DOCKET #: W3025

PROPOSED ZONING:
RM8-S and Special Use Permit

EXISTING ZONING:
RS9

PETITIONER:
Bradley NC LLC
for property owned
by Parkway Baptist Church

SCALE: 1" represents 400'
STAFF: Roberts
GMA: 3
ACRES: 8.57
NEAREST BLDG: 10' west
MAP(S): 624834
March 25, 2009

Bradley NC, LLC
c/o Traci Dusenbury
115 Red Wolf Trail
Myrtle Beach, SC  29579

RE: ZONING MAP AMENDMENT AND SPECIAL USE PERMIT W-3025

Dear Ms. Dusenbury:

The attached report of the Planning Board to the City Council is sent to you at the request of the Council Members. You will be notified by the City Secretary’s Office of the date on which the Council will hear this petition.

Sincerely,

A. Paul Norby, FAICP
Director of Planning

pc: City Secretary’s Office, P.O. Box 2511, Winston-Salem, NC  27102
Harris Gupton, Harris Gupton & Associates, P.A., 2200 Silas Creek Parkway, 2B,
Winston-Salem, NC  27103
Ashley Webb, Harris Gupton & Associates, P.A., 2200 Silas Creek Parkway, 2B,
Winston-Salem, NC  27103
Traci Dusenbury, Bradley Development, 1403-305 Pitchingwedge Drive, Raleigh, NC  27603
Charles Whitaker, 288 Country Lane, Winston-Salem,  27107
Hayden Ireland, 3172 Hickory Ridge Drive, Winston-Salem, NC  27127
Duane Siemers, 3655 Fiddler's Glenn Court, Winston-Salem, NC  27127
Sharon Ireland, 3172 Hickory Ridge Road, Winston-Salem, NC  27127
Parkway Baptist Church, 1170 Clemmonsville Road, Winston-Salem, NC  27127
### ACTION REQUEST FORM

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>DATE</th>
<th>March 25, 2009</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>TO</td>
<td>The Honorable Mayor and City Council</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FROM</td>
<td>A. Paul Norby, FAICP, Director of Planning</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

#### BOARD ACTION REQUEST:

Request for Public Hearing on zoning map amendment of Bradley NC, LLC for property owned by Parkway Baptist Church

#### SUMMARY OF INFORMATION:

Zoning map amendment of Bradley NC, LLC for property owned by Parkway Baptist Church from RS-9 to RM-8-S (Residential Building, Multifamily; Residential Building, Townhouse; Residential Building, Duplex; Residential Building, Twin Home; and Residential Building, Single Family) and Special Use Permit for access to RM-8-S through RS-9 zoning: property is located on the south side of Clemmonsville Road, across from Spach Drive (Zoning Docket W-3025).

#### PLANNING BOARD ACTION:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>MOTION ON PETITION</th>
<th>APPROVAL</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>SPECIAL USE PERMIT</td>
<td>APPROVAL</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FOR</td>
<td>UNANIMOUS</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>AGAINST</td>
<td>NONE</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SITE PLAN ACTION</td>
<td>CONFORMS TO THE REQUIREMENTS OF THE UDO</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
CITY ORDINANCE - SPECIAL USE

Zoning Petition of Bradley NC, LLC for property
owned by Parkway Baptist Church, Docket W-3025

AN ORDINANCE AMENDING THE
WINSTON-SALEM CITY
ZONING ORDINANCE AND THE
OFFICIAL ZONING MAP OF
THE CITY OF WINSTON-SALEM, N.C.

BE IT ORDAINED by the City Council of the City of Winston-Salem as follows:

Section 1. The Winston-Salem City Zoning Ordinance and the Official Zoning Map of
the City of Winston-Salem, N.C. are hereby amended by changing from RS-9 to RM-8-S
(Residential Building, Multifamily; Residential Building, Townhouse; Residential Building,
Duplex; Residential Building, Twin Home; and Residential Building, Single Family) the zoning
classification of the following described property:

BEGINNING at a rebar placed on the southern R/W of Clemmonsville Rd. (S.R.2747). Said
rebar being the northwest corner of lot 1 of Fiddler’s Glenn subdivision, phase 1, section 1 as
recorded in plat book 49 page 84. Thence with the western line of lots 1 through 10 of said
Fiddler’s Glenn subdivision the following 10 calls: S 00 deg. 16 min. 34 sec. W 15.88’ to a 5/8th
inch rebar, S 00 deg. 16 min. 34 sec. W 72.11’ to a 5/8th inch rebar the NW corner of lot 2, S 00
deg. 16 min. 34 sec. W 54.93’ to a 5/8th inch rebar NW corner of lot 3, S 00 deg. 19 min. 36 sec.
W 55.05’ to a 5/8th inch rebar NW corner of lot 4, S 00 deg. 19 min. 36 sec. W 109.99’ to 5/8th
inch rebar NW corner of lot 6, S 00 deg. 19 min. 36 sec. W 54.97’ to a 5/8th inch rebar NW
corner of lot 7, S 00 deg. 19 min. 36 sec. W 54.95’ to a 5/8th inch rebar NW corner of lot 8, S 00
deg. 19 min. 36 sec. W 69.55’ to a 5/8th inch rebar NW corner of lot 9, S 00 deg. 17 min. 54 sec.
W 83.70’ to a 5/8th inch rebar. Said rebar being the NW corner of the common area of Fiddler’s
Glenn subdivision, phase 1, section 2, as recorded plat book 49 page 134. Thence with the
western line of said common area and the western line of lots 14 through 18 of said Fiddler’s
Glenn subdivision the following 8 calls: S 00 deg. 19 min. 32 sec. W 176.86’ to a stone, S 00
deg. 19 min. 32 sec. W 30.01’ to a 5/8th inch rebar NW corner of lot 14, S 00 deg. 19 min. 32
sec. W 95.08’ to a 1 inch iron pipe, S 00 deg. 19 min. 32 sec. W 49.29’ to a 5/8th inch rebar NW
corner of lot 16, S 00 deg. 19 min. 32 sec. W 56.51’ to a 5/8th inch rebar NW corner of lot 17, S
00 deg. 11 min. 14 sec. W 38.48’ to a stone in the northern line of lot 18, N 88 deg. 52 min. 09
sec. W 62.31’ to a 1 inch iron, S 01 deg. 40 min. 06 sec. W 56.69’ to a rebar. Said rebar being
the NE corner for Duke Power Co. (Deed Book 1133 page 1615, PIN# 6823-85-5364). Thence,
with the northern of said Duke Power Co., N 89 deg. 42 min. 59 sec. W 349.33’ to a rebar
placed. Said rebar being the SE corner of Willie E. Williams (Deed Book 1184 page 889, PIN# 6823-85-3679). Thence, with the eastern line of said Williams property, N 01 deg. 31 min. 23
sec. E 138.32’ to a 1 inch iron. Said iron being the SE corner for Parkway Baptist Church (Deed Book 2851 page 2713, Tract 1, PIN# 6823-86-4000). Thence with said Parkway Baptist Church eastern line, N 01 deg. 31 min. 23 sec. E 122.86’ to a rebar set. Thence, two new lines: N 08 deg. 37 min. 15 sec. E 96.38’ to a rebar set, N 05 deg. 34 min. 30 sec. W 96.38’ to a rebar set in said Parkway Baptist Church eastern line. Thence, N 01 deg. 31 min. 23 sec. E 285.48’ to a rebar placed on the southern R/W of Clemmonsville Road. Thence with the southern R/W of said Clemmonsville Road the following 5 calls: N 58 deg. 53 min. 14 sec. E 52.60’ to a rebar set, N 50 deg. 32 min. 27 sec. E 79.99’ to rebar set, N 42 deg. 42 min. 04 sec. E 93.13’ to a rebar set, N 41 deg. 09 min. 06 sec. E 190.34’ to rebar set, N 40 deg. 21 min. 08 sec. E 161.62’ to the point and place of BEGINNING. Containing 8.503 acres, more or less.

Section 2. This Ordinance is adopted after approval of the site plan entitled Orchard Creek Apartments and identified as Attachment "A" of the Special Use District Permit issued by the City Council the ______ day of __________________, 20___ to Bradley NC, LLC for property owned by Parkway Baptist Church.

Section 3. The City Council hereby directs the issuance of a Special Use District Permit pursuant to the Zoning Ordinance of the Unified Development Ordinances for a development to be known as Orchard Creek Apartments. Said Special Use District Permit and site plan with associated documents are attached hereto and incorporated herein.

Section 4. This Ordinance shall be effective from and after its adoption.
CITY - SPECIAL USE DISTRICT PERMIT

SPECIAL USE DISTRICT PERMIT

Issued by the City Council
of the City of Winston-Salem

The City Council of the City of Winston-Salem issues a Special Use District Permit for the site shown on the site plan map included in this zoning petition of Bradley NC, LLC for property owned by Parkway Baptist Church, (Zoning Docket W-3025). The site shall be developed in accordance with the plan approved by the Board and bearing the inscription: "Attachment A, Special Use District Permit for RM-8-S (Residential Building, Multifamily; Residential Building, Townhouse; Residential Building, Duplex; Residential Building, Twin Home; and Residential Building, Single Family), approved by the Winston-Salem City Council the _____ day of _____________________, 20____" and signed, provided the property is developed in accordance with requirements of the RM-8-S zoning district of the Zoning Ordinance of the Unified Development Ordinances, the Erosion Control Ordinance, and other applicable laws, and the following additional conditions be met:

• PRIOR TO THE ISSUANCE OF GRADING PERMITS:
  a. Developer shall obtain driveway permits from City of Winston-Salem Public Works Department and NCDOT. Required improvements include, but are not limited to:
  b. Right-of-way dedication along West Clemmonsville Road
  c. Payment in lieu of construction of curb and gutter and sidewalk along West Clemmonsville Road
  d. Developer shall have a stormwater management study submitted for review by the Public Works Department of the City of Winston-Salem. If required, an engineered stormwater management plan shall be submitted and approved by the Public Works Department.

• PRIOR TO THE ISSUANCE OF BUILDING PERMITS:
  a. An engineered lighting plan shall be submitted to Inspections for the proposed lighting demonstrating the use of full-cut off fixtures, light height of 25' or less and no more than 0.5 foot-candles at the property line.
  b. Developer shall record a final plat in the Office of the Register of Deeds. Final Plat shall show lots, common areas, public streets, easements, and utilities.
c. Developer shall substantially comply with the building materials within the submitted building elevations as shown on Exhibit A and as verified by Planning staff. The building footprint shall be substantially consistent with those shown on the site plan.

• PRIOR TO THE SIGNING OF PLATS:
  a. All documents including covenants, restrictions, and homeowners’ association agreements shall be recorded in the office of the Register of Deeds. Final plats must show common open space declarations.

