



DOCKET #: W3194
 (Continued from 9/12/2013)

PROPOSED ZONING:
 PB

EXISTING ZONING:
 LI and RS9

PETITIONER:
 Nissen Wagon Works
 Properties LLC for property
 owned by Same

SCALE: 1" represents 400'

STAFF: King

GMA: 2

ACRES: 10.57

**NEAREST
 BLDG:** 0' north

MAP(S): 642846



**CITY-COUNTY PLANNING BOARD
DRAFT STAFF REPORT**

| PETITION INFORMATION | |
|---|---|
| Docket # | W-3194 |
| Staff | Aaron King |
| Petitioner(s) | Nissen Wagon Works Properties LLC |
| Owner(s) | Same |
| Subject Property | PIN#s 6844-36-9521, 6844-46-1263, and 6844-46-2303 |
| Address | 1517 Waughtown Street |
| Type of Request | General use rezoning |
| Proposal | <p>The petitioner is requesting to amend the Official Zoning Maps for the subject property from LI (Limited Industrial) and RS9 (Residential Single Family; 9,000sf lot size) to PB (Pedestrian Business – General use zoning).</p> <p>NOTE: General, special use limited, and special use district zoning were discussed with the petitioner(s) who decided to pursue the rezoning as presented.</p> |
| Neighborhood Contact/Meeting | No neighborhood meeting has been held as of this writing. |
| Zoning District Purpose Statement | The PB District is primarily intended to accommodate office, retail, service, institutional, and high density residential uses which customarily serve community and convenience business needs of smaller communities and urban nodes in the city and county. The district is intended to encourage the development of attractive, identifiable small towns, and to accommodate the pattern of building in the business concentrations surrounding the central core of Winston-Salem, and the central core of other municipalities in the County. The district should demonstrate pedestrian oriented design through elements such as buildings pulled up to the street, on-street parking, street trees, covered arcades, awnings, storefront display windows, public/private outdoor spaces, wide sidewalks, and building entrances facing the street. This district is intended for application in GMAs 1, 2 and 3. |
| Applicable Rezoning Consideration from Chapter B, Article VI, Section 6-2.1(R) | (R)(1) - Is the proposal consistent with the purpose statement(s) of the requested zoning district(s)? |
| | Yes, the site is located within GMA 2 (Urban Neighborhoods) and can accommodate a variety of uses. |
| GENERAL SITE INFORMATION | |
| Location | North side of Waughtown Street, east side of Pleasant Street, and west side of Marble Street |
| Jurisdiction | City of Winston-Salem |
| Ward(s) | Southeast |
| Site Acreage | ± 10.57 acres |
| Current | The site contains the Nissen Wagon Works facility which has been |

| | | | |
|---|--|-------------------------------------|--------------------------------|
| Land Use | primarily vacant for a significant period of time. | | |
| Surrounding Property Zoning and Use | Direction | Zoning District | Use |
| | North | RS9 | Single family homes |
| | East | | |
| | South | RS9 | Single family homes and church |
| West | LI & RS9 | Single family homes and post office | |
| Applicable Rezoning Consideration from Chapter B, Article VI, Section 6-2.1(R) | (R)(2) - Is/are the use(s) permitted under the proposed classification/request compatible with uses permitted on other properties in the vicinity? | | |
| | <p>The proposed PB district allows eighty (80) different land uses. Staff is concerned that many of the proposed uses would not be compatible with the single family homes that surround the site. Specifically staff believes the following uses could result in negative impacts to surrounding homes:</p> <p style="text-align: center;">Car Wash; Convenience Store; Motor Vehicle, Repair and Maintenance; Motorcycle Dealer; Stadium, Coliseum, or Exhibition Building; Correctional Institution; Landfill, Land Clearing/Inert Debris; Helistop; and Shelter for Homeless</p> <p>Additionally, staff could potentially see that surrounding residents may also have concerns about: Boarding or Rooming House; Family Group Home B; Family Group Home C; Group Care Facility A; Group Care Facility B; Borrow Site; and Dirt Storage. Staff recommends the request be converted to a special use limited (PB-L) zoning where non-compatible uses can be excluded.</p> | | |
| Physical Characteristics | The majority of the site is covered by the existing manufacturing facility and its associated parking. The topography is favorable and there are no streams or wetlands located on the site. | | |
| Proximity to Water and Sewer | The site has access to public water and sewer. | | |
| Stormwater/ Drainage | No known issues. | | |
| Watershed and Overlay Districts | The site is not located within a water supply watershed. | | |
| Historic, Natural Heritage and/or Farmland Inventories | <p>The subject property is the site of the c. 1919 Nissen Wagon Works, an industrial complex with a high degree of historical and architectural significance. The Nissen company was begun in 1834 by John Phillip Nissen. Nissen's company became known nationally for its superior wagons. The Wagon Works played an important role in the development of Waughtown and continued to produce wagons until 1948. By the mid-1870s, the works was spread over a 600-acre tract on the north side of Waughtown Street and employed about one hundred men. In 1876, two years after the death of John Nissen, his sons, George and Will, were producing 427 wagons a year at an average price of one hundred twenty dollars each, realizing a profit of about \$13,000. In 1917, the plant is listed as George E. Nissen & Co., wagon manufacturers and was located</p> | | |

