PROPOSED ZONING:
RSQ-L

EXISTING ZONING:
RS9

PETITIONER:
Grace Sheets
for property owned by Same

SCALE: 1" represents 200'

STAFF: Roberts

GMA: 2

ACRES: 0.68

NEAREST BLDG: 5' south

MAP(S): 630874

DOCKET #: W3105
June 22, 2011

Grace Sheets
5536 Gyddie Drive
Winston-Salem, NC 27105

RE: ZONING MAP AMENDMENT W-3105

Dear Ms. Sheets:

The attached report of the Planning Board to the City Council is sent to you at the request of the Council Members. You will be notified by the City Secretary’s Office of the date on which the Council will hear this petition.

Sincerely,

[Signature]
A. Paul Norby, FAICP
Director of Planning

pc: City Secretary’s Office, P.O. Box 2511, Winston-Salem, NC 27102
Wesley Alexander Boyles, 2439 Sink Street, Winston-Salem, NC 27107
Cheryl Barr, 219 Alspaugh, Winston-Salem, NC 27105
Melvin Gaither, 3990 Shamel Street, Winston-Salem, NC 27105
**ACTION REQUEST FORM**

**DATE:** June 22, 2011  
**TO:** The Honorable Mayor and City Council  
**FROM:** A. Paul Norby, FAICP, Director of Planning

**COUNCIL ACTION REQUEST:**

Request for Public Hearing on zoning map amendment of Grace Sheets

**SUMMARY OF INFORMATION:**

Zoning map amendment of Grace Sheets from RS9 to RSQ-L (Residential Building, Single Family; Residential Building, Duplex; and Residential Building, Twin Home): property is located on the southeast corner of Alspaugh Street and Shamel Street (Zoning Docket W-3105).

**PLANNING BOARD ACTION:**

**MOTION ON PETITION:** APPROVAL.  
**FOR:** UNANIMOUS  
**AGAINST:** NONE  
**SITE PLAN ACTION:** NOT REQUIRED
CITY ORDINANCE - SPECIAL USE LIMITED DISTRICT

Zoning Petition of Grace Sheets, Docket W-3105

AN ORDINANCE AMENDING THE
WINSTON-SALEM CITY
ZONING ORDINANCE AND THE
OFFICIAL ZONING MAP OF
THE CITY OF WINSTON-SALEM, N.C.

BE IT ORDAINED by the City Council of the City of Winston-Salem as follows:

Section 1. The Winston-Salem City Zoning Ordinance and the Official Zoning Map of the City of Winston-Salem, N.C. are hereby amended by changing from RS9 to RSQ-L (Residential Building, Single Family; Residential Building, Duplex; and Residential Building, Twin Home) the zoning classification of the following described property:

PIN #s 6837-04-0951 and 0812

Section 2. This Ordinance is adopted after approval of the Special Use Limited District Permit issued by the City Council the _____ day of _________________, 20___ to Grace Sheets.

Section 3. The City Council hereby directs the issuance of a Special Use Limited District Permit pursuant to the Zoning Ordinance of the Unified Development Ordinances for a development to be known as Grace Sheets. Said Special Use Limited District Permit with conditions is attached hereto and incorporated herein.

Section 4. This Ordinance shall be effective from and after its adoption.
The City Council of the City of Winston-Salem issues a Special Use Limited District Permit for the zoning petition of Grace Sheets, (Zoning Docket W-3105). The site shall be developed in accordance with the conditions approved by the Board and the following uses: Residential Building, Single Family; Residential Building, Duplex; and Residential Building, Twin Home, approved by the Winston-Salem City Council the ______ day of ____________________, 20____" and signed, provided the property is developed in accordance with requirements of the RSQ-L zoning district of the Zoning Ordinance of the Unified Development Ordinances, the Erosion Control Ordinance, and other applicable laws, and the following additional condition be met:

• OTHER REQUIREMENTS:
  a. The zoning lot containing PIN#'s 6837-04-0951 and 6837-04-0812 shall not contain more than four (4) dwelling units.

