01.16) Application for Certificate of Appropriateness

City of Winston-Salem
100 E 1st St., 520 | Winston-Salem, NC 27101
P: 336-727-8000 | E: citylink@cityofws.org

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Project Overview</th>
<th>#950715</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Project Title:</strong> Rogers House 102 S Cherry St</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Application Type:</strong> 01.16) Application for Certificate of Appropriateness</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Workflow:</strong> 01.16) Application for Certificate of Appropriateness</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Jurisdiction:</strong> City of Winston-Salem</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>State:</strong> NC</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>County:</strong> Forsyth</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### 01.16) Application for Certificate of Appropriateness

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Address of Subject Property:</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>- 102 CHERRY ST WINSTON SALEM NC 27101 (Unverified)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- 102 S CHERRY ST (6835-15-6438.000)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

| Local Historic Landmark?: Yes |
| Landmark Number (if applicable. Type "N/A: if not): #40 |

| Are you amending a previously submitted COA?: Yes |
| Is this an "After the Fact" COA application?: Yes |
| PIN(s) of subject property: |
| - 102 CHERRY ST WINSTON SALEM NC 27101 (Unverified) |
| - 102 S CHERRY ST (6835-15-6438.000) |

| Landmark Name (If applicable. Type "N/A: if not): Rogers House |
| Local Historic District: Non-Applicable |
| Prior COA case #: (if applicable): |

### Project Description

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>COA Project Intent and Background Statement (click &quot;help&quot; for description):</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

To restore and preserve the Rodgers house.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>COA Scope of Work (click the &quot;help&quot; button for description):</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

Foundation repair:

Adjustments to the East facing Porch:

Siding Replacement:

Exterior lighting At back doors:

Roof Replacement:

Replacement of Sliding Doors on West side:

Replacement of North West Porch:

Removal and Replacement of Lattico Work:

Removal of Windows:

Replacement of the rear east Posterior Staircase:

Replacement of Retaining wall:

New walkway to the Property:

Foundation repair:

Removal of Non-Original Wall:

Judges Molding:
Replacement with Third Floor Shutters:

COA Compliance with Design Review Standards and/or Guidelines (Copies of the Design Review standards for each district can be found [here](https://www.cityofws.org/1397/Publications);

**COA Compliance with Design Review Standards and/or Guidelines**

If all or part of a historic walkway, driveway, or on-site parking area is too damaged or deteriorated to repair, replace it with materials that are compatible in size, shape, appearance, color, and texture. Replace only the deteriorated section instead of the entire feature.

Introduce new walkways, driveways, and on-site parking areas in locations, configurations, materials, and scale that are compatible with the landmark building and site. It is not appropriate to introduce new walkways, driveways, or on-site parking areas if doing so will substantially alter the site's topography or necessitate the loss of significant site features.

Protect significant site features, such as mature trees significant to the landmark property from damage due to the construction of new walkways, driveways and on-site parking areas.

1. Introduce lighting for walkways, driveways, and on-site parking areas in accordance with the Standards for Exterior Lighting.
2. Replace damaged, deteriorated, or missing exterior lighting fixtures with new fixtures that are compatible with the character of the landmark building and site in terms of materials, design, scale, color, and brightness.
3. Limit the quantity and size of new exterior lighting fixtures to minimize their impact on the overall historic character of the landmark building and site. It is not appropriate to over-illuminate or indiscriminately light a landmark building façade or site. Consider the height, direction, brightness, and color of the light source in determining the appropriateness of proposed new lighting.
4. Introduce new exterior lighting in locations that do not diminish or compromise the historic character of the landmark building or site.
5. Introduce lighting for security and safety in ways that do not diminish or compromise the historic character of the landmark building or site. Where appropriate, install unobtrusive low-level lighting sources, including footlights, recessed lighting, post lights, or directional lights, to meet security or safety needs.
6. Retain and preserve wood features and surfaces including, but not limited to, clapboards, weatherboards, shingles, columns, balustrades, and architectural trim that contribute to the overall historic character of a building or site.
7. If all or part of a historic wood feature is too damaged or deteriorated to repair, replace to match the original in material.
design, dimension, detail, and finish. Replace only the deteriorated section instead of the entire feature. Consider a compatible substitute material only if replacement in kind is not possible.

- If all or part of a historic wood feature is missing, either replace it to match the original feature (if documentary evidence is available) or replace it with a new feature in a design compatible with the historic building or site in material, size, scale, finish, and detail.

Retain and preserve masonry features and surfaces including foundations, chimneys, retaining walls, landscape features, tile roofs, steps, walkways, and exterior walls that contribute to the overall historic character of a building site.

Repair damaged or deteriorated historic masonry features and surfaces through appropriate repair techniques including piecing in, patching, reinforcing, and consolidating.

Repoint deteriorated mortar joints as necessary to prevent moisture infiltration and deterioration. Match the original mortar in composition, color, strength, and texture. Match the dimension and profile of the original mortar joint.

Repair damaged or deteriorated historic exterior wall features and surfaces through appropriate repair techniques. It is not appropriate to remove exterior wall features, such as chimneys, storefronts, or architectural trim, rather than repair them.

- If all or part of a historic exterior wall or feature is too damaged or deteriorated to repair, replace to match the original in material, design, dimension, detail, color, and finish. Replace only the deteriorated section instead of the entire feature. Consider a compatible substitute material only if replacement in kind is not feasible.

Retain and preserve the features, details, and finishes of historic exterior windows and doors.

4. Repair damaged or deteriorated historic exterior windows and doors through appropriate repair techniques. 5. If all or part of a historic exterior window or door is missing, either replace it to match the original feature (if documentary evidence is available) or replace it with a new feature in a design compatible with the historic building in design, location, material, size, scale, proportion, pane and panel configuration, trim, muntin profile and style, color, and detail.

It is not appropriate to cover or eliminate a historic window or door on a prominent elevation or a location that is visible from the street.

Maintain and protect painted and stained finishes through traditional methods, including the following steps: Inspect finishes routinely for evidence of deterioration or damage due to moisture, mildew, discoloration, and soiling. Clean painted surfaces routinely with the gentlest means possible to extend the life of the
paint. Prepare previously painted surfaces carefully to ensure the
new paint will properly bond. Remove deteriorated paint layers
down to a sound surface using the gentlest means possible. It is
only appropriate to use heat guns or plates selectively to remove
paint layers if hand scraping or sanding are not effective. Repaint
features and surfaces with compatible paint systems when the
paint begins to deteriorate or fail.

- Select historically appropriate paint colors when repainting
  historic features and surfaces. It is not appropriate to paint metal
  or masonry surfaces that were not previously painted.

Retain and preserve the materials, line, shape, pitch, and
overhang of roofs that contribute to the overall historic character of
a building or structure.

3. Maintain and protect roofs and roof features through traditional
methods, including the following steps: Inspect roofs routinely for
evidence of deterioration or moisture damage and to ensure that
roofing materials are properly anchored to resist environmental
elements, such as water and wind. Ensure that roof sheathing is
properly ventilated to prevent moisture damage. Routinely clean
roof surfaces, gutters, and downspouts of debris and leaves.
Repaint previously painted roof surfaces as necessary to maintain
a sound paint surface.

4. Repair damaged or deteriorated historic roof features.

- Repair damaged or deteriorated historic entrance, porch, and
  balcony features and surfaces through appropriate repair
  techniques. Functional or decorative features, such as
  balustrades, brackets, columns, or concealed gutters should be
  repaired, rather than removed.

It is not appropriate to cover over or eliminate a historic entrance,
porch, or balcony window or door on a prominent elevation or a
location that is highly visible.

- If all or part of a historic building interior is missing, either
  replace it to match the original feature (if documentary evidence is
  available) or replace it with a new feature in a design compatible
  with the historic building in material, size, scale, and detail.
following project to be undertaken within the boundaries of a Historic District, Historic Overlay District, or Local Historic Landmark.

