September 23, 2015

Taylor Development Group, LLC
1645 Westbrook Plaza Drive
Winston-Salem, NC  27103

RE: Zoning Petition W-3272

Dear Petitioner:

The attached report of the Planning Board to the City Council is sent to you at the request of the Council Members. You will be notified by the City Secretary’s Office of the date on which the Council will hear this petition.

Sincerely,

A. Paul Norby, FAICP
Director of Planning and Development Services

pc:  City Secretary’s Office, P.O. Box 2511, Winston-Salem, NC  27102
**ACTION REQUEST FORM**

**DATE:** September 23, 2015  
**TO:** The Honorable Mayor and City Council  
**FROM:** A. Paul Norby, FAICP, Director of Planning and Development Services

**COUNCIL ACTION REQUEST:**
Request for Public Hearing on zoning petition of Taylor Development Group, LLC

**SUMMARY OF INFORMATION:**
Zoning petition of Taylor Development Group, LLC from RS9 to RM5-S (Residential Building, Duplex; Residential Building, Single Family; Residential Building, Townhouse; Residential Building, Twin Home; and Planned Residential Development): property is located on the northeast corner of Country Club Road and Clifftdale Drive; (Zoning Docket W-3272).

**PLANNING BOARD ACTION:**

**MOTION ON PETITION:** APPROVAL  
**FOR:** UNANIMOUS  
**AGAINST:** NONE  
**SITE PLAN ACTION:** CONFORMS TO THE REQUIREMENTS OF THE UDO
The City Council of the City of Winston-Salem issues a Special Use District Permit for the site shown on the site plan map included in this zoning petition of Taylor Development Group, LLC, (Zoning Docket W-3272). The site shall be developed in accordance with the plan approved by the Board and bearing the inscription: "Attachment A, Special Use District Permit for RM5-S (Residential Building, Duplex; Residential Building, Single Family; Residential Building, Townhouse; Residential Building, Twin Home; and Planned Residential Development), approved by the Winston-Salem City Council the _____ day of ______________________, 20____" and signed, provided the property is developed in accordance with requirements of the RM5-S zoning district of the Zoning Ordinance of the Unified Development Ordinances, the Erosion Control Ordinance, and other applicable laws, and the following additional conditions be met:

• **PRIOR TO THE ISSUANCE OF GRADING PERMITS:**
  a. Developer shall have a stormwater management study submitted for review by the Public Works Department of the City of Winston-Salem. If required, an engineered stormwater management plan shall be submitted and approved by the Public Works Department. Relocation or installation of any stormwater treatment device into any buffer areas, vegetation designated to remain, or close proximity to adjacent residentially zoned land shall require a Staff Change approval at minimum, and may require a Site Plan Amendment.
  b. Developer shall obtain a driveway permit from the City of Winston-Salem; additional improvements may be required prior to issuance of driveway permit. Required improvements include:
     • Right-of-way dedication of 20’ from center line along Cliffdale Drive along with a 5’ sidewalk easement.
     • Install curb and gutter along Cliffdale Drive and sidewalk along Country Club Road.

• **PRIOR TO THE ISSUANCE OF BUILDING PERMITS:**
  a. The proposed buildings shall be in substantial conformance with the submitted elevations as shown on “Elevation A” as verified by Planning staff.
b. Developer shall record a final plat in the office of the Register of Deeds. Final plat shall show tentative building locations for the multifamily buildings and all access and utility easements, negative access easement along Country Club Road and right-of-way dedication along Cliffdale Drive.

• PRIOR TO THE ISSUANCE OF OCCUPANCY PERMITS:
  a. Developer shall complete all requirements of the driveway permit.
  b. Building shall be constructed in substantial conformance with the approved building elevations as approved by Planning staff.
## CITY-COUNTY PLANNING BOARD  
### STAFF REPORT

