DOCKET #: F1312
(continued from June 8 CCPB meeting)

PROPOSED ZONING:
RS20-S (Residential Building, Single Family)

EXISTING ZONING:
AG and RS20

PETITIONER:
Robert J. Lovell, III, and Elizabeth J. Lovell

SCALE: 1" represents 400'
STAFF: Simmons
GMA: 4B
ACRE(S): 37.45
MAP(S): 588902, 588906
August 23, 2000

Robert J. Lovill, III and
Elizabeth J. Lovill
6600 West Lebanon Street
Mount Airy, NC  27030

RE:   ZONING MAP AMENDMENT F-1312

Dear Mr. Lovill and Ms. Lovill:

The attached report of the Planning Board to the Forsyth County Board of
Commissioners is sent to you at the request of the Commissioners.

When the rezoning is scheduled for public hearing, you will be notified by Jane Cole,
Clerk to the County Commissioners, of the date on which the Commissioners will hear this
petition.

Sincerely,

A. Paul Norby, AICP
Director of Planning

Attachment

pc:   Jane Cole, County Manager's Office
      Allen Johnson, 660 W. Lebanon Street, Mount Airy, NC  27030
      Boyce Shore, 3650 Rolling Hill Drive, Tobaccoville, NC  27050
      Kerrie McDuffie, Manager, Town of Tobaccoville, P.O. Box 332, Tobaccoville, NC
      27050-0032
FORSYTH COUNTY
BOARD OF COMMISSIONERS

MEETING DATE: ____________________________ AGENDA ITEM NUMBER: _________________

SUBJECT:-

Zoning map amendment of Robert J. Lovill, III and Elizabeth J. Lovill

COUNTY MANAGER'S RECOMMENDATION OR COMMENTS:-

SUMMARY OF INFORMATION:-

Zoning map amendment of Robert J. Lovill, III and Elizabeth J. Lovill from AG and RS-20 to RS-20-S (Residential Building, Single Family): property is located on the southeast side of Tobaccoville Road across from Flip Newsome Road (Zoning Docket F-1312).

After consideration, the Planning Board recommended approval of the zoning map amendment.

ATTACHMENTS:-  X  YES  ___ NO

SIGNATURE: _______________________________  DATE:
BE IT ORDAINED by the Board of County Commissioners of the County of Forsyth as follows:

Section 1. The Zoning Ordinance of the Unified Development Ordinances of the County of Forsyth, North Carolina, and the Official Zoning Map of the County of Forsyth, North Carolina, are hereby amended by changing from AG and RS-20 to RS-20-S (Residential Building, Single Family) the zoning classification of the following described property:

BEGINNING at an iron pin in the southern margin of Tobaccoville Road at David Watts' northwestern corner and runs with Watts' line south 32° 15' 33" east 247.59 feet to a pin; north 60° 03' 40" east 187.17 feet to a pin in Hattie Watts' line; with Watts' line south 18° 18' 59" east 528 feet to a pin; south 22° 37' 28" east 280 feet to a pin; south 28° 23' 22" east 300 feet to a pin; south 31° 02' 06" east 601.10 feet to a pin at Owens' corner; with Owens' line north 85° 00' 0" west 781.97 feet to a pin; south 02° 15' 22" west 294.20 feet to a pin in Lane's line; with Lane's line north 83° 55' 06" west 127.54 feet to a pin; north 88° 06' 30" west 172.56 feet to a stone at Corn's line; with Corn's line north 86° 30' 12" west 294.93 feet to an oak in Vaughn's line; with Vaughn's line north 05° 12' 50" west 1,244.08 feet to a pin at Watts' southwest corner; north 57° 09' 54" east 330 feet to a pin at Atwood's southeast corner; with Atwood's line north 33° 21' 26" west 246.81 feet to a pin in the southern margin of Tobaccoville Road; with the road north 56° 48' 54" east 400.54 feet to the BEGINNING.

Containing 37.448 acres; Old Richmond Township, Forsyth County; Tax Lots 101, 68B, 69B, 70B, 68A, 69A and 70A, Block 4724.
Section 2. This Ordinance is adopted after approval of the site plan entitled Village Trace, and identified as Attachment A of the Special Use District Permit issued by the Forsyth County Board of Commissioners the _____ day of __________________, 19_____ to Robert J. Lovill, III and Elizabeth J. Lovill.

Section 3. The Board of Commissioners hereby directs the issuance of a Special Use District Permit pursuant to the Zoning Ordinance of the Unified Development Ordinances for a development to be known as Village Trace. Said Special Use District Permit and site plan with associated documents are attached hereto and incorporated herein.

Section 4. This Ordinance shall be effective from and after its adoption.
The Forsyth County Board of Commissioners issues a Special Use District Permit for the site shown on the site plan map included in this zoning petition of Robert J. Lovill, III and Elizabeth J. Lovill (Zoning Docket F-1312). The site shall be developed in accordance with the plan approved by the Board and bearing the inscription: "Attachment A, Special Use District Permit for RS-20-S (Residential Building, Single Family), approved by the Forsyth County Board of Commissioners the _____ day of ________________, 19 ____" and signed, provided the property is developed in accordance with requirements of the RS-20-S zoning district of the Zoning Ordinance of the Unified Development Ordinances of the County Code, the Erosion Control Ordinance, and other applicable laws, and the following conditions be met:

- **PRIOR TO THE ISSUANCE OF GRADING PERMITS**
  a. The developer shall contract with a qualified archaeologist to conduct a cursory archaeological investigation of documented archaeological site # FS 30131 and surrounding areas. The scope of contracted on-site field work shall consist of limited sampling of a scope that would not typically exceed one week in duration. Any archaeological resources recovered shall become the property of an educational institution for research purposes.
  b. The NCDOT shall approve the site distance for the new road (Village Trace Drive) on to Tobaccoville Road.