We understand that all required information must be submitted for this application to be considered complete, assigned a case number, and either (a) processed by staff as a minor work project, or (b) placed on the agenda of the Forsyth County Historic Resources Commission. By applying for a COA and signing below, we give permission to staff of Winston-Salem/Forsyth County Planning & Development Services to enter upon the property to (1) post signage at the property regarding a pending COA application and (2) inspect the property for any reason related to this application and/or an issued COA. We understand that an interior inspection may be necessary for proposed changes to the interior of a Local Historic Landmark.
Adjustments to the East facing Porch:

- Plexiglass walls: We will be removing the plexiglass walls on the front porch and restoring the porch to its original esthetic. These plexiglass walls are clearly not original to the house and do not depict the original architecture of the time period. We will be reconstructing the front porch to its original format, as an open air porch. This will include installing an exterior door from the foyer of The Roger's home, to the east facing side of the porch, which we believe to be true to the original structural layout.

- Wood porch floors: There is currently ½” plywood to accommodate indoor carpet, since this space was recently used as an indoor waiting room. We will be removing the plywood and replacing it with solid yellow pine 1x6 tongue and groove board, as used on the original north facing exterior porch.

- New railing: The current railings are only 28” in height. Due to new code restrictions and liability concerns, we want to change the railing height on the front porch to meet the minimum code restrictions of North Carolina building code height minimum of 34”. In order to raise the height we will have new spindles made and installed matching the same design and material of the original. If we only replaced the deteriorated spindles and railing, then we would have a porch with mismatched heights of railing. Clearly, this would not look appropriate. All spindles will have to be replaced in order to have the same height for liability concerns. We plan to do this on the east and north facing porches.
Siding Replacement:

- We are removing the existing siding due to extensive and full coverage rot. The rot is so extensive, that the building may suffer from structural integrity issues and potential pest issues if left and not addressed. The rot is not always visible to the naked eye due to the extensive amount of paint placed over the rot to cover up this extensive issue. While the siding is off, we will take this opportunity to insulate and place a vapor barrier in order to better preserve the building. We will replace the original pine siding with yellow pine. The original siding was 6" tall in varying lengths and was made out of different varieties of pine. We assume this comes from where replacements had been made over the years. The new siding is yellow pine, 6 inches tall, and comes in 12 to 16 ft lengths. The wood is primed on all sides to help permanently seal it in cases that water penetrates the front overlap. We will save all decorative accents and window trim that is not more than 25 percent rotten. Any replacements will be replicated using yellow pine.
Exterior lighting At back doors:
- We will be adding two outdoor wall sconces on the back french doors to provide proper sufficient lighting behind the building. This will allow proper lighting for safety and security of the building. We will be installing age appropriate lights, please see photos. These lights are made of metal and have seeded glass. 15"H x 6.2"W. These lights will be mounted on the right and left of the rear door, replacing the old flood lights that were originally mounted in the soffit overhang.
Roof Replacement:

- The roof is showing deterioration and has presented a couple minor leaks that have been patched over the years. To ensure the longevity of the property, we will replace the current asphalt shingle roof with a new asphalt shingle. The color and line of roofing we will be using is called natural shadow GAF Timberline shingle. Picture shown below. This is the same shingle that is currently on the home but in a different color.
Replacement of Sliding Doors on West side:

- We will replace the existing glass sliding doors on the posterior of the house (west facing). We will be installing solid wood french doors with a similar grid like pattern of the home's time period. The wood muntins have been installed on both the interior and exterior of the coor. The previous glass sliding door is where the new door is placed. No changes to the position of the door have been made. The muntins were installed with special formulated epoxy to the windows and are ¾ wide and are 58 ¾ long.
Exterior lighting At back doors:
- We will be adding two outdoor wall sconces on the back french doors to provide proper sufficient lighting behind the building. This will allow proper lighting for safety and security of the building. We will be installing age appropriate lights, please see photos. These lights are made of metal and have seeded glass. 15"H x 6.2"W. These lights will be mounted on the right and left of the rear door, replacing the old flood lights that were originally mounted in the soffit overhang.
Replacement of North West Porch:

- Upon inspection of the posterior porch, we found an original hand-bricked water well. A porch had then previously been built over the well, covering all appearance of the well after the original construction of the home. We would like to rebuild the porch with the same dimensions as the previous porch, but will uncover the well. We will also construct a brick ramp as the entrance to the porch on the left side. The ramp will also act as a passageway for the caterers and staff to the prep kitchen. The reason for it being offset is that the ramp will lead directly to the carriage house french doors. Making it easy access for the F&B staff and to provide the best service to our guests.
Removal and Replacement of Lattice Work:

- Currently, there are 2x4 supports and 8 foot lattice work surrounding the west facing back door as a privacy screen. Due to the previous back porch not being true to the original structure, we would like to enclose two sides of the porch with wood siding. The wood siding would be the same siding on the exterior of the home. We would like to keep the same privacy as previously constructed.
Removal of Windows:

- We would like to remove a small window located on the second floor on the posterior of the home. The room is currently a restroom and the window is located directly above the toilet. We would like to remove the window due to privacy concerns. In keeping with The Forsyth County Design Review Guidelines, this window will not be on a prometate level visible from the street once the previously approved carriage house has been constructed.

- We would like to remove two first floor windows located on the posterior side of the home. These windows are currently in a restroom, and for privacy reasons we would like to have them removed with wood siding in their place. We will also be in compliance with the Forsyth County Design Review Guidelines due to these windows not being of prominent elevation and will not be visible from the street.
Window over rear entrance to the home:

- We are going to put the window back. The dimensions of the window are 35 ½ by 71 1/2. The muntins are ¾ wide and are 67 ½ long.
- The muntins were added by using a special glass adhesive to the glass and.
• Removal of window seen below. This area is the prep kitchen. In order to keep guests from seeing inside we would like to have this be a solid wall.
Replacement of the rear east Posterior Staircase:
- The foundation of the stairs has severe damage due to roots from previously adjacent trees. We will replace the stairs with the same brick and design as the original front facing porch.
Replacement of Retaining wall:

- The existing retaining wall on both the west and north sides of the property has collapsed. We will replace the entire wall with the same brick and style that has been previously approved for the staircase on the front of the home.

- The previous wall was a combination of cinder block and cinder block casted to resemble rock. Both of these materials do not appear to be original or symbolic of the time period. There was significant bowing of the wall, and eventually collapsed onto the sidewalk. Reason for changing the material of the wall is to have the entire property outlined using one type of material. This will help create symmetry of the property. In this case it will be the same brick used for the staircase and the retaining wall on Cherry St.

- Based on the council's suggestion of removing the curved portion of the wall, we would like to point out that large vehicles continue to hit that corner of the property when turning left from Cherry St. onto First St. This is the reason why The City of Winston-Salem had to place the crosswalk sign out of the right of way, onto the Roger's House property. We are happy to place a diagonal wall or curved wall, but it must be offset from the property line due to large vehicular damage to that corner that is uncontrollable. The wall must be placed in this corner in order to maintain retention of the slope.

- The wall will be 46 inches high and 15.5 inches wide.
New walkway to the Property:

- We would like to propose a new walking path that would provide access to both the front and back of the home. The walkway would begin from the adjacent parking lot on the south side of the building and adjoin the front brick staircase. The walkway would also connect to the back of the house to provide access to the ramp located on the posterior porch. The walkway will be constructed with the same brick and design as the previously approved staircase on the front of the house.
Foundation repair:

- The current brick foundation had an array of different styles of brick where previous owners had replaced individual pieces and segments that were either broken or damaged. Also, there are large gaps in the foundation due to damage that could cause other structural issues to the home. These findings require us to repair the foundation with similar brick and surewall the entire foundation using red mortar. No cinder blocks were used in reinforcing the foundation, only brick. Argos red reinforcing mortar along with creek sand and horse hair mixed into the blend to add reinforcing fiber to help hold the foundation together. This will help provide structural integrity to the home and help reduce future damage. Some areas of the foundation had already been repaired this way, visible in the below photo.

- The foundation vents - There were holes in the foundation to allow ventilation, but no covers. To cover the said holes, we placed vent covers that eliminate pests into entering the basement of the home, which had previously caused damage to the home. We chose to utilize vents that are of Victorian style to keep with the Victorian era of the home.
Removal of Non-Original Wall:

- There was a wall constructed in the left main level front room that was used to divide the room for previous office space. This is not authentic to the home and will allow us to open the room up to its original format.