### PETITION INFORMATION

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Docket #</th>
<th>W-3272</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Staff</td>
<td>Gary Roberts, Jr. AICP</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Petitioner(s)</td>
<td>Taylor Development Group, LLC</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Owner(s)</td>
<td>Same</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Subject Property</td>
<td>PIN #s 6815-24-4879, 6815-24-6907; 6815-25-5029, 6815-25-5280, and 6815-25-7016</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Address</td>
<td>3601, 3605, and 3613 Country Club Road and 113 North Cliffldale Drive</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Type of Request</td>
<td>Special use rezoning from RS9 to RM5-S</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Proposal</td>
<td>The petitioner is requesting to amend the Official Zoning Maps for the subject property from RS9 (Residential, Single Family district – 9,000 sq minimum lot size) to RM5-S (Residential, Multifamily – 5 units per acre maximum density - special use zoning). The petitioner is requesting the following uses: Residential Building, Duplex; Residential Building, Single Family; Residential Building, Townhouse; Residential Building, Twin Home; and Planned Residential Development</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Neighborhood Contact/Meading</td>
<td>According to an email received on September 2, 2015 from the petitioner’s site plan preparer: “A neighborhood drop-in session is scheduled to be held next Wednesday (September 9) from 6:00 pm until 7:30 pm prior to the Planning Board meeting for the Clifflmoor project on the corner of Country Club Road and Cliffldale Drive. The drop-in session will be held in a conference room of the Park West office building directly across Country Club Road from the site.”</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Zoning District Purpose Statement</td>
<td>The RM5 District is primarily intended to accommodate low density, pedestrian-oriented sites and communities containing duplexes, twin homes, multifamily and townhouse residential buildings with three or four units, and similar residential uses at a maximum overall density of five units per acre. This district is intended for GMAs 2 and 3 and may be suitable for GMA 4 and Metro Activity Centers where public facilities, including public water and sewer, public roads, parks, and other governmental support services, are available.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Applicable Rezoning Consideration from Chapter B, Article VI, Section 6-2.1(R)</td>
<td>(R)(1) - Is the proposal consistent with the purpose statement(s) of the requested zoning district(s)? Yes, the subject property fronts onto a major thoroughfare and it is adjacent to other multifamily zoned property.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### GENERAL SITE INFORMATION

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Location</th>
<th>Northeast corner of Country Club Road and Cliffldale Drive</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Jurisdiction</td>
<td>Winston-Salem</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ward(s)</td>
<td>West</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Site Acreage</td>
<td>± 3.35 acres</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-------------</td>
<td>-------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Current Land Use</td>
<td>Currently, four single family homes are located on the subject property.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Surrounding Property Zoning and Use</td>
<td><strong>Direction</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>North</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>East</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>South</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>West</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Applicable Rezoning Consideration from Chapter B, Article VI, Section 6-2.1(R)</td>
<td>(R)(2) - Is the use(s) permitted under the proposed classification/request compatible with uses permitted on other properties in the vicinity?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Yes, the proposed duplex units are compatible with single and multifamily residential buildings which are permitted on the adjacent properties.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Physical Characteristics</td>
<td>The developed site has a gentle slope downward in all directions from the highest portion of the site in the southeastern corner.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Proximity to Water and Sewer</td>
<td>Public water and sewer are available to the site.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Stormwater/Drainage</td>
<td>The site plan proposes underground stormwater management facilities in the southwestern and northeastern corners of the site. A stormwater study will be required.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Watershed and Overlay Districts</td>
<td>The site is not located within a water supply watershed.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Analysis of General Site Information</td>
<td>The site appears to have no development constraints such as steep slopes, regulatory floodplains, or watersheds.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### SITE ACCESS AND TRANSPORTATION INFORMATION

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Street Name</th>
<th>Classification</th>
<th>Frontage</th>
<th>ADT Count</th>
<th>Capacity/LOS D</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Country Club Road</td>
<td>Major Thoroughfare</td>
<td>462'</td>
<td>15,000</td>
<td>15,800</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Clifffield Drive</td>
<td>Local Street</td>
<td>475'</td>
<td>NA</td>
<td>NA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Silas Creek Parkway Ramp</td>
<td>Expressway</td>
<td>347'</td>
<td>52,000</td>
<td>49,000</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Proposed Access Point(s):** The site plan shows one access for the development onto Clifffield Drive.

**Planned Road Improvements:** The 2012 Comprehensive Transportation Plan recommends sidewalks on both sides of Country Club Road.

