

**STAFF REPORT**  
**for**  
**MARCH 3, 2021 HRC MEETING**

**Case #:** COA2021-012  
**Staff:** Heather M. Bratland

**Applicant:** Chris Sandman

**LOCATION**

District: West End Historic Overlay District #332  
Street: 1404 Clover Street, Winston-Salem  
Building: Charles P. Johnston House  
Status: Contributing  
Local Historic  
Landmark#: n/a

**REQUEST(S)**

- After-the-fact porch deck replacement with Azek composite boards

**APPLICABLE SECTIONS OF DESIGN REVIEW STANDARDS**

*West End Historic Overlay District Design Review Standards*  
**(Please refer to the applicable sections of the *Standards*, as detailed in the staff comments.)**

**PROJECT DESCRIPTION/ELEMENTS**

*Please refer to the information provided with the application.*

**STAFF COMMENTS**

This after-the-fact project is proposed to replace the tongue-and-groove wooden porch floor, which has already been demolished. The under-floor framing has been reconstructed and plywood underlayment has been installed.

**STAFF FINDINGS**

Commission staff finds that the project is incongruous with the character of the West End Historic Overlay District because:

- 1) The Azek composite boards do not match the historic floor in-kind, and the applicant has not provided evidence to show that repair of the porch floor is not feasible. A basement extends under the existing porch. Previously, the wooden tongue-and-groove porch floor was the only roof for this space. A home inspection identified mold on the building materials and wood frame in the basement under the porch, potentially caused by water infiltration through the porch floor. A floor joist pocketed into the brick foundation was found to be rotted out from water infiltration. The applicant has not provided sufficient information to demonstrate that the use of a substitute material on top of a waterproof membrane is necessary to address the water infiltration. (*Entrances, Porches, Enclosures, and Balconies*, West End Standards 3 and 5; *Appendix A-Glossary of Terms*, West End Feasibility Circumstance 3)

**STAFF RECOMMENDATION**

Based on the preceding findings, staff recommends that the Commission deny COA2021-012 at the Charles P. Johnston House, located at 1404 Clover Street, within the West End Historic Overlay District (PIN 6825-76-1898.00).