

# STAFF REPORT for AUGUST 4, 2021 HRC MEETING

**Case #:** COA2021-056  
**Staff:** Heather M. Bratland

**Applicant:** Keith Wales Jr.

## **LOCATION**

District: West End Historic Overlay District #104  
Street: 421 Summit Street, Winston-Salem  
Building: Office Building  
Status: Noncontributing  
Local Historic  
Landmark#: n/a

## **REQUEST(S)**

- Adaptive reuse

## **APPLICABLE DESIGN REVIEW STANDARDS**

*West End Historic Overlay District Design Review Standards* available at <https://www.cityofws.org/DocumentCenter/View/4089>; *Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation* available at <https://www.nps.gov/tps/standards/rehabilitation.htm>.

## **STAFF COMMENTS**

The Office Building is a noncontributing building designed by the Winston-Salem architecture firm of Lashmit, James, Brown, and Pollock and constructed in 1957 to serve as their office. Lashmit, James, Brown, and Pollock was the successor firm of the prominent Winston-Salem firm of Northup and O'Brien. Luther Lashmit became one of the firm's most sought-after architects after designing Graylyn. After Northup and O'Brien retired, Lashmit partnered with engineers M. D. Brown and W. W. Pollock, who joined the firm in 1929 and 1936, respectively, and architect William Russell James Jr. to reorganize the firm in 1953 under the name Lashmit, James, Brown, and Pollock. The opinion of staff is that the noncontributing building has individual historical and architectural significance.

## **STAFF FINDINGS**

Commission staff finds that the project is not incongruous with the character of the West End Historic Overlay District because:

- 1) The historic character of the property will be retained and preserved. The simple rectilinear form and clean lines of the Modernist design will be retained and preserved, as will the brick cladding and steel columns at the storefront. While the glass and aluminum storefront and second floor window on the Summit Street façade will be replaced, the new storefront and window will replicate the materials and design of the existing fenestration and maintain its pattern of vertical modules, while complying with current building code. The removal of the sun louvers at the second floor of the Summit Street façade will not diminish the building's historic character. The brick will be painted, maintaining the original appearance of a darker shade on the recessed lower floor and a lighter color above. Painting the modern, hard-fired brick will not damage the material. (*Noncontributing Structures*, West End Standard 2; *Secretary's Standards*, Rehabilitation Standards 2, 5, and 7)
- 2) Both original openings on the Summit Street façade will include operable casement windows at the southern bays, necessitating new horizontal framing members. Two additional entry doors for

commercial tenant spaces will be added at the ground floor of the Summit Street façade. These minor alterations from the original door and window configuration will differentiate the new work from the old. Three new single-bay openings will be punched into the second floor of the Summit Street façade, and they will be compatible in size and shape with the historic modules. The single module configuration differentiates these openings from the multi-module historic openings. Like the storefront and historic window openings, these will be infilled with aluminum and glass casement and fixed windows. The new windows and doors are compatible with the historic materials, features, size, scale, and proportion. (*Noncontributing Structures*, West End Standard 2; *Secretary's Standards*, Rehabilitation Standard 9)

- 3) On the 4 ½ Street façade, a flush metal egress door will be installed at the ground level. At the rear façade, two obsolete mechanical louvers will be removed and the openings infilled with matching brick. Neither of these alterations will destroy historic material that characterizes the property. A band of aluminum and glass casement windows will be installed in an existing second floor window opening on the rear façade. Two new openings will be cut into the second-floor brick of the rear façade and infilled with a mixture of fixed panes and doors. The rectilinear shape of the openings is compatible with the historic character of the building, as are the materials and design of the new doors and windows. However, the difference in size from the historic module differentiates this work from the original. (*Noncontributing Structures*, West End Standard 2; *Secretary's Standards*, Rehabilitation Standard 9)
- 4) In the parking lot, a wooden stockade fence screening mechanical equipment will be removed. In the same area of the lot, a brick wall with painted-steel fence inset will be installed to create a screened outdoor recreation area adjacent to the second-floor residential space. The new wall is compatible with the site and property in terms of size, height, scale, and materials; it will not impact the site topography or any historic site features. Metal is an appropriate material for fences in an area of low visibility. (*Walls*, West End Standards 5 and 9; *Fences*, West End Standard 4)
- 5) A small patio composed of porcelain pavers, a porcelain paver walkway, a brick fireplace, planting areas, and an above-ground pool will be installed inside the walled area, which is within the area of low visibility and screened from view. The patio is compatible with the special character of the building and site; tile is an appropriate paving material. The walkway is an appropriate scale, and it will not impact the site topography or any historic site features. The brick fireplace will be constructed adjacent to the building and can be removed without damaging it. The pool will not be visible to the public; therefore, it will not be incongruous with the special character of the West End. (*Decks, Terraces, and Patios*, West End Standards 3 and 4; *Noncontributing Structures*, West End Standard 2; *Walkways and Steps*, West End Standard 7; *Accessory Features: Commercial Trash Receptacles and Recreational Features*, West End Standards 2 and 4)

### **STAFF RECOMMENDATION**

Based on the preceding findings, staff recommends that the Commission approve COA2021-056 at the Office Building, located at 421 Summit Street, within the West End Historic Overlay District (PIN 6825-86-7809.00), with the following conditions:

- 1) The applicant shall receive, prior to commencement of the work, all other required permits or permissions from governmental agencies;
- 2) Commission staff shall review and approve any revisions or deviations to any portion of the as-submitted work, that qualifies as a minor work, prior to commencement of that portion of the project; and,

- 3) The applicant shall submit the *Certificate of Appropriateness Request for Certification of Completed Work* and photo documentation of the completed project to HRC staff within ten (10) days of its completion.