DOCKET #: W3054

PROPOSED ZONING:
Site Plan Amendment

EXISTING ZONING:
RM8-S

PETITIONER:
Melvin L. Frazier and Victoria M. Frazier for property owned by Same

SCALE: 1" represents 300'

STAFF: Roberts

GMA: 2

ACRES: 2.19

NEAREST BLDG: 30' south

MAP(S): 636874
January 20, 2010

Rev. Melvin L. and Victoria M. Frazier
421 Chesham Drive
Kernersville, NC  27284

RE:  SITE PLAN AMENDMENT W-3054

Dear Rev. & Mrs. Frazier:

The attached report of the Planning Board to the City Council is sent to you at the request of the Council Members. You will be notified by the City Secretary’s Office of the date on which the Council will hear this petition.

Sincerely,

A. Paul Norby, FAICP
Director of Planning

pc:  City Secretary’s Office, P.O. Box 2511, Winston-Salem, NC  27102
Melvin Frazier, 421 Chesham Drive, Kernersville, NC  27284
Victoria Frazier, 421 Chesham Drive, Kernersville, NC  27284
Mamie F. Blakney, 4613 Old Rural Hall Road, Winston-Salem, NC  27105
Cynthia Cox Moore, 4418 Old Rural Hall Road, Winston-Salem, NC  27105
Clarice James, 1601 Forest Knoll Circle, Winston-Salem, NC  27101
### ACTION REQUEST FORM

**DATE:** January 20, 2010  
**TO:** The Honorable Mayor and City Council  
**FROM:** A. Paul Norby, FAICP, Director of Planning

**COUNCIL ACTION REQUEST:**

Request for Public Hearing on Site Plan Amendment of Melvin L. Frazier and Victoria M. Frazier

**SUMMARY OF INFORMATION:**

Site Plan Amendment of Melvin L. Frazier and Victoria M. Frazier for a RM-8-S (Child Day Care Center; and Residential Building, Single Family) zoned site: property is located on the southeast corner of Old Rural Hall Road and Opportunity Road (Zoning Docket W-3054).

**PLANNING BOARD ACTION:**

**MOTION ON PETITION:** APPROVAL  
**FOR:** UNANIMOUS  
**AGAINST:** NONE  
**SITE PLAN ACTION:** CONFORMS TO THE REQUIREMENTS OF THE UDO
CITY ORDINANCE - SPECIAL USE

Site Plan Amendment of Melvin L. Frazier and Victoria M. Frazier,
Docket W-3054

AN ORDINANCE AMENDING THE
WINSTON-SALEM CITY
ZONING ORDINANCE AND THE
OFFICIAL ZONING MAP OF
THE CITY OF WINSTON-SALEM, N.C.

_________________________________

BE IT ORDAINED by the City Council of the City of Winston-Salem as follows:

Section 1. The Winston-Salem City Zoning Ordinance and the Official Zoning Map of
the City of Winston-Salem, N.C. are hereby amended by granting a Site Plan Amendment for
property zoned RM-8-S (Child Day Care Center; and Residential Building, Single Family) - Site
Plan Amendment] and described as follows:

Lying and being in Winston Township of Forsyth County, NC and beginning at an iron
found in the east right-of-way line of Old Rural Hall Road, said iron found being located
at the northwest corner of Tax Lot 9 of Block 925 and also being located at the southwest
corner of Tax Lot 10 of Block 925, said iron found being the point of beginning.

