# CITY-COUNTY PLANNING BOARD
## STAFF REPORT

### PETITION INFORMATION

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Docket #</th>
<th>W-3204</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Staff</td>
<td>Gary Roberts, Jr. AICP</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Petitioner(s)</td>
<td>Papadia Properties, LLC</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Owner(s)</td>
<td>Same</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Subject Property</td>
<td>PIN# 6804-76-7360</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Address</td>
<td>See addressing comments below.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Type of Request</td>
<td>Final development plan for property zoned GB-S Two-Phase</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Proposal</td>
<td>The petitioner is requesting final development plan approval for a GB-S Two-Phase (General Business – Special Use) zoned site. The requested use is Shopping Center, Small.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### GENERAL SITE INFORMATION

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Location</th>
<th>Northeast corner of Hanes Mall Boulevard and Oxford Station Lane</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Jurisdiction</td>
<td>City of Winston-Salem</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ward(s)</td>
<td>Southwest</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Site Acreage</td>
<td>+/- 1.85 acre</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Current Land Use</td>
<td>The site has been rough graded but is currently undeveloped.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

#### Surrounding Property Zoning and Use

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Direction</th>
<th>Zoning District</th>
<th>Use</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>North</td>
<td>GB-S</td>
<td>Residence Inn (under construction)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>East</td>
<td>GB-S</td>
<td>Merchant’s Tire</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>South</td>
<td>GB-S</td>
<td>Shoppes at Little Creek</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>West</td>
<td>GB-S</td>
<td>Shine Time Car Wash (under construction)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

#### Physical Characteristics

The undeveloped site has a moderate slope upward from Hanes Mall Boulevard to Oxford Station Way.

#### Proximity to Water and Sewer

Public water and sewer are available.

#### Stormwater/Drainage

A stormwater study for the overall 21.59 acre site was approved on May 29, 2014. Stormwater quality and quantity, from the subject 1.85 acre parcel, will be managed with the use of a community stormwater facility to be located west of the subject property.

#### Watershed and Overlay Districts

The site is not located within a water supply watershed.

#### Analysis of General Site Information

The site includes no regulatory floodplains or watersheds. The site has been rough graded.
## SITE ACCESS AND TRANSPORTATION INFORMATION

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Street Name</th>
<th>Classification</th>
<th>Frontage</th>
<th>ADT Count</th>
<th>Capacity/LOS D</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Hanes Mall Boulevard</td>
<td>Major Thoroughfare</td>
<td>+/-230'</td>
<td>18,000</td>
<td>40,900</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Oxford Station Lane</td>
<td>Private Street (Under construction)</td>
<td>+/-247'</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>N/A</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Oxford Station Way</td>
<td>Private Street (Under construction)</td>
<td>+/-295'</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>N/A</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Proposed Access Point(s)**
The site will have two driveways onto Oxford Station Way. This private street connects directly to Oxford Station Lane which has a right-in, right-out and left-over access point onto Hanes Mall Boulevard across from Fox Trot Court. Off site, the eastern portion of Oxford Station Way connects to Old English Court which has a signalized intersection with Hanes Mall Boulevard.

**Planned Road Improvements**
Hanes Mall Boulevard has been improved to a multilane, median divided facility with right deceleration lanes, left turn lanes, and sidewalks.

**Trip Generation - Existing/Proposed**
See comments below in the Analysis of Site Access and Transportation Information section.

**Sidewalks**
Sidewalks are currently located along Hanes Mall Boulevard, Oxford Station Lane, and Oxford Station Way.

**Transit**
Route 43 runs along Hanes Mall Boulevard.

**Connectivity**
The overall first phase site plan proposes connectivity with the GB-S Two Phase zoned properties to the east and west.

**Traffic Impact Study (TIS)**
A Transportation Impact Study was submitted and reviewed by WSDOT staff as part of the original rezoning (see comments below).

**Analysis of Site Access and Transportation Information**
In 2006, improvements to Hanes Mall Boulevard (including replacement of the adjacent bridge over I-40) were completed. At that time, two access points, which serve the overall GB-S Two Phase zoned site were established to provide access to Hanes Mall Boulevard.

