01.16) Application for Certificate of Appropriateness
City of Winston-Salem
100 E 1st St., 520 | Winston-Salem, NC 27101
P: 336-727-8000 | E: citylink@cityofws.org

Project Overview

Project Title: 823 S Church St - tree removal for driveway repair
Application Type: 01.16) Application for Certificate of Appropriateness
Workflow: 01.16) Application for Certificate of Appropriateness

Jurisdiction: City of Winston-Salem
State: NC
County: Forsyth

01.16) Application for Certificate of Appropriateness

Address of Subject Property: 823 S Church ST (6835-32-4072.000)
Local Historic Landmark?: Yes

Landmark Number (if applicable. Type "N/A: if not): 35
Are you amending a previously submitted COA?: Yes
Is this an "After the Fact" COA application?: No

PIN(s) of subject property: 823 S Church ST (6835-32-4072.000)
Landmark Name (If applicable. Type "N/A: if not): Anna Johanna Vogler House
Local Historic District: Old Salem
Prior COA case #: (if applicable): COA2020-126

Project Description

COA Project Intent and Background Statement (click "help" for description):
One of the purposes listed and approved in our original COA2020-126 was "Repair and stabilize driveway that is slowly collapsing." As an example, the wheel of a contractor's pickup truck broke through the asphalt into a hole a few feet in diameter. The contractor who will be supervising the driveway repair brought to our attention additional damage to our current driveway by a holly tree that is just a few feet from the driveway. Additionally, the holly tree canopy is currently competing with that of a large beautiful oak tree.

COA Scope of Work (click the "help" button for description):
The previously approved driveway repair will necessarily involve the removal of at least one holly tree root that is currently damaging the existing driveway. Since the driveway cannot be relocated, we propose to remove the holly tree to mitigate damage to the driveway once it is repaired. This will also provide the large oak tree canopy "breathing space".

COA Compliance with Design Review Standards and/or Guidelines (Copies of the Design Review standards for each district can be found online here:
https://www.cityofws.org/1397/Publications):
Old Salem Historic District Standards, page 52, states that trees may be removed if hazardous to property. The holly tree has damaged the driveway and, given its immediate proximity, will be prone to do the same following an expensive driveway repair.

We have already planted a number of native trees and have not removed any native trees from the property. To compensate for the holly tree removal, I propose planting a few holly trees at the rear boundary of our lot (I will even ask Salem College permission to plant on their side of the boundary). Someone many years ago planted BANANA trees there, completely
inappropriate. Perhaps the holly trees could shade them into oblivion. Frequent machete attacks have failed to succeed.

Project Contacts

**Applicant Full Name:** James W Lester Jr

**Applicant Address:**

3010 Creola Wood Drive

Chapel Hill, NC 27514

**Applicant Phone:** (919) 696-3877

**Applicant Email Address:** jw@ncmaps.org

**Owner Full Name (If not the applicant):**

**Owner Address:**

**Owner Phone Number (If not the applicant):**

**Owner Email Address:**

COA Consent Statement

We, the applicant and owner (if not the applicant), do hereby make an application for a Certificate of Appropriateness (COA) for the following project to be undertaken within the boundaries of a Historic District, Historic Overlay District, or Local Historic Landmark.

We understand that all required information must be submitted for this application to be considered complete, assigned a case number, and either (a) processed by staff as a minor work project, or (b) placed on the agenda of the Forsyth County Historic Resources Commission. By applying for a COA and signing below, we give permission to staff of Winston-Salem/Forsyth County Planning & Development Services to enter upon the property to (1) post signage at the property regarding a pending COA application and (2) inspect the property for any reason related to this application and/or an issued COA. We understand that an interior inspection may be necessary for proposed changes to the interior of a Local Historic Landmark.
Holly tree

Driveway damage from holly tree root
Ms. McCullough-

As requested by the property owner, we made a delightful site visit to 823 S. Church St. in the Historic Old Salem District to assess the condition a 19" DBh American holly. The property owner intends to make repairs to the driveway on the south side of the tree and would like to remove the tree as part of the project. The tree appears to be in good health with no obvious signs of decline or disease. It has been topped in the past but has recovered well from the mistreatment. It is growing beneath the canopy of a larger Red oak planted in the City ROW. They are in competition for resources but seem to have reached an agreement where they both thrive. The Holly is beginning to grow into some limbs on the outer edge of the Oak’s crown, but this is not overly problematic and could be handled with some selective pruning to create more space for both. The main concern for the property owner seems to be the root which is beneath the asphalt near the throat of the driveway. It can be seen pushing up the paved surface. One option here is to simply remove the offending root once the paved surface has been removed in preparation for the new driveway. If the tree is to be retained, this should be done making a clean cut with a sharp tool and not merely ripped out with an excavator or similar piece of equipment. I should also point out that more than just this one root may be damaged during the course of the project.

Contractors will most likely need to excavate 4" below the surface to pour the driveway. The continued viability of the tree will be contingent upon how much of the root mass will be impacted by activity in its immediate surroundings. In order to preserve and maintain the tree, industry standards require a protection zone where the root mass will remain undisturbed in a minimum area equal to one foot for every inch of trunk diameter. This is only a minimum suggestion and 1.5' for every inch of trunk diameter is preferred. In this case, since the tree measures 19” DBH, the minimum area should be nineteen feet. Given the edge of the driveway is five feet from the base of the tree on the South side, it will be impossible to maintain the minimum approach distances for the protection zone. Most of the driveway is directly beneath the dripline of the tree on the South quadrant. It is fair to assume that a significant amount of root mass will be compromised during the course of the project. I would estimate between a quarter and a third of the root mass will be disturbed. Not only is the amount of root mass to be impacted concerning, but also the size of the roots and how close the project is to the tree. The further away from the base, the smaller the diameter of the roots to be damaged/severed. The closer to the tree, the larger the diameter of the roots to be compromised and so to is the impact on the health of the tree. It is entirely possible that roots within the structural root plate will be damaged during construction. Damage within the structural root plate often results in structural instability or tree mortality. The structural root plate for a tree of this size is roughly 8.5’. As mentioned above, the edge of the driveway rests only 5’ from the base of the tree.

While the current condition of the tree is good, I cannot say that it will be once the project is completed. Most often the tree will show signs of stress 2-3 years after completion of construction projects. If the damage is severe, it can be evidenced that same growing season. While Hollies are known to be relatively resistant to injury due to construction, the proximity of the project and the amount of root mass to be impacted is concerning for the continued success/survival of the tree. While I cannot say definitively the tree will or will not survive, I can say it will be significantly impacted by the project.

Best regards,

Derek Renegar
Urban Forester
City of Winston-Salem
336-748-3019
derekr@cityofws.org