Running thence with the east right-of-way line of Old Rural Hall Road north 17° 44' 55"
west 190.93 feet to an iron found, said iron found being located at the northwest corner of
Tax Lot 10 of Block 925 and also being located at the southwest corner of Tax Lot 201 of
Block 2328; thence continuing with the east right-of-way line of Old Rural Hall Road
north 17° 43' 52" west 179.48 feet to an iron found; thence continuing with the east right-
of-way line of Old Rural Hall Road on a curve to the right with an arc of 75.13 feet, a
radius of 160.65 feet, and a chord bearing and distance of north 04° 20' 04" west 74.45
feet to an iron found at the intersection of the east right-of-way line of Old Rural Hall
Road and the south right-of-way line of Opportunity Road; thence with the south right-
of-way line of Opportunity Road north 86° 17' 43” east 341.13 feet to an iron found, said
iron found being located at the northeast corner of Tax Lot 201 of Block 2328 and also
being located at the northwest corner of Tax Lot 67 of Block 2328; thence with the
common line between Tax Lot 201 of Block 2328 and Tax Lot 67 of Block 2328 south
04° 11' 25” east 148.26 feet to a point; thence with a new line across Tax Lot 201 of
Block 2328 south 86° 39’ 01” west 108.00 feet to a point; thence with a new line across
Tax Lot 201 of Block 2328 south 04° 11’ 25” east 100.41 feet to a point in the common
line between Tax Lot 201 of Block 2328 and Tax Lot 43 of Block 302; thence with the
common line between Tax Lot 201 of Block 2328 and Tax Lot 43 of Block 3022 south
86° 39’ 01” west 11.21 feet to an iron found in the south line of Tax Lot 201 of Block
2328, said iron found being located at the northwest corner of Tax Lot 43 of Block 3022 and also being located at the northeast corner of Tax Lot 10 of Block 925; thence with the common line between Tax Lot 43 of Block 3022 and Tax Lot 10 of Block 925 south 17° 43’ 30” east 134.79 feet to an iron found at the southwest corner of Tax Lot 43 of Block 3022, said iron found also being located at the northwest corner of the right-of-way of Ada Avenue; thence with the west right-of-way line of Ada Avenue south 17° 40’ 00” east 13.09 feet to an iron found at the southeast corner of Tax Lot 10 of Block 925, said iron found also being located at the northeast corner of Tax Lot 9 of Block 925; thence with the common line between Tax Lot 10 of Block 925 and Tax Lot 9 of Block 925 south 72° 13’ 28” west 174.43 feet to an iron found in the east right-of-way line of Old Rural Hall Road being the point of beginning.

Section 2. This Ordinance is adopted after approval of the site plan entitled Melvin Frazier and identified as Attachment "A" of the Special Use District Permit issued by the City Council the ______ day of __________________, to Melvin L. Frazier and Victoria M. Frazier.

Section 3. The City Council hereby directs the issuance of a Special Use District Permit pursuant to the Zoning Ordinance of the Unified Development Ordinances for a development to be known as Melvin Frazier. Said Special Use District Permit and site plan with associated documents are attached hereto and incorporated herein.

Section 4. This Ordinance shall be effective from and after its adoption.
CITY - SPECIAL USE DISTRICT PERMIT

SPECIAL USE DISTRICT PERMIT

Issued by the City Council of the City of Winston-Salem

The City Council of the City of Winston-Salem issues a Special Use District Permit for the site shown on the site plan map included in this zoning petition of Melvin L. Frazier and Victoria M. Frazier, (Zoning Docket W-3054). The site shall be developed in accordance with the plan approved by the Board and bearing the inscription: "Attachment A, Special Use District Permit for RM-8-S (Child Day Care Center; and Residential Building, Single Family), approved by the Winston-Salem City Council the _____ day of _____________________, 20____" and signed, provided the property is developed in accordance with requirements of the RM-8-S zoning district of the Zoning Ordinance of the Unified Development Ordinances, the Erosion Control Ordinance, and other applicable laws, and the following additional conditions be met:

• **PRIOR TO ISSUANCE OF ANY PERMITS:**
  a. Developer shall obtain a driveway permit from City of Winston-Salem Public Works Department. Required improvements include:
     • Sidewalk along Old Rural Hall Road.
  b. Developer shall obtain a driveway permit from NCDOT; additional improvements may be required prior to issuance of driveway permit.

