DOCKET #: W2761

PROPOSED ZONING:
LO-S-HO (Residential Building, Multifamily; Offices, Miscellaneous; Professional Office)

EXISTING ZONING:
RM-18-HO

PETITIONER:
St. Paul Place, Inc., for property owned by Same

SCALE: 1” represents 200’
STAFF: Roberts
GMA: 2
ACRE(S): 0.26
MAP(S): 624854
April 20, 2005

St. Paul’s Place, Inc
c/o St. Paul's Episcopal Church
520 Summit Street
Winston-Salem, NC  27101

RE: ZONING MAP AMENDMENT W-2761

Dear Sir:

The attached report of the Planning Board to the City Council is sent to you at the request of the Council Members. You will be notified by the City Secretary’s Office of the date on which the Council will hear this petition.

Sincerely,

A. Paul Norby, AICP
Director of Planning

pc: City Secretary’s Office, P.O. Box 2511, Winston-Salem, NC  27102
    James E. Vaughan, 206 N. Spruce Avenue, Suite 2A, Winston-Salem, NC  27101
ACTION REQUEST FORM

DATE: April 20, 2005
TO: The Honorable Mayor and City Council
FROM: A. Paul Norby, AICP, Director of Planning

COUNCIL ACTION REQUEST:

Request for Public Hearing on zoning map amendment of St. Paul’s Place, Inc.

SUMMARY OF INFORMATION:

Zoning map amendment of St. Paul’s Place, Inc. from RM-18-HO to LO-S-HO (Residential Building, Multifamily; Offices, Miscellaneous; and Professional Office): property is located on the west side of Summit Street north of Sixth Street (Zoning Docket W-2761).

PLANNING BOARD ACTION:

MOTION ON PETITION: APPROVAL
FOR: UNANIMOUS
AGAINST: NONE
SITE PLAN ACTION: CONFORMS
BE IT ORDAINED by the City Council of the City of Winston-Salem as follows:

Section 1. The Winston-Salem City Zoning Ordinance and the Official Zoning Map of the City of Winston-Salem, N.C. are hereby amended by changing from RM-18-HO to LO-S-HO (Residential Building, Multifamily; Offices, Miscellaneous; and Professional Office) the zoning classification of the following described property:

Tax Block 0134, Tax Lot 211

Section 2. This Ordinance is adopted after approval of the site plan entitled St. Paul’s Place, Inc and identified as Attachment "A" of the Special Use District Permit issued by the City Council the ______ day of __________________, 20___ to St. Paul’s Place, Inc.

Section 3. The City Council hereby directs the issuance of a Special Use District Permit pursuant to the Zoning Ordinance of the Unified Development Ordinances for a development to be known as St. Paul’s Place, Inc. Said Special Use District Permit and site plan with associated documents are attached hereto and incorporated herein.

Section 4. This Ordinance shall be effective from and after its adoption.
The City Council of the City of Winston-Salem issues a Special Use District Permit for the site shown on the site plan map included in this zoning petition of St. Paul’s Place, Inc. (Zoning Docket W-2761). The site shall be developed in accordance with the plan approved by the Board and bearing the inscription: "Attachment A, Special Use District Permit for LO-S-HO (Residential Building, Multifamily; Offices, Miscellaneous; and Professional Office), approved by the Winston-Salem City Council the _____ day of _____________________, 20____" and signed, provided the property is developed in accordance with requirements of the LO-S-HO zoning district of the Zoning Ordinance of the Unified Development Ordinances, the Erosion Control Ordinance, and other applicable laws, and the following additional conditions be met:

- **PRIOR TO THE ISSUANCE OF OCCUPANCY PERMITS**
  a. Developer shall obtain a variance from the Winston-Salem Zoning Board of Adjustment for the parking, bufferyard and driveway width requirements. If said variances are not granted, the zoning of the subject property will revert back to RM-18.
ZONING STAFF REPORT

DOCKET #   W-2761
STAFF:     Gary Roberts

Petitioner(s): St. Paul’s Place, Inc.
Ownership: Same

REQUEST

From: RM-18-HO Residential Multifamily District; maximum density 18 units/acre; Historic Overlay
To: LO-S-HO Limited Office District; Historic Overlay (Residential Building, Multifamily; Offices, Miscellaneous and Professional Office)

Both general and special use district zoning were discussed with the applicant(s) who decided to pursue the zoning as requested.