W-3105 June 2011
## PETITION INFORMATION

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Docket #</th>
<th>W-3105</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Staff</td>
<td>Gary Roberts, Jr. AICP</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Petitioner(s)</td>
<td>Grace Sheets</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Owner(s)</td>
<td>Same</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Subject Property</td>
<td>PIN #s 6837-04-0951 and 0812</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Address</td>
<td>219 and 227 Alspaugh Street</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Type of Request</td>
<td>Special Use Limited rezoning from RS9 to RSQ-L</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Proposal</td>
<td>The petitioner is requesting to amend the Official Zoning Maps for the subject property from RS9 (Residential, Single Family District; 9,000 sf minimum lot size) to RSQ-L (Residential Single Family Quadruplex - Special Use Limited District). The petitioner is requesting the following uses: Residential Building, Single Family; Residential Building, Duplex; and Residential Building, Twin Home</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Neighborhood Contact/Meeting</td>
<td>The petitioner has scheduled a neighborhood/community meeting at the First Assembly of God Church on Thursday May 26, 2011.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Zoning District Purpose Statement</td>
<td>The RSQ District is primarily intended to accommodate predominantly single family areas containing a mixture of single family detached dwellings, duplexes, triplexes, and quadruplexes in urban neighborhoods and in areas with adequate infrastructure to support more intense development. This district is intended for application in GMAs (Growth Management Areas) 2 (Urban Neighborhoods) and 3 (Suburban Neighborhoods) and may be suitable for Metro Activity Centers where public facilities, including public water and sewer, public roads, parks, and other governmental support services are available.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Applicable Rezoning Consideration from Chapter B, Article VI, Section 6-2.1(R)</td>
<td>(R)(1) - Is the proposal consistent with the purpose statement(s) of the requested zoning district(s)? Yes, the site is within a predominantly single family area which also has some mixture of housing types within the Urban Neighborhoods GMA.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

## GENERAL SITE INFORMATION

<p>| Location | Southeast corner of Alspaugh Street and Shamel Street |
| Jurisdiction | City of Winston-Salem |
| Ward(s) | North |
| Site Acreage | ±.68 acre |
| Current Land Use | One single family home is currently located on the site. |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Surrounding Property Zoning and Use</th>
<th>Direction</th>
<th>Zoning District</th>
<th>Use</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>North</td>
<td>RS9</td>
<td>North Hills Elementary School</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>East</td>
<td>RS9</td>
<td>Quadraplex</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>South</td>
<td>RS9</td>
<td>Single family home</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>West</td>
<td>RS9</td>
<td>Single family homes</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**(R)(2) - Is/are the use(s) permitted under the proposed classification/request compatible with uses permitted on other properties in the vicinity?**
Yes, the proposed single family and duplex uses are compatible with the institutional and other residential uses currently found in the vicinity.

**Physical Characteristics**
The site has a gentle to moderate slope downward to the east. No streams or wetlands are located on the site.

**Proximity to Water and Sewer**
Public water and sewer are available to the site.

**Stormwater/Drainage**
No known issues.

**Watershed and Overlay Districts**
The site is not within a water supply watershed.

**Analysis of General Site Information**
The site has no apparent constraints and appears to be suitable for development within the proposed RSQ District.

**SITE ACCESS AND TRANSPORTATION INFORMATION**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Street Name</th>
<th>Classification</th>
<th>Frontage</th>
<th>ADT Count</th>
<th>Capacity/LOS D</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Alspaugh Street</td>
<td>Collector Street</td>
<td>209'</td>
<td>NA</td>
<td>NA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Shamel Street</td>
<td>Local Street</td>
<td>165'</td>
<td>NA</td>
<td>NA</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Proposed Access Point(s)**
Because this is a Special Use Limited request with no site plan or access conditions, the exact location of access points (other than the existing driveway onto Alspaugh Street) is unknown.