The wall that was removed is the one on the left side of the widow in the below picture. This was previously added as a divider wall for office space.
Judges Molding

- When removing the wallpaper we found small nail holes indicating that at one time the home had judge’s molding. We have now put the molding back in.
Replacement with Third Floor Shutters:

- The shutters on the 3rd floor windows on the front of the home were falling off due to severe rot. They were temporarily removed and will be replaced with the same design, size, trim, style, and material of the original shutters.
Michelle McCullough

From: Michelle McCullough
Sent: Thursday, February 9, 2023 10:10 AM
To: Michelle McCullough
Subject: FW: 102 South Cherry Street, Roger House LHL #40 COA additional material request
Attachments: ATP Scan In Progress

From: Michelle McCullough
Sent: Monday, February 6, 2023 5:10 PM
To: Adam Spear <adam@spearproperties.net>; Austin Hayes <ahayes@spearproperties.net>
Cc: Heather Bratland <heatherb@CITYOFWS.ORG>; John Floyd <JOHNF@CITYOFWS.ORG>; Tracy Phillips <tracyp@CITYOFWS.ORG>; Jamison M. Roe <jamisonr@CITYOFWS.ORG>; Amy Crum <AMYC@CITYOFWS.ORG>; Tiffany N. White <TIFFANYW@CITYOFWS.ORG>; Kelly Bennett <kellyb@CITYOFWS.ORG>; Chris Murphy <chrism@CITYOFWS.ORG>; Amy Lanier <amylr@CITYOFWS.ORG>
Subject: 102 South Cherry Street, Roger House LHL #40 COA additional material request

Thank you for submitting a Certificate of Appropriateness for 102 South Cherry Street, Rogers House, LHL #40 for pre-submittal review.

Below are staff’s comments on what additional materials needs to be submitted for the application to be considered complete and comments regarding what would be appropriate if details were missing from the description. This list may not be exhausted due to the lack of submitted documentation of the condition of the building prior to commencement of the current work.

The final and complete COA needs to be submitted by Wednesday, February 8, 2023 by 5:00pm in the IDT Plans Portal.

1. **Siding Replacement** (After-the-fact)
   - Include in the COA application the size, reveal, and dimensions of the historic siding and the new siding. What type of wood was used originally and what is the replacement species? If the siding has already been replaced, provide photographs of before and after. Include photographs of each elevation.
   - Specify what trim pieces will be replaced on each elevation. Include photos of each elevation. The trim should be replaced with the same material, design, dimensions, detail, and finish. If the trim has already been replaced, provide photographs of before and after.

2. **Replacement of Sliding Doors on west side** (After-the-fact)
   - Submit project literature about the doors installed including how the muntins are installed. The appropriate muntins should be a wood muntin that is applied to the exterior and interior. This will give the doors the depth that is appropriate for the house.
   - Submit a drawing showing where the existing door was located and where the new door is located.

3. **Replacement of the rear west Posterior Staircase** (After-the-fact)
   - Submit photos of the stair prior to demolition. Include a description of what existed prior to demolition including material, design, dimension, detail, and finish. Include the same details for the new stair and terrace, including any details of an expansion of the stair and/or terrace. If historic features, such a basement windows were removed include that in the description and explain why it could not be retained.
4. **Work to the northwest porch** *(After-the-fact)*
   - **Replacement of Posterior West Porch**
   - **Removal and Replacement of Lattice Work**
   - **Removal of Windows**

   - Submit information on the door replacement, the removal of the windows beside the door on the west elevation and why they had to be removed and/or replaced. Give full details of replacement material, designs, dimensions, etc.
   - Submit photos of what existed before and what currently exists of the porch.
   - Submit a drawing and elevations of the new design that includes two new walls and roof.
   - Explain why reconstruction of the original porch was not feasible.
   - Provide evidence that the back porch was not original to the building. This includes windows on the first and second floor on all three sides.
   - On the northwest addition there are three original windows that have been removed. Explain why they were removed and why they could not be replaced.
   - Explain why such a large ramp and patio was installed. At the meeting on 2/6/2023 it was discussed that it is not an ADA ramp, therefore the accessibility standards do not apply. Explain why the ramp was offset to the north of the house.
   - Submit plans and a description of how the well will be reconstructed.
   - Will there be railing added to the porch area? If yes, please include a drawing and details including the material, design, dimension, detail, and finish.
   - Will there be any lighting installed? If yes, submit a photo or drawing that shows the location on the building the lighting will be installed and product literature about the lighting.

5. **Removal of Windows** *(After-the-fact)*
   - Submit before and current photos of all windows removed. Highlight on a photo or drawing the windows to be removed. Submit floor plans to illustrate the current bathroom layout and potential need for privacy.
   - Explain why each window was removed.

6. **Foundation repair** *(After-the-fact)*
   - Submit explanation why brick could not be used to repair the foundation.
   - Provide product literature on the material used to parget the foundation.
   - Submit product literature on the new foundation vents.

7. **Replacement with Third Floor Shutters** *(After-the-fact)*
   - The replacement shutters should be the same design, location, material, sizes, scale, proportions, trim, style, color, and detail.

8. **Replacement of Retaining wall** *(After-the-fact)*
   - Submit a site plan and elevation drawings of the new wall to be installed. Include material, dimensions, scale, configuration, color, detail, and finish. Please include any lighting that will be installed.
   - Submit a reason for changing the material of the wall.
   - Staff recommends removing the curved portion of the wall at the corner of First and Cherry Streets. This will add an inappropriate feature that is not congruous with the site and create a false sense of the historical site development.

9. **Adjustments to the east and north facing Porch:**
   - The porch floor should be replaced with a wood, tongue and groove board, not decking boards. Please include in the COA application product literature on the wood you will be using.
   - The front porch spindle and woodwork needs to match the historic in material, design, detail, and finish and only the deteriorated portions should be removed and replace. Current code heights should be the only change in design. The height required, per Jamie Roe, Plan Examiner, is 36".
10. **Exterior lighting at back doors:**
   - Submit a photo or drawing that shows the location on the building where the lighting will be installed.

11. **Roof Replacement**
   - Include the name of the new color and product literature from the manufacturer about the specific line of roofing material to be installed.

12. **New walkway to the Property:**
   - Submit a site plan that includes all the walkways and patios, including the ones approved around the proposed carriage house.
   - As mentioned at the meeting on 2/6/2023, the ramp is not an ADA ramp, so remove that descriptor from the description.

   - Submit interior plans, highlighting the wall to be removed.

The following work was noticed by staff at the 2/6/2023 site visit. Submit the required COA materials for the review of each item. Supply as much detail as possible including drawings, photos, product literature, and narrative descriptions.

- Removal of a historic window over the rear center entrance.
- Removal and replacement of a historic door in the Northwest addition.
- Removal of a historic window on the Southwest addition on the north elevation and on the west elevation.
- Removal of a historic diamond-shaped vent in the Southwest addition.
- Interior changes. Submit all changes made to the interior space including but not limited to installing new lights, new HVAC, new railing/molding, new bathrooms, new walls, removal of any walls, ceilings, tile, plaster, stairwells, etc. Photos show a new removed interior stair, passage from the main house to the additions at the upper floors, and partition walls near the rear entrance. Submit floor plans and details that show all changes.

Please submit the final COA through the IDT Plans Portal. I have attached the instructions and a word documents of the above request.

Thank you!

Michelle M. McCullough
Historic Resources Officer
Winston-Salem/Forsyth County Planning & Development Services
100 East First Street
P.O. Box 2511
Winston-Salem, NC 27102
336.747.7063 (Direct)
336.701.9452 (Mobile)
336.748.3163 (Fax)
michellem@cityofws.org (Email)

From: Adam Spear <adam@spearproperties.net>
Sent: Sunday, February 5, 2023 3:19 PM
To: Michelle McCullough <michellem@cityofws.org>
Subject: [EXTERNAL] COAs

3
I hope you are having a good weekend Michelle. I was really hoping for Austin to have this finished earlier this week, but he had a family emergency. I was able to work on what he started over the weekend and attach photos. I am sharing a copy for your review before I submit it through the portal.

I appreciate everything, and again, I am sorry for the delay.

Adam