DOCKET #: W2754
(Continued from 3/10/05 CCPB meeting)

PROPOSED ZONING:
IP-S (Club or Lodge)

EXISTING ZONING:
IP-S & RS9

PETITIONER:
Westwood Club, Inc., for property owned by Same

SCALE: 1” represents 400’
STAFF: King
GMA: 3
ACRE(S): 4.33
MAP(S): 612850
April 20, 2005

Westwood Club, Inc.
c/o Tom Gibbs, Vice President
265 Harper Street
Winston-Salem, NC  27104

RE:  ZONING MAP AMENDMENT W-2754

Dear Mr. Gibbs:

       The attached report of the Planning Board to the City Council is sent to you at the request of the Council Members. You will be notified by the City Secretary’s Office of the date on which the Council will hear this petition.

       Sincerely,

       A. Paul Norby, AICP
       Director of Planning

pc:  City Secretary’s Office, P.O. Box 2511, Winston-Salem, NC  27102
     Donald Green, 231 Harper Street, Winston-Salem, NC  27104
### ACTION REQUEST FORM

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>DATE</th>
<th>April 20, 2005</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>TO</td>
<td>The Honorable Mayor and City Council</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FROM</td>
<td>A. Paul Norby, AICP, Director of Planning</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

#### COUNCIL ACTION REQUEST:

Request for Public Hearing on zoning map amendment of Westwood Club, Inc.

#### SUMMARY OF INFORMATION:

Zoning map amendment of Westwood Club, Inc. from RS-9 and IP-S (Club or Lodge) to IP-S (Club or Lodge): property is located on the east side of Harper Street and the west side of Silas Creek Parkway and is north of Business I-40/US 421 (Zoning Docket W-2754).

#### PLANNING BOARD ACTION:

- **MOTION ON PETITION**: APPROVAL
- **FOR**: UNANIMOUS
- **AGAINST**: NONE
- **SITE PLAN ACTION**: CONFORMS
CITY ORDINANCE - SPECIAL USE

Zoning Petition of Westwood Club, Inc., Docket W-2754

AN ORDINANCE AMENDING THE WINSTON-SALEM CITY ZONING ORDINANCE AND THE OFFICIAL ZONING MAP OF THE CITY OF WINSTON-SALEM, N.C.

_________________________________

BE IT ORDAINED by the City Council of the City of Winston-Salem as follows:

Section 1. The Winston-Salem City Zoning Ordinance and the Official Zoning Map of the City of Winston-Salem, N.C. are hereby amended by changing from RS-9 and IP-S (Club or Lodge) to IP-S (Club or Lodge) the zoning classification of the following described property:

Tax Block 2913, Tax Lots 2, 12, and 106

Section 2. This Ordinance is adopted after approval of the site plan entitled Westwood Club, Inc. and identified as Attachment "A" of the Special Use District Permit issued by the City Council the _____ day of ________________, 20___ to Westwood Club, Inc..

Section 3. The City Council hereby directs the issuance of a Special Use District Permit pursuant to the Zoning Ordinance of the Unified Development Ordinances for a development to be known as Westwood Club, Inc.. Said Special Use District Permit and site plan with associated documents are attached hereto and incorporated herein.

Section 4. This Ordinance shall be effective from and after its adoption.
CITY - SPECIAL USE DISTRICT PERMIT

SPECIAL USE DISTRICT PERMIT

Issued by the City Council
of the City of Winston-Salem

The City Council of the City of Winston-Salem issues a Special Use District Permit for the site shown on the site plan map included in this zoning petition of Westwood Club, Inc. (Zoning Docket W-2754). The site shall be developed in accordance with the plan approved by the Board and bearing the inscription: "Attachment A, Special Use District Permit for IP-S (Club or Lodge), approved by the Winston-Salem City Council the _____ day of ______________, 20____" and signed, provided the property is developed in accordance with requirements of the IP-S zoning district of the Zoning Ordinance of the Unified Development Ordinances, the Erosion Control Ordinance, and other applicable laws, and the following additional conditions be met:

• PRIOR TO THE ISSUANCE OF GRADING PERMITS
  a. Storm water calculations must be submitted with the application for a grading permit.
  b. Driveway permits obtained.

• PRIOR TO THE ISSUANCE OF BUILDING PERMITS
  a. Building plans must be in conformance with the building elevations as shown in exhibit "A".

