

STAFF REPORT
for
NOVEMBER 4, 2020 HRC MEETING

Case #: COA2020-111
Staff: Heather M. Bratland

Applicant: Robin "Ginny" Norton

LOCATION

District: West End Historic Overlay District #318
Street: 1101 Glade Street, Winston-Salem
Building: P. Oscar Leak House
Status: Contributing
Local Historic
Landmark#: n/a

REQUEST(S)

- Replacement of the slate roof

APPLICABLE SECTIONS OF DESIGN REVIEW STANDARDS

West End Historic Overlay District Design Review Standards
(Please refer to the applicable sections of the *Standards*, as detailed in the staff comments.)

PROJECT DESCRIPTION/ELEMENTS

Please refer to the information provided with the application.

STAFF COMMENTS

The *West End Historic Overlay District Report* describes the P. Oscar Leak House has having "a pyramidal roof with overhanging bracketed eaves" The roof material is not described.

STAFF FINDINGS

Commission staff finds that the project is not incongruous with the character of the West End Historic Overlay District because:

- 1) The applicant has provided evidence to show that it is not feasible to repair the slate roof or replace it with slate because of the "unavailability of skilled craftsmen". Per the application:

In October 2014, a 100 year old tree fell on the right side of our house (facing 5th street). The damage was significant particularly to the entire right and right front facing side of the house. The insurance company hired a slate roofing company from Durham to replace most of the right facing side of the roof. The work performed has caused problems since installation, typical of the experience we have had with slate roof contractors. In the greater Winston Salem area there is one contractor, Preferred Roofing. With greater than 30% of the slate damaged/worn, flashing deteriorated, and all hips/valley's needing to be addressed, the roof needs to be replaced. After much work and time spent trying to get the one contractor to our home for an assessment – 5 left messages, email, Facebook messages- we received no return calls. At this point, we need to get the roof replaced and moving to an alternative material provides us with more contractors to use for installation and ongoing maintenance. – Ginny Norton

(Roofs, West End Standards 4; *Appendix A – Glossary of Terms*, West End Feasibility Circumstance 2)

- 2) The applicant proposes to replace the slate with DaVinci tiles. The existing roof slates are uniform in width, a rectangular shape, and dark grey in color. DaVinci tiles are made of resin and molded from slates to exhibit the natural contours of natural slate. Like natural slate, the tiles vary slightly in color from one tile to the next. The tiles will be dark grey in color, a uniform width of 12”, and ½” thick at the butt ends. DaVinci tiles have been approved by the State Historic Preservation Office and National Park Service as a substitute material for slates on a tax credit rehabilitation project in Statesville. All flashing, drip edges, and trim will be replaced with new copper that matches the existing features. The roof form and detailing, including the brackets and chimneys, will be retained and preserved. The substitute material conveys the same appearance as the historic material, and the new material is compatible with the special character of the building. (Roofs, West End Standards 1, 3, and 4)

STAFF RECOMMENDATION

Based on the preceding findings, staff recommends that the Commission approve COA2020-111 at the P. Oscar Leak House located at 1101 Glade Street, within the West End Historic Overlay District (PIN 6825-86-0556.00), with the following conditions:

- 1) The applicant shall receive, prior to commencement of the work, all other required permits or permissions from governmental agencies;
- 2) Commission staff shall review and approve any revisions or deviations to any portion of the as-submitted work, that qualifies as a minor work, prior to commencement of that portion of the project; and,
- 3) The applicant shall submit the *Certificate of Appropriateness Request for Certification of Completed Work* and photo documentation of the completed project to HRC staff within ten (10) days of its completion.