Acreage: 0.26 acre

LOCATION:

Street: West side of Summit Street north of Sixth Street.
Jurisdiction: City of Winston-Salem.
Ward: West.

SITE PLAN

Proposed Use: Apartment and office building.
Square Footage: 3,800 sf of office and 11 multifamily residential units.
Building Height: Four Stories.
Density: 42 units per acre.
Parking: Required: 20 spaces; Proposed: 9 spaces. Note: Variance to be applied for.
Bufferyard Requirement: Type II bufferyard adjacent to RSQ (HO). Note: Variance to be applied for.

PROPERTY SITE/IMMEDIATE AREA

Existing Structures on Site: Four story structure.
Adjacent Uses:
   North- Single family homes zoned RSQ (HO).
   East- Attached housing zoned RM-18 (HO).
   South- St. Paul’s Episcopal Church.
   West- Outdoor play area for St. Paul’s Episcopal Church child day care.
GENERAL AREA

Character/Maintenance: Well maintained historic neighborhood with a mixture of uses. Development Pace: Slow.

HISTORY

Relevant Zoning Cases:

1. W-2482; RSQ (HO) to PB-S (HO) (Club or Lodge; Offices Miscellaneous; and Professional Office) and IP-S (HO) (Club or Lodge); denied August 20, 2001; south of the intersection of Sunset Drive and West End Boulevard; 0.72 acre; Planning Board and staff recommended approval.

2. W-1804; R-1, R-2, B-2, and B-3 to R-1 (HO), R-2 (HO), B-2 (HO), and B-3 (HO); approved February 1, 1993; the West End area which is generally north of Business 40, south of West End Boulevard, east of Peters Creek Parkway, and west of Broad Street; 229 acres; Planning Board and staff recommended approval.

PHYSICAL FEATURES/ENVIRONMENTAL REVIEW

Impact on Existing Features: Minimal impact as site is already developed. Topography: Moderate slope downward from the east to the west. Streams: No streams are located within or adjacent to the subject property. Vegetation/habitat: Small lawn area exists on the site. Water Supply Watershed: Site is not within the boundaries of a water supply watershed.

TRANSPORTATION

Direct Access to Site: Summit Street. Street Classification: Local Street. Average Daily Traffic Count/Estimated Capacity at Level of Service D (Vehicles per Day): No traffic counts are available for Summit Street. Trip Generation/Existing Zoning: 15 units x 6.63 (Apartment Trip Rate) = 105 Trips per Day. Trip Generation/Proposed Zoning: 11 units x 6.63 (Apartment Trip Rate) = 73 Trips per Day + 3,800 / 1,000 x 11.01 (Office Trip Rate) = 418 Trips = 491 Total Trips per Day. Sidewalks: Sidewalks exist along both sides of Summit Street. Transit: Route 15 along Fifth Street. Bicycle Route: Downtown Loop along Fourth Street and Fifth Street.

CONFORMITY TO PLANS

GMP Area (Legacy): Urban Neighborhoods, GMA 2. Relevant Comprehensive Plan Recommendation(s): Legacy recommends greater residential densities where appropriate, community services; and historic preservation, rehabilitation and reuse of existing structures.
Relevant Development Guide Recommendation(s): Institutions should be allowed to grow in a compatible manner. Creative solutions including adaptive rehabilitation of existing structures may be necessary to grow compatibly with the surrounding neighborhoods.

**HISTORIC RESOURCES REVIEW**

Known Historic Resources: Yes.
Forsyth County Architectural Inventory Number/Name: Summit Apartments.
National Register of Historic Place: Yes.
Local Historic Landmark: No.
Historic District: Yes.