**Trip Generation - Existing/Proposed:**

- **Existing Zoning: RS9**
  3.35 acres / 9,000 sf = 16 units x 9.57 (SFR Trip Rate) = 153 Trips per Day

- **Proposed Zoning: RM5-S**
  16 units x 7.5 (Residential Planned Unit Development Trip Rate) = 120 Trips per Day
| Sidewalks | A sidewalk is located along the southern side of Country Club Road. A sidewalk is required along the northern (subject) side of Country Club Road. |
| Transit | Route 12 runs along Country Club Road. |
| Analysis of Site Access and Transportation Information | The subject property currently has two driveways onto Country Club Road, and four driveways onto Cliffrdale Drive. The proposed development would have one private street entrance on Cliffrdale Drive opposite of Candelwyck Manor Drive. |

**CONFORMITY TO PLANS AND PLANNING ISSUES**

| Legacy 2030 GMA | Growth Management 3 - Suburban Neighborhoods |
| Relevant Legacy 2030 Recommendations | • Legacy 2030 recommends increasing densities along growth corridors to establish a well-used public transit system and accommodate more residents, including seniors and those citizens needing affordable housing. |
| Relevant Area Plan(s) | West Suburban Area Plan (2012) |
| Area Plan Recommendations | • The West Suburban Area Plan recommends low-density residential (up to 5 du/ac) land use at this location. |
| Site Located Along Growth Corridor? | The site is located along Country Club Road Growth Corridor. |
| Site Located within Activity Center? | The site is not located within an activity center. |
| Addressing | There are no addressing or street naming concerns. |

| Applicable Rezoning Consideration from Chapter B, Article VI, Section 6-2.1(R) | (R)(3) - Have changing conditions substantially affected the area in the petition? |
| | No |
| (R)(4) - Is the requested action in conformance with Legacy 2030? | Yes |

| Analysis of Conformity to Plans and Planning Issues | The subject request is to rezone 3.35 acres from RS9 to RM5-S in order to construct a Planned Residential Development (PRD) consisting of duplexes. The proposed density would be 4.78 dwelling units per acre. |
| | The request is consistent with the recommended land use of the West Suburban Area Plan which is for is low-density residential of up to five dwelling units per acre. The site is located along the Country Club Road Growth Corridor and more specifically, it is located on a corner lot which is adjacent to the Silas Creek Parkway exit ramp and a modest sized apartment complex to the north. |
| | From a building mass and scale perspective, the proposed duplex units are compatible with the nearby single family homes. Planning staff sees the proposed rezoning as a well-situated residential infill opportunity. |
### RELEVANT ZONING HISTORIES

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Case</th>
<th>Request</th>
<th>Decision &amp; Date</th>
<th>Direction from Site</th>
<th>Acreage</th>
<th>Recommendation</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>W-2469</td>
<td>RS9-S Site Plan Amendment</td>
<td>Approved 5-7-01</td>
<td>Directly west</td>
<td>.22</td>
<td>Approval Approval</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>W-1753</td>
<td>LO-S Site Plan Amendment</td>
<td>Approved 2-3-92</td>
<td>Directly southeast</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>Approval Approval</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### SITE PLAN COMPLIANCE WITH UDO REQUIREMENTS

- **Units (by type) and Density**: 16 duplex units on 3.35 acres = 4.78 dwelling units per acre.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Parking</th>
<th>Required</th>
<th>Proposed</th>
<th>Layout</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>32 spaces</td>
<td>40 spaces</td>
<td>Primarily located within individual driveways</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Building Height</th>
<th>Maximum</th>
<th>Proposed</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>40'</td>
<td>30'</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Impervious Coverage</th>
<th>Maximum</th>
<th>Proposed</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>NA</td>
<td>48.96%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

- **UDO Sections Relevant to Subject Request**:
  - Chapter B, Article II, Section 2-1.2 (K) RM5 Residential Multifamily District
  - Chapter B, Article II, Section 2-5.60 Planned Residential Development Use Conditions
  - Chapter B, Article II, Section 2-5.64 Residential Building, Townhouse; and Residential Building, Twin Home Use Conditions

- **Complies with Chapter B, Article VII, Section 7-5.3**:
  - (A) *Legacy 2030* policies: Yes
  - (B) *Environmental Ord.*: NA
  - (C) *Subdivision Regulations*: NA

- **Analysis of Site Plan Compliance with UDO Requirements**:

  The site plan consists of eight duplex structures for a total of 16 dwelling units. Said homes are located around an internal, circular private drive which connects onto Cliffdale Drive opposite of Candlewyck Manor Drive.

