

**STAFF REPORT**  
**for**  
**SEPTEMBER 2, 2020 HRC MEETING**

**Case #:** COA2020-094  
**Staff:** Heather M. Bratland

**Applicant:** Robert Falkowski

**LOCATION**

District: West End Historic Overlay District #572  
Street: 1519 Jarvis Street, Winston-Salem  
Building: House  
Status: Noncontributing  
Local Historic  
Landmark#: n/a

**REQUEST(S)**

- After-the-fact installation of vinyl windows and siding

**APPLICABLE SECTIONS OF DESIGN REVIEW GUIDELINES**

*West End Historic Overlay District Design Review Standards*  
**(Please refer to the applicable sections of the *Standards*, as detailed in the staff comments.)**

**PROJECT DESCRIPTION/ELEMENTS**

*Please refer to the information provided with the application.*

**STAFF COMMENTS**

The House is classified as a noncontributing structure built during the 1940s in the *West End Historic Overlay District Report*. However, the house was actually built ca. 1924. It is not shown on the 1921 Sanborn map, but it is shown on the June 1924 Sanborn map. Residents were listed at 1519 Jarvis Street in the 1925 Winston-Salem City Directory. Therefore, the appropriate noncontributing category for the House is a structure built before 1931 that has been insensitively altered. At the time of designation, the House was sheathed with asbestos shingles and had two picture windows in the street façade. No information regarding windows on the side or rear facades was recorded.

Staff noted the installation of vinyl siding and windows during a District walk with Duke Energy in January 2020 to look at tree trimming around the power lines. After researching Commission files, staff confirmed that the vinyl siding and windows were not present at the time of designation, were not shown in photos of the property dating to 2007, and that no COA for vinyl siding or windows had been issued. Staff then forwarded notice of the violation to Zoning Enforcement. Subsequently, the owner of the property submitted this after-the-fact COA application.

The applicant states that installation of vinyl siding and windows occurred during December 2013-January 2014.

**STAFF FINDINGS**

Commission staff finds that the project is incongruous with the character of the West End Historic Overlay District because:

- 1) Vinyl windows with grids between the glass are not appropriate in areas of high visibility. The windows in areas of high visibility must be either true divided light windows or simulated divided

light windows with permanently applied interior and exterior muntins. (*Noncontributing Structures*, West End Standard 1; *Windows and Doors*, West End Standard 6)

- 2) While it is possible that asbestos shingle was the original exterior cladding material, the boxed in eaves and enclosure of the left side porch indicate that the House had been re-clad sometime prior to the 1980s. Given the prevalence and relatively low cost of wooden clapboards, they were most likely originally used to clad the House. Removal of the vinyl siding and asbestos shingle to expose the clapboard is appropriate. The applicant has not shown that this is not feasible. Moreover, the applicant has not shown that using new wood clapboard is not feasible, which is necessary for the Commission to consider the use of a substitute material. (*Noncontributing Structures*, West End Standard 1; *Wood*, West End Standards 4 and 5)

### **STAFF RECOMMENDATION**

Based on the preceding findings, staff recommends that the Commission deny COA2020-094 at the House located at 1519 Jarvis Street, within the West End Historic Overlay District (PIN 6825-64-9591.00).