• PRIOR TO THE ISSUANCE OF OCCUPANCY PERMITS
  a. All Fire Hydrants shall be installed in accordance with the City of Winston-Salem Fire Department.

• OTHER REQUIREMENTS
  a. A maximum of one six (6) foot high monument sign shall be allowed along the frontage of Harper Street.
ZONING STAFF REPORT

DOCKET # W-2754
STAFF: Aaron King

Petitioner(s): Westwood Club, Inc.
Ownership: Same

REQUEST

From: RS-9 Residential Single Family District; 9,000 sf minimum lot size and IP-S Institutional and Public District (Club or Lodge)
To: IP-S Institutional and Public District (Club or Lodge)

Both general and special use district zoning were discussed with the applicant(s) who decided to pursue the zoning as requested.

Acreage: 4.33 acres

CONTINUANCE HISTORY

This petition was continued from the March 10, 2005 Planning Board public hearing to the April 14, 2005 meeting to allow the petitioner time to prepare building elevations.

LOCATION:

Street: East side of Harper Street north of Vandalia Street.
Jurisdiction: City of Winston-Salem.
Ward: Southwest.

SITE PLAN

Proposed Use: Recreation and tennis club (Club or Lodge).
Square Footage: Site plan indicates a future building of approximately 17,631 square feet.
Building Height: 40 foot maximum.
Parking: Required: 90; Proposed: 104.
Bufferyard Requirements: 15 foot type II bufferyard adjacent to RS-9 zoning district.
Vehicular Use Landscaping Standards Requirements: UDO standards apply.

PROPERTY SITE/IMMEDIATE AREA

Existing Structures on Site: The subject property currently consists of several recreational structures including eight tennis courts, a pool house, swimming pool, snack bar building, and a covered shelter.
Adjacent Uses:

East- Silas Creek Parkway.
South- Single family home zoned RS-9.
Southwest- Single family homes zoned RS-9.
West- Single family homes zoned RS-9.

GENERAL AREA

Character/Maintenance: The general area is characterized by moderate to well maintained single family homes.
Development Pace: Slow

HISTORY

Relevant Zoning Cases:

1. W-2643; RS-9 to LO-S (Medical and Surgical Offices; Professional Office; Offices, Miscellaneous; and Government Offices); denied September 2, 2003; northeast corner of Goodyear Drive and Harper Street; 0.64 acre; Planning Board recommended approval, staff recommended approval.

2. W-2537; RS-9 to LO-S (Professional Office; and Offices, Miscellaneous); withdrawn July 15, 2002; northeast corner of Goodyear Drive and Harper Street; 0.64 acre; Planning Board recommended approval, staff recommended denial.

3. W-2031; RS-9 to IP-S (Club or Lodge); approved February 19, 1996; east side of Harper Street across from Vandalia Drive and west side of Silas Creek Parkway between Goodyear Drive and Business I-40 (part of current site); 3.91 acres; Planning Board and staff recommended approval.

4. W-1719; R-4 to R-1-S (Office uses including day care, single family, and two-family dwellings) (converted to LO-S in UDO); approved June 3, 1991; northwest corner of Silas Creek Parkway and Goodyear Drive; 0.52 acre; Planning Board and staff recommended approval.

PHYSICAL FEATURES/ENVIRONMENTAL REVIEW

Impact on Existing Features: Moderate impact to existing features including removing an existing house and a small storage building.
Topography: The property is relatively flat.
Streams: None noted.
Vegetation/habitat: No significant vegetation noted.
Wetlands: None noted
Environmental Resources Beyond the Site: This proposal should not impact environmental resources beyond the site.
Water Supply Watershed: The property is not located in a water supply watershed.

TRANSPORTATION

Direct Access to Site: Harper Street.
Street Classification: Local Road.
Average Daily Traffic Count/Estimated Capacity at Level of Service D (Vehicles per Day): No traffic count available for Harper Street.
Trip Generation/Existing Zoning: IP-S and RS-9
0.36 acre (RS-9) x 43,560/9,000 = 1 unit x 9.57 (SFR Trip Rate) = 10 Trips per Day
5,605/1,000 x 17.14 (Racquet Club Trip Rate) = 96 Trips per Day
Trip Generation/Proposed Zoning: IP-S
22,036/1,000 x 17.14 (Racquet Club Trip Rate) = 378 Trips per Day
Planned Road Improvements/Thoroughfare Plan: None.
Sight Distance: Sight distance is adequate.
Traffic Impact Study recommended: No.
Sidewalks: None existing.
Bicycle Route: None existing.

