**CITY-COUNTY PLANNING BOARD**
**STAFF REPORT**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Docket #</th>
<th>W-3204</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Staff</td>
<td>Gary Roberts, Jr. AICP</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Petitioner(s)</td>
<td>Murphy Oil USA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Owner(s)</td>
<td>Pavilion Winston Salem LLC</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Subject Property</td>
<td>PIN# 6804-86-2259</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Address</td>
<td>The new address assignment is 3820 Oxford Station Way.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Type of Request</td>
<td>Final development plan for property zoned GB-S Two-Phase</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Proposal</td>
<td>The petitioner is requesting final development plan approval for a GB-S Two-Phase (General Business – Special Use) zoned site. The requested use is Convenience Store.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### GENERAL SITE INFORMATION

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Location</th>
<th>Northwest corner of Hanes Mall Boulevard and Old English Court</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Jurisdiction</td>
<td>City of Winston-Salem</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ward(s)</td>
<td>Southwest</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Site Acreage</td>
<td>+/- 1.12 acre</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Current Land Use</td>
<td>The site has been rough graded but is currently undeveloped.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

#### Surrounding Property Zoning and Use

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Direction</th>
<th>Zoning District</th>
<th>Use</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>North</td>
<td>GB-S</td>
<td>Hobby Lobby</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>East</td>
<td>GB-S</td>
<td>Parking for Hobby Lobby</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>South</td>
<td>GB-S</td>
<td>Shoppes at Little Creek</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>West</td>
<td>GB-S</td>
<td>Zaxby’s</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

#### Physical Characteristics

The undeveloped site has a moderate to gentle slope upward from Hanes Mall Boulevard to Oxford Station Way.

#### Proximity to Water and Sewer

Public water and sewer are available.

#### Stormwater/Drainage

A stormwater study for the overall 21.59 acre site was approved on May 29, 2014. Stormwater quality and quantity, from the subject 1.12 acre parcel, will be managed with the use of a community stormwater facility to be located west of the subject property.

#### Watershed and Overlay Districts

The site is not located within a water supply watershed.

#### Analysis of General Site Information

The site includes no regulatory floodplains or watersheds. The site has been rough graded.
## SITE ACCESS AND TRANSPORTATION INFORMATION

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Street Name</th>
<th>Classification</th>
<th>Frontage</th>
<th>Average Daily Trip Count</th>
<th>Capacity at Level of Service D</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Hanes Mall Boulevard</td>
<td>Major Thoroughfare</td>
<td>+/-157'</td>
<td>18,000</td>
<td>40,900</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Old English Court</td>
<td>Private Street</td>
<td>+/-250'</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>N/A</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Oxford Station Way</td>
<td>Private Street</td>
<td>+/-148'</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>N/A</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Proposed Access Point(s)

The site will have one driveway onto Oxford Station Way. This private street connects directly to Old English Court which has a signalized intersection with Hanes Mall Boulevard.

### Planned Road Improvements

Hanes Mall Boulevard has been improved to a multilane, median divided facility with right deceleration lanes, left turn lanes, and sidewalks.

### Trip Generation - Existing/Proposed

See comments below in the Analysis of Site Access and Transportation Information section.

### Sidewalks

Sidewalks are currently located along Hanes Mall Boulevard, Oxford Station Way and Old English Court.

### Transit

Route 43 runs along Hanes Mall Boulevard.

### Connectivity

The overall first phase site plan proposes connectivity with the GB-S Two Phase zoned properties located to the east and west.

### Traffic Impact Study (TIS)

A Transportation Impact Study was submitted and reviewed by WSDOT staff as part of the original rezoning (see comments below).

### Analysis of Site Access and Transportation Information

In 2006, improvements to Hanes Mall Boulevard (including replacement of the adjacent bridge over I-40) were completed. At that time, two access points, which serve the overall GB-S Two Phase zoned site were established to provide access to Hanes Mall Boulevard.

An updated Traffic Impact Study was prepared for the entire 21.59 acre GB-S Two Phase zoned site in 2013. The existing lane configurations put in place during said Hanes Mall Boulevard widening project, are sufficient to handle traffic generated by the proposed development. The updated study was compared with the original TIS and both show approximately equal trip generation and Level of Service in the build-out year. The overall 21.59 site, when built out, will generate approximately 13,964 new trips and the signalized intersection for Hanes Mall Boulevard and Old English Court will operate at an acceptable Level of Service C during peak periods. The proposed 1,200 square foot Convenience Store would generate approximately 886 trips per day.
## Legacy 2030 Growth Management Area

Growth Management Area 3- Suburban Neighborhoods

### Relevant Legacy 2030 Recommendations

- Require sufficient, but not excessive parking, while protecting adjacent land uses, surrounding neighborhoods and the environment.
- Promote a pedestrian-friendly orientation for new development and redevelopment and reduce the visual dominance of parking areas.

