DOCKET #: W2682
(Continued from 10/11/02 CCPB meeting)

PROPOSED ZONING:
MU-S (Multiple Uses)

EXISTING ZONING:
RS9

PETITIONER:
Hilcrest Properties of Winston-Salem for property owned by Hillcrest Properties of Winston-Salem and others

SCALE: 1” represents 800’
STAFF: Hall
GMA: 3
ACRE(S): 161.45
MAP(S): 606838, 600838, 606842, 600842
CONTINUANCE HISTORY

This case was continued from the October 10, 2002, Planning Board meeting to the December 12, 2002, Planning Board meeting at the request of the petitioner. Staff is requesting an additional one-month continuance to allow adequate time to review the revised site plan which has not been resubmitted as of this writing (December 4, 2002). The UDO does not allow for further continuances after the January 9th meeting.

REQUEST

From: RS-9 Residential Single Family District; minimum lot size 9,000 sf
To: MU-S Mixed Use District - Special Use (Residential Building, Single Family; Residential Building, Duplex; Residential Building, Twin Home; Residential Building, Townhouse; Residential Building, Multifamily; Combined Use; Congregate Care Facility; Life Care Community; Planned Residential Development; ABC Store; Arts and Crafts Studio; Convenience Store; Food or Drug Store; Furniture or Home Furnishings Store; General Merchandise Store; Hardware Store; Restaurant without Drive Through Service; Retail Store, Specialty or Miscellaneous; Shopping Center; Banking and Financial Services; Bed and Breakfast; Car Wash; Funeral Home; Hotel or Motel; Medical or Dental Lab; Medical or Surgical Offices; Non-Store Retailer; Offices, Miscellaneous; Professional Office; Services, Business A; Services, Business B; Services, Personal; Testing and Research Lab; Veterinary Services; Golf Course; Golf Driving Range; Recreation Services, Indoor; Recreation Services, Outdoor; Recreation Facility, Public; Swimming Pool, Private; Theater, Indoor; Adult Day Care Center; Child Day Care Center; Child Day Care, Large Home; Child Day Care, Small Home; Child Day Care, Drop In; Child Day Care, Sick Children; Church or Religious Institution, Community; Church or Religious Institution, Neighborhood; Club or Lodge; College or University; Government Offices; Hospital or Health Center; Library, Public; Museum or Art Gallery; Neighborhood Organization; Police or Fire Station; Post Office; School, Private; School, Public; School, Vocational or Professional; Stadium, Coliseum, or Exhibition Building; and Helistop - TWO PHASE)

Both general and special use district zoning were discussed with the applicant(s) who decided to pursue
the zoning as requested.

Acreage: 161.45

**LOCATION**

Street: Northwest corner of Stratford Road and Somerset Drive.
Jurisdiction: City of Winston-Salem.
Ward: Southwest.

**SITE PLAN**

**Area One:**
Proposed Use: Neighborhood Center/Mixed Use.
Square Footage: 600,000 sf.
Building Height: Four stories, 60'/unlimited; the height of structures may be increased one foot for each foot of additional setback beyond 40' from RS-9 zoned land.
Density: Max. 340 units = 4.69 dwelling units per acre (du/a).
Parking: Required: 3,000; proposed: 3,001; layout: combination of on-street parking spaces as well as surface lots.
Bufferyard Requirements: To be determined through site plan review.
Vehicular Use Landscaping Standards Requirements: UDO standards apply.

**Area Two:**
Proposed Use: Mixed residential.
Square Footage: 10,000 sf.
Building Height: Three stories, 50' max.
Density: Max. 372 units = 8 du/a.
Parking: Required: 783; proposed: 921; layout: combination of on-street parking spaces as well as surface lots.
Bufferyard Requirements: To be determined through site plan review.
Vehicular Use Landscaping Standards Requirements: UDO standards apply.

**Area Three:**
Proposed Use: Single family residential.
Square Footage: Not available.
Building Height: Three stories, 60' max.
Density: 60 units = 2.96 du/a.
Parking: Required: Two spaces per dwelling unit
Bufferyard Requirements: To be determined through site plan review.
Vehicular Use Landscaping Standards Requirements: UDO standards apply.
Area Four:
Proposed Use: Single family residential.
Square Footage: Not available.
Building Height: Three stories, 60' max.
Density: 60 units = 2.71 du/a.
Parking: Required: Two spaces per dwelling unit.
Buffery Requirements: To be determined through site plan review.
Vehicular Use Landscaping Standards Requirements: UDO standards apply.

