DOCKET #: W2700

PROPOSED ZONING:
LB-S (Multiple Uses)

EXISTING ZONING:
LB-S

PETITIONER:
Westgate Circle Company for property owned by Same

SCALE: 1" represents 400'

STAFF: Roberts

GMA: 3

ACRE(S): 2.31

MAP(S): 612874
REQUEST

From: LB-S Limited Business District (Offices, Miscellaneous; Professional Office; Recreational Services, Indoor)
To: LB-S Limited Business District [Offices, Miscellaneous; Professional Office; Recreational Services, Indoor; Restaurant (without drive-through service); and General Merchandise Store]

Both general and special use district zoning were discussed with the applicant(s) who decided to pursue the zoning as requested.

Acreage: 2.31

LOCATION

Street: Southwest side of Reynolda Road south of Yadkinville Road.
Jurisdiction: City of Winston-Salem.
Ward: Northwest.

SITE PLAN

Proposed Use: Indoor recreational and office use, restaurant and general merchandise store.
Square Footage: 21,000 square feet.
Building Height: One story.
Parking: Required: 105 spaces; Proposed: 123 spaces.
Bufferyard Requirements: 40 foot type IV bufferyard adjacent to RS-9.
Vehicular Use Landscaping Standards Requirements: UDO standards apply.

PROPERTY SITE/IMMEDIATE AREA

Existing Structures on Site: Property is undeveloped.
Adjacent Uses:
    East- Reynolda Road and undeveloped property zoned RS-9.
    South- Commercial use zoned LB-S.
    Southwest- Undeveloped property zoned RS-9.
    West- Undeveloped property zoned RS-9.
    Northwest- Commercial use zoned LB-S.
GENERAL AREA

Character/Maintenance: Mixture of well maintained single family residences and small scale office and commercial uses along a major thoroughfare.
Development Pace: Slow to moderate.

PHYSICAL FEATURES/ENVIRONMENTAL REVIEW

Impact on Existing Features: Significant removal of mature vegetation and grading to accommodate proposed improvements shown on site plan.
Topography: The subject site has a steep slope along the western edge of the property boundary, quickly falling from about 860 feet in the southwest corner of the property down to about 830 feet in the southern corner of the proposed building. Along the rest of the property, the elevation rises from about 800 feet in the northwest section of the property up to about 832 feet in the southeastern section of the property.
Streams: Mill Creek lies approximately 250 feet directly west of the northwest corner of the subject property.
Vegetation/habitat: Currently, the subject property is covered almost entirely with vegetation. The proposed site plan will remove most of this vegetation but maintain significant existing vegetation adjacent to residentially zoned properties.
Floodplains: Floodway and floodway fringe areas lie to the west along Mill Creek.
Environmental Resources Beyond The Site: The proposed site plan does not appear to impact environmental resources beyond the site.
Water Supply Watershed: The subject property is not located in a water supply watershed.

TRANSPORTATION

Direct Access to Site: Reynolda Road.
Street Classification: Major Thoroughfare.
Average Daily Traffic Count/Estimated Capacity at Level of Service D (Vehicles per Day):
Reynolda Road between Fairlawn Drive and Yadkinville Road = 26,000 / 30,400
Trip Generation/Existing Zoning: LB-S
18,000/1,000 x 32.93 Health and Fitness Club Trip Rate = 593 Trips per Day
Trip Generation/Proposed Zoning: LB-S
15,000 / 1,000 x 32.93 Health and Fitness Trip Rate = 494 Trips per Day
3,000 / 1,000 x 127.15 (High Turnover Sit Down Restaurant Trip Rate) = 381 Trips per Day
3,000 / 1,000 x 44.32 (Specialty Retail Trip Rate) = 133 Trips per Day
Total Proposed Trip Generation = 1,008 Trips per Day
Planned Road Improvements: Yadkinville Road between Reynolda Road and the Northern Beltway; from 2 lanes to 3 lanes; 2021 - 2025
Traffic Impact Study recommended: TIS may be required if either the restaurant or General Merchandise Store use exceeds 3,000 square feet.
Sidewalks: Exist on the east side of Reynolda Road and on the west side of Reynolda Road 200± feet northwest of the subject property at the entrance of the Bethabara Park Trail. Petitioner has agreed to provide a sidewalk along the frontage of the subject property.
which is consistent with the current LB-S site plan conditions.
Transit: Route 16 along Reynolda Road.

**HISTORY**

Relevant Zoning Cases:

1. **W-2659; LO to LB-S (Offices, Miscellaneous; Professional Office; Recreational Services, Indoor); approved December 1, 2003; southwest side of Reynolda Road south of Yadkinville Road, current site; 2.31 acres; Planning Board and staff recommended approval.**

2. **W-1952; HB and RS-9 to HB; approved February 6, 1995; east corner of Reynolda Road/NC67 and Bethabara Park Boulevard. 8.74 acres; Planning Board and staff recommended approval.**

3. **W-762; R-1 to B-3-S (Offices; Stores or Shops, Retail); approved February 4, 1980; southwest side of Reynolda Road south of Yadkinville Road, adjacent to northwestern side of subject property; 0.4 acre; Planning Board recommended approval, staff recommended denial.**

4. **W-697; R-1 to B-3-S (Stores or Shops, Retail); approved January 2, 1979; southwest side of Reynolda Road northwest of Valley Road, adjacent to southern side of subject property; 0.67 acre; Planning Board recommended approval, staff recommended denial.**

**CONFORMITY TO PLANS**

GMP Area (*Legacy*): Suburban Neighborhoods (GMA 3).
Relevant Comprehensive Plan Recommendation(s): The *Legacy Development Guide* recommends that business uses not “strip out” along highway corridors but be located in more compact areas of mixed use development. The *Guide* also includes as part of its future vision the creative use of abandoned buildings and vacant land in older commercial areas. The commercial areas north along Reynolda Road from the petitioner’s site have vacant stores that might accommodate some of the uses the petitioner is seeking.