• **PRIOR TO THE ISSUANCE OF OCCUPANCY PERMITS:**
  a. Developer shall install sidewalk along the frontage of Old Rural Hall Road.
  b. Developer shall install an “Enter Only” sign on the northernmost driveway
  c. Developer shall record a negative access easement along Old Rural Hall Road.

• **OTHER REQUIREMENTS:**
  a. Any freestanding signage shall be limited to one monument sign with a maximum height of six (6) feet and a maximum copy area of eighteen (18) square feet.
  b. All trees shown on the site plan as “to remain” shall not be removed.
PETITION INFORMATION

Docket #  W-3054

Staff  
Gary Roberts, Jr., AICP

Petitioner(s)  Melvin L. Frazier and Victoria M. Frazier

Owner(s)  Same

Subject Property  PIN #6837-87-1296 and a portion of 6837-87-2413

Address  4647 Old Rural Hall Road

Proposal  The petitioner is requesting a Site Plan Amendment to the existing RM-8-S zoned property to increase the number of children in the existing day care center from 35 to 95 children. The permitted uses established for this site in 1998 (W-2209) are:
- Child Day Care Center; and Residential Building, Single Family

Zoning District Purpose Statement  The RM-8 District is primarily intended to accommodate duplexes, twin homes, townhouses, multifamily, and other low intensity multifamily uses at a maximum overall density of eight (8) units per acre. This district is appropriate for Growth Management Areas 2 and 3 and may be suitable for Metro Activity Centers where public facilities, including public water and sewer, public roads, parks, and other governmental support services, are available.

Applicable Rezoning Consideration from Chapter B, Article VI, Section 6-2.1(R)  (R)(I) - Is the proposal consistent with the purpose statement(s) of the requested zoning district(s)?

Yes, request is consistent with the purpose statement of the existing RM-8-S District in that the site is located within the Urban Neighborhoods (GMA 2).

GENERAL SITE INFORMATION

Location  Southeast corner of Old Rural Hall Road and Opportunity Road

Jurisdiction  City of Winston-Salem

Ward(s)  Northeast

Site Acreage  ± 2.19 acres

Current Land Use  Child Day Care Center with approval for up to 35 children.

Surrounding Property Zoning and Use

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Direction</th>
<th>Zoning District</th>
<th>Use</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>North</td>
<td>RS-9</td>
<td>Single family homes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>East</td>
<td>RS-9</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>South</td>
<td>RS-9</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>West</td>
<td>RS-9</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
### Applicable Rezoning Consideration from Chapter B, Article VI, Section 6-2.1(R)

**Is/are the use(s) permitted under the proposed classification/request compatible with uses permitted on other properties in the vicinity?**

Increasing the number of children in the existing day care center from 35 to 95 will increase the intensity of said use and possibly the impact on some of the adjacent single family homes. However, considering the existing nature of the use, the relatively minor change proposed to the site plan and the corner lot location along a major thoroughfare, staff considers the use to be generally compatible with the surrounding uses.

### Physical Characteristics

The site includes some mature canopy trees and has a gentle slope downward to the east.

### Proximity to Water and Sewer

Public water and sewer are available.

### Stormwater/Drainage

No known issues.

### Analysis of General Site Information

The site appears to have no development constraints and is suitable for the proposed improvements.

### SITE ACCESS AND TRANSPORTATION INFORMATION

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Street Name</th>
<th>Classification</th>
<th>Frontage</th>
<th>ADT Count</th>
<th>Capacity/LOS D</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Old Rural Hall Road</td>
<td>Major Thoroughfare</td>
<td>442’</td>
<td>11,000</td>
<td>16,100</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Opportunity Road</td>
<td>Local Street</td>
<td>332’</td>
<td>NA</td>
<td>NA</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Proposed Access Point(s)**
The site plan illustrates the retention of the two existing driveways onto Old Rural Hall Road.

**Planned Road Improvements**
The Comprehensive Transportation Plan recommends a three lane section with wide outside lanes, curb and gutter and sidewalks for Old Rural Hall Road.

**Trip Generation - Existing/Proposed**

**Existing and Proposed Zoning: RM-8-S**

4,866/1,000 x 79.26 (Day Care Center Trip Rate) = 386 Trips per Day

Note: It would be logical to assume the trip generation of this site will increase along with the proposed increase in the number of children. However, the trip rate for this use is based upon the square footage of the facility devoted to said use and not the number of children. According to the site plan, the existing 4,866 sf structure will continue to be used completely for the child day care center.

**Sidewalks**

There are no sidewalks located in the general area. Sidewalks are required along Old Rural Hall Road.

**Transit**

Route 9 along Old Rural Hall Road.

**Connectivity**

Disconnected streets increase potential for delayed emergency response as per Forsyth County Fire Department. Ada Avenue should eventually either be connected at Old Rural Hall Road or one segment be renamed.
Staff does not anticipate any negative transportation impacts from this request. Sidewalks are required along Old Rural Hall Road.

### CONFORMITY TO PLANS AND PLANNING ISSUES

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Legacy GMA</th>
<th>Growth Management Area 2, Urban Neighborhoods</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Relevant Legacy</td>
<td>Permit services near where people live including places of worship and other institutions in a manner that is compatible with surrounding uses, and provide retail and service uses within walking and bicycling distance of neighborhoods. (p. 148)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Relevant Area Plan(s)</td>
<td>Carver Road/Ogburn Station Development Guide (1991)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Area Plan Recommendations</td>
<td>The Carver Road/Ogburn Station Development Guide recommends the subject property for low density residential development.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Applicable Rezoning Consideration from Chapter B, Article VI, Section 6-2.1(R)</td>
<td>(R)(3) - Have changing conditions substantially affected the area in the petition? Yes, the site was rezoned for a Child Day Care Center in 1998. (R)(4) - Is the requested action in conformance with Legacy? Yes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Analysis of Conformity to Plans and Planning Issues</td>
<td>The subject request would increase the number of children at the existing day care center from 35 to 95. The only alteration to the site plan is the addition of 7 parking spaces. No building expansion is proposed and the existing outdoor play area is currently large enough to meet the 100 sf per child size requirement of the UDO. The proposed parking expansion would result in the removal of one of the canopy trees on the site. The petitioner has agreed to retain the other remaining trees on the site. Planning staff sees the request as being consistent with the recommendations of Legacy in that it would allow for the expansion of an institutional use which is compatible and convenient to the surrounding uses.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### RELEVANT ZONING HISTORIES

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Case</th>
<th>Request</th>
<th>Decision &amp; Date</th>
<th>Direction from Site</th>
<th>Acreage</th>
<th>Recommendation</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>W-2439</td>
<td>RS-9 &amp; RM8-S to RM8-S</td>
<td>Withdrawn 3-8-01</td>
<td>Included current site</td>
<td>3.02</td>
<td>Approval</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>W-2209</td>
<td>RS-9 to RM8-S</td>
<td>Approved 3-2-98</td>
<td>Included current site</td>
<td>2.29</td>
<td>Approval</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>W-1999</td>
<td>RS-9 to RM8-S</td>
<td>Denied 11-6-95</td>
<td>Included current site</td>
<td>4.13</td>
<td>Approval</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
### SITE PLAN COMPLIANCE WITH UDO REQUIREMENTS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Building Square Footage</th>
<th>Square Footage</th>
<th>Placement on Site</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Parking</td>
<td>4,866 sf²</td>
<td>Central portion of site</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Building Height</th>
<th>Required</th>
<th>Proposed</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Parking</td>
<td>17 spaces</td>
<td>17 spaces</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Impervious Coverage</th>
<th>Maximum</th>
<th>Proposed</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>70%</td>
<td>22.7 %</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>UDO Sections Relevant to Subject Request</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>- Chapter B, Article II, Section 2-1.2 (L) RM-8 District</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Chapter B, Article II, Section 2-5.18 Day Care Center Use Conditions</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Complies with Chapter B, Article VII, Section 7-5.3</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>(A) Legacy policies: Yes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(B) Environmental Ord. NA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(C) Subdivision Regulations NA</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Analysis of Site Plan Compliance with UDO Requirements</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>The site plan meets UDO requirements.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### CONCLUSIONS TO ASSIST WITH RECOMMENDATION