PROPERTY SITE/IMMEDIATE AREA

Existing Structures on Site: Primarily, the only structure to be removed is the existing clubhouse for the golf course (nine holes will also be removed during the first phase of development). Two other structures are surrounded by the proposed development; these are not being included in this petition and are to be protected. However, the functionality of the plan is being hampered by the exclusion of these homes and the viability of these structures to remain single family residences is in question.

Adjacent Uses:
- North - Existing single family zoned RS-9, lot sizes average 20,000 sf.
- East - Existing lake and floodplain leading down to Little Creek; across Little Creek is existing single family zoned RS-9, lot sizes average 12,000 sf.
- Southeast - Existing GI (across Stratford Road).
- South - Undeveloped land zoned NSB-S (Shopping Center).
- Southwest - Existing single family zoned RS-9, lot sizes average 15,000 sf.
- West - Existing "Cities" restaurant zoned HB.
- Northwest - Existing single family zoned RS-9, lot sizes average 20,000 sf.

GENERAL AREA

Character/Maintenance: The area around the proposed development primarily consists of stable single family residences surrounding the existing golf course. A sprinkling of business zonings occupies the surrounding area with the "Cities" restaurant having been recently built to the west of the subject property. This was built using the typical suburban model leaving little chance to have either vehicular or sidewalk connections to the proposed development. Across Stratford Road lies existing industrial land that is currently developed. The industrial zoning extends southwestwardly until Clemmonsville Road.

Development Pace: Moderate; other than the recent "Cities" rezoning, this immediate area has been fairly stable although there is much development and zoning pressure northward toward Hanes Mall Boulevard.
PHYSICAL FEATURES/ENVIROMENTAL REVIEW

Impact on Existing Features: As a first phase, nine holes of the golf course will be closed to permit development. There a several wetland areas, as well as Little Creek, that may be subject to adverse impacts [see below].

Topography: There is an approximate change in elevation on the subject property of 116' from an approximate elevation of 843' in the southeast down to an approximate elevation of 727' in the west (at Little Creek).

Streams: Little Creek and some smaller tributaries pass through the subject property. There is a stream runs along a portion of the southern property line, a stream that runs along the northern property line and a stream that crosses the northern portion of the site near the northern single-family "pod" and the impounded wetlands.

Vegetation/habitat: There is some existing vegetation on the subject property - the site is currently developed as a golf course and thus has stands of trees along fairways and clustered around greens and tee-boxes.

Floodplains: Floodway and floodway fringe for Little Creek is present on the subject property.

Wetlands: Yes - the WS West quad shows that there are palustrine, unconsolidated bottom, permanently flooded, dammed and impounded wetlands (PUBHh) on the subject property.

Natural Heritage Sites: None.

Farmland Preservation Sites: None.

How will development of the site affect environmental resources beyond the site?
While the development has many of the elements that have been encouraged in Legacy and by staff, it is being proposed using current parking standards from the UDO. The 4,000+ parking spaces and associated impervious surfaces will generate a significant increase in stormwater runoff, possibly contributing to increased downstream nuisance flooding and degrading water quality.

Watershed? Site is not within a water supply watershed.

Compliance with Federal/State requirements for wetland/stream protection: Yes.

Comments: The wetland areas are being protected adequately. Most of the streams appear to be protected adequately. However, there is a portion of the perennial stream that crosses the northern residential "pod" near the eastern-most connection to Farmbrook Drive that is covered by a parking area. This parking area should be removed from the plans and the stream allowed to continue its flow (fully realizing that the stream must be culverted for the street crossing. As a final note, the overall impervious surface for the site should be reduced through the elimination of surface parking (reduction in the # of spaces and the construction of multi-leveled parking decks to the rear of commercial areas) to reduce the threat of nuisance flooding and water quality degradation along Little Creek and associated tributaries.

TRANSPORTATION

Direct Access to Site: Stratford Road; Somerset Drive; Kimwell Drive; Farmbrook Road
Street Classification: Stratford Road - major thoroughfare; Somerset Drive - minor thoroughfare;
Kimwell Drive - minor thoroughfare; Farmbrook Road - local road.

Average Daily Traffic Count/Estimated Capacity at Level of Service D (Vehicles per Day):
- Stratford Road between Somerset Drive and Burke Mill Road = 23,000/42,200
- Somerset Drive between Stratford Road and Jonestown Road = 2,000/11,1000
- Kimwell Drive between Stratford Road and end = 6,200/16,100

Trip Generation/Existing Zoning: RS-9

161.45 \times 43,560 / 9,000 = 781 \text{ units} \times 9.57 \text{ (SFR Trip Rate)} = 7,474 \text{ Trips per Day}

Trip Generation/Proposed Zoning: MU-S

Planned Road Improvements: While there are no immediate improvements planned for Stratford Road in this area, the Traffic Impact Study has made the following recommendations:

Intersection of Stratford Road and Main Entrance (to the proposed development):

C Install a traffic signal at this intersection with protected/permisive phasing provided for left turn movement into the Main Entrance from Stratford Road. This signal should be coordinated with the existing traffic signal on Stratford Road at Kimwell Drive. In addition, preemption devices should be provided at both traffic signals to accommodate the Fire Department that is proposed to be located on Somerset Drive.

C Construct an exclusive right turn land on Stratford Road at he Main Entrance. Provide a minimum of 200 feet of full storage and an appropriate bay taper. The bay taper length may need to be shorter than desired in order to maximize storage while preventing the taper from extending across existing driveway connections.

C Provide a four-lane cross-section consisting of two (2) ingress lanes and two (2) egress lanes. The driveway approach should provide an exclusive left turn lane and a left-right combination lane to accommodate the anticipated egress movements. The left-right combination lane is recommended in order to minimize the number of lanes so that a landscaped median can be constructed within the driveway stem to provide an aesthetically pleasing appearance while maintaining the site entrance's functionality. The multi-lane cross-section should extend a minimum of 300 feet, or to the first internal intersection, so that conflicts associated with the left-turning movements can be prevented at the internal intersection.

Intersection of Stratford Road and Site Entrance 1 (approx. 750' NE of Main Entrance):

C Construct an exclusive right turn lane on Stratford Road at Site Entrance 1. Provide a minimum of 100 feet of full storage and an appropriate bay taper; the bay taper length may need to be shorter than desired in order to maximize storage while preventing the taper from extending across existing driveway connections.

C Provide a three-lane cross-section consisting of one (1) ingress lane and two (2) egress lanes. The driveway approach should provide an exclusive left turn lane and an exclusive right turn lane to accommodate the anticipated egress movements. The three-lane cross-section should extend to the first internal intersection (at a minimum) to prevent conflicts associated with the left-turning and/or crossing movements at the internal intersection.

Sight Distance: Good.

Interior Streets: Public with on-street parking throughout.
Traffic Impact Study recommended: Submitted [see recommendations above].

Connectivity of street network: Within the development, there are multiple connections to adjacent uses, although there may be some conflict as to which traffic and pedestrian movements are through parking lots and which are on streets. Connections to development areas beyond the site specific are adequate. The location of the main entrance drive is not in the optimal location.

Sidewalks: None existing. DOT and staff would like to see sidewalks not only internal to the project, but also along both Stratford Road and Somerset Drive.

Transit: Route 19 along Stratford Road.

Bike: None.

HISTORY

Relevant Zoning Cases:

1. W-2531; HB-S to HB-S; approved March 4, 2002; south side of Hewes Street northwest of Stratford Road; 0.5 acre; Planning Board and staff recommended approval.

2. W-2349; RS-9 to HB; approved November 1, Northwest side of Stratford Road/U.S. 158, between Hewes Street and Parrish Street; 0.34 acre; Planning Board and staff recommended approval.

3. W-2156; RS-9 to HB; approved June 2, 1997; northwest side of Stratford Road west of Parrish Street; 3.63 acres; Planning Board and staff recommended approval.

4. W-1493; R-6 to B-3-S (Stores or shops, retail; Agriculture); approved January 4, 1988; southwest intersection of Hewes Street and Stratford Road; 1.67 acres; Planning Board recommended approval, staff recommended denial.

5. F-696; R-6 to B-3; approved May 29, 1984; northwest side of Stratford Road southwest of Parrish Road; 1.03 acres; Planning Board and staff recommended approval.