- **PRIOR TO THE SIGNING OF FINAL PLATS**
  a. Negative access easements shall be recorded for lot #2 contiguous to Tobaccoville Road.
  b. Square footage of each lot shall be shown on the final plats.
  c. If not currently existing, developer shall dedicate thirty (30) feet of right-of-way from the centerline of Tobaccoville Road.
  d. City-County Inspections Division fees for Special Use District Permits shall apply in addition to standard subdivision fees.
  e. Developer volunteers to donate a minimum of 175' from the eastern property
boundary (lots 4 - 15) to the Town of Tobaccoville.

- **PRIOR TO OCCUPANCY PERMITS**
  a. Public water and sewer shall be installed in accordance with the City-County Utilities Commission.
  b. Fire hydrants shall be installed in accordance with the Forsyth County Fire Department.
  c. Developer shall complete all roadway improvements as required and agreed to between the developer and the North Carolina Department of Transportation. Additional traffic from future development accessing through the project may require the installation of turn lanes at the project entrance on Tobaccoville Road in accordance with North Carolina Department of Transportation standards.
DOCKET # F-1312
STAFF: Glenn Simmons

Petitioner(s): Robert J. Lovill, III and Elizabeth J. Lovill
Ownership: Same

REQUEST

From: AG Agricultural District and RS-20 Residential Single Family District; minimum lot size 20,000 sf
To: RS-20-S Residential Single Family District; minimum lot size 20,000 sf
(Residential Building, Single Family)

Both general and special use district zoning were discussed with the applicant(s) who decided to pursue the zoning as requested.

Acreage: 37.45 acres

CONTINUANCE HISTORY

This zoning request was continued from the April 4, 2000 Planning Board meeting to the August 10, 2000 meeting at the request of the Planning Board in order for the Village of Tobaccoville to present preliminary draft recommendations regarding the village's development guidelines study. Planning staff reviewed and discussed the preliminary recommendations of the report with the staff of the NC Division of Community Assistance. The report summarized alternatives to conventional development and generally supported neo-traditional development concepts and the open space benefits of cluster (PRD) developments. The report at its current stage of development, however, does not specifically identify, or otherwise recommend, zoning classifications which would be appropriate for the current site.

Although the draft report is helpful in understanding the general wishes of the community, the report, at this stage of generality, does not alter Planning staff's support of the current RS-20-S zoning request. Staff notes that the proposed zoning request at a density of 1.15 units per acre is substantially less that what might otherwise be developed under RS-20 densities and that certain sensitive natural areas are shown to remain undeveloped under the Special Use District site plan.

At the August 10, 2000, Planning Board public hearing, the Manager of the Town of Tobaccoville was present. The applicant has revised the site plan, including volunteering to donate a substantial portion of the project site along its eastern edge to the Town (for open space and stream protection). The land donation and proposed density is in line with preliminary recommendations of the Town's draft land use plan, and the Town is in support of the project.

LOCATION

Street: Southeast side of Tobaccoville Road across from Flip Newsome Road.
Jurisdiction: The RS-20 portion of the property currently lies within the Village Limits of Tobaccoville; the AG portion lies within unincorporated areas of Forsyth County. The entire site lies within the Forsyth County Commissioner's zoning jurisdiction.

SITE PLAN

Proposed Use: Conventional single family residential subdivision.
Density: 43 lots located on 37.443 acres or 1.15 units per acre.
Parking: Required: Two spaces per dwelling unit.
Bufferyard Requirements: N/A.
Vehicular Use Landscaping Standards Requirements: N/A.

PROPERTY SITE/IMMEDIATE AREA

Existing Structures on Site: Single family frame residence facing Tobaccoville Road to remain.
Adjacent Uses:
  North - Well maintained single family homes zoned RS-20.
  Northeast - Single family homes zoned RS-20. Tobaccoville Road and Tobaccoville-Bethania Road intersect approximately one half mile to northeast.
  East - Vacant woodlands and cultivated fields zoned AG.
  Southeast - Vacant woodlands and cultivated land zoned AG.
  South - Vacant woodlands zoned AG and RS-20.
  Southwest - Single family home facing Tobaccoville Road zoned RS-20 and developing conventional subdivision zoned AG and RS-20.
  West - Developed RM-8 quadraplexes and single family homes facing Tobaccoville Road.
  Northwest - Vacant pastureland and woodland and rural residential homes on large lots.

GENERAL AREA

Character/Maintenance: Generally well maintained single family homes in a rural residential setting located on both sides of Tobaccoville Road. RM-8 zoned quadraplexes and a conventional one-half acre lot subdivision developing opposite Tobaccoville Road to the southeast.
Development Pace: Slow to moderate.

PHYSICAL FEATURES/ENVIRONMENTAL REVIEW

Impact on Existing Features: Conventional one-half acre to one acre lots will require moderate clearing of existing wooded acreage. Larger and deeper lots backing up to an intermittent stream located along the eastern edge of the site will help protect this steeper and more sensitive natural area.

Topography: A high point is located in the west central portion of the property. The property slopes downward gently to moderately to the southeast, south, and east. Moderately steep slopes define the eastern edge of the property.
Streams: A small intermittent stream runs across a portion of the easternmost edge of the
petitioner's tract.
Vegetation/habitat: Largely wooded.
Constraints: Moderate to steeply sloping terrain especially along the eastern edge of the property. Lot #4, according to the petