STAFF REPORT  
APRIL 12, 2023 HRC MEETING

Case #: COA2023-018  
Staff: Heather M. Bratland  
Applicant: Nate Goldesberry

LOCATION
District: West End Historic Overlay District  
Street: 133 West End Boulevard, Winston-Salem  
Building: Elizabeth J. Reedy House #14  
Status: Contributing  
Local Historic Landmark#: n/a

REQUEST(S)
- After-the-fact replacement of the porch roof, installation of handrails, and paving of the driveway

APPLICABLE DESIGN REVIEW STANDARDS
West End Historic Overlay District Design Review Standards available at:  
https://www.cityofws.org/DocumentCenter/View/4089

STAFF COMMENTS
The West End Historic Overlay District Report notes that “the Craftsman style is simply but strongly stated in the Reedy House.”

STAFF FINDINGS
Commission staff finds that replacement of the porch roof is incongruous with the character of the West End Historic Overlay District because:

1) The porch roof is a highly visible feature of the house. The Sanborn Fire Insurance Map from 1917 documents that the porch roof was clad in shingles. The proposed replacement material for the porch roof is standing seam metal. Many small components combine to create a roof with texture, depth, and dimension when shingles are used. A standing seam metal roof does not have the same texture and visual character. Standing seam metal roofing is not a compatible substitute material because it does not convey the same appearance as a shingle roof. (Roofs, West End Standards 3-4)

Commission staff finds that installation of handrails and paving of the driveway is not incongruous with the character of the West End Historic Overlay District because:

2) The proposed handrails at the front porch steps will be simple and constructed from metal, which is an appropriate material. Each handrail will have two square posts, and the ends of the rails will have a simple scroll. One handrail will be located on each side of the porch steps. The railings are compatible with existing railings that are not incongruous with the special character of the West End. The railings are compatible with, yet differentiated from, historic porch features, and they will not create a false historical appearance. (Entrances, Porches, Enclosures, and Balconies, West End Standard 12; Railings in the Landscape, West End Standards 1-2)

3) A curb cut, concrete apron, and older photos confirm that a driveway exists in the proposed location. It appears to have been paved in gravel at one time, and it is significantly deteriorated with significant vegetation growth. The driveway leads directly to the side of the house. The new design, which includes paving with concrete instead of gravel, is compatible with the special
character of the house and West End. (*Driveways and Parking Areas, West End Standards 3 and 6*)

**STAFF RECOMMENDATION**

Based on the preceding findings, staff recommends that the Commission deny COA2023-018 with respect to replacement of the porch roof and approve installation of handrails and paving of the driveway at 133 West End Boulevard (PIN 6825-98-9179) within the West End Historic Overlay District, with the following condition:

1) The applicant shall submit a Certificate of Appropriateness application for the retaining wall that borders the driveway within thirty (30) days.