  Planned Residential Developments allow for reduced lot sizes in exchange for 15% Common Open Space. This open space must be provided in the form of Passive, Active, and Thoroughfare Open Space as the site fronts on Country Club Road. Typically, the Thoroughfare Open Space requirement is shown as a fifty (50) foot deep Type III buffer yard. However, through the Alternative Compliance option, the petitioner is proposing a twenty (20) foot deep landscaped space with brick patio walls. Planning staff sees said design as being an acceptable alternative.
### CONCLUSIONS TO ASSIST WITH RECOMMENDATION

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Positive Aspects of Proposal</th>
<th>Negative Aspects of Proposal</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>The request is consistent with the low-density residential land use recommendation of the West Suburban Area Plan.</td>
<td>A modest increase in vehicle trip generation will occur compared with the current number of trips from the site.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The request serves as a good residential infill opportunity.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The scale of the proposed buildings is compatible with the surrounding homes.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The development will not have direct access onto Country Club Road.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The site is located along the Country Club Road Growth Corridor.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### SITE-SPECIFIC RECOMMENDED CONDITIONS OF APPROVAL

The following proposed conditions are from interdepartmental review comments and are proposed in order to meet codes or established standards, or to reduce negative off-site impacts.

- **PRIOR TO THE ISSUANCE OF GRADING PERMITS:**
  a. Developer shall have a stormwater management study submitted for review by the Public Works Department of the City of Winston-Salem. If required, an engineered stormwater management plan shall be submitted and approved by the Public Works Department. Relocation or installation of any stormwater treatment device into any buffer areas, vegetation designated to remain, or close proximity to adjacent residentially zoned land shall require a Staff Change approval at minimum, and may require a Site Plan Amendment.
  b. Developer shall obtain a driveway permit from the City of Winston-Salem; additional improvements may be required prior to issuance of driveway permit. Required improvements include:
      - Right-of-way dedication of 20’ from center line along Cliffdale Drive along with a 5’ sidewalk easement.
      - Install curb and gutter along Cliffdale Drive and sidewalk along Country Club Road.

- **PRIOR TO THE ISSUANCE OF BUILDING PERMITS:**
  a. The proposed buildings shall be in substantial conformance with the submitted elevations as shown on “Elevation A” as verified by Planning staff.
  b. Developer shall record a final plat in the office of the Register of Deeds. Final plat shall show tentative building locations for the multifamily buildings and all access and utility easements, negative access easement along Country Club Road and right-of-way dedication along Cliffdale Drive.
• PRIOR TO THE ISSUANCE OF OCCUPANCY PERMITS:
  a. Developer shall complete all requirements of the driveway permit.
  b. Building shall be constructed in substantial conformance with the approved building elevations as approved by Planning staff.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION: Approval

NOTE: These are staff comments only; final recommendations on projects are made by the City-County Planning Board, with final decisions being made by the appropriate Elected Body, who may approve, deny, table or request modification for any project. THE APPLICANT OR REPRESENTATIVE IS STRONGLY ENCOURAGED TO ATTEND THE PUBLIC HEARINGS WHERE THE CASE WILL BE CONSIDERED BY THE PLANNING BOARD AND THE ELECTED BODY.
CITY-COUNTY PLANNING BOARD
PUBLIC HEARING
MINUTES FOR W-3272
SEPTEMBER 10, 2015

PUBLIC HEARING

FOR:  None

AGAINST:  None

WORK SESSION

During discussion by the Planning Board, the following points were made:

In response to a question from the Board, Luke Dickey, 601 N. Trade Street, Suite 200, Winston-Salem, NC 27101 explained the types of walls around the development. Immediately behind residential units will be brick walls. Along the open areas will be decorative fencing. The attempt is to mirror the walls at Highland Park.

George Bryan expressed concern that new developments in this area are gated communities. RM5 is intended to be a pedestrian oriented zoning district and we need to be cognizant of that when approving these developments.

The fencing is not required in the Unified Development Ordinances.

MOTION:  Clarence Lambe moved approval of the zoning petition and certified that the site plan (including staff recommended conditions) meets all code requirements if the petition is approved.
SECOND:  Paul Mullican
VOTE:
   FOR:  George Bryan, Melynda Dunigan, Arnold King, Clarence Lambe, Darryl Little, Paul Mullican, Brenda Smith, Allan Younger
   AGAINST:  None
   EXCUSED:  None

____________________________
A. Paul Norby, FAICP
Director of Planning and Development Services
USES ALLOWED WITH A PERMIT FROM THE ZONING OFFICER (Z)
Adult Day Care Home
Child Day Care, Small Home
Church or Religious Institution, Neighborhood
Family Group Home A
Police or Fire Station
Recreation Facility, Public
Residential Building, Single Family
Swimming Pool, Private