**Trip Generation - Existing/Proposed**
- **Existing Zoning:** RS9
  
  0.68 acre x 43,560 sf / 9,000 = 3 units x 9.57 (SFR Trip Rate) = 29 Trips per Day

- **Proposed Zoning:** RSQ-L
  
  4 units (based on condition) x 7.69 (Average of SFR and Townhouse Trip Rates) = 31 Trips per Day

**Sidewalks**
A sidewalk is located along the eastern side of Alspaugh Street.

**Transit**
Route 7 runs along Alspaugh Street.

**Analysis of Site Access and Transportation Information**
Staff does not anticipate any negative transportation impacts from this request.
### CONFORMITY TO PLANS AND PLANNING ISSUES

| Relevant Legacy Recommendations | • Manage growth by making more efficient use of land that has already been developed, encouraging reuse and infill and capitalizing on other development opportunities. Older urban and suburban neighborhoods should be reinforced as good places to live and do business.  
• In order to utilize the land in the Municipal Services Area (MSA) more effectively, a housing mix that includes more compact, higher density forms of residential development should be encouraged. |
| Relevant Area Plan(s) | North Suburban Area Plan, 2005 |
| Area Plan Recommendations | • The North Suburban Area Plan recommends the subject property for low-density residential development. According to the plan, low-density residential has a density of 0 to 5 units per acre and consists mostly of single-family units. |
| Other Applicable Plans and Planning Issues | The site is within the Forest Hills/North Hills – Rehabilitation, Conservation & Reconditioning area as certified on June 14, 1990. The objective of this program was to preserve the area as a residential neighborhood and encourage residential investment. |
| Addressing | There are no address numbering or street naming concerns. |
| Applicable Rezoning Consideration from Chapter B, Article VI, Section 6-2.1(R) |  
(R)(3) - Have changing conditions substantially affected the area in the petition?  
No  
(R)(4) - Is the requested action in conformance with Legacy?  
Yes |
| Analysis of Conformity to Plans and Planning Issues | The request is to rezone a .68 acre parcel from RS9 to RSQ-L. The North Suburban Area Plan recommends low-density residential development of up to five units per acre for the subject property. It further specifies that this shall “consist mostly of single-family units.”  
The character of the immediate area is predominantly single family homes with some nearby attached units as well. There is an existing quadraplex directly east of the site and a duplex further east on Shamel Street. North Hills Elementary School is located to the north along Alspaugh Street. This character is consistent with the purpose statement of the proposed RSQ District. Also, corner lots are often suitable locations for duplex or twin home structures because of their increased total street frontage and fewer directly adjacent neighbors.  
The petitioner has agreed to a condition which limits the site to a total of four dwelling units. Currently three single family units could be constructed on the site if the property was to be replatted. While this |
The proposed density of 5.88 units per acre slightly exceeds the recommended maximum of five units per acre, the unique setting of the subject property, as noted above, makes it an appropriate location, in staff’s opinion, for the proposed RSQ District.

The request is also consistent with the recommendations of Legacy in regard to encouraging infill development opportunities with the Urban Neighborhoods GMA.

### RELEVANT ZONING HISTORIES

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Case</th>
<th>Request</th>
<th>Decision &amp; Date</th>
<th>Direction from Site</th>
<th>Acreage</th>
<th>Recommendation</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>W-3082</td>
<td>RS9 to LI-L</td>
<td>Approved 12-6-10</td>
<td>200’ southwest</td>
<td>1.72</td>
<td>Denial Approval</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>W-625</td>
<td>R-4 to R-2 (RM8)</td>
<td>Approved 3-8-78</td>
<td>175’ south</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>Denial Approval</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### CONCLUSIONS TO ASSIST WITH RECOMMENDATION

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Positive Aspects of Proposal</th>
<th>Negative Aspects of Proposal</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Request is consistent with the recommendations of the North Suburban Area Plan and Legacy.</td>
<td>The proposed density slightly exceeds the recommended maximum of five units per acre.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Request is consistent with the varied zoning and development pattern of the area.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Request is consistent with the purpose statement of the proposed RSQ District.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Request would allow for an infill opportunity within the Urban Neighborhoods GMA.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### SITE-SPECIFIC RECOMMENDED CONDITIONS OF APPROVAL

The following proposed conditions are from interdepartmental review comments and are proposed in order to meet codes or established standards, or to reduce negative off-site impacts.