just south of a rail spur. The company was sold to F.B. Reamy in 1925 and closed in 1948. The earliest remaining building in the complex dates to 1919, when the original structure was destroyed by a fire. The 1919 building is a one story brick structure with a low-pitched gable roof, and features a stepped parapet with corbelled corners. Small, decorative wagon wheels ornament the main façade, the bricked-up windows feature segmental arch heads, and the interior features exposed beams. Later additions to the complex consist of several gable roof, metal buildings that date c. 1955-c. 1980. A c. 1970 one-story, exposed aggregate concrete paneled building was added to the front elevation c. 1970.

Of outstanding significance is the smokestack (c. 1880), which is believed to have survived the 1919 fire and is original to the property. The structure is a brick, polygonal smokestack with a decorative star-shaped top mouth opening. This site is an anchor to the Waughtown-Belview National Register Historic District. Some of the buildings on-site are highly significant while others are considered non-contributing. Because of the property's high degree of significance, Historic Resources staff recommends special use zoning for the site (in order to distinguish which buildings will be retained), that the buildings on the site be kept in good repair, and that rehabilitation of the complex follow the *Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation*.

Analysis of General Site Information

The 10.57 acre subject property is developed with an industrial facility that dates back to the 1910's. While the site has significant frontage on Waughtown Street, it is also largely surrounded by a single family neighborhood constructed in the 1950's. The subject request includes several uses (see above) that raise the potential for negative impacts to these surrounding homes if approved. In comparison, the former Hanes Plant on Stratford Road also had a very prominent frontage on a major thoroughfare and was wrapped by single family homes on at least two other sides. When the former Hanes Plant came in for rezoning approval over the past two months (W-3190), the petitioner recognized that some uses were not suitable for development in close proximity to single family homes and in turn, a significant number of uses were excluded from the special use limited rezoning request. Staff views the issues of land use on this site and the W-3190 as very similar and recommends that the list of proposed uses be further reduced.

SITE ACCESS AND TRANSPORTATION INFORMATION

| Street Name | Classification | Frontage | ADT Count | Capacity/LOS D |
|--------------------|-----------------------|-----------------|------------------|-----------------------|
| Waughtown Street | Major Thoroughfare | 305' | 13,800 | 13,000 |
| Marble Street | Local Street | 15' | NA | NA |
| Pleasant Street | Local Street | 25' | NA | NA |

Proposed Access Point(s) The subject property has public road frontage on Waughtown Street, Marble Street, and Pleasant Street.

Planned Road The *Comprehensive Transportation Plan* recommends the future cross

| | |
|---|---|
| Improvements | section for Waughtown Street be: two-lanes with on-street parking, bike lanes, and sidewalks on both sides. |
| Trip Generation - Existing/Proposed | Staff cannot determine the trip generation for a general use request. It should be noted that there are several high trip-generating uses included in this request. |
| Sidewalks | Sidewalks are located along the north side of Waughtown Street. |
| Transit | Route 29 runs along Waughtown Street. |
| Traffic Impact Study (TIS) | Not required |
| Analysis of Site Access and Transportation Information | The subject property has over 300' of road frontage on Waughtown Street. It is located in an area with a lot of pedestrian traffic and where transit is available. Without a site plan, traffic impact study, or conditions relating to use square footages, staff is unable to provide a thorough analysis of the potential transportation impacts associated with this case. |
| CONFORMITY TO PLANS AND PLANNING ISSUES | |
| Legacy GMA | GMA 2 (Urban Neighborhoods) |
| Relevant Legacy Recommendations | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The reuse of vacant and underutilized commercial and industrial sites. • The redevelopment and reuse of existing sites and buildings that is compatible and complementary with the surrounding area. • A pedestrian-friendly orientation for new development and redevelopment and reducing the visual dominance of parking areas. • Promote quality design so that infill does not negatively impact surrounding development. • Encourage redevelopment and reuse of existing sites and buildings that is compatible and complementary with the surrounding area. • Encourage major employers and institutions to restore or rehabilitate existing buildings in an architecturally- or historically sensitive manner to maintain the unique sense of place. • Encourage retention over replacement of historic structures. |
| Relevant Area Plan(s) | <i>Southeast Winston-Salem Area Plan (2013)</i> |
| Area Plan Recommendations | <p>The redevelopment of the Nissen Wagon Works property has been a community priority for a long time because of its potential to become an attraction and destination in the area. Since the site is currently zoned Limited Industrial (LI), the site could be redeveloped for industrial/warehousing uses without elected body approval or public input. If the site does redevelop under the current LI zoning, the preferred development is an office/industrial park that has minimal potential negative impacts on the neighborhood such as noise, exposure to hazardous material through storage or transport, or large vehicles on local streets. However, this type of development is not what the community envisions for this property. The subject property is located within the Waughtown/Pleasant Activity Center. The Area Plan recommends the following:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Redevelop the Nissen Wagon Works site with a mixture of uses including residential, office, retail, institutional, recreation and open space uses in a pedestrian-friendly environment to ensure this site has |

| | | | | | | |
|---|--|----------------------------|----------------------------|----------------|-----------------------|-------------|
| | <p>a positive impact on the surrounding community.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Consider eliminating the 1980s front office building to open up the site and allow views of the older 1919 building and to provide a gathering square in a central location. • Explore Local Historic Landmark designation and associated tax credits to make the redevelopment of this property more feasible. | | | | | |
| Addressing | A floor plan that illustrates the tenant spaces in this building is required in order to make the appropriate address assignments. | | | | | |
| Applicable Rezoning Consideration from Chapter B, Article VI, Section 6-2.1(R) | (R)(3) - Have changing conditions substantially affected the area in the petition? | | | | | |
| | No | | | | | |
| | (R)(4) - Is the requested action in conformance with Legacy? | | | | | |
| | See comments below | | | | | |
| Analysis of Conformity to Plans and Planning Issues | <p>The site is located within the boundaries of the <i>Southeast Winston-Salem Area Plan</i>. The plan recommends that the subject property be redeveloped with a mixture of uses. It also recommends that the original Wagon Works buildings on-site be retained and supports the removal of additions done in later years to improve visibility of the original buildings.</p> <p>As mentioned in the area plan narrative above, the Nissen Wagon Works building is an extremely important part of the Waughtown community. It is because of its significant importance that staff strongly recommends that the contributing structures be retained and redeveloped for mixed use. While the subject property and the former Hanes Plant on Stratford Road share many similarities, they are very different in terms of the historical significance of their respective structures. The Hanes Plant did not have any structures that have been determined to be eligible for local or state designation. Subsequently, there were no recommendations or conditions to retain existing structures associated with that request. Given the high degree of historical significance of the Nissen Wagon Works site, staff recommends that a condition be included with this request for the retention of the historically significant structures on-site. A site plan showing how the property will be adaptively reused would be even better.</p> | | | | | |
| RELEVANT ZONING HISTORIES | | | | | | |
| Case | Request | Decision & Date | Direction from Site | Acreage | Recommendation | |
| | | | | | Staff | CCPB |
| No relevant zoning cases for this request. | | | | | | |
| UDO Sections Relevant to Subject Request | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Section 2-1.3(F) PB District | | | | | |
| Complies with Chapter B, Article VII, Section 7-5.3 | (A) Legacy policies: | | No | | | |
| | (B) Environmental Ord. | | NA | | | |
| | (C) Subdivision Regulations | | NA | | | |
| CONCLUSIONS TO ASSIST WITH RECOMMENDATION | | | | | | |

| Positive Aspects of Proposal | Negative Aspects of Proposal |
|--|--|
| PB zoning allows for a mixture of uses as called for in the area plan. | The list of proposed uses includes several uses that are not compatible with the adjacent single family homes. |
| The request is consistent with the PB purpose statement. | The request does not include any assurance that the historically significant buildings on-site will be retained. |
| | No use limitations or restrictions are offered to mitigate impacts to surrounding residential areas. |
| | The request is not consistent with many of <i>Legacy's</i> recommendations. |

STAFF RECOMMENDATION: DENIAL

NOTE: These are **staff comments** only; final recommendations on projects are made by the City-County Planning Board, with final decisions being made by the appropriate Elected Body, who may approve, deny, table or request modification for any project. **THE APPLICANT OR REPRESENTATIVE IS STRONGLY ENCOURAGED TO ATTEND THE PUBLIC HEARINGS WHERE THE CASE WILL BE CONSIDERED BY THE PLANNING BOARD AND THE ELECTED BODY.**

**CITY-COUNTY PLANNING BOARD
PUBLIC HEARING
MINUTES FOR W-3194
SEPTEMBER 12, 2013**

PUBLIC HEARING regarding continuance request.

FOR: None

AGAINST: None

WORK SESSION

MOTION: Paul Mullican moved continuance of the zoning petition to October 10, 2013.

SECOND: Clarence Lambe

VOTE:

FOR: Tommy Hicks, Arnold King, Clarence Lambe, Darryl Little, Barry Lyons, Lynne Mitchell, Paul Mullican, Brenda Smith, Allan Younger

AGAINST: None

EXCUSED: None