### Relevant Area Plan(s)

*Southwest Suburban Area Plan (2009)*

### Area Plan Recommendations

- The *Southwest Suburban Area Plan* recommends the subject property for mixed-use development.
- This area (The Hanes Mall Retail/Residential Mixed-Use Area) is proposed for a mix of multifamily use and retail uses. This area currently consists primarily of big-box commercial development, strip centers, and outparcel development and contains a large amount of surface parking. As development pressures mount in future decades, these surface parking lots could be redeveloped as vertically-oriented, mixed-use developments incorporating multifamily residential and structured parking. Redevelopment here should incorporate pedestrian-scaled architectural detailing such as awnings and allow for visual connections between the inside and outside of buildings.

### Site Located Along Growth Corridor?

The site is not located along a growth corridor.

### Site Located within Activity Center?

The site is not located within an activity center.

### Analysis of Conformity to Plans and Planning Issues

The site is part of a larger 21.59 acre GB-S Two Phase site which was rezoned in 2013. This rezoning divided the site into multiple parcels ranging in size from .5 acre to 9.6 acres and included the access points, internal circulation, and external connections. The subject request represents the eighth final development plan within this area and the proposed use is a 1,200 square foot Convenience Store.

The *Southwest Suburban Area Plan* identifies the site as being within the Hanes Mall Retail/Residential Mixed-Use Area. Recommendations include the incorporation of pedestrian-scaled architectural detailing such as awnings and allow for visual connections between the inside and
outside of buildings. These recommendations are similar to the façade and building material requirements for Large Scale Retail Developments which are applicable whenever a single tenant would exceed 75,000 square feet of gross floor area.

The first phase approval of this site included conditions regarding signage and conditions which addressed the above mentioned building appearance matters. Specifically, for properties which front directly onto Hanes Mall Boulevard, at least 50% of the façade must consist of brick or enhanced architectural materials. In addition, the building walls which face Hanes Mall Boulevard must either be the front entrance to the building or said walls must include doors and windows which would give the reasonable appearance of a front building façade. While the site plan is for a Convenience Store with a canopy, the front building entrance faces Hanes Mall Boulevard and the primary façade material for the building and the columns for the canopy are brick.

In order to soften the appearance of the proposed gas canopy, Planning staff recommends the inclusion of a combination of brick columns with faux wrought iron fencing along the frontage of Hanes Mall Boulevard and up along Old English Court to the front façade of the building. Staff also recommends increasing the streetyard plantings in this area to visually soften the appearance of the canopy for the proposed convenience store.

There were also conditions regarding the establishment of a common landscaping theme (with respect to plant type/species) for the overall development and for lighting i.e. pole height, fixture type, and foot/candels measured along Hanes Mall Boulevard. The request will comply with those conditions and is consistent with other recently approved final development plans within this development.

### Relevant Zoning Histories

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Case</th>
<th>Request</th>
<th>Decision &amp; Date</th>
<th>Direction from Site</th>
<th>Acreage</th>
<th>Recommendation</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>W-3204</td>
<td>GB-S Two Phase Final Development Plan (Multi-Tennant Retail Space)</td>
<td>Approved 8-13-15</td>
<td>300’ west</td>
<td>1.85</td>
<td>Approval</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Approved</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>W-3204</td>
<td>GB-S to GB-S Two Phase</td>
<td>Approved 11-4-13</td>
<td>Included current site</td>
<td>21.59</td>
<td>Approval</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Approval</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
### SITE PLAN COMPLIANCE WITH UDO REQUIREMENTS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Building Square Footage</th>
<th>Square Footage</th>
<th>Placement on Site</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>1,200</td>
<td>Central portion of the site</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Parking</th>
<th>Required</th>
<th>Proposed</th>
<th>Layout</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>6 spaces</td>
<td>6 spaces</td>
<td>On the west side of the building</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Building Height</th>
<th>Maximum</th>
<th>Proposed</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>60’</td>
<td>14’</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Impervious Coverage</th>
<th>Maximum</th>
<th>Proposed</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>86%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

- **UDO Sections Relevant to Subject Request**
  - Chapter B, Article II, Section 2-1.3 (J) General Business district

#### Complies with

- **Chapter B, Article VII, Section 7-5.3**
- (A) Legacy 2030 policies: Yes
- (B) Environmental Ord.: N/A
- (C) Subdivision Regulations: N/A

#### Analysis of Site Plan Compliance with UDO Requirements

The proposed final development plan is for a 1,200 square foot Convenience Store. The site is in the first tier of lots which front onto Hanes Mall Boulevard. See the comments above in the Analysis of Conformity to Plans and Planning Issues section in regard to compliance with the approved conditions. The site plan meets the requirements of the UDO and the request complies with the approved first phase conditions regarding common landscaping and lighting.

### CONCLUSIONS TO ASSIST WITH RECOMMENDATION

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Positive Aspects of Proposal</th>
<th>Negative Aspects of Proposal</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>The site is already zoned GB-S.</td>
<td>The proposed Convenience Store will result in an increase in traffic volume.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The site is part of a comprehensive development with coordinated access, stormwater management, and common lighting and landscaping.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The proposed building elevations, along with additional screening along Hanes Mall Boulevard, comply with the first phase conditions.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### SITE-SPECIFIC RECOMMENDED CONDITIONS OF APPROVAL

The following proposed conditions are from interdepartmental review comments and are proposed in order to meet codes or established standards, or to reduce negative off-site impacts.

- **PRIOR TO THE ISSUANCE OF GRADING PERMITS:**
  a. Developer shall have a stormwater management study submitted for review by the Public Works Department of the City of Winston-Salem. If required, an engineered stormwater management plan shall be submitted and approved by the Public Works
Department. Relocation or installation of any stormwater treatment device into any buffer areas, vegetation designated to remain, or close proximity to adjacent residentially zoned land shall require a Staff Change approval at minimum, and may require a Site Plan Amendment.

- **PRIOR TO THE ISSUANCE OF BUILDING PERMITS:**
  a. The exterior walls must have: (1) a combined minimum of 50% brick or enhanced architectural materials or a combination thereof; and (2) either their front door/façade oriented toward Hanes Mall Boulevard or have the building designed to have a rear façade facing Hanes Mall Boulevard that contains doors and windows and gives the reasonable appearance of a front building façade. The proposed building shall be in substantial conformance with the submitted elevations as shown on “Exhibit A” as verified by Planning staff.
  b. An engineered lighting plan shall be submitted to Inspections which complies with the following: (1) maximum pole height of twenty-five (25) feet; (2) full cut-off fixtures; (3) any wallpacks or attached lighting shall be angled downward and away from Hanes Mall Boulevard; (4) no more than 0.5 ft/candle along the right-of-way of Hanes Mall Boulevard; and (5) the average foot candle reading beneath the canopy shall be 30. Decorative lighting (same style/fixtures) shall be installed throughout all parcels that front on Hanes Mall Boulevard.

- **PRIOR TO THE ISSUANCE OF OCCUPANCY PERMITS:**
  a. Developer shall install common landscaping (with respect to plant type/ species) which is consistent with that shown on the approved plan for Hobby Lobby.
  b. Building shall be constructed in substantial conformance with the approved building elevations approved by Planning staff.
  c. Lighting shall be installed per approved lighting plan and certified by an engineer.

- **OTHER REQUIREMENTS:**
  a. Freestanding signage shall be limited to one sign with a maximum height of six (6) feet and a maximum copy area of thirty-six (36) square feet.
  b. The exterior colors of all buildings constructed on the property shall primarily be earth tones (as determined by Planning Board during final development plan Review).

**STAFF RECOMMENDATION:** Approval

**NOTE:** These are staff comments only; final recommendations on projects are made by the City-County Planning Board, with final decisions being made by the appropriate Elected Body, who may approve, deny, table or request modification for any project. **THE APPLICANT OR REPRESENTATIVE IS STRONGLY ENCOURAGED TO ATTEND THE PUBLIC HEARINGS WHERE THE CASE WILL BE CONSIDERED BY THE PLANNING BOARD AND THE ELECTED BODY.**
CITY-COUNTY PLANNING BOARD
PUBLIC HEARING
MINUTES FOR W-3204
JUNE 9, 2016

PUBLIC HEARING

FOR: None

AGAINST: None

WORK SESSION

MOTION: Clarence Lambe moved approval of the final development plan with the amended lighting condition.
SECOND: Paul Mullican
VOTE:
FOR: George Bryan, Melynda Dunigan, Arnold King, Clarence Lambe, Darryl Little, Paul Mullican, Brenda Smith, Allan Younger
AGAINST: None
EXCUSED: None

____________________________
A. Paul Norby, FAICP
Director of Planning and Development Services
**PROPOSED ZONING:** Final Development Plan (Convenience Store)

