

STAFF REPORT MAY 4, 2022 HRC MEETING

Case #: COA2022-021
Staff: Michelle M. McCullough

Applicant: Adam Spear

LOCATION

District: N/A
Street: 102 South Cherry Street, Winston-Salem
Building: Rogers House
Status: Contributing
Local Historic
Landmark#: 40

REQUEST(S)

- New construction of an outbuilding

APPLICABLE DESIGN REVIEW STANDARDS

Forsyth County Design Review Standards for Local Historic Landmarks available at <https://www.cityofws.org/DocumentCenter/View/21035/Historic-Landmark-Standards-July-2021-PDF>

STAFF FINDINGS

Commission staff finds that the project is not incongruous with the character of the Landmark because:

- 1) The proposed outbuilding will be located at the rear of the lot in a traditional location for outbuildings on this block and site. It is, therefore, compatible with the visual and spatial character of the Landmark's setting. The proposed outbuilding is sited at the rear corner of the property, adjacent to First and Marshall Streets. It is set back from the primary structure's facade along Cherry Street with its main facade oriented south. The 1917 Sanborn Fire Insurance Company map shows two outbuildings adjacent to Marshall Street on this lot, one in the location of the proposed outbuilding. The new construction will not diminish or compromise the character of the Landmark building at this location and conforms to the historic patterns of building setbacks and spacing. The size and the orientation of the proposed building is not consistent with other historical outbuildings, however, no significant site features will be lost with the construction of this outbuilding. (*New Construction*, Landmark Standards 1-3; *Outbuildings and Garages*, Landmark Standards 8-10; *Setting*, Landmark Standard 3)
- 2) The proposed building is one-story, 28' high at its highest, 65' long x 34' wide. Although the building footprint is large, it is a single story, and it does not overpower the Landmark building. There will be less green space in the rear yard. However, the yard was not noted as having any significant features in the Landmark application and report. (*New Construction*, Landmark Standard 4; *Outbuildings and Garages*, Landmark Standard 11)
- 3) Most homes in the downtown had rear yard outbuildings, which were utilitarian in nature and simple in design and shape. Many did not mimic the style or massing of the primary house. The proposed outbuilding is compatible with typical simple outbuilding form and detailing by combining a rectangular design with a side gable asphalt architectural shingle roof and minimal detailing. The siding is proposed to be yellow pine wood lap siding, of a size and dimension to match the Landmark building. The proposed design and features are compatible with Landmark building. The proposed design will include six exterior matte black wall lights that look like lanterns. The lights are 12" high by 7" inches wide. The proposed outbuilding is compatible in materials with the historic materials of the Landmark building with regard to composition, size, shape, pattern, texture, scale,

detail, color, and surface finish. (*New Construction*, Landmark Standards 5-7; *Outbuildings and Garages*, Landmark Standards 6 and 7)

- 4) The proposed outbuilding utilizes compatible windows that are wood, paired four-light casement windows, which mimic the four-light casement windows found in one of the rear additions of the Landmark building. The south facade will include three sets of paired, wooden French doors flanked by sidelights. The north elevation will include four pairs of four-light casement windows. The east elevation will have two pairs of wooden, four-light casement windows and two wooden, eight-light doors. The Landmark building has one set of wooden double doors and a wooden single door both facing Cherry Street. The doors and windows selected are compatible in configuration, proportion, material, and detail with the windows and doors of the Landmark building. The relationship of solids to voids in the exterior walls is compatible with other secondary structures and the Landmark building. (*New Construction*, Landmark Standard 6; *Outbuildings and Garages*, Landmark Standard 6)
- 5) The Landmark building is an example of the move toward eclecticism in late Victorian architecture, with clearly stated influences of the Gothic Revival, Italianate and Queen Anne styles. The design of the proposed outbuilding is compatible with, but differentiated from, the Landmark building due to its simpler design and style. (*New Construction*, Landmark Standard 8)
- 6) A brick patio is proposed to be located adjacent to the south facade. The brick will be a red, reclaimed brick, laid in a herringbone pattern. An existing sidewalk made of similar brick leads from the parking area to the front porch. This patio is a new feature that is compatible with the visual, spatial, and associative characteristics of the Landmark's setting and historic context. (*Setting*, Landmark Standard 3; *Site Features and Plantings*, Landmark Standard 8)

STAFF RECOMMENDATION

Based on the preceding findings, staff recommends that the Commission approve COA2022-021 at the Rogers House, Local Historic Landmark #40, located at 102 South Cherry Street, Winston-Salem (PIN 6835-15-6438), with the following conditions:

- 1) The applicant shall meet with historic resources staff and the City's Urban Forester to select appropriate plantings to screen the First and Marshall Street facades of the outbuilding;
- 2) The applicant shall submit a COA application and receive a COA for installation of said plantings within three (3) months of the issuance of the COA and install such plantings within nine (9) months of completion of the project;
- 3) The applicant shall submit a COA application and receive a COA for screening of the HVAC unit prior to installation; the COA application shall include the design, material, height, and details of the screening; the screening shall be installed within three (3) months of the issuance of the COA;
- 4) The applicant shall receive, prior to commencement of the work, all other required permits or permissions from governmental agencies;
- 5) Commission staff shall review and approve any revisions or deviations to any portion of the as-submitted work, that qualifies as a minor work, prior to commencement of that portion of the project; and
- 6) The applicant shall submit the Certificate of Appropriateness Request for Certification of Completed Work form and photo documentation of the completed project to HRC staff within ten (10) days of its completion.