

## STAFF REPORT APRIL 6, 2022 HRC MEETING

**Case #:** COA2022-020  
**Staff:** Heather M. Bratland

**Applicant:** Teresa Grossi

### **LOCATION**

District: West End Historic Overlay District #183  
Street: 1001 West Fifth Street, Winston-Salem  
Building: James S. Easley House  
Status: Contributing  
Local Historic  
Landmark#: n/a

### **REQUEST(S)**

- Replacement of the porch columns

### **APPLICABLE DESIGN REVIEW STANDARDS**

*West End Historic Overlay District Design Review Standards* available at:  
<https://www.cityofws.org/DocumentCenter/View/4089>

### **STAFF COMMENTS**

According to the *West End Historic Overlay District Report*, the James S. Easley House has a “wrap-around porch with turned posts and a pedimented entrance bay. ... The only significant change has been the post-1945 enclosure of the porch, but this does not appear irreversible and does not destroy the integrity of the house.” The survey photographs of the house do not show the posts. The porch enclosure walls have been removed, and the posts are modern replacements exhibiting comb joints and a thin coating of paint. The scroll sawn brackets appear to be original and have significant paint build up.

### **STAFF FINDINGS**

Commission staff finds that the project is not incongruous with the character of the West End Historic Overlay District because:

- 1) The applicant proposes to replace the modern wooden columns with new composite columns. The existing wooden replacement columns use modern carpentry techniques and have very little paint build up, evidence of post-1980 installation. They have already begun to rot and decay at the bases where they absorb water from the porch floor. This is an inherent flaw in the design of the porch, which situates the column bases close to the edge of the porch in an exposed area. The pine replacement columns available today are not the same quality as historic wood, which has a much tighter grain and is more rot resistant. The applicant has demonstrated that it is not feasible to replace the columns in-kind because of inherent flaws in the original materials or design and the unavailability of historic materials. Composite is an appropriate substitute material that will convey the same appearance as wooden columns. The composite columns will be turned, which is the style of column documented in the narrative description for the James S. Easley House. The applicant will reinstall the historic wooden brackets after replacing the columns. (*Entrances, Porches, Enclosures, and Balconies*, West End Standards 1, 2, 4, and 5; *Glossary*, West End Standards: Feasibility)

## **STAFF RECOMMENDATION**

Based on the preceding findings, staff recommends that the Commission approve COA2022-020 at the James S. Easley House located at 1001 West Fifth Street (PIN 6825-86-1766), within the West End Historic Overlay District, with the following conditions:

- 1) The applicant shall receive, prior to commencement of the work, all other required permits or permissions from governmental agencies;
- 2) Commission staff shall review and approve any revisions or deviations to any portion of the as-submitted work, that qualifies as a minor work, prior to commencement of that portion of the project; and
- 3) The applicant shall submit the Certificate of Appropriateness Request for Certification of Completed Work form and photo documentation of the completed project to HRC staff within ten (10) days of its completion.