> – Vestal Road (serving future phases and connecting directly to Mizpah Church Road)</li> </ul> <p>Access 2 and Access 3 will only serve the proposed multifamily development.</p> <p>The majority of the development within Tract II will use Access 1 and Access 4, once constructed. It should be noted that the improvements associated with the NCDOT Northern Beltway project (R-2247EC) were modeled in this TIA. Future improvements at Shore Road and</p>					

	<p>Vestal Road are projected to improve overall efficiency where each intersects with Bethania-Rural Hall Road.</p> <p>This request is expected to generate approximately 800 trips per day, with approximately 70 of those trips arriving during the PM peak. Through the course of a day, this development is not expected to significantly impact the Level of Service (LOS) of the surrounding intersection approaches. Considering the relatively low existing traffic volumes on the surrounding street network, as well as the improvements included with the NCDOT project, there is ample capacity to accommodate the projected traffic generation.</p> <p>However, once Tract II is fully developed, estimated traffic generation will be approximately 4,813 trips per day. During the AM peak, this results in 84 vehicles entering and 264 vehicles exiting. During the PM peak, this results in 286 vehicles entering and 169 vehicles exiting. Per the TIA, accommodations for left-turning traffic will be needed at Access 1. WSDOT will require a west-bound left turn lane on Mizpah Church Road, with a minimum of 75 feet of storage and an appropriate design speed taper. As this site is expected to develop in phases over several years, WSDOT will evaluate the conditions of the surrounding street network prior to each phase of development. Additional improvements may be warranted as the site develops.</p>		
<b>Analysis of Site Access and Transportation Information</b>	<p>This request represents the first phase of proposed development for Long Creek Village north of the future beltway. While this initial development will not produce any significant traffic impacts, the projected demand on Mizpah Church Road at full buildout will require left turn accommodations at the primary access from Mizpah Church Road, across from Ridge Bluff Drive.</p>		
<b>SITE PLAN COMPLIANCE WITH UDO REQUIREMENTS</b>			
<b>Units (by type) and Density</b>	<p>30 single-family units and 60 multifamily units on 25.69 acres = 3.5 units per acre</p>		
<b>Parking (multifamily)</b>	<b>Required</b>	<b>Proposed</b>	<b>Layout</b>
	120 spaces	150 spaces	90-degree head-in, adjacent to the proposed apartment buildings
<b>Building Height</b>	<b>Maximum</b>		<b>Proposed</b>
	N/A		Two stories (multifamily)
<b>Impervious Coverage</b>	<b>Maximum</b>		<b>Proposed</b>
	N/A		17.7 percent
<b>UDO Sections Relevant to Subject Request</b>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Section 4.8.3 MU-S Mixed Use – Special Use District</li> <li>Section 5.2.70 Residential Building, Multifamily (use-specific standards)</li> </ul>		
<b>Complies with Section 3.2.11</b>	<b>(A) Legacy 2030 policies:</b>	Yes	
	<b>(B) Environmental Ordinance:</b>	N/A	
	<b>(C) Subdivision Regulations:</b>	Yes	

<b>Analysis of Site Plan Compliance with UDO Requirements</b>	The proposed site plan shows 30 single-family homes fronting along new public streets on the western portion of the site, while the eastern portion includes 60 apartment/townhome units in two-story buildings. Proposed common recreation and tree save areas exceed the minimum requirements for each, and a 40-foot Type III bufferyard provides physical and visual separation from adjacent single-family residential properties. The plan complies with UDO requirements and the approved first phase concept.
<b>CONFORMITY TO PLANS AND PLANNING ISSUES</b>	
<b>Legacy 2030 Growth Management Area</b>	Growth Management Area 3 – Suburban Neighborhoods
<b>Relevant Legacy 2030 Recommendations</b>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Facilitate land use patterns that offer a variety of housing choices.</li> <li>• Residents sometimes oppose street connections out of fear of increased traffic on their residential streets. Recognizing this, all parties involved in decision-making must fully understand the communitywide benefits of a highly connected transportation system.</li> </ul>
<b>Relevant Area Plan(s)</b>	<i>Tobaccoville Area Plan Update (2013)</i>
<b>Area Plan Recommendations</b>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• The subject property is recommended for low-density residential use.</li> <li>• Low-density residential development is recommended for larger parcels of undeveloped or large lot residential land in parts of the planning area, excluding areas in proposed activity centers and other designated sites. This land is generally located in the eastern half of the planning area, either has sewer or is sewerable, and has easy access to US 52/I-74. This is where the majority of new residential development in the area is expected to locate.</li> </ul>
<b>Site Located Along Growth Corridor?</b>	The site is not located along a growth corridor.
<b>Site Located within Activity Center?</b>	The site is not located within an activity center.
<b>Addressing</b>	The proposed street names have been approved by MapForsyth.
<b>Analysis of Conformity to Plans and Planning Issues</b>	<p>This request is a Final Development Plan for a site with MU-S (Two Phase) zoning. Long Creek Village was approved in 2000 as a large planned residential development with a mixture of housing types and an overall density under four units per acre.</p> <p>Long Creek Village is bisected from east to west by the future Northern Beltway. The area south of the beltway (Tract I) is primarily built out. The area north of the beltway (Tract II) includes the subject property, and this request represents the first Final Development Plan within Tract II.</p> <p>This request is consistent with the approved first phase conceptual plan, which highlighted generalized areas for single-family and multifamily development with an overall street circulation pattern.</p>

