

STAFF REPORT
for
SEPTEMBER 1, 2021 HRC MEETING

Case #: COA2021-063
Staff: Heather M. Bratland

Applicant: Elizabeth Scalf

LOCATION

District: West End Historic Overlay District #554
Street: 111 South Sunset Drive, Winston-Salem
Building: House
Status: Noncontributing
Local Historic
Landmark#: n/a

REQUEST(S)

- After-the-fact porch remodel and replacement of landscape railings

APPLICABLE DESIGN REVIEW STANDARDS

West End Historic Overlay District Design Review Standards available at <https://www.cityofws.org/DocumentCenter/View/4089>

STAFF COMMENTS

The House was constructed after 1930, and it has no individual historical or architectural significance.

STAFF FINDINGS

Commission staff finds that the after-the-fact porch remodel is not incongruous with the character of the West End Historic Overlay District because:

- 1) The deteriorated and sinking concrete steps and porch will be replaced with a painted wood porch floor and steps. A painted wood porch floor and steps are compatible with the style and character of the simple house and the special character of the West End. (*Noncontributing Structures*, West End Standard 3)
- 2) The wooden porch railings will be replaced with a railing constructed of painted wooden posts and handrails with black aluminum balusters. The neo-traditional style of the railings is compatible with the simple character of the mid-20th-century cottage, and it is compatible with, yet differentiated from, the historic character of contributing West End porch railings. (*Noncontributing Structures*, West End Standard 3)
- 3) The porch roof will be changed from a shed roof to an end-gable roof. The roof will be sheathed with standing seam metal because it is not possible to match the faded asphalt shingles. The roof form is compatible with the character of the house and the West End. Standing-seam metal is an appropriate material for roofing in the West End. The West End includes historic houses that combine metal porch roofs with a different shingle material on the main body of the house. This treatment is consistent with the character of the house and the West End. (*Noncontributing Structures*, West End Standard 3)
- 4) The porch ceiling and fascia will be finished with white vinyl beadboard. The house is clad with vinyl siding, as is the existing porch ceiling and fascia. The use of vinyl for these features is consistent with the character of the house. (*Noncontributing Structures*, West End Standard 3)

Commission staff finds that the after-the-fact replacement of landscape railings is incongruous with the character of the West End Historic Overlay District because:

- 5) The pipe railings at the steps between the driveway and front yard will be replaced with railings constructed of painted wooden posts and handrails with aluminum balusters, which will match the porch railings. Metal and wood are appropriate materials for railings in areas of high visibility. The railings are located in an area of high visibility and are not compatible with existing railings that are not incongruous with the character of the West End. Existing railings that are compatible with the character of the West End blend with the landscape and are visually unobtrusive, constructed with minimal post dimensions, and only located on one side of the stairs. (*Railings in the Landscape*, West End Standards 1 and 2)

STAFF RECOMMENDATION

Based on the preceding findings, staff recommends that the Commission approve COA2021-063 with respect to the after-the-fact porch remodel and deny COA2021-063 with respect to the after-the-fact replacement of railings in the landscape, all at the House, located at 111 South Sunset Drive, within the West End Historic Overlay District (PIN 6825-64-9803.00), with the following condition:

- 1) The wooden porch elements shall be painted within three (3) months of the issuance of this Certificate of Appropriateness.