

STAFF REPORT
for
MARCH 3, 2021 HRC MEETING

Case #: COA2021-010
Staff: Heather M. Bratland

Applicant: Sue Family Investments c/o Melissa Sue Vaughan

LOCATION

District: West End Historic Overlay District #366
Street: 1101 West Fourth Street, Winston-Salem
Building: O'Hanlon-Joyce House
Status: Contributing
Local Historic
Landmark#: n/a

REQUEST(S)

- Replacement of the slate roof with CertainTeed Grand Manor shingles

APPLICABLE SECTIONS OF DESIGN REVIEW STANDARDS

West End Historic Overlay District Design Review Standards
(Please refer to the applicable sections of the *Standards*, as detailed in the staff comments.)

PROJECT DESCRIPTION/ELEMENTS

Please refer to the information provided with the application.

STAFF COMMENTS

The applicant requests permission to replace a slate roof with asphalt shingles. The shingles have randomly placed tabs designed to mimic the depth and dimensional appearance of slate from a distance. The *West End Historic Overlay District Report* states "the richly detailed weatherboarded house features a slate hip roof with a matching dormer"

STAFF FINDINGS

Commission staff finds that the project is not incongruous with the character of the West End Historic Overlay District because:

- 1) The applicant has provided evidence to show that it is not feasible to repair the slate roof or replace it with slate because of the "unavailability of skilled craftsmen." Per the applicant:

After a series of serious leaks, in 2017 ... trying to get a local roofing company ... to return a phone call was next to impossible. Every company we spoke with refused to deal with a slate roof. We hired a contractor out of Greensboro who claimed to have experience working with slate roof repair and replacement to do the partial roof on the right side in 2018-2019. We were able to locate slate from the Virginia Slate Company in Richmond, Va. Pennsylvania slate was no longer available The job was not done properly, the slate was improperly installed is now not salvageable. After firing the incompetent contractor, I learned that Preferred Roofing might handle slate roofs. I attempted to contact Preferred Roofing on numerous occasions, leaving several messages in November and December 2020. My calls were not returned. I also reached out to Angie's List which was a complete joke. I specifically indicated that I needed a roofing company with slate experience. Despite being told that "We've matched pros to

your Natural Slate Roof Install project,” that was not the case. The first company I called wanted me to file an insurance claim before they would talk to me. (J.W. Arnold Commercial and Residential Roofing LLC.) I left messages with three additional companies asking for someone to call me about a slate roof replacement and never got a return phone call. It is clear that there are very few, if any, roofers who want to work on a slate roof replacement. Under the circumstances, it is not feasible for us to find a skilled craftsman who could replace the slate roof. I have no confidence that there are any reputable roofing contractors with slate experience that will be willing tackle this job. A significant portion of the underlying sheeting, the valleys, hips and all flashing will need to be replaced. In addition, we need to repair the eaves on the left side and in the front of the house. Moving to an alternative material will provide us with more options for reputable roofing contractor and ease of repairs as we head into the future.

(Roofs, West End Standard 4; Appendix A-Glossary of Terms, West End Feasibility Circumstance 2)

- 2) The applicant proposes to replace the slate with CertainTeed Grand Manor shingles and install new copper flashing at the valleys, chimneys, and drip edges. The multi-layered asphalt shingles create shadows and convey the three-dimensional appearance of slate. The Restoration Branch of the State Historic Preservation Office has approved the use of these shingles on a state-owned historic house, and the National Park Service has approved their use at a rehabilitation tax credit project in Raleigh. The deteriorated metal ridgeline details and finials will be recreated in copper to match the existing features. (Roofs, West End Standards 1, 3, and 4)

STAFF RECOMMENDATION

Based on the preceding findings, staff recommends that the Commission approve COA2021-010 at the O’Hanlon-Joyce House, located at 1101 West Fourth Street, within the West End Historic Overlay District (PIN 6825-75-6920.00), with the following conditions:

- 1) The applicant shall receive, prior to commencement of the work, all other required permits or permissions from governmental agencies;
- 2) Commission staff shall review and approve any revisions or deviations to any portion of the as-submitted work, that qualifies as a minor work, prior to commencement of that portion of the project; and,
- 3) The applicant shall submit the *Certificate of Appropriateness Request for Certification of Completed Work* and photo documentation of the completed project to HRC staff within ten (10) days of its completion.