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Positive Aspects of Proposal</th>
<th>Negative Aspects of Proposal</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Request is consistent with Legacy in that it would allow for the expansion of a neighborhood serving institutional use.</td>
<td>Request will increase the intensity of the site.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Petitioner will retain the existing canopy trees on the site with the exception of one tree now located in the proposed parking area.</td>
<td>Request will generate more traffic to/from the site.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### SITE-SPECIFIC RECOMMENDED CONDITIONS OF APPROVAL

The following proposed conditions are from interdepartmental review comments and are proposed in order to meet codes or established standards, or to reduce negative off-site impacts.

- **PRIOR TO ISSUANCE OF ANY PERMITS:**
  a. Developer shall obtain a driveway permit from City of Winston-Salem Public Works Department. Required improvements include:
     - Sidewalk along Old Rural Hall Road.
  b. Developer shall obtain a driveway permit from NCDOT; additional improvements may be required prior to issuance of driveway permit.

- **PRIOR TO THE ISSUANCE OF OCCUPANCY PERMITS:**
  a. Developer shall install sidewalk along the frontage of Old Rural Hall Road.
  b. Developer shall install an “Enter Only” sign on the northernmost driveway
  c. Developer shall record a negative access easement along Old Rural Hall Road.
• **OTHER REQUIREMENTS:**
  a. Any freestanding signage shall be limited to one monument sign with a maximum height of six (6) feet and a maximum copy area of eighteen (18) square feet.
  b. All trees shown on the site plan as “to remain” shall not be removed.

**STAFF RECOMMENDATION:** Approval

**NOTE:** These are staff comments only; final recommendations on projects are made by the City-County Planning Board, with final decisions being made by the appropriate Elected Body, who may approve, deny, table or request modification for any project. **THE APPLICANT OR REPRESENTATIVE IS STRONGLY ENCOURAGED TO ATTEND THE PUBLIC HEARINGS WHERE THE CASE WILL BE CONSIDERED BY THE PLANNING BOARD AND THE ELECTED BODY.**

Gary Roberts presented the staff report.

**PUBLIC HEARING**

FOR:

Melvin Frazier, 421 Chesham Drive, Kernersville, NC  27284
- We’ve been working in this area since 1995 when we originally came before the board.
- We were approved for a day care center at the corner of Old Rural Hall Road and Baux Mountain Road in 1998.
- We have been full from the very beginning, for 11 years.
- We have consistently been turning people away.
- We have other day cares in the area and they are full as well.
- We have reached out to the neighborhood, tried to meet with them and talked with them.
  We took their concerns to heart and came up with what we feel is a good solution.
- One of the main concerns is the traffic problem. Approximately 35-50 percent of the children we service are being transported on our buses.
- We don’t want to upset the neighborhood.
- We don’t believe this will increase the traffic.

Victoria Frazier, 421 Chesham Drive, Kernersville, NC  27284
- I’m the owner of Victoria’s Academy.
- I don’t see where there would be a problem with this.
- When we were here last time they wouldn’t allow us to do what we were asking. Since then they’ve put in stores and stuff so I’m hoping you’ll allow this.
AGAINST:

Mamie F. Blakney, 4613 Old Rural Hall Road, Winston-Salem, NC  27105
- My property adjoins the driveway of this property.
- I’ve been here for 35 years.
- From what I can see the Frazier’s are going around the back door to get what they asked for previously.
- They were told then why they were limited to 35 children.
- Traffic was one of the major problems.
- Old Rural Hall Road runs from the County to the City. There are only two traffic signals and traffic from several roads feeds into this one.
- The speed limit is 35 mph.
- The Fraziers are now using the exit entrance for in and out traffic.
- When the board originally approved this, they were instructed to have one entrance and one exit. The exit was to be next to me.
- My driveway is very close to their driveway. The City bus stops right there. Ada Avenue is directly across the street from this driveway.
- It would be very difficult for me to get in and out of my property. It is a dangerous situation.
- I don’t remember the Fraziers being given a residential house. It didn’t make sense to do a residential house and then limit him to 35 children.
- I would like for you all to take into consideration those who live on Old Rural Hall Road.

