

# STAFF REPORT for SEPTEMBER 1, 2021 HRC MEETING

**Case #:** COA2021-065  
**Staff:** Heather M. Bratland

**Applicant:** John Bacon and Raquel Ward

## **LOCATION**

District: West End Historic Overlay District #291  
Street: 1111 Brookstown Avenue, Winston-Salem  
Building: House  
Status: Contributing  
Local Historic  
Landmark#: n/a

## **REQUEST(S)**

- Landscape alterations and porch floor replacement

## **APPLICABLE DESIGN REVIEW STANDARDS**

*West End Historic Overlay District Design Review Standards* available at <https://www.cityofws.org/DocumentCenter/View/4089>

## **STAFF COMMENTS**

The “Colonial Revival dwelling is one of the typical 1920s expressions of the style. ... The central entrance provides the most handsome detailing, with a six-panel door with narrow sidelights and wooden semicircular fan suggesting a Palladian design motif, and a porch with slender Tuscan posts and a pedimented entablature with a barrel-vaulted ceiling.” The appearance of the retaining wall, steps, and walkways are not described in the *West End Historic Overlay District Report*.

## **STAFF FINDINGS**

Commission staff finds that the landscape alterations are not incongruous with the character of the West End Historic Overlay District because:

- 1) The existing concrete retaining walls do not contribute to the special character of the property, and they do not include unique construction methods or design features. The concrete retaining wall to the right of the steps is significantly deteriorated and in need of replacement to stabilize the lot. The replacement wall will be veneered with rounded fieldstone with flat joints. The existing retaining wall to the left of the steps will be veneered with rounded fieldstone. Both stone-veneered walls will be capped with 2” thick Pennsylvania bluestone. The stone-veneered walls will be compatible with the special character of the House, the West End, and existing walls that contribute to the special character of the West End. Stone is an appropriate material for walls in an area of high visibility. The stone-veneered walls will not impact the property’s historic features, and they are compatible with the site in setback, size, height, and scale. The stone-veneered walls will follow the topography of the site. (*Retaining and Other Landscaping Walls*, West End Standards 1, 3-7)
- 2) The existing concrete walkways and steps do not contribute to the special character of the West End. The concrete stair risers will be veneered with rounded fieldstone to match the veneered retaining walls. The concrete stair treads will be capped with 2” thick Pennsylvania bluestone. The concrete walkways will be covered with patterned Pennsylvania bluestone set in mortar. The proposed design for the walkways and steps is compatible with the special character of the property, West End, and existing walkways and steps that contribute to the special character of

the West End. Stone is an appropriate material for replacement walkways and steps in an area of high visibility. The location, dimensions, and elevations of the steps and walkways will not be changed. (*Walkways and Steps*, West End Standards 1, 3-5)

- 3) Two curved, 32" high cheek walls veneered with rounded fieldstone and capped with bluestone will be constructed on either side of the upper set of stairs. The new walls will be compatible with existing walls that contribute to the special character of the West End. They will not impact the property's historic features, and they are compatible with the site in setback, size, height, and scale. Stone is an appropriate material for new walls in an area of high visibility. (*Retaining and Other Landscaping Walls*, West End Standards 4-5, 7)
- 4) The proposed bluestone stepping stone path will connect the upper walkway with 4 ½ Street. The bluestones will have a natural edge. The proposed path is compatible with the special character of the property, West End, and existing walkways and steps that contribute to the special character of the West End. The new path will not impact any historic features or the topography of the site. Stone is an appropriate material for a new walkway in an area of high visibility. (*Walkways and Steps*, West End Standards 4-5)
- 5) Two 3' wide, bluestone slab steps will be added in the side yard to provide access to the air-conditioning unit. The bluestone steps are compatible with existing steps that contribute to the special character of the West End. Stone is an appropriate material for steps in an area of high visibility. (*Walkways and Steps*, West End Standards 4-5)

Commission staff finds that replacement of the porch floor is incongruous with the character of the West End Historic Overlay District because:

- 6) The proposed bluestone porch floor will cover the existing terracotta porch floor, a historic and functional feature of the porch. The terracotta porch floor is not damaged or deteriorated, and it is not in need of repair or replacement. Numerous other historic properties in the West End have terracotta porch floors, including the 1924 Craftsman apartment building at 864-866 West Fourth Street, the 1924 Craftsman duplex at 124-126 South Sunset Drive, the 1927 Colonial Revival Poole-Kiser House at 1404 West First Street, the 1927 Colonial Revival Masten House at 804 West End Boulevard, the 1930 Craftsman Louis Reznick House at 130-132 Piedmont Avenue, and the 1942 Y.W.C.A. at 1201 Glade Street. (*Entrances, Porches, Enclosures, and Balconies*, West End Standards 1 and 2)

### **STAFF RECOMMENDATION**

Based on the preceding findings, staff recommends that the Commission approve COA2021-065 with respect to the landscape alterations and deny COA2021-065 with respect to the porch floor, all at the House, located at 1111 Brookstown Avenue, within the West End Historic Overlay District (PIN 6825-86-4743.00), with the following conditions:

- 1) The applicant shall receive, prior to commencement of the work, all other required permits or permissions from governmental agencies;
- 2) Commission staff shall review and approve any revisions or deviations to any portion of the as-submitted work, which qualify as minor work, prior to commencement of that portion of the project; and,
- 3) The applicant shall submit the Certificate of Appropriateness Request for Certification of Completed Work form and photo documentation of the completed project to HRC staff within ten (10) days of its completion.