- **OTHER REQUIREMENTS:**
  - a. The zoning lot containing PIN#’s 6837-04-0951 and 6837-04-0812 shall not contain more than four (4) dwelling units.

### STAFF RECOMMENDATION: Approval

**NOTE:** These are staff comments only; final recommendations on projects are made by the City-County Planning Board, with final decisions being made by the appropriate Elected Body, who may approve, deny, table or request modification for any project. THE APPLICANT OR REPRESENTATIVE IS STRONGLY ENCOURAGED TO ATTEND THE PUBLIC HEARINGS WHERE THE CASE WILL BE CONSIDERED BY THE PLANNING BOARD AND THE ELECTED BODY.
CITY-COUNTY PLANNING BOARD  
PUBLIC HEARING  
MINUTES FOR W-3105  
JUNE 9, 2011

Gary Roberts presented the staff report.

PUBLIC HEARING

FOR:

Grace Sheets, 5536 Gyddie Dr, Winston-Salem, NC  27105
  • I sent out 50 letters explaining what I would like to do and had a community meeting to address the zoning request.
  • Many people misunderstood the request and thought I would be building apartment buildings all across the area.
  • I have restored about 10 properties in Winston-Salem which are for elderly or disabled clients.
  • My goal is to provide good, low-income housing which will enhance the community.
  • I do plan to add lighting along Shamel Street because presently that area is very dark. That will increase safety in the neighborhood.
  • I want my clients to feel safe. I have security cameras outside each property. I have added privacy fences where necessary.

Wesley Alexander Boyles, 2439 Sink Street, Winston-Salem, NC  27107
  • I'm a disabled vet.
  • I got home in February 2009.
  • It was a hard transition.
  • I wanted to work but jobs are hard to find.
  • Everyone told me to give up and file for disability.
  • Grace has gone out of her way and made it very easy and manageable. She's made life bearable. She has a heart of gold.
  • I think she will do wonders with this property if y'all give her a chance.

Cheryl Barr, 219 Alspaugh, Winston-Salem, NC  27105
  • We totally support Ms. Sheets and what she's doing.
  • She works with us.
  • What she's doing will make a big difference in the neighborhood.
AGAINST:

Melvin Gaither, 3990 Shamel Street, Winston-Salem, NC 27105
- I'm opposed to this because it would crowd up that corner.
- Shamel Street is very narrow. The residents will have to rely on Shamel Street for access.
- I'm concerned about safety and crowding.
- This will create a chaotic and dangerous situation on this corner.
- The four-unit property immediately behind this one has brought a lot of problems to this corner.
- There is an overcrowding of vehicles and people standing around on this corner, even into the street.
- To allow another poor family like that would be detrimental to the community.
- I have nothing against Ms. Sheets. This is a great idea.
- There is vacant property on down the street where this could be located.
- This would attract more multifamily dwellings on the vacant lots.

WORK SESSION

During discussion by the Planning Board, the following points were made:

1. This proposal is to serve a portion of the population which is currently being underserved.

2. If there is an issue with cars parking along the street, this project may help enforce the regulations against that.

3. Under the current zoning three homes could be built on the site. That would result in 29 trips per day. The proposed zoning with four units that are other than single family have a lower trip generation and would result in 31 trips per day, a difference of two trips per day.

4. The narrow street helps with traffic calming since vehicles cannot go as fast as they can on a wider street. The narrower street also results in a prohibition about cars parking on the side of the street. If cars do park on the street, residents can call CityLink (727-8000) to get that issue addressed.

5. Increased density is beneficial. However it seems like a good portion of our higher density developments go into our older neighborhoods which are sometimes troubled.

6. Our community needs this type of housing. It reaches a community which often slips between the cracks.
7. Ms. Smith asked that maintaining the street and monitoring the brush along Shamel be addressed by the City. Mr. Norby noted that staff will pass that request on to the appropriate department.

