STAFF REPORT
APRIL 12, 2023 HRC MEETING

Case #: COA2023-027
Staff: Heather M. Bratland
Applicant: Mackenzie Wartenberger

LOCATION
District: West End Historic Overlay District
Street: 109 Piedmont Avenue, Winston-Salem
Building: Lipscomb-Criner House #488
Status: Contributing
Local Historic Landmark#: n/a

REQUEST(S)
- Repair and replacement of windows

APPLICABLE DESIGN REVIEW STANDARDS
West End Historic Overlay District Design Review Standards available at: https://www.cityofws.org/DocumentCenter/View/4089

STAFF FINDINGS
Commission staff finds that the project is not incongruous with the character of the West End Historic Overlay District because:

1) The applicant proposes to repair the windows on the west façade facing Piedmont Avenue and three windows with diamond-paned sashes on the north and south facades. Damaged glass on the Piedmont Avenue façade will be replaced with wavy glass. Standard glass will be used for replacement on the north and south facades. Pulleys and wood elements will be repaired as needed. Repair of damaged window elements is preferred over replacement of the entire window when possible. (Windows and Doors, West End Standards 1 and 4)

2) The applicant has provided evidence to show that it is not feasible to repair all of the deteriorated and damaged windows because of the “unavailability of skilled craftsmen” to complete repairs in a reasonable amount of time. Per the applicant’s historic window repair expert:

   The above project [discussed in Staff Finding 1] constitutes an enormous amount of tedious, finicky, expensive labor. The remaining 16 windows face both sides and the back yard. While each one could be done [repaired] like those first nine windows, the benefit derived would be minimal and the expense would be considerable. In my opinion, a wiser option would be to go with a good quality (i.e. Marvin or equivalent) replacement window (with similar appearance) in these less visible locations.

   (Windows and Doors, West End Standard 6; Appendix A-Glossary of Terms, West End Feasibility Circumstance 2)

3) The applicant proposes to replace standard double-hung windows on the north and south facades with true divided light wooden windows that will replicate the sash configuration of the window being replaced, i.e., 9/1, 8/1, or 6/1. The new windows will convey the same appearance and have the same functionality as the historic windows. True divided light windows are appropriate for use in areas of high visibility. (Windows and Doors, West End Standard 6)
STAFF RECOMMENDATION

Based on the preceding findings, staff recommends that the Commission approve COA2023-027 at 109 Piedmont Avenue (PIN 6825-75-4191) within the West End Historic Overlay District, with the following conditions:

1) The applicant shall receive, prior to commencement of the work, all other required permits or permissions from governmental agencies;

2) Commission staff shall review and approve any revisions or deviations to any portion of the as-submitted work, that qualifies as a minor work, prior to commencement of that portion of the project; and

3) The applicant shall submit the Certificate of Appropriateness Request for Certification of Completed Work form and photo documentation of the completed project to HRC staff within ten (10) days of its completion.