STAFF REPORT
for
MARCH 3, 2021 HRC MEETING

Case #: COA2021-012
Staff: Heather M. Bratland
Applicant: Chris Sandman

LOCATION

District: West End Historic Overlay District #332
Street: 1404 Clover Street, Winston-Salem
Building: Charles P. Johnston House
Status: Contributing
Local Historic Landmark#: n/a

REQUEST(S)

• After-the-fact porch deck replacement with Azek composite boards

APPLICABLE SECTIONS OF DESIGN REVIEW STANDARDS

West End Historic Overlay District Design Review Standards
(Please refer to the applicable sections of the Standards, as detailed in the staff comments.)

PROJECT DESCRIPTION/ELEMENTS

Please refer to the information provided with the application.

STAFF COMMENTS

This after-the-fact project is proposed to replace the tongue-and-groove wooden porch floor, which has already been demolished. The under-floor framing has been reconstructed and plywood underlayment has been installed.

STAFF FINDINGS

Commission staff finds that the project is incongruous with the character of the West End Historic Overlay District because:

1) The Azek composite boards do not match the historic floor in-kind, and the applicant has not provided evidence to show that repair of the porch floor is not feasible. A basement extends under the existing porch. Previously, the wooden tongue-and-groove porch floor was the only roof for this space. A home inspection identified mold on the building materials and wood frame in the basement under the porch, potentially caused by water infiltration through the porch floor. A floor joist pocketed into the brick foundation was found to be rotted out from water infiltration. The applicant has not provided sufficient information to demonstrate that the use of a substitute material on top of a waterproof membrane is necessary to address the water infiltration. (Entrances, Porches, Enclosures, and Balconies, West End Standards 3 and 5; Appendix A-Glossary of Terms, West End Feasibility Circumstance 3)

STAFF RECOMMENDATION

Based on the preceding findings, staff recommends that the Commission deny COA2021-012 at the Charles P. Johnston House, located at 1404 Clover Street, within the West End Historic Overlay District (PIN 6825-76-1898.00).