Comments: This property is located within the West End Historic Overlay District. West End is also listed on the National Register of Historic Places. The subject property, Summit Apartments, is a contributing resource to the West End Historic District. Constructed in 1926, the Colonial Revival building is among the most handsome built in Winston-Salem’s 1920s boom period. As the property is within an historic overlay district, any major exterior physical changes to the building/site need to be reviewed and approved by the Historic Resources Commission (HRC) under the Certificate of Appropriateness (COA) process. The Commission is aware that work has been ongoing at this property. The predominance of the work is interior (over which the HRC has no jurisdiction). However, the current proposal includes an exterior stair that requires a COA. HRC staff has received and approved a Minor Work COA for the aforementioned work. All other exterior work being conducted is considered routine maintenance under the West End Historic Overlay District Design Review Guidelines and therefore no further COAs are required. With regard to the rezoning petition, the HRC does not have authority to review/approve rezoning petitions and use questions within historic overlay districts. As such, no review by the HRC on the petition is required.

**ANALYSIS**

The subject request is to rezone a 0.26 acre lot located on the west side of Summit Street from RM-18 (HO) to LO-S (HO). Currently located on the property is a 4 story structure which was originally constructed in the 1920’s as a 15 unit apartment building. Directly south and west of the site is the St. Paul’s Episcopal Church and it’s associated child day care area zoned IP (HO). To the north and northeast along Summit Street are single family homes zoned RSQ (HO). Across the Summit Street are some attached housing also zoned RM-18 (HO).

The subject building was constructed in 1926 and has been used since that time as a 15 unit apartment building. The structure is considered Nonconforming in regard to off-street parking, bufferyards and building setbacks. St. Paul’s Episcopal Church is requesting to convert 4 of the existing units into 3,800 sf of church related office space. The site is located within the South Central Winston-Salem Area Plan which was adopted in 2003. The plan recommends that institutions be allowed to grow in a compatible manner, recognizing that creative solutions, including adaptive rehabilitation of existing structures, may be necessary to grow compatibly.
with the surrounding neighborhoods. The site is also located within the West End Historic Overlay District and said building is considered one of the contributing structures within the district. Planning staff sees this property as an architecturally excellent example of affordable housing adding diversity and character to this premier urban neighborhood. While the subject request would exchange some of the dwelling units for office space, the exterior character will not change and the impact to the surrounding neighborhood should not increase. The area plan appropriately recognizes that some older structures may need to undergo some degree of use change in order to remain viable in a changing economic and social climate.

Due to the limited size of the site and the inability to comply with current zoning codes such as driveway width, parking and bufferyard requirements, the property owner will need to obtain variance approval from the Zoning Board of Adjustment. The petitioner is agreeable that if such variances are not granted, the property would automatically revert back to its current RM-18 classification. Planning staff recommends approval of the request.

FINDINGS

1. *Legacy* recommends greater residential densities where appropriate, community services, historic preservation and the rehabilitation and reuse of existing structures.

2. The *South Central Winston-Salem Area Plan* recommends that institutions should be allowed to grow in a compatible manner and that creative solutions including adaptive rehabilitation of existing structures may be necessary to grow compatibly with the surrounding neighborhoods.

3. The subject RM-18 (HO) to LO-S (HO) request would enable four out of the 15 multifamily dwelling units within an existing four story building to be converted into 3,800 sf of office space.

4. The subject request would retain the historic character of the property and introduce a small degree of a relatively low impacting use into the area.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION

Zoning: **APPROVAL.**

Site Plan: Staff certifies that the site plan meets all code requirements, and recommends the following conditions:

- **PRIOR TO THE ISSUANCE OF OCCUPANCY PERMITS**
  a. Developer shall obtain a variance from the Winston-Salem Zoning Board of Adjustment for the parking, bufferyard and driveway width requirements. If said variances are not granted, the zoning of the subject property will revert back to RM-18.
PUBLIC HEARING

FOR: None

AGAINST: None

WORK SESSION

MOTION: Dara Folan moved approval of the zoning map amendment, certified that the site plan meets all code requirements and recommends staff conditions.
SECOND: Jimmy Norwood
VOTE:
   FOR: Clark, Folan, Glenn, King, Mullican, Norwood
   AGAINST: None
   EXCUSED: None

____________________________________
A. Paul Norby, AICP
Director of Planning