6. F-434; R-6 to B-3; approved January 17, 1977; northwest side of Stratford Road southwest of Parrish Road; 0.75 acre; Planning Board and staff recommended approval.

CONFORMITY TO PLANS

GMP Area (Legacy): Suburban Neighborhoods (GMA 3).

Relevant Comprehensive Plan Recommendation(s): Legacy promotes compact, pedestrian-oriented neighborhoods that contain a mixture of residential and commercial buildings, public spaces and amenities, and offer a variety of transportation options.

Relevant Development Guide Recommendation(s): The *South Stratford Road Development Guide* recommends that the subject property remain as a site for recreation [see Maps 6 and 7 of the development guide (pages 16 and 17)].

**GREENWAY/RECREATION/OPEN SPACE REVIEW**

Greenway Plan: Greenway Plan for Winston-Salem and Forsyth County; *South Stratford Road Development Guide*.

Greenway/Trail Name: Little Creek

Easement Requested: 40 feet

Side of Creek: East side

Is site designated for parks/open space? Yes. See *South Stratford Road Development Guide*, page 21.

Comments/Status of Trail: The development guide proposes that the City Recreation Department consider purchasing the site for recreation. If this is not feasible staff should support development as a "PUD" or "PRD" with retention of significant open space. A greenway is proposed along Little Creek. A greenway along Little Creek can ultimately connect the Muddy Creek Greenway to Hanes Mall Boulevard. (see Greenway Plan Map).

**ANALYSIS**

The current request is to rezone 161.45 acres from RS-9 to MU-S. The site is located on the northwest corner of Stratford Road and Somerset Drive. The area around the proposed development primarily consists of stable single family residences. A sprinkling of business zonings occupies the surrounding area with the "Cities" restaurant having been recently built to the west of the subject property. Across Stratford Road lies existing industrial land that is mostly currently developed. The industrial zoning extends southwestwardly until Clemmonsville Road.

The current petition utilizes the MU-S District zoning classification which promotes a balanced mixture of residential, commercial, and in some cases light industrial uses. Depending on context, the MU-S District encourages at least three distinctly different use components. Key elements of the overall concept include not only integrated relations of land uses, but also the design relations regarding building mass, rhythm, scale, and transition. Additionally, a cohesive and connected pedestrian and vehicular network is encouraged.

The *Legacy* development guide promotes compact, pedestrian-oriented neighborhoods that contain a mixture of residential and commercial buildings, public spaces and amenities, and offer a variety of transportation options. Although the rail lines are located on the other side of Stratford Road, it is feasible that a transit line could utilize the existing rail line and a station could potentially be located in this area to serve the industrial on the east side of Stratford Road as well as the retail and business commercial uses within the proposed development on the west. However, transit typically requires a
sufficient and dense number of people that live or work close to the transit stop. With the total site balancing at 5.15 dwelling units per acre (du/a) coupled with a surrounding residential density of less than 3 du/a, the likelihood of a transit stop to serve this location is improbable.

The *South Stratford Road Development Guide* recommends that the subject property remain as a site for recreation. This suggested land use is most likely based on an assumption that the existing golf course would always remain. The development guide also has recommendations for commercial zoning in this area along Stratford Road; however, many existing businesses as well as the existing zoning for the shopping center south of Somerset (zoned NSB-S) directed those recommendations. The language of the report speaks of not adding any new additional commercial along Stratford in an effort to prevent the typical "strip commercial" effect.

The *Legacy* development guide identifies the area of Hanes Mall Boulevard and Stratford Road as a Metro Activity Center (MAC), the largest of the three activity centers. The support area for a Metro Activity Center extends one-half mile from the center of the core. The support area is a critical component due to the fact that it provides medium-high to high residential densities which serves the core (a quarter mile radius from the center) commercial, institutional, and office uses. This concentration of high density and employment helps warrant transit stations to serve the area. The support area also serves as a buffer between the intense uses of the core and the lower density residential areas beyond the boundaries of the Metro Activity Center.

The subject property is located one mile from the intersection of Hanes Mall Boulevard and Stratford Road, about half a mile beyond the periphery of the MAC. Staff has concern regarding locating the proposed development beyond those limits of the MAC, especially in conjunction with the suggestions from the Area Plan which attempts to stop the sprawling commercial development common along Stratford Road north of Hanes Mall Boulevard. However, some of those concerns could be mitigated by a proposed mixed-use concept with a pedestrian friendly neo-traditional design. This would need to be an exceptional model for suburban mixed-use development, though.

The proposed site plan for Hillcrest, shown as a full build-out master plan, has four different areas of development that include at least three distinctly different use components. The plan includes various elements of pedestrian friendly design utilizing a connection of major roads that incorporates buildings being pulled up close to the roadway, street trees, on-street parking and sidewalks. However, there are occasional areas within the design where the neo-traditional streetscape suffers by not providing terminal vistas or by emphasizing parking and, by default, the vehicle. Additionally, the overall concept provides areas of open space and walking trails, but fails to provide any common greens or squares often viewed as a benefit in the residential areas. Plaza space in the neighborhood center would also be beneficial.

More specific issues regarding each area of the plan is provided below:
Area 1, which is broken into two different phases of development, is designated as "neighborhood center/mixed-use". This area is to include 520,000 sf of business and personal services uses and institutional and public uses. There is an additional 80,000 sf of retail and wholesale trade uses. The build-out of this area also includes 340 residential units to be located above office and/or retail. The plan does not note the total square footage to be built per phase.

In Area 1, the majority of parking is located to the side and/or rear of the buildings, as viewed from the major streets. There is also substantial on-street parking represented throughout the project. Staff has some concern regarding the total amount of off-street parking illustrated on the plan. Area 1 has a requirement of 3,000 parking spaces and 3,001 spaces are provided. However, this does not take into account a 15% reduction which is allowed utilizing the MU-S District which promotes shared parking nor does the total parking reflect a 35% reduction of the required off-street parking by providing on-street. Staff has been informed that the market demands that each potential business prefers to have their full amount of parking versus shared parking. If the total amount of parking cannot be reduced, then staff would prefer to see the amount of surface parking consolidated into structured parking that would enable the provision of more open space and/or more residential.

Area 2 of the master plan is designated as "mixed residential", but also includes 5,000 sf of business and personal services uses and 5,000 sf of institutional and public uses. The residential component in Area 2 consists of 372 units; these appear to be multifamily based on the site plan.

In Area 2, staff has some concern about the conceptual plan regarding the amount of parking and parking lot design as well as the orientation of the multifamily units as they may relate to the single family development in Area 3. Firstly, the total amount of parking required in Area 2 is 783 while 921 spaces are being provided; staff finds an excess of 138 parking spaces to be detrimental to the pedestrian friendly concept that is desired. In addition, the design of some of the parking lots in Area 2 come together to function as a street. Staff would prefer to see an actual street implemented, which accommodates the pedestrian in a safe and friendly manner, with the parking and buildings rearranged off of such street. This rearrangement of buildings could also permit a more compatible relationship between the narrow side of the multifamily buildings with the mass of the single family residential in Area 3. Should a rearrangement of buildings not be possible, then it is suggested that a different product (such as townhouses) be used to assist in that transition into the single family residential area.

Areas 3 and 4 are reserved for 60 single family residential units in each designated area yielding a total of 120 units. Based on volunteered conditions by the developer, these units shall average 3 units per acre in order to address compatibility concerns with surrounding existing residential.

In reference to the various areas and phases of development, Planning staff has some additional concerns regarding the build-out ratio of non-residential to residential. Plans have been submitted before with phasing that includes a mixture of non-residential and residential uses only for the site to eventually be built with only the non-residential. The inclusion of residential over the business and/or retail eases some of those concerns, but the possible "positive" consideration of this plan is greatly
impacted by the inclusion of the proposed residential development in Areas 2, 3 and 4. Moreover, as stated previously, the purpose of the MU-S District is to provide a balanced mixture of uses.

There are also several transportation issues that have been revealed through the Traffic Impact Study. The current proposed placement of the main entrance to the subject property will cause Cloverleaf Drive to fail at a Level of Service (LOS) F by 2012. Ideally, the main entrance would be lined up with Cloverleaf Drive but negotiations to acquire the land with the homeowner which occupies the property across from Cloverleaf Drive have not been successful, per this writing. The site plan preparer is investigating other options regarding the location of the main entrance drive.