<b>CONCLUSIONS TO ASSIST WITH RECOMMENDATION</b>	
<b>Positive Aspects of Proposal</b>	<b>Negative Aspects of Proposal</b>
The underlying zoning has been in place since 2000.	The site does not have direct access to public sewer.
The request is consistent with the recommendations of the area plan and the first phase plan.	
Mizpah Church Road has ample capacity.	
<b>SITE-SPECIFIC RECOMMENDED CONDITIONS OF APPROVAL</b>	
<p>The following conditions are proposed from interdepartmental review comments to meet established standards or reduce negative off-site impacts:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• <b><u>PRIOR TO THE ISSUANCE OF GRADING PERMITS:</u></b> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>a. Developer shall have a stormwater management study submitted for review by the City of Winston-Salem. If required, an engineered stormwater management plan shall be submitted and approved. Relocation or installation of any stormwater control measure into any buffer areas, vegetated areas designated to remain, or in close proximity to adjacent residentially zoned land shall require a Staff Change approval at minimum and may require a Site Plan Amendment.</li> <li>b. Developer shall obtain a driveway permit from the City of Winston-Salem and NCDOT; additional improvements may be required prior to issuance of the driveway permit(s). Required improvements include: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• At the westernmost access (across from Ridge Bluff Drive), installation of a left turn lane with a 75-foot minimum storage length on westbound Mizpah Church Road.</li> </ul> </li> </ol> </li> <li>• <b><u>PRIOR TO THE ISSUANCE OF BUILDING PERMITS:</u></b> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>a. The proposed building plans shall be in substantial conformance with the submitted elevations as verified by Planning staff.</li> <li>b. Developer shall obtain all necessary off-site public sewer easements.</li> </ol> </li> <li>• <b><u>PRIOR TO THE ISSUANCE OF OCCUPANCY PERMITS:</u></b> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>a. Developer shall complete all requirements of the driveway permit(s).</li> <li>b. Buildings shall be constructed in substantial conformance with the approved building elevations as verified by Planning staff.</li> <li>c. Developer shall record a public access easement along Willow Forest Circle connecting Mizpah Church Road to Martha Avenue.</li> </ol> </li> <li>• <b><u>OTHER REQUIREMENTS:</u></b> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>a. Entry signage along Mizpah Church Road shall be of monument style, with a maximum height of six (6) feet and a maximum area of 36 square feet. No entry signage shall be permitted at the Martha Avenue access.</li> </ol> </li> </ul>	

**STAFF RECOMMENDATION: Approval**

**NOTE:** These are **staff comments** only; **final recommendations** are made by the City-County Planning Board, and **final action** is taken by the appropriate Elected Body, who may approve, deny, continue, or request modifications to any proposal. **THE APPLICANT OR**

**REPRESENTATIVE IS STRONGLY ENCOURAGED TO ATTEND THE PUBLIC HEARINGS WHERE THE PROPOSAL IS CONSIDERED BY THE PLANNING BOARD AND/OR THE ELECTED BODY.**

---

---

**CITY-COUNTY PLANNING BOARD  
PUBLIC HEARING  
MINUTES FOR F-1309  
SEPTEMBER 10, 2020**

Desmond Corley presented the staff report.

Melynda Dunigan asked about the lack of connection between the larger multi-family units and the western portion of the 150 acres. And stated that another connection to the west would be less of a burden on neighborhood streets to the east. Staff confirmed that the stream that is shown on the area map presented topographical issues for connection, which was confirmed by Matthew Kirchner, a representative from Eagle Engineering, working on the project.

George Bryan asked whether Martha Avenue and Vestal Road, which are stubbed streets, were maintained by the City and if there were plans to upgrade the streets. Staff was not aware of any discussion about upgrading these streets.

George asked what the City policy was on placing signs on side roads when we have a case such as this one. Staff stated that this was a Final Development Plan, not a rezoning, and signs were not required. However, for the conversion related to this case, property owner letters were sent out, signs were posted, and the Final Development Plan case number was included on the signs.

George asked for clarification on providing a cross access easement on Willow Circle to Martha Avenue. Desmond stated that this would create public access from Martha Avenue, which is a public street, through this development to Mizpah Church Road. A secondary access for emergency services is required.

**PUBLIC HEARING**

FOR: None

AGAINST: None

**WORK SESSION**

Matthew Kirchner, Eagle Engineering, 2013 Van Buren Avenue, Indian Trail, NC 28079

Matthew confirmed staff's statements on topographical issues with connection.

George stated that in having discussions with some of the neighbors in the area, they were not aware of a road coming through to the development. He highlighted the dilemma in Martha Avenue being the connection to Mizpah Church Road and further discussed the second access.

George also emphasized that there is a lot being put on this neighborhood with traffic, the bypass, and somehow preserving this neighborhood from additional traffic. Many of the yards abut the road. Aaron King discussed problems that the City has seen over the years concerning connectivity and gave examples of several neighborhoods where this was an issue. George stated that it needed to be a high priority of the City to make city road planners aware of connection issues ahead of time so that surrounding roads can be made useable.

Melynda stated her concern about safety in that area because Martha Avenue and Vestal Road appear to be minimal in terms of their standards. There are no sidewalks for walkers, and the yards abut the road, as George previously stated. Her biggest concern is that, as the project builds out, there will be a connection to Vestal Road. Vestal Road will be backing up to the beltway on one side, and on the other side, there will be traffic coming from the development. She highlighted what a burden this will put on a neighborhood that was designed for the minimal street that is there presently.

MOTION: Clarence Lambe recommended that the Planning Board approve the Final Development Plan

SECOND: Tommy Hicks

VOTE:

FOR: George Bryan, Melynda Dunigan, Jason Grubbs, Tommy Hicks, Clarence Lambe, Chris Leak, Brenda Smith, Jack Steelman

AGAINST: None

EXCUSED: None

---

Aaron King  
Director of Planning and Development Services