MOTION: Barry Lyons moved approval of the zoning map amendment.
SECOND: Lynne Mitchell
VOTE:
    FOR: Wesley Curtis, Arnold King, Clarence Lambe, Darryl Little, Barry Lyons, Lynne Mitchell, Paul Mullican, Brenda Smith, Allan Younger
    AGAINST: None
    EXCUSED: None

A. Paul Norby, FAICP
Director of Planning
DOCKET #: W3105

PROPOSED ZONING:
RSQ-L

EXISTING ZONING:
RS9

PETITIONER:
Grace Sheets
for property owned by Same

SCALE: 1" represents 200'
STAFF: Roberts
GMA: 2
ACRES: 0.68
NEAREST BLDG: 5' south
MAP(S): 630874
EXISTING RS9 USES ALLOWED
City of Winston-Salem Jurisdiction Only

USES ALLOWED WITH A PERMIT FROM THE ZONING OFFICER (Z)
Adult Day Care Home
Child Day Care, Small Home
Church or Religious Institution, Neighborhood
Family Group Home A
Police or Fire Station
Recreation Facility, Public
Residential Building, Single Family
Swimming Pool, Private

USES ALLOWED WITH REVIEW BY THE PLANNING BOARD (P)
Church or Religious Institution, Community
Golf Course
Library, Public
Limited Campus Uses
Planned Residential Development
School, Private
School, Public
Utilities

USES ALLOWED WITH SPECIAL USE PERMIT FROM ZONING BOARD OF ADJUSTMENT (A)
Bed and Breakfast
Child Day Care, Large Home
Habilitation Facility A
Landfill, Land Clearing/Inert Debris
Manufactured Home, Class A
Park and Shuttle Lot

USES ALLOWED WITH SPECIAL USE PERMIT FROM ELECTED BODY (E)
Access Easement, Private Off-Site
Parking, Off-Site, for Multifamily or Institutional Uses

Uses Allowed in RS-9
Revised 3/17/2011
STATEMENT OF CONSISTENCY WITH COMPREHENSIVE PLAN
W-3105
(GRACE SHEETS)

The proposed special use zoning map amendment from RS9 (Residential, Single Family; 9000 sf minimum lot size) to RSQ-L (Residential, Single Family Quadruplex-Special Use Limited District---Residential, Single Family, Duplex or Twin Home) with its added conditions is consistent with the Legacy Comprehensive Plan, and the North Suburban Area Plan and is reasonable and in the public interest because:

1. The request is consistent with the purpose statement of the proposed RSQ District;

2. The request is consistent with the varied zoning and development pattern of the area;

3. The request would allow for an infill opportunity within the Urban Neighborhoods GMA that is only one dwelling unit more than what would be allowed under the current zoning; and

4. The site has no apparent constraints and appears to be suitable for development within the proposed RSQ District.
Dear Mr. Gary Roberts:

In reference to the rezoning proposal at Alspaugh and Shamel St, I am sorry to advise you that I will be involved in graduation exercises at the Carter High School on the evening of June 9th. I am also aware that the meeting to discuss and vote on the said proposal is scheduled to also be heard on that date. It appears that I may not be able to attend the meeting, however I am in total disagreement, and I hereby oppose this rezoning request for a Quadrplex zoning. My reasons are as follows:

1. If it is allowed, that will open up the possibility of the remaining vacant properties being used for apartments being built on those lots as well, including my vacant lot # 63, which will make this street far too congested and filled more chaos than one would imagine. Also 4 times more automobiles and people for that lot in question, and all the remaining undeveloped properties on the 3900 block of Shamel St would prove disastrous for peace, and security for a property owner that lives on Shamel St like my family does, unlike those looking to create income rental structures like the one proposed in this matter. Thus it will increase traffic congestion, crime possibilities that my street and neighborhood cannot afford.

2. This rezoning will also further down grade the values of properties like mine, something me or any other homeowner cannot afford.

3. With the upper end of Pine Tree Rd being no longer open at Alspaugh St, near Garner Foods, that rezoning would make traffic because of increased people living in multi-family dwellings, with more automobiles a living night mare.

4. With all due respect for the person who is proposing rezoning for multi-family building purposes, this in not the place. No You can’t

Yours Truly,

Melvin Gaither