Another transportation concern entails the placement of stoplights in this area. It is the desire of the city to have a stoplight at the intersection of Stratford Road and Somerset Drive in order to provide a light for the fire department. The main entrance to the subject property will also require a stoplight. With a light already at Kimwell, NCDOT as well as the State has concerns regarding the function of Stratford Road and its ability to efficiently move traffic with the close proximity of all these lights to each other. The most preferred scenario would involve the main entrance aligning with Cloverleaf Drive and would also require the realignment of Somerset Drive to intersect at Kimwell Drive.

While the full master plan brings many of these issues into focus, it must be remembered that this analysis is looking at the full plan as if it were to be constructed all at once. By looking ahead at a well-integrated composition of all these elements, it enables Staff (Planning, Transportation, Inspections, etc.) to evaluate and prepare for this development under a "worst case scenario" impact. The comprehensive understanding of all these issues helps to prepare for the future development of this parcel while evaluating impacts off site. In addition, the knowledge of the impacts both on and off site of the proposed development (upon full build-out) aids in the decision making of other potential projects in the surrounding areas by assessing those impacts with the knowledge of what is already expected.

In summary, the proposed master plan for the Hillcrest site has been submitted representing a full build-out at the request of Planning staff. While it is realized that such build-out will occur in phases over at least a ten year period, the plan has put into perspective many issues of concern regarding the plan for the site specific as well as for off-site impacts such as impacts upon the intersection of Hanes Mall Boulevard and Stratford Road. The fact that the plan has been submitted as a mixed-use concept with substantial residential is one of the only reasons staff would be supportive of business/retail development in this area of Stratford Road for both Legacy and the South Stratford Road Area Plan oppose such development. With that, the plan needs to be exceptional in its concept and should serve as a model for any other suburban mixed use developments.
With the proposed plan still needing much work regarding, mainly, transportation issues and due to the fact that several design decisions currently erode the cohesive pedestrian fabric demonstrative of successful mixed-use developments, staff would like additional time to work with the petitioner to see if such issues can be rectified. With the knowledge that solving the transportation concerns along Stratford Road could greatly impact the design and function of the site, staff feels uncomfortable making a recommendation until seeing the modified plan. Furthermore, staff would like for there to be an additional review by DOT, Inspections, and other entities that may have concerns based on the redesigned plan.

**FINDINGS**

1. MU-S District zoning classification which promotes a balanced mixture of residential, commercial, and in some cases light industrial uses.

2. The *Legacy* development guide promotes compact, pedestrian-oriented neighborhoods that contain a mixture of residential and commercial buildings, public spaces and amenities, and offer a variety of transportation options.

3. The language of the *South Stratford Road Development Guide* speaks of not adding any new additional commercial along Stratford in an effort to prevent the typical "strip commercial" effect.

4. The *Legacy* development guide identifies the area of Hanes Mall Boulevard and Stratford Road as a Metro Activity Center.

5. The subject property is located one mile from the intersection of Hanes Mall Boulevard and Stratford Road, about half a mile beyond the periphery of the MAC.

6. Some of the concerns regarding the fear of strip commercial along Stratford Road could be mitigated with an exceptional model for suburban mixed-use development.

7. The current plan has several issues needing resolution, especially transportation issues which could impact the site design.

8. Staff would like additional time to work with the petitioner to see if such issues can be rectified.

**STAFF RECOMMENDATION**

Zoning: **CONTINUANCE.**

Site Plan: Staff certifies that the site plan meets all code requirements, and recommends the following conditions:
Conditions will be recommended at the January 9, 2003, meeting.

**PUBLIC HEARING** - October 10, 2002

FOR:  None

AGAINST:  None

**WORK SESSION**

MOTION: Philip Doyle moved continuance of the zoning map amendment and site plan to December 12, 2002.
SECOND: Arnold King
VOTE:

FOR:  Avant, Bost, Clark, Doyle, Folan, King, Norwood
AGAINST:  None
EXCUSED:  None

**PUBLIC HEARING** - December 12, 2002

FOR:  None

AGAINST:  None

**WORK SESSION**

MOTION: Philip Doyle moved continuance of the zoning map amendment and site plan to January 9, 2003.
SECOND: Jerry Clark
VOTE:

FOR:  Avant, Bost, Clark, Doyle, Folan, Glenn, King, Powell
AGAINST:  None
EXCUSED:  None