**EXISTING ZONING:** GB-S Two-Phase

**PETITIONER:** Murphy Oil USA

**SCALE:** 1" represents 400'

**STAFF:** Roberts

**GMA:** 3

**ACRES:** 1.12

**NEAREST BLDG.:** 110' south

**MAP(S):** 6804.02

**DOCKET #:** W3204

Property included in zoning request

500' mail notification radius. Property not in zoning request

Property included in zoning request

500' mail notification radius. Property not in zoning request

Scale: 1" represents 400'
**INTERDEPARTMENTAL SITE PLAN REVIEW COMMITTEE**

*Project Case Number: W3204*

---

**PRELIMINARY COMMENTS AND/OR RECOMMENDED CONDITIONS**

*Note: City-County Planning staff is responsible for coordinating the Interdepartmental Review of Special Use Rezoning Requests, Subdivisions, and Planning Board Review items; please contact the appropriate Department at the phone # indicated below if you have any questions about the comments or recommendations lists. A list of recommended conditions from this Interdepartmental Review will be sent to you via e-mail generally by the end of the business day on Friday the week prior to the Planning Board Public Hearing.*

---

**PROJECT CASE NUMBER:** W3204  **PROJECT TITLE:** Murphy Express  **DATE:** May 25, 2016

**PROJECT DESCRIPTION:** Northwest corner of Hanes Mall Boulevard and Old English Court (Southwest Ward)

**NCDOT (Wright Archer)- Phone # - 336.747.7900 Email:** warcher@ncdot.gov

- No Comments

**WSDOT (Connie James)- Phone # - 336.747.6872 Email:** conniej@cityofws.org

- Ensure grading does not impact traffic control cabinet and in-ground box. Designate walkway through drive aisle from sidewalk to building. Ensure proper materials are used to adhere to concrete where applicable. Coordinate with Ken Baker, transit planner, for WSTA improvements (747.6882).

**Engineering (Al Gaskill)- Phone # - 336.747.6846 Email:** albertcg@cityofws.org

1. No grading in public R/W
2. No grading in sight easement
3. No Retaining wall in SD easement.

- Show connection of new inlet to exist 36” RCP. Recommend MH

**Inspections - Phone # - Donna Guffey - 336.747.7420 or Desmond Corley - 336.747.7427 Email:** donnagb@cityofws.org or desmondc@cityofws.org

- Meet Special Use Site Conditions for W-3204 (original rezoning request)
- 26-foot drive aisle required for 90-degree parking
- Label dumpster screening type/height
- Tree save area summary and calculations required with a grading permit
- Label building/canopy height(s) in stories and feet
- Drive aisles cannot encroach into required streetyards
- Minimum 2 bicycle parking spaces required
- Motor vehicle surface area plantings required (1 large variety tree per 5,000 square feet), meeting the spacing requirement for parking areas
- Label height of proposed ground sign
An Environmental Grading and Erosion Control Permit will be required if more than 10,000 square feet is to be disturbed during any potential construction. An Erosion and Sedimentation Control plan must be submitted and approved before the permit can be issued. Please submit this plan at least 30 days prior to the intended start date of construction.

Stormwater Division (Joe Fogarty)- Phone # - 336.747.6961 Email: josephf@cityofws.org

No Comment

City Fire- (Doug Coble) - Phone # - 336.734.1290 Email: douglasc@cityofwsfire.org

Tank Permit is required separate permit submittal

Utilities (Jack Fitzgerald)- Phone # - 336.747.7309 Email: jackf@cityofws.org

A 6” sewer connection exists for this site. Water connection(s) can be made in Oxford station Way or Old English Ct. Backflow preventers required on all water connections. Water meters purchased through City of Winston-Salem

Sanitation (Randy Britton)- Phone # - 336.748.3080 Email: randallb@cityofws.org

A bulk container(s) or dumpster is required for this project. Placement of the container(s) should allow for easy access for servicing by a container tender truck. The location of the container must be free of overhanging wires or other obstructions and provide @ least 35 feet of vertical clearance and 40 feet linear clearance in the dumping area. All screens or enclosures should be open on one side and have @ least three feet of clearance on the remaining 3 sides.

Please consider utilizing a Commercial Recycling Program.

Planning (Aaron King)- Phone # - 336.747.7068 Email: aaronk@cityofws.org

Staff recommends a combination of brick columns/faux wrought iron fencing along the frontage of HMB and up Old English Ct up to the front façade of the building- staff would also recommend increasing the streetyard plantings in this area; how will the streetyard plantings along Old English Ct work with the retaining wall?

Street Names/Addresses (Matt Hamby) -336. 747.7074 Email: hambyme@mapforsyth.org

Address is 3820 Oxford Station Way.