An updated Traffic Impact Study was prepared for the entire 21.59 acre GB-S Two Phase zoned site. The existing lane configurations put in place during said Hanes Mall Boulevard widening project, are sufficient to handle traffic generated by the proposed development. The updated study was compared with the original TIS and both show approximately equal trip generation and Level of Service in the build-out year. The overall 21.59 site, when built out, will generate approximately 13,964 new trips and the signalized intersection for Hanes Mall Boulevard and Old English Court will operate at an acceptable Level of Service C during peak periods. The proposed 14,190 square foot retail building would generate approximately 609 trips per day.
## CONFORMITY TO PLANS AND PLANNING ISSUES

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Legacy GMA</th>
<th>Growth Management Area 3- Suburban Neighborhoods</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| Relevant Legacy Recommendations | • Require sufficient, but not excessive parking, while protecting adjacent land uses, surrounding neighborhoods and the environment. Provide incentives to reduce on-site parking, promote active forms of transportation, and minimize environmental impacts.  
• Promote a pedestrian-friendly orientation for new development and redevelopment and reduce the visual dominance of parking areas. |
| Relevant Area Plan(s) | *Southwest Suburban Area Plan (2009)* |
| Area Plan Recommendations | • The *Southwest Suburban Area Plan* recommends the subject property for mixed-use development.  
• This area (The Hanes Mall Retail/Residential Mixed-Use Area) is proposed for a mix of multifamily use and retail uses. This area currently consists primarily of big-box commercial development, strip centers and outparcel development and contains a large amount of surface parking. As development pressures mount in future decades, these surface parking lots could be redeveloped as vertically-oriented, mixed-use developments incorporating multifamily residential and structured parking. Redevelopment here should incorporate pedestrian-scaled architectural detailing such as awnings and allow for visual connections between the inside and outside of buildings. |
| Site Located Along Growth Corridor? | The site is not located along a growth corridor. |
| Site Located within Activity Center? | The site is not located within an activity center. |
| Addressing | Although the address assignment for this building is 3890 Oxford Station Way, if this proposed building is divided into multiple tenant spaces, each tenant will be assigned a separate address number. |
| Analysis of Conformity to Plans and Planning Issues | The site is part of a larger 21.59 acre GB-S Two Phase site which was rezoned in 2013. This rezoning divided the site into multiple parcels ranging in size from .5 acre to 9.6 acres and included the access points, internal circulation, and external connections. The subject request represents the seventh final development plan within this area and the proposed use is a 14,190 square foot multi-tenant retail building.  

The *Southwest Suburban Area Plan* identifies the site as being within the Hanes Mall Retail/Residential Mixed-Use Area. Recommendations include the incorporation of pedestrian-scaled architectural detailing such as awnings and allow for visual connections between the inside and outside of buildings. These recommendations are similar to the façade and building material requirements for Large Scale Retail Developments which are applicable whenever a single tenant would exceed 75,000 sf. |
The first phase approval of this site included conditions regarding signage and conditions which addressed the above mentioned building appearance matters. Specifically, for properties which front directly onto Hanes Mall Boulevard, at least 50% of the façade must consist of brick or enhanced architectural materials. In addition, the building walls which face Hanes Mall Boulevard must either be the front entrance to the building or said walls must include doors and windows which would give the reasonable appearance of a front building façade. The proposed elevations fully comply with these conditions and include attractive looking windows and doors facing Hanes Mall Boulevard.

There were also conditions regarding the establishment of a common landscaping theme (with respect to plant type/species) for the overall development and for lighting i.e. pole height, fixture type, and foot/candles measured along Hanes Mall Boulevard. The request will comply with those conditions and is consistent with other recently approved final development plans within this development.

### RELEVANT ZONING HISTORIES

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Case</th>
<th>Request</th>
<th>Decision &amp; Date</th>
<th>Direction from Site</th>
<th>Acreage</th>
<th>Recommendation</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>W-3204</td>
<td>GB-S Two Phase Final Development Plan (Shine Time Car Wash)</td>
<td>Approved 1-8-15</td>
<td>Directly west</td>
<td>.95</td>
<td>Approved</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>W-3204</td>
<td>GB-S to GB-S Two Phase</td>
<td>Approved 11-4-13</td>
<td>Included current site</td>
<td>21.59</td>
<td>Approval</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### SITE PLAN COMPLIANCE WITH UDO REQUIREMENTS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Building Square Footage</th>
<th>Square Footage</th>
<th>Placement on Site</th>
<th>Parking</th>
<th>Required</th>
<th>Proposed</th>
<th>Layout</th>
<th>Building Height</th>
<th>Maximum</th>
<th>Proposed</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>14,190</td>
<td>Pulled up to the corner of Hanes Mall Boulevard and Oxford Station Lane</td>
<td>71 spaces</td>
<td>95 spaces</td>
<td>On the northern side of the building</td>
<td>60'</td>
<td>25'</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Impervious Coverage</th>
<th>Maximum</th>
<th>Proposed</th>
<th></th>
<th>N/A</th>
<th>Proposed</th>
<th></th>
<th>81.6 %</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>UDO Sections Relevant to Subject Request</th>
<th>(A) Legacy policies:</th>
<th>Yes</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>(B) Environmental Ord.</td>
<td>N/A</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>(C) Subdivision Regulations</td>
<td>N/A</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

W-3204 August 2015
The proposed final development plan is for a 14,190 square foot commercial building which falls into the category of Shopping Center, Small. The site is in the first tier of lots which front onto Hanes Mall Boulevard. The proposed building is pulled up close to Hanes Mall Boulevard and Oxford Station Lane with the parking located to the side and rear. The site plan meets the requirements of the UDO and the request complies with the approved first phase conditions regarding common landscaping and lighting.

**CONCLUSIONS TO ASSIST WITH RECOMMENDATION**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Positive Aspects of Proposal</th>
<th>Negative Aspects of Proposal</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>The site is already zoned GB-S.</td>
<td>The proposed commercial building will result in an increase in traffic volume.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The site is part of a comprehensive development with coordinated access, stormwater management, and common lighting and landscaping.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The proposed building elevations comply with the first phase conditions.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**SITE-SPECIFIC RECOMMENDED CONDITIONS OF APPROVAL**

The following proposed conditions are from interdepartmental review comments and are proposed in order to meet codes or established standards, or to reduce negative off-site impacts.

- **PRIOR TO THE ISSUANCE OF GRADING PERMITS:**
  a. Developer shall have a stormwater management study submitted for review by the Public Works Department of the City of Winston-Salem. If required, an engineered stormwater management plan shall be submitted and approved by the Public Works Department. Relocation or installation of any stormwater treatment device into any buffer areas, vegetation designated to remain, or close proximity to adjacent residentially zoned land shall require a Staff Change approval at minimum, and may require a Site Plan Amendment.

- **PRIOR TO THE ISSUANCE OF BUILDING PERMITS:**
  a. The exterior walls must have: (1) a combined minimum of 50% brick or enhanced architectural materials or a combination thereof; and (2) either their front door/façade oriented toward Hanes Mall Boulevard or have the building designed to have a rear façade facing Hanes Mall Boulevard that contains doors and windows and gives the reasonable appearance of a front building façade. The proposed building shall be in substantial conformance with the submitted elevations as shown on “Exhibit A” as verified by Planning staff.
  b. An engineered lighting plan shall be submitted to Inspections which complies with the following: (1) maximum pole height of twenty-five (25) feet; (2) full cut-off fixtures; (3) any wallpacks or attached lighting shall be angled downward and away from Hanes Mall Boulevard; and (4) no more than 0.5 ft/candle along the right-of-way of Hanes Mall Boulevard. Decorative lighting (same style/fixtures) shall be installed throughout all parcels that front on Hanes Mall Boulevard.
• **PRIOR TO THE ISSUANCE OF OCCUPANCY PERMITS:**
  a. Development shall install common landscaping (with respect to plant type/s) which is consistent with that shown on the approved plan for Hobby Lobby.
  b. Building shall be constructed in substantial conformance with the approved building elevations approved by Planning staff.
  c. Lighting shall be installed per approved lighting plan and certified by an engineer.

• **OTHER REQUIREMENTS:**
  a. Freestanding signage shall be limited to one sign with a maximum height of six (6) feet and a maximum copy area of thirty-six (36) square feet.
  b. The exterior colors of all buildings constructed on the property shall primarily be earth tones (as determined by Planning Board during final development plan Review). Additional colors may be allowed as accent/secondary colors. All awnings shall be the same color.

**STAFF RECOMMENDATION:** Approval

**NOTE:** These are staff comments only; final recommendations on projects are made by the City-County Planning Board, with final decisions being made by the appropriate Elected Body, who may approve, deny, table or request modification for any project. **THE APPLICANT OR REPRESENTATIVE IS STRONGLY ENCOURAGED TO ATTEND THE PUBLIC HEARINGS WHERE THE CASE WILL BE CONSIDERED BY THE PLANNING BOARD AND THE ELECTED BODY.**
PUBLIC HEARING

FOR: None

AGAINST: None

WORK SESSION

MOTION: Clarence Lambe moved approval of the final development plan.
SECOND: Paul Mullican
VOTE:
  FOR: George Bryan, Melynda Dunigan, Arnold King, Clarence Lambe, Paul Mullican, Brenda Smith, Allan Younger
  AGAINST: None
  EXCUSED: None

A. Paul Norby, FAICP
Director of Planning and Development Services
Proposed Land Use

- Agriculture / Large-Lot Residential
- Low-Density Residential (up to 1 du/acre) (see text page 30)
- Intermediate-Density Residential (12+ du/acre) (see text page 31)
- High-Density Residential (31+ du/acre) (see text page 34)
- Office / High-Density Residential
- Mixed-Use (see text page 34)
- Commercial Recreation
- Retail / Office
- Commercial
- Public Space
- Commercial
- Commercial
- Utility

Special Land Use Conditions

- Activity Centers
- Special

Southwest Suburban Area Plan, 2008

Printed: 7/19/2015
Southwest Suburban Area Plan, DRAFT

Proposed Land Use
- Large-Lot Residential (over 5 Ac)
- Single-Family Residential (0-8 Du/Ac)
- Low-Density Attached Residential (0-8 DU/Ac)
- Intermediate-Density Residential (8.1-18 DU/Ac)
- High-Density Residential (over 18 DU/Ac)
- Offices
- Office/Low-Intensity Commercial
- Commercial
- Mixed-Use Development
- Industrial
- Institutional
- Park
- Open space
- Commercial Recreation
- Utilities
- Activity Center
- Special Land Use Condition Area

Growth Corridors
- Large-Lot/Rural Residential
- Urban/Suburban Single-Family Residential
- Commercial/Office/Multi-family with Urban Form
- Commercial/Office/Multi-family with Suburban Form

Scale: 500 250 0 500 Feet

[Map with land use zones and growth corridors marked]
INTERDEPARTMENTAL SITE PLAN REVIEW COMMITTEE
Project Case Number: W-3204

PRELIMINARY COMMENTS AND/OR RECOMMENDED CONDITIONS

Note: City-County Planning staff is responsible for coordinating the Interdepartmental Review of Special Use Rezoning Requests; please contact the appropriate Department at the phone # indicated below if you have any questions about the comments or recommendations lists. Further, please note that additional information may be forthcoming from Departments that indicate "See Emailed Comments" or other similar phrase. A list of recommended conditions from this Interdepartmental Review will be sent to you via e-mail generally by the end of the business day on Friday the week prior to the Planning Board Public Hearing.

PROJECT CASE NUMBER: W-3204 PROJECT TITLE: Pavillion Outparcel 2 Site Improvements
DATE: July 29, 2015

PROJECT DESCRIPTION: Northeast corner of Hanes Mall Boulevard and Oxford Station Lane

NCDOT- Phone # - 336.747.7900 Email: warcher@ncdot.gov
• Replace any right-of-way markers disturbed by construction.
• No NCDOT driveway permit will be required.
• An encroachment agreement will be needed for any construction in NCDOT right-of-way

WSDOT- Phone # - 336.747.6872 Email: conniej@cityofws.org
Show existing or proposed drive ways across Oxford station way. Provide Bike parking facility.

City Engineer- Phone # - 336.747.6846 Email: albertcg@cityofws.org
1. No streetyard in public R/W
2. No ret walls or ftgs allowed in Public R/W.
3. How protect SD where crossed by ret wall?
4. Cross SD as close to 90 as possible.
5. No monument sign in SD R/W.
6. Please note patio may be damaged if repairs needed to SD system.

Inspections (Zoning)- Phone # - 336.727.2626 or 336.747.7427
Email: donnagb@cityofws.org or desmondc@cityofws.org
• Label the square footage of the largest tree island
• A portion of the parking lot is within the required streetyard along Hanes Mall Boulevard

Erosion Control - Phone # - 336.747.7453 Email: matthewo@cityofws.org
Erosion Control currently has an existing Grading Permit on the larger development where this project is located called Pavilion Winston-Salem. If the developer/financially responsible party is the same for the Pavillion Outparcel 2 Site Improvements project and the Pavilion Winston-Salem project then the Pavillion Outparcel 2 Site Improvements can be constructed with only needing to submit a revised plan. Otherwise the Pavillion Outparcel 2 Site Improvements project will be separate and require the submittal of an Erosion Control Plan to obtain its own Grading Permit.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Department</th>
<th>Phone #</th>
<th>Email</th>
<th>Comments</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Stormwater Division</td>
<td>336.747.6961</td>
<td><a href="mailto:josephf@cityofws.org">josephf@cityofws.org</a></td>
<td>No comment</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fire (City)</td>
<td>336.734.1290</td>
<td><a href="mailto:douglasc@cityofwsfire.org">douglasc@cityofwsfire.org</a></td>
<td>No Comments</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Utilities</td>
<td>336.747.7309</td>
<td><a href="mailto:jackf@cityofws.org">jackf@cityofws.org</a></td>
<td>Water Meters purchased through City of W-S. All water connections will require a backflow preventer. If sewer CO is in driveway a traffic rated CO will be required.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sanitation</td>
<td>336.748.3080</td>
<td><a href="mailto:randallb@cityofws.org">randallb@cityofws.org</a></td>
<td>Bulk containers shall be located as to provide easy ingress and egress by a container tender truck to the container(s). The location of the container(s) shall be free from any overhanging wires or other obstructions which have less than 35 feet of vertical clearance and 40 feet linear clearance of overhead obstruction in the dumping area. All screens or enclosures shall be open on one side for easy access and provide a three foot clearance on all sides from the bulk container(s). Please consider a commercial recycling program and utilizing a commercial recycling vendor. (Winston-Salem, NC Code of Ordinances).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Planning</td>
<td>336.747.7043/747.7068</td>
<td><a href="mailto:aaronk@cityofws.org">aaronk@cityofws.org</a></td>
<td>Ensure that red awnings shown on the proposed elevations are of an “earth tone” shade as required in the approved conditions.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Street Names/Addresses</td>
<td>336.747.7048</td>
<td><a href="mailto:benfs@cityofws.org">benfs@cityofws.org</a></td>
<td>Although the address assignment for this building is 3890 Oxford Station Way, if this proposed building is divided into multiple tenant spaces, each tenant will be assigned a separate address number.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
RE: W-3204  
From: Amanda Williams [mailto:asiegal_williams@bscholdings.com]  
Sent: Thursday, August 13, 2015 12:31 PM  
To: Aaron King  
Subject: Development across Hanes Mall Blvd  

Aaron  

We appreciate you forwarding to us a rendering of the proposed commercial building for the site being considered by the Planning Board this afternoon. We have not been contacted by the group and did not know of any plans to add a new commercial building across the street.  

As you know we are a very active and significant real estate developer in Winston Salem. We have a very substantial investment across Hanes Mall Boulevard in the Shoppes of Little Creek development. Our Lofts at Little Creek development currently consists of 197 upper end apartments renting for $1,000 to $1,500 per month. This 20 million dollar investment compliments the Shoppes of Little Creek and was developed in the character of the development that Ladd Freeman worked so hard to achieve. Our clientele looks directly at this building. We also in the process of adding additional upper end apartment units on the hill behind our building that would look directly at the site in discussion. When we chose the site to build our development, it was because the character and the style was upper end and fit in well with our concept of upper end living.  

While we have always supported real estate development, we cannot support the proposed development based on the architectural drawings proposed. We would hope that the City could work with the developer of these buildings to modify the character of them so that they would compliment the development in this area along Hanes Mall Boulevard. Specifically the bright colored and possibly multi colored awnings are not in character with the buildings in the Shoppes of Little Creek development or the development in which this building is proposed. When Mr. Walls initially proposed the overall development across the street, he agreed to earth tone colors and masonry and stone materials facing Hanes Mall Boulevard to keep with the character of the development across the street.  

Sincerely,  

Amanda Williams  
BSC Holdings, Inc.  
PO Box 8306  
Greensboro, NC 27419  
(336) 292-9010  
www.bscholding.us