• PRIOR TO THE ISSUANCE OF OCCUPANCY PERMITS:
  a. All required improvements of the City of Winston-Salem/NCDOT driveway permit shall be completed.
  b. Lighting shall be installed per approved lighting plan and certified by an engineer.
  c. Developer shall coordinate with the Winston-Salem Transit Authority (WSTA) for a transit stop/shelter.
BE IT ORDAINED by the City Council of the City of Winston-Salem as follows:

Section 1. The City Council hereby makes an affirmative finding as follows, based upon the material and competent evidence presented at the public hearing:

1. That the use will not materially endanger the public health or safety if located where proposed and developed according to the application and plan as submitted and approved;
2. That the use meets all required conditions and specifications;
3. That the use will not substantially injure the value of adjoining or abutting property, or that the use is a public necessity; and,
4. That the location and character of the use, if developed according to the application and plan submitted and approved, will be in harmony with the area in which it is to be located and in general conformity with Legacy.

Section 2. The Winston-Salem City Council hereby issues a special use permit for access to RM-8-S through RS-9 zoning in accordance with Section 6-1.5 of the Zoning Ordinance of the Unified Development Ordinances to Bradley NC, LLC for property owned by Parkway Baptist Church to be established on the following described property:

BEGINNING at a point, said point being located N 01 deg. 31 min. 23 sec. E 11.94’ from a 1” iron pipe found, being the northeast corner for Willie E. Williams (Deed Book 1184, Page 889; PIN #6823-85-3697) also being the southeast corner of Parkway Baptist Church (Deed Book 2851, Page 2713, Tract 1; PIN #6823-86-4000), said point being the southwest corner of a 60’ private access easement. Thence with the southern line of said easement the following two calls: S 90 deg. 00 min. 00 sec. W 129.37’ to a point; N 88 deg. 28 min. 37 sec. W 289.86’ to a point on the eastern edge of pavement of Sides Road (S.R. 2932). Thence N 01 deg. 21 min. 39 sec. E 60.00’ to a point at the edge of pavement of Sides Road. Thence, with the northern line of said easement the following two calls: S 88 deg. 28 min. 37 sec. E 289.23’ to a point, N 90 deg. 00 min. 00 sec. E 130.17’ to a point. Thence S 01 deg. 31 min. 23 sec. W 60.02’ to the point and place of BEGINNING.
Section 3. This Ordinance is adopted after approval of the site plan entitled Bradley NC, LLC for property owned by Parkway Baptist Church and identified as Attachment "A" of the Special Use Permit issued by the City Council the _____ day of __________________, to Bradley NC, LLC for property owned by Parkway Baptist Church.

Section 4. The City Council hereby directs the issuance of a Special Use Permit pursuant to Section 6-1.5 of the Zoning Ordinance of the Unified Development Ordinances for a development to be known as Bradley NC, LLC for property owned by Parkway Baptist Church. Said Special Use Permit and site plan with associated documents are attached hereto and incorporated herein.

Section 5. This Ordinance shall be effective from and after its adoption.
CITY - SPECIAL USE PERMIT

SPECIAL USE PERMIT

Issued by the City Council of the City of Winston-Salem

The City Council of the City of Winston-Salem issues a Special Use Permit for the site shown on the site plan map included in this zoning petition of Bradley NC, LLC for property owned by Parkway Baptist Church, (Zoning Docket W-3025). The site shall be developed in accordance with the plan approved by the Council and bearing the inscription: "Attachment A, Special Use Permit for access to RM-8-S through RS-9 zoning, approved by the Winston-Salem City Council the _____ day of _____________________, 20____" and signed, provided the property is developed in accordance with requirements of Section 6-1.5 of the Zoning Ordinance of the Unified Development Ordinances, and other applicable laws, and the following additional conditions be met:

• PRIOR TO THE ISSUANCE OF GRADING PERMITS:
  a. Developer shall obtain driveway permits from City of Winston-Salem Public Works Department and NCDOT. Required improvements include, but are not limited to:
  b. Right-of-way dedication along West Clemmonsville Road
  c. Payment in lieu of construction of curb and gutter and sidewalk along West Clemmonsville Road
  d. Developer shall have a stormwater management study submitted for review by the Public Works Department of the City of Winston-Salem. If required, an engineered stormwater management plan shall be submitted and approved by the Public Works Department.

• PRIOR TO THE ISSUANCE OF BUILDING PERMITS:
  a. An engineered lighting plan shall be submitted to Inspections for the proposed lighting demonstrating the use of full-cut off fixtures, light height of 25' or less and no more than 0.5 foot-candles at the property line.
  b. Developer shall record a final plat in the Office of the Register of Deeds. Final Plat shall show lots, common areas, public streets, easements, and utilities.
  c. Developer shall substantially comply with the building materials within the submitted building elevations as shown on Exhibit A and as verified by Planning staff. The building footprint shall be substantially consistent with those shown on the site plan.
• PRIOR TO THE SIGNING OF PLATS:
  a. All documents including covenants, restrictions, and homeowners’ association agreements shall be recorded in the office of the Register of Deeds. Final plats must show common open space declarations.