Cynthia Cox Moore, 4418 Old Rural Hall Road, Winston-Salem, NC  27105
- We’ve been down this trail before: Traffic, traffic, traffic and children.
- The Family Dollar store was the Paragon.
- I live right next door to the Family Dollar store and traffic is piled up against me.
- The big accident last week happened at this site.
- The idea of adding 60 children and all those buses to this road is horrifying.
- What’s the point of busing all those children from all over the county into this one institution?
- We don’t have many children in this neighborhood.
- This is just a money-making proposition.
- I’m speaking for myself and my sister-in-law who is too feeble to come speak for herself.

Clarice James, 1601 Forest Knoll Circle, Winston-Salem, NC  27101
- This is an incident that has just been revisited.
- This whole thing seems to be a money-making thing.
- What will the children be doing while they are at Victoria’s Academy waiting for their transfer.
- There are older people in this neighborhood in this particular area, so why can’t these people get any peace, live quietly, and enjoy life.
- This immediate area is heavily congested anyway. To bring more children here doesn’t make sense except to make money.
- Please do not let the Fraziers swallow up the other people in the community.
- Please oppose this.
WORK SESSION

During discussion by the Planning Board, the following points were made:

1. Lynne Mitchell: I would like to know about the buses and vans that will be coming to this site. Mr. Frazier explained that they go to the children’s homes and pick the children up. We bring them to the centers and disperse them to the centers. At Victoria’s we have two buses and two vans that are coming in the center. Mrs. Frazier stated that the children are from the area. She stated that this was a mission rather than simply a money-making business.

2. Traffic caused by this site is mostly between 6-9 am and 3-5:30 pm. We let children catch school buses from this site and then transport the ones for whom buses do not run past this site.

3. Wesley Curtis: Traffic can certainly be an issue here, especially at this intersection and it can be tricky. Improving the intersection may help the circulation situation. The idea that children are being transported via vans instead of individual vehicles helps. I’m leaning towards supporting the motion at this point.

4. Arthur King: I’m sympathetic to the neighbors’ concerns about traffic. The staff report suggests that the calculation of traffic increase is based more on the size of the building than on anything else. In essence the increase in the number of children served should not have a major impact on the number of cars coming and going in this area. For me that is one of the issues that leads me to support this application. Child Care is an extremely important issue in our society. To have it done right and well is increasingly rare. If somebody cares about taking care of the little people whose parents have to work, I think we need to do whatever we can to support that.

5. The Fraziers were limited to 35 children because they said Old Rural Hall Road needed to be widened and they needed a turn lane.

6. The staff report indicates the traffic count today on Old Rural Hall Road is about 11,000 and the capacity is a little over 16,000.

7. Lynne Mitchell: Having good childcare and having it accessible and picking kids up from school really helps people and helps with traffic. I am going to be supporting this case.

8. Paul Mullican: I’m very familiar with their operation. I have never seen anything out of place on this site. The facility is neat, the house is neat. I’d like to thank them for that.
MOTION: Clarence Lambe moved approval of the Site Plan Amendment, certified that the site plan meets all code requirements and recommends staff conditions.
SECOND: Paul Mullican
VOTE:
    FOR: Wesley Curtis, Arnold King, Arthur King, Clarence Lambe, Darryl Little, Lynne Mitchell, Paul Mullican, Brenda Smith
    AGAINST: None
    EXCUSED: None

_______________________
A. Paul Norby, FAICP
Director of Planning