Relevant Development Guide Recommendation(s): The area plan on page 28 recommends the subject property be developed for office use. On page 45 the plan states that “An unbroken strip of commercial development from Fairlawn Drive to Shattalon Drive is undesirable.”

**ANALYSIS**

The subject request is to rezone 2.31 acres located on the southwest side of Reynolda Road south of Yadkinville Road from LB-S to LB-S. The petition would increase the approved building
square footage from 18,000 to 21,000 and add the uses of Restaurant (without drive-through service) and General Merchandise Store.

The property is currently undeveloped and heavily vegetated with many mature, canopy trees. It is located within a relatively small, commercial and office strip lining the southwest side of Reynolda Road (NC 67) just south of Mill Creek. Directly on either side of the site are two relatively small LB-S sites with the principal structures being less than 3,000 square feet each. Undeveloped RS-9 property is located behind the site and across Reynolda Road. Substantial topographic changes also characterize the general area. Northwest of the subject property along Reynolda Road and across Mill Creek, is a community scale, strip commercial area. Southeast of the site in the direction of downtown are single family residences zoned RS-9. Further southeast is a second established community activity center loosely centered on the Reynolda Manor Shopping Center and the intersection of Reynolda Road and Fairlawn Drive.

The property was rezoned from LO to LB-S in December of 2003, W-2659. While the Polo/Reynolda Road Area Plan, recommends office use for the subject property, staff supported the conversion to LB-S based upon the limited nature of the request and several positive site plan elements. The currently approved uses are Offices, Miscellaneous; Professional Office and Recreational Services, Indoor. Staff viewed these uses as comparable to what would typically be developed under the previous LO zoning. However the present request to add retail and restaurant uses, along with an additional 3,000 square feet of building area, would significantly increase the level of intensity on the property and establish a precedent for similar uses on the surrounding properties. As noted previously, the site is located along a major thoroughfare between two large commercial centers. It should be noted that these centers have experienced some degree of increased vacancies in recent years. Staff supports the area plans recommendation which discourages strip commercial development from occurring along Reynolda Road between these two existing centers.

Regarding the site plan, the currently approved plan places the parking and circulation areas to the side or rear of the two principal structures. This approach has obvious benefits to the overall streetscape and serves to enhance the experience of future pedestrians who may choose to access the Bethabara Park Trail head located ±200 feet from the site. The proposed site plan locates a new two-way drive aisle between the smaller northern most building and Reynolda Road. The request also includes 123 parking spaces which is 18 spaces more than required by the UDO. This increase is noteworthy in an area where stormwater runoff issues are a concern for many downstream properties along Mill Creek.

In summary, the current request is to increase the maximum building square footage by 3,000 square feet, add two relatively intense uses and amend the vehicular circulation pattern of the previously approved site plan. Staff’s support of the existing LB-S zoning was based upon several site plan characteristics and land use limitations which are not present in the current request. Staff sees the subject petition as inconsistent with the Polo/Reynolda Road Area Plan, and potentially establishing a negative precedent for more intense strip commercial development along this portion of Reynolda Road.
FINDINGS

1. *Legacy* recommends that business uses not “strip out” along highway corridors but be located in more compact areas of mixed use development.

2. The *Polo/Reynolda Road Area Plan* recommends the subject property be developed for office use and states that “An unbroken strip of commercial development from Fairlawn Drive to Shattalon Drive is undesirable.”

3. Staff supported the existing LB-S zoning based upon the limited nature of the requested uses and several positive site plan elements.

4. The subject request deviates from the approved zoning by increasing the maximum building square footage by 3,000 square feet, adding two relatively intense uses and altering the building placement and vehicular circulation pattern.

5. The subject request would establish a negative precedent for strip commercial development along this portion of Reynolda Road.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION

Zoning: **DENIAL.**

Site Plan: Staff certifies that the site plan meets all code requirements, and recommends the following conditions:

- **PRIOR TO THE ISSUANCE OF GRADING PERMITS**
  a. Developer shall cordon off areas shown on the site plan as natural area proposed to be left undisturbed.
  b. A storm water management study shall be submitted to the Public Works Department of the City of Winston-Salem for review. If required, an engineered storm water management plan shall be submitted and approved by the Public Works Department of the City of Winston-Salem.

- **PRIOR TO THE ISSUANCE OF BUILDING PERMITS**
  a. On site fire hydrant locations shall be approved by the City Fire Department in writing to the Inspections Division.
  b. Developer shall obtain a new driveway permit from the North Carolina Department of Transportation.
  c. Traffic Impact Study may be required if either the restaurant or general merchandise store exceeds 3,000 square feet.
• PRIOR TO THE ISSUANCE OF OCCUPANCY PERMITS
  a. All required fire hydrants shall be installed in accordance with the City Fire Department.
  b. Developer shall complete any improvements, as required by the North Carolina Department of Transportation.
  c. Parking lot and bufferyard trees shall be of a large variety as defined in UDO Section 3-4.10.
  d. Developer shall install enhanced streetyard plantings as shown on site plan.
  e. Developer shall install a minimum five (5) foot wide sidewalk along the entire frontage of the property along Reynolda Road at the back edge of the right-of-way to City of Winston-Salem standards.

• OTHER REQUIREMENTS
  a. Signage shall be limited to one (1) monument sign with a maximum height of six (6) feet.
  b. No on site lighting shall be taller than 15 feet and shall be of the “shoebox” type or otherwise designed not to cast direct light on adjacent residential properties.