• PRIOR TO THE ISSUANCE OF OCCUPANCY PERMITS:
  a. All required improvements of the City of Winston-Salem/NCDOT driveway permit shall be completed.
  b. Lighting shall be installed per approved lighting plan and certified by an engineer.
  c. Developer shall coordinate with the Winston-Salem Transit Authority (WSTA) for a transit stop/shelter.
### PETITION INFORMATION

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Docket #</th>
<th>W-3025</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Staff</td>
<td>Gary Roberts, Jr. AICP</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Petitioner(s)</td>
<td>Bradley NC, LLC</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Owner(s)</td>
<td>Parkway Baptist Church</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Subject Property</td>
<td>PIN # 6823-86-8317, and portions of PIN #s 6823-86-8110, 6823-85-8709, and 6823-86-4000; 1170 West Clemmonsville Road</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Type of Request</td>
<td>Special use rezoning and Special Use Permit for access to RM-8-S through RS-9 zoning</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Proposal</td>
<td>The petitioner is requesting to amend the Official Zoning Maps for the subject property from RS-9 Residential Building, Single Family; 9,000 sf minimum lot size to RM-8-S Residential, Multifamily District, maximum density of 8 units per acre. The petitioner is requesting the following uses: Residential Building, Multifamily; Residential Building, Townhouse; Residential Building, Duplex; Residential Building, Twin Home; and Residential Building, Single Family</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Zoning District Purpose Statement

The RM-8 District is primarily intended to accommodate duplexes, twin homes, townhouses, multifamily, and other low intensity multifamily uses at a maximum overall density of eight (8) units per acre. This district is appropriate for Growth Management Areas 2 and 3 and may be suitable for Metro Activity Centers where public facilities, including public water and sewer, public roads, parks, and other governmental support services, are available.

### Applicable Rezoning Consideration from Chapter B, Article VI, Section 6-2.1(S)

(S)(1) - Is the proposal consistent with the purpose statement(s) of the requested zoning district(s)?

Yes

### GENERAL SITE INFORMATION

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Location</th>
<th>South side of West Clemmonsville Road, across from Spach Drive</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Jurisdiction</td>
<td>City of Winston-Salem</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ward(s)</td>
<td>South</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Site Acreage</td>
<td>Approximately ± 8.57 acres</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Current Land Use</td>
<td>The site is currently undeveloped.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Surrounding Property Zoning and Use</td>
<td>Direction</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-----------------------------------</td>
<td>-----------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>North</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>East</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>South</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>West</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

(Applicable Rezoning Consideration from Chapter B, Article VI, Section 6-2.1(S))

(S)(2) - Is/are the use(s) permitted under the proposed classification/request compatible with uses permitted on other properties in the vicinity?

Yes, the proposed multifamily use is compatible with the adjacent church and utility uses. The proposed development backs up to a single family neighborhood, Fiddlers Glen, to the east. For further information regarding land use compatibility, see the Analysis of Conformity to Plans and Other Planning Issues section below.

Physical Characteristics

The site is heavily wooded and has a gentle to moderate slope downward to the southeast.

Proximity to Water and Sewer

Public water and sewer are available to the site

Stormwater/Drainage

A stormwater study will be required prior to the issuance of a grading permit.

Watershed and Overlay Districts

The site is not within a water supply watershed.

Analysis of General Site Information

The site possesses no known development constraints.

Generalized Recommended Conditions

BRIEF DESCRIPTION OF CONDITION(S):

- Stormwater condition

### SITE ACCESS AND TRANSPORTATION INFORMATION

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Street Name</th>
<th>Classification</th>
<th>Frontage</th>
<th>ADT Count</th>
<th>Capacity/LOS D</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>West Clemmonsville Road</td>
<td>Major Thoroughfare</td>
<td>600’</td>
<td>17,000</td>
<td>17,700</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sides Road</td>
<td>Local Street</td>
<td>30’</td>
<td>NA</td>
<td>NA</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Proposed Access Point(s)

The site plan shows an access onto West Clemmonsville Road and one onto Sides Road through the use of a Special Use Permit, see the Conformity to Plans and Planning Issues section below.

Planned Road Improvements

Road improvement project TIP U-2923 calls for a widening of West Clemmonsville Road between Peters Creek Parkway and Brewer Road to a three lane section with widened outside curb lanes and the realignment of Spach Drive at its intersection with West Clemmonsville Road.
| Trip Generation - Existing/Proposed | Existing Zoning: RS-9  
8.57 acres x 43,560 sf / 9,000 = 41 units x 9.57 (SFR Trip Rate) = 392 Trips per Day  
Proposed Zoning: RM8-S  
64 units x 6.59 (Multifamily Trip Rate) = 421 Trips per Day |
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Sidewalks</td>
<td>There are no sidewalks along either side of West Clemmonsville Road; however, the Sidewalk and Pedestrian Facilities Plan requires sidewalks along said roadway. Staff recommends a sidewalk along the proposed connection to Sides Road.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Transit</td>
<td>Route 13 along Clemmonsville Road</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Connectivity</td>
<td>The proposed secondary connection onto Sides Road will provide excellent connectivity to the site.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Traffic Impact Study (TIS)</td>
<td>No TIS is required.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Analysis of Site Access and Transportation Information</td>
<td>Access to the site is adequate; however, a Special Use Permit to cross RS-9 zoned property to access a Multifamily Residential will be required, see below. Road improvement project TIP U-2923 will result in the realignment of Spach Drive, therefore the main entrance to the subject property will need to be relocated to align with Spach Drive. Consequently, the site plan will need to be redesigned to accommodate the entrance relocation. The developer shall pay for curb and gutter and sidewalks along the frontage of West Clemmonsville Road in lieu of constructing them. Staff recommends a sidewalk along the proposed connection to Sides Road. The revised site plan includes a sidewalk in this location.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
| Generalized Recommended Conditions | **BRIEF DESCRIPTION OF CONDITION(S):**  
- Obtain driveway permit from NCDOT & WSDOT |
| SCHOOL DISTRICT INFORMATION | School capacity data has been requested of the school system. |
| CONFORMITY TO PLANS AND PLANNING ISSUES | **Legacy GMA**  
Growth Management Area 3, Suburban Neighborhoods  
**Relevant Legacy Recommendations**  
- Suburban neighborhoods have the most undeveloped land where much of the future residential, commercial and industrial development should occur. All of the Metro Activity Centers are located within this area. This area is appropriate for future urban or suburban development.  
(p. 30)  
- In order to utilize the land in the Municipal Services Area (MSA) more effectively, a housing mix that includes more compact, higher density forms of residential development should be encouraged.  
(p. 35)  
- Infill development, like any land use issue, must balance the concerns of surrounding residents about the preservation of the character of their neighborhood with the needs of property owners and developers and the goals of the larger community.  
(p. 40) |
- Encourage cost effective site design such as narrow streets, higher densities, clustered housing units, and narrow lot widths to encourage development of affordable housing. (p. 125)
- Creating a more “compact pattern of development” will necessitate increasing the overall density and intensity of residential and commercial development in areas with public sewer, good roads and other urban services. It will also mean concentrating higher density and mixed use urban development around certain activity centers and along major transportation corridors. (p. 28)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Relevant Area Plan(s)</th>
<th>Site is not within the boundaries of an area plan or development guide.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| Other Applicable Plans and Planning Issues | For Special Use Permits (SUP) requiring approval by the Elected Body, certain findings have to be met. Findings of the Planning Board accompanying a favorable recommendation shall include: **Planning Board Findings:**

1. The development is in conformity with Legacy. (Yes)
2. Water and sewer service are available in adequate capacity. (Yes)
3. Where buildings greater than thirty-five (35) feet in height are proposed within the City of Winston-Salem limits, there is adequate access for aerial fire-fighting equipment. (No buildings 35’ are proposed on the Special Use Permit property)
4. Streets and highways, both within and in the vicinity of the development, are of such design and traffic-carrying capacity that the development will not create a traffic hazard. (Yes)
5. General layout and design of the development meet all requirements of this Ordinance. (Yes)
6. Adequate, safe and convenient provision is made for vehicular and pedestrian movement on the site with particular attention paid to the needs of public safety equipment and personnel (fire, police, etc) and service vehicles and personnel (sanitation, postal delivery, etc). (Yes)
7. The Planning Board may recommend to the Elected Body conditions as identified in Section 6-1.3(A)(1) for the issuance of the special use permit to reduce impacts associated with the project. (**See “SITE-SPECIFIC RECOMMENDED CONDITIONS OF APPROVAL” section below**)

The Elected Body shall issue a special use permit only when the Elected Body makes an affirmative finding as follows:

**Elected Body Findings:**

1. That the use will not materially endanger the public health or safety if located where proposed and developed according to the application and plan as submitted and approved. (Yes)
2. That the use meets all required conditions and specifications. (Yes)
3. That the use will not substantially injure the value of adjoining or abutting property, or that the use is a public necessity; and, (Yes)
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th><strong>Applicable Rezoning Consideration from Chapter B, Article VI, Section 6-2.1(S)</strong></th>
<th><strong>(S)(3) - Have changing conditions substantially affected the area in the petition?</strong></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>No</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>(S)(4) - Is the requested action in conformance with Legacy?</strong></td>
<td>Yes</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

| **Analysis of Conformity to Plans and Planning Issues** | **The subject property is not within an area plan or development guide. However, recognizing various factors unique to the subject request, staff is supportive of the rezoning. The factors include: the existing mixture of uses in close proximity to the site; having frontage on a major thoroughfare and the inclusion of a secondary access point onto Sides Road (see SUP analysis above); the scale of the proposed buildings, their relationship to the adjacent single family homes and the density of 7.5 units per acre.** |

In addition, while working on land use and design alternatives for the property surrounding the Peters Creek Parkway Metro Activity Center, staff has suggested that multifamily townhouses may be a good support land use for the undeveloped 12 acre tract located directly southwest of the subject property on the west side of Sides Road. Similarly, staff views the subject request as providing a good transitional and supportive land use between the single family homes to the east and the commercial and institutional developments to the west. Regarding the proposed site design, staff commends the placement of the location of the clubhouse, picnic area and recreation area in the highly visible front portion of the site. Staff also applauds the use of some parallel, on-street parking which helps to create a more traditional streetscape for the future residents as opposed to the more typical 90° head end parking arrangement found in most apartment complexes.

The proposed development backs up to a single family neighborhood, Fiddlers Glen, to the east. Although only one of the proposed two story residential buildings is located in this area, staff recommends the following items in order to provide a more sensitive treatment along this eastern property line: slightly rotate said building to increase the building setback in this area (this would also provide an even more cohesive streetscape); preserve as much of the existing vegetation as possible along this property line; and relocate the proposed dumpster site. A lighting condition is also recommended. The revised site plan incorporates these recommendations.
## Generalized Recommended Conditions

**BRIEF DESCRIPTION OF CONDITION(S):**
- Lighting condition

## Relevant Zoning Histories

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Case</th>
<th>Request</th>
<th>Decision &amp; Date</th>
<th>Direction from Site</th>
<th>Acreage</th>
<th>Recommendation</th>
<th>Staff</th>
<th>CCPB</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>W-2759</td>
<td>RS-9 to HB-S</td>
<td>Approved 5-2-05</td>
<td>200’ northeast</td>
<td>1.17</td>
<td>Denial</td>
<td>3 to 3 tie</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>W-1706</td>
<td>R1-S to R1-S (RM12-S)</td>
<td>Approved 3-4-91</td>
<td>Directly north</td>
<td>1.13</td>
<td>Approval</td>
<td>Approval</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

## Site Plan Compliance with UDO Requirements

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Building Square Footage</th>
<th>Building Multifamily Residential Units on 8.57 acres = 7.5 units per acre.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Units (by type) and Density</td>
<td>64 multifamily residential units on 8.57 acres = 7.5 units per acre.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Parking</td>
<td>132 spaces 138 spaces 90° and some parallel on-street</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Building Height</td>
<td>Maximum Proposed 45’ 2 story</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Impervious Coverage</td>
<td>Maximum Proposed 70% 36.4%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
| UDO Sections Relevant to Subject Request | • Chapter B, Article II, Section 2-1.2 (L) RM-8 District
• Chapter B, Article II, Section 2-5.64 Residential, Building Multifamily use conditions
• Chapter B, Article II, Section 2-5.2 Access Easement Use Conditions |
| Complies with Chapter B, Article VII, Section 7-5.3 | (A) Legacy policies: Yes
(B) Environmental Ord. NA
(C) Subdivision Regulations NA |
| Analysis of Site Plan Compliance with UDO Requirements | The revised site plan complies with the requirements of the UDO. |

## BRIEF DESCRIPTION OF CONDITION(S):”
- Building elevation condition

## Conclusions to Assist with Recommendation

### Positive Aspects of Proposal
- Request would generate a comparable amount of traffic with what could be expected under a single family residential build-out scenario.
- Request meets all SUP Findings and provides good street connectivity.

### Negative Aspects of Proposal
- The proposed development will take place on a site which is now heavily wooded.
Request is consistent with RM-8 District purpose statement.

Request would provide additional housing along a bus route and within walking distance to a shopping center.

Request is consistent with *Legacy*.

### SITE-SPECIFIC RECOMMENDED CONDITIONS OF APPROVAL

The following proposed conditions are from interdepartmental review comments and are proposed in order to meet codes or established standards, or to reduce negative off-site impacts.

**• PRIOR TO THE ISSUANCE OF GRADING PERMITS:**

a. Developer shall obtain driveway permits from City of Winston-Salem Public Works Department and NCDOT. Required improvements include, but are not limited to:

b. Right-of-way dedication along West Clemmons Villa Road

c. Payment in lieu of construction of curb and gutter and sidewalk along West Clemmons Villa Road

d. Developer shall have a stormwater management study submitted for review by the Public Works Department of the City of Winston-Salem. If required, an engineered stormwater management plan shall be submitted and approved by the Public Works Department.

**• PRIOR TO THE ISSUANCE OF BUILDING PERMITS:**

a. An engineered lighting plan shall be submitted to Inspections for the proposed lighting demonstrating the use of full-cut off fixtures, light height of 25' or less and no more than 0.5 foot-candles at the property line.

b. Developer shall record a final plat in the Office of the Register of Deeds. Final Plat shall show lots, common areas, public streets, easements, and utilities.

c. Developer shall substantially comply with the building materials within the submitted building elevations as shown on Exhibit A and as verified by Planning staff. The building footprint shall be substantially consistent with those shown on the site plan.

**• PRIOR TO THE SIGNING OF PLATS:**

a. All documents including covenants, restrictions, and homeowners’ association agreements shall be recorded in the office of the Register of Deeds. Final plats must show common open space declarations.

**• PRIOR TO THE ISSUANCE OF OCCUPANCY PERMITS:**

a. All required improvements of the City of Winston-Salem/NCDOT driveway permit shall be completed.

b. Lighting shall be installed per approved lighting plan and certified by an engineer.

c. Developer shall coordinate with the Winston-Salem Transit Authority (WSTA) for a transit stop/shelter.
STAFF REZONING RECOMMENDATION: Approval

STAFF SPECIAL USE PERMIT RECOMMENDATION: Approval

NOTE: These are staff comments only; final recommendations on projects are made by the City-County Planning Board, with final decisions being made by the appropriate Elected Body, who may approve, deny, table or request modification for any project. THE APPLICANT OR REPRESENTATIVE IS STRONGLY ENCOURAGED TO ATTEND THE PUBLIC HEARINGS WHERE THE CASE WILL BE CONSIDERED BY THE PLANNING BOARD AND THE ELECTED BODY.

PUBLIC HEARING regarding continuance request by opposition.

FOR the continuance request:

Hayden Ireland, 3172 Hickory Ridge Drive, Winston-Salem, NC 27127
• Because we live in a larger neighborhood that isn't contiguous to this proposed project, the first I heard of this was an article in the paper published a week ago today. It was not in the legal section. It was just a general article about development of a project in the area near us.
• When I asked several neighbors if they had heard of it, they had not.
• That is why I asked for the continuance to get more neighborhood involvement in this because of the access to the roads where this project is going to be built have a direct impact on the neighborhoods surrounding that.
• Primarily I'm speaking of traffic congestion and traffic patterns.
• There are other issues such as the appearance of the area and the impact on real estate values.
• That's basically my request for the continuance.

AGAINST the continuance request:

Traci Dusenbury, Bradley Development, 1403-305 Pitchingwedge, Drive Raleigh, NC 27603
• I represent the petitioner.
• We would not like to see this continued.
• Unfortunately with our financing timeframe, we just do not have time for any continuances or delays.
• Mr. Arthur King said it best when he said, "He who holds the gold holds the power". That's our case.
• On top of that, we've already held several community meetings and we feel we've done a lot of outreach. We're still working with the residents. We've incorporated a lot of their input into our design. We've changed a lot of things and have told them we're still willing to keep working with them on refining our lighting plan and our landscaping plan.

Arnold King: So you'd be willing to conduct more community meetings between now and City Council to give these folks who missed the first meetings opportunity to participate?

Ms. Dusenbury: Yes
Clarence Lambe: Is there any indication that the petitioner did not meet the requirements for notice or anything like that?

David Reed: It appears that they did a good-faith effort to reach out to the neighboring residents.

Clarence Lambe: But the legal notices that are sent out?

David Reed: We send those out.

Clarence Lambe: Is there any indication that those were faulty or anything like that?

Paul Norby: No, again the letter notification goes to adjacent property owners. As I understand it from the Irelands, they and their neighbors are actually a little bit south of where this map ends, but their streets interconnect.

Clarence Lambe: Was our notice policy complied with?

Paul Norby: Yes. Not only letter notification but the directional signs in the neighborhood, and on Clemmonsville Road and Sides Road, plus the legal ad in the paper.

Arnold King: Petitioner has made it clear that they're not interested in continuing. Do you want to continue it or hear it?

Several voices from the Board indicated the desire to hear the request.

Arnold King: The petitioner did indicate that they are willing to conduct more community meetings between now and the time it goes to City Council and you'll have plenty of opportunity to maybe get your questions answered there, so we will go ahead and hear both sides today.

Gary Roberts presented the staff report.

**PUBLIC HEARING** regarding zoning request, site plan, and Special Use Permit.

FOR:

Harris Gupton & Associates, P.A., 2200 Silas Creek Parkway, 2B, Winston-Salem, NC 27103
- This is a great project and these are a phenomenal group of developers. We've worked with them a number of times throughout the years.
- I've visited their other projects and they do a great job.
- They have many letters of recommendation.
- We've had the neighborhood meetings. We've tried to address their concerns.
- Submitted questions from neighbors. We've tried to incorporate as best we could the comments from neighbors and staff in order to have the best possible site plan and we think we've reached that goal.
- Traffic would be comparable to a RS-9 development.
DOT has a traffic signal at Sides Road and another which they will line up when they realign Clemmonsville Road. We've put our entrance halfway between those two signals. We're better than 600 feet from each signal.

We've planned the second entrance at Planning staff's recommendation to give some additional circulation and also for fire safety.

DOT is also requesting left-turn and right-turn lanes and we are working with everyone involved in that to insure that our design will work with those changes.

We feel like we've done a great deal to meet the traffic and to address the issues that have been brought before us.


I've got the original site plan that we went to the community with so you can see how things have changed.

Ms. Webb noted changes.

We're also providing a 40' fill slope which can be landscaped.

Regarding storm water, we will be putting in a water quality and quantity pond to control the storm water.

We were able to pull the Fiddler's Glenn subdivision's approved site plan to see their proposed grading of those lots and the lots along the back of Building One and the Clubhouse have the elevations already filled in so the elevation of those houses and the elevation of our buildings are just about the same.

The houses are two stories and this will be two story buildings. This will not be towering over them. It will really be quite comparable.

We've been able to offer a lot more things than the minimum that is required. We're offering tree save areas that would comply with the future tree ordinance. We have 17.5 percent of tree save area. We're also adding some planting areas in the corners of the property behind the Fiddler's Glenn lots instead of just along the property line.

At staff's recommendation we were able to put sidewalk along one side of the connector street that's going out to Sides Road. That will help with the pedestrian connectivity.

The developer will be posting a bond for a sidewalk along Clemmonsville Road.

The connectivity, both vehicular and pedestrian, is going to be pretty good.

There are a lot of other things the developer has offered besides the tree save areas and the sidewalks. These apartment buildings have entrances to the units on all sides so these buildings really look like the front on all sides, so even if you look at these buildings from the adjoining homes, it's still going to look nice.

We've got all sorts of amenities - the playgrounds, the tot lot, the picnic area, the gazebo, and the list goes on and on.

Staff is requiring that we install a right taper and a left turn lane off Clemmonsville Road. That will really help with the traffic. That will all be coordinated with the WSDOT plans to widen Clemmonsville Road. I don't anticipate traffic really being an issue.

The developer has really made an effort to do everything they can with this project.

Displayed photographs of other projects done by the developer.
Traci Dusenbury, Bradley Development, 1403-305 Pitchingwedge Drive, Raleigh, NC  27603
  • Our development team has been developing high quality developments like this for over 25 years.
  • We have done our work on this development. We've had a third party market analyst who has looked into the need for the type development we have proposed. That has been confirmed.
  • We think this is a great location for a low-density apartment home development like this. It's a good transition between single family and going into the commercial. We've really thought about that.
  • We will have an on-site manager and maintenance worker every business day and they will be on call 24 hours, seven days a week.
  • We did meet with the residents, going above and beyond the Planning staff's actions about notification. We also sent letters to surrounding property owners. We had an initial meeting and then a follow-up meeting to show them what was planned.
  • We just found out about the Irelands and Kingstree's concern over our project. We are more than happy to meet with them both before the council meeting and to continue meetings until we actually build.
  • We really can't continue this case because we need to get before the City Council in April.
  • We would appreciate your support of this project and staff's recommendation.
  • We are going to make sure that this development is attractive and is an asset to the community.

Charles Whitaker, 288 Country Lane, Winston-Salem, 27107
  • I'm the pastor of Parkway Baptist Church.
  • I agree with everything that's been said here this evening.
  • We are glad we met this company. We have property that we don't intend to use. The trees are falling and it's getting to be an eyesore.
  • We've discussed getting rid of it many, many times.
  • This company came along and everything they've said and done has been right.
  • This will be good for the community.
  • The funds we receive from this sale will be used on the church building and grounds. Certainly it will be something the community will be proud of also.
  • That's our goal.
  • We are community oriented. We would do absolutely nothing that would bring down the value of properties in that areas.

AGAINST:

Hayden Ireland, 3172 Hickory Ridge Drive, Winston-Salem, NC  27127
  • This appears to be an extremely well-designed project.
  • Clearly they have done their homework and we see the fruition of that in their presentation today.
  • My concern as a homeowner in a neighborhood that isn't directly connected but is certainly impacted by traffic, especially by traffic patterns. Fiddlers Glenn and Sides Road turn out to be main feeders for the neighborhood I live in, Kingstree.
• We are concerned about the quality and the impact it will have on real estate values.
• One of the attractive features of our area is that it is primarily single family residential.
• It has been that way for a long time.
• Single family development in that area adds a certain kind of attractiveness in that area that may be impacted by multifamily dwellings, even when extremely well-planned, well-executed, profitable, and desirable. I still believe it will have an impact by virtue of being multi-family.
• I ask the board to consider the impact on both the intrinsic value of a single family area and the possible impact on real estate values in this area.

Duane Siemers, 3655 Fiddler's Glenn Court, Winston-Salem, NC 27127
• My first question is that I'd like to know where all these letters and neighborhood meetings were sent because I certainly didn't get one.
• They stated that the traffic for this development would be comparable to what's there now. It will not.
• Right now Clemmonsville Road is overloaded. You should be there in the mornings when it's rush hour and in the evenings when people are coming home.
• Also concerned about property values going down.
• This might be a good plan in another neighborhood but it's certainly not in ours for the simple reason that the traffic on Clemmonsville Road as it is now would be increased.
• They're talking about lining up Brewer and Fiddler's Glenn roads. Even with the traffic light there, it's already a dangerous intersection.

Arnold King explained that a development could currently be built on the site without further review or public input that would generate approximately the same amount of traffic as this project which does come with review and conditions.

Clarence Lambe: There are plenty of studies that say property values will not be impacted by multifamily development or that they will actually be increased. There's support for both sides of that argument.

Sharon Ireland, 3172 Hickory Ridge Road, Winston-Salem, NC 27127
• I found out about this a week ago today through an article in the newspaper.
• We've canvassed most of Kingstree Drive and all of Hickory Ridge and no one had even known about this.
• Our lots do not directly adjoin Fiddlers Glenn but there is a road which will go next to our street and will intersect a couple of our streets and everyone will end up going to Wal-Mart by that route, including the people from the new apartment complex. They will probably use this shortcut.
• There is another church here which is building a large community center and parking lot.
• I'm concerned that there will just be one traffic accident after another.
• I don't know how they are going to widen Clemmonsville Road.
• We asked for time to basically get all of our facts together.
• If notices are going to be sent out, it should probably be on a broader spectrum.
WORK SESSION

During discussion by the Planning Board, the following points were made:

1. There is a tree preservation area east of the church. It is approximately 10 feet in width as opposed to 30 feet elsewhere on this site.

2. Notifications were handled properly, including newspaper advertising, signage, and letters to adjoining property owners. The requirement is for letters to go to adjacent property owners. The reason signs are posted is so people in the larger community who go by the site are notified. Those signs will remain up through the City Council hearing.

3. Right now they could build by-right single family dwellings which would have about the same amount of traffic.

4. This is lower density multifamily, but a good transition.

5. There is HB-S zoning right across the street. This serves as a good transition, especially with two-story buildings.

6. No matter what you do, you aren't going to catch everybody, but it looks like a lot of effort went into notifying people, listening to their comments, and making such changes as were possible.

7. There is going to be a drop-in session about the widening of Clemmons ville Road on March 26 between 3-7 at the Georgia Taylor Recreation Center.

MOTION: Clarence Lambe moved approval of the zoning map amendment.
SECOND: Jerry Clark
VOTE:
FOR: Jerry Clark, Wesley Curtis, Arnold King, Arthur King, Clarence Lambe, Lynne Mitchell, Paul Mullican, Brenda Smith
AGAINST: None
EXCUSED: None

SPECIAL USE PERMIT MOTION: Clarence Lambe moved approval of the Special Use Permit.
SECOND: Jerry Clark
VOTE:
FOR: Jerry Clark, Wesley Curtis, Arnold King, Arthur King, Clarence Lambe, Lynne Mitchell, Paul Mullican, Brenda Smith
AGAINST: None
EXCUSED: None
SITE PLAN MOTION: Clarence Lambe certified that the site plan meets all code requirements and recommends staff conditions.
SECOND: Jerry Clark
VOTE:
   FOR: Jerry Clark, Wesley Curtis, Arnold King, Arthur King, Clarence Lambe, Lynne Mitchell, Paul Mullican, Brenda Smith
   AGAINST: None
   EXCUSED: None

_________________________
A. Paul Norby, FAICP
Director of Planning