CONFORMITY TO PLANS

GMP Area (Legacy): Suburban Neighborhoods, GMA 3
Relevant Comprehensive Plan Recommendation(s): Legacy calls for existing neighborhoods to be protected from inappropriate commercial encroachment.
Relevant Development Guide Recommendation(s): The Country Club/Jonestown Area Plan recognizes this site as existing Low Density Residential Development (0-4 du/ac). The Area Plan also shows this for Low Density Residential Development (0-4 du/ac). The plan also recommends buffering existing single-family residential areas from more intensive land uses which are constructed on adjacent land.

ANALYSIS

The subject request is to rezone 4.33 acres of property located on the east side of Harper Street, from RS-9 and IP-S to IP-S (Club or Lodge). The majority of the site is presently zoned IP-S (Club or Lodge) with Lot 2 of Block 2913 being zoned RS-9. The subject property currently contains the amenities common to most tennis clubs including: tennis courts, swimming pool, pool house, snack bar, and a covered shelter. The general area surrounding the Westwood Club is made up of single family homes zoned RS-9, with some small office development to the north and Silas Creek Parkway adjoining to the east.

This request would allow the Westwood Club to expand their current facilities by acquiring the adjacent lot to the north. The site plan indicates that the existing clubhouse and covered shelter will be removed and replaced with a 17,631 square foot indoor tennis/workout facility and an
additional parking lot. The total building square footage of the site would increase from 5,605 square feet to 22,036 square feet. Access to the site comes via two entrances off of Harper Street.

The addition of the proposed indoor tennis/workout facility could change the character of the Westwood Club. By providing an indoor recreational facility, the hours of operation could expand from a twelve hour day to an eighteen hour day, and would allow a more steady use throughout the fall and winter. Along with this expansion, may come an increase in traffic volume which may negatively impact the surrounding residents. The increase in traffic must be balanced with the opportunity for an existing use to expand.

Staff has reviewed the site plan and requested that some minor changes be made to help improve the overall site layout. With these revisions to the site plan, staff recommends approval of this request.

**FINDINGS**

1. *Legacy* calls for existing neighborhoods to be protected from inappropriate commercial encroachment.

2. The subject property is located within the *Country Club/Jonestown Area Plan*. The plan recommends buffering existing single-family residential areas from more intensive land uses which are constructed on adjacent land.

3. Westwood Club is an existing facility and the increase in traffic must be balanced with the opportunity for expansion.

**STAFF RECOMMENDATION**

Zoning: **APPROVAL**

Site Plan: Staff certifies that the site plan meets all code requirements, and recommends the following conditions:

- **PRIOR TO THE ISSUANCE OF GRADING PERMITS**
  a. Storm water calculations must be submitted with the application for a grading permit.
  b. Driveway permits obtained

- **PRIOR TO THE ISSUANCE OF OCCUPANCY PERMITS**
  a. All Fire Hydrants shall be installed in accordance with the City of Winston-Salem Fire Department.

- **OTHER REQUIREMENTS**
  a. A maximum of one six (6) foot high monument sign shall be allowed along the frontage of Harper Street.
PUBLIC HEARING - March 10, 2005

Aaron King presented the staff report.

FOR:

Tom Gibbs, 255 Ashbourne Lake Court, Clemmons, NC 27012
- I'm the current Board President for the Westwood Club.
- The intention for the indoor facility is a premanufactured metal structure or building with a brick facade on the west elevation facing Harper Street. Also, the structure is not actually rectangular. There is a section of it on the south side that would actually be a brick facility for checking in and possible fitness room for our members.
- Our members are looking for the opportunity to play indoors, year round. This would allow that.