USES ALLOWED WITH REVIEW BY THE PLANNING BOARD (P)
Church or Religious Institution, Community
Golf Course
Library, Public
Limited Campus Uses
Planned Residential Development
School, Private
School, Public
Utilities

USES ALLOWED WITH SPECIAL USE PERMIT FROM ZONING BOARD OF ADJUSTMENT (A)
Bed and Breakfast
Child Day Care, Large Home
Habilitation Facility A
Manufactured Home, Class A
Park and Shuttle Lot

USES ALLOWED WITH SPECIAL USE PERMIT FROM ELECTED BODY (E)
Access Easement, Private Off-Site
Parking, Off-Site, for Multifamily or Institutional Uses
Transmission Tower
# Preliminary Comments and/or Recommended Conditions

Note: City-County Planning staff is responsible for coordinating the Interdepartmental Review of Special Use Rezoning Requests; please contact the appropriate Department at the phone # indicated below if you have any questions about the comments or recommendations lists. Further, please note that additional information may be forthcoming from Departments that indicate "See Emailed Comments" or other similar phrase. A list of recommended conditions from this Interdepartmental Review will be sent to you via e-mail generally by the end of the business day on Friday the week prior to the Planning Board Public Hearing.

## Project Case Number: W-3272  Project Title: Cliffmoor  Date: August 26, 2015

### Project Description:
Northeast corner of Country Club Road and Clifsdale Drive

### NCDOT- Phone #: 336.747.7900  Email: warcher@ncdot.gov
No Comment

### WSDOT- Phone #: 336.747.6872  Email: conniej@cityofwso.org
Please explain working of gates at entrance. Sidewalk along Country Club Road. Widen 13 feet from center with curb and gutter. Dedicate 25 feet right of way from center line

### City Engineer- Phone #: 336.747.6846  Email: albertcg@cityofwso.org
1. Driveway permit req’d.
2. Concrete apron req’d.
3. CB’s at entrance req’d.
4. Engr to review/approve all road improvements.
5. NAE along Country Club Rd.
6. Close all unused curb cuts with std C&G.
7. Dedicate R/W (R=20) at intersection.
8. Engr to rev/app interior private roads.
9. Remove Clifsdale Dr. ditch/pipes or improve ditch and provide pipe to CB on Country Club Rd. depending on extent of road improvements req’d.

### Inspections (Zoning)- Phone #: 336.727.2626 or 336.747.7427  Email: donnagb@cityofwso.org or desmondc@cityofwso.org
- Correct density calculations (16 units/3.35 acres = 4.78 units/acre)
- Label types of materials for alternative compliance (i.e. walls, fences and trees)

### Erosion Control - Phone #: 336.747.7453  Email: matthewo@cityofwso.org
An Environmental Grading and Erosion Control Permit will be required if more than 10,000 square feet is to be disturbed during any potential construction. An Erosion and Sedimentation Control plan must be submitted and approved before the permit can be issued. Please submit this plan at least 30 days prior to the intended start date of construction.

### Stormwater Division- Phone #: 336.747.6961  Email: josephf@cityofwso.org
Stormwater Study Required
## Fire (City)

- **Phone #**: 336.734.1290
- **Email**: douglasc@cityofwsfire.org

Show Fire Hydrants within 500' of all portions of the building measured the way in which the Fire Apparatus would travel.

## Utilities

- **Phone #**: 336.747.7309
- **Email**: jackf@cityofws.org

Water and sewer will be private. Water will be master metered and require a backflow preventer. Water meter purchased through City of W-S. Any existing water and/or sewer connections will require evaluation for compliance with backflow preventer requirements, connection serviceability, and/or termination at the main.

## Sanitation

- **Phone #**: 336.748.3080
- **Email**: randallb@cityofws.org

This property would be served by a bulk container (dumpster). Please show the location of the container(s) which should be paved and free of all overhead obstructions.

The container must be enclosed with one side open to provide easy access. There must be three feet of clearance is on the remaining three sides.

## Planning

- **Phone #**: 336.747.7043/747.7068
- **Email**: aaronk@cityofws.org

Elevation condition will be included.

## Street Names/Addresses

- **Phone #**: 336.747.7048
- **Email**: benfs@cityofws.org

No addressing or street naming concerns. I suggested that the developer change the street type from Ct to Way or Ln, due to the current street configuration.