AGAINST:

Donald Green, 231 Harper Street, Winston-Salem, NC 27104
- I would be backed up to the parking lot watching people go in and out of this 40' tall building if this plan is approved.
- There are several neighbors who are against this rezoning but were unable to be here today.
- This will not help my property values at all.
- I've invested in this house as my estate for my children.
- Traffic is already heavy in this area. This rezoning would make it worse.
- The lights for this property will end up right against my property.
- I'm concerned about the precedent this sets. My property is a good example - if I'm right next to a parking lot and between an engineering company and a chiropractor's office, I'm going to be thinking about opening something like an auto parts store because the precedent is already there.
- I'm concerned about the traffic, the noise, the light, the precedent this would set and my own personal property value.

WORK SESSION

During discussion by the Planning Board, the following points were made:

1. The petitioner agreed to offer the brick veneer on west facing side of building and on the south side of the building at the entrance (the work-out lobby area) as conditions.
2. The revised site plan indicates the petitioners will use cut-off lights which are shielded.
3. A combination of plantings and a fence (the fence-option buffer) would be preferable to the neighbor and acceptable to the petitioner.
4. The Club's By-Laws limit membership to 400. There are currently 359 members. The building is intended for three tennis courts which will be 12 people. There is not room for tournaments or a lot of spectators.
5. This use does not generate enough trips to warrant a traffic impact study. The cut-off is 150 trips during the peak hour and this use will only generate 282 trips per day.

6. Jimmy Norwood: I have a concern about the scale and context of this proposal. This is basically a metal warehouse with brick on one side and at the small entranceway. We've had churches and other "engineered buildings" which aren't in scale with the areas in which they are located. I'm having a hard time with this one for that reason. Although this is large horizontally, it will also add a vertical element that will change the character of the area. Would the petitioner be willing to do brick veneer on the north side?

7. Brenda Smith: I think that's a valid concern because we look for compatibility in planned developments and infill developments.

8. In response to Mr. Norwood's comments and question, the petitioner indicated that he appreciated the concerns about the metal building. It's an economical way to build a building that won't have more than 12 people using it at a time. Our intent was to have the brick on the west side at the highest point of the building and mask it off. It will be approximately 32 feet at the north elevation. We didn't want to have a metal building facing Harper Street. We wanted to make sure it at least had brick there to keep it in character with the rest of the club. We want to be good neighbors and keep our neighbors happy.

9. Chairman King asked the petitioner if continuing the case for 30 days would give him a chance to meet with his Board and see if they would approve additional brick veneer or elevations or some other way to break up the appearance of the building. The petitioner agreed that would be helpful.

10. In summary for the petitioner, the concerns are primarily the scale of the building (a three-story building) relative to the rest of the area. It does not have to be brick, because there are a myriad of ways to break up a building of this type.

11. Carol Eickmeyer also asked that the petitioner discuss Mr. Green's concerns with his Board.

MOTION: Clarence Lambe moved continuance of the zoning map amendment and site plan to April 14, 2005.
SECOND: Jimmy Norwood
VOTE:
   FOR: Clark, Eickmeyer, Glenn, King, Lambe, Mullican, Norwood, Smith
   AGAINST: None
   EXCUSED: None

APRIL 14, 2005 MEETING

David Reed presented an update on this case and reminded the Planning Board about their previous discussions regarding the building's architecture. The public hearing was held and closed on March 10th. The Planning Board is in Work Session.

Tom Gibbs, 255 Ashbourne Lake Street, Clemmons, NC 27012
Mr. Gibbs briefed the Planning Board on possible facade treatments. He submitted new elevations which are to be part of the approval.
WORK SESSION

During discussion by the Planning Board, the following points were made:

1. Jimmy Norwood: I appreciate your going back and revisiting this. I think it will downplay the scale of the building.

MOTION: Jimmy Norwood moved approval of the zoning map amendment, certified that the site plan meets all code requirements, and recommends staff conditions with the elevations submitted today.
SECOND: Dara Folan
VOTE:
  FOR: Clark, Folan, Glenn, King, Mullican, Norwood
  AGAINST: None
  EXCUSED: None

___________________________
A. Paul Norby, AICP
Director of Planning
1. PRELIMINARY SOUTH ELEVATION
   SCALE: 3/32" = 1'-0"

2. PRELIMINARY WEST ELEVATION
   SCALE: 3/32" = 1'-0"

3. PRELIMINARY NORTH ELEVATION
   SCALE: 3/32" = 1'-0"

4. PRELIMINARY EAST ELEVATION
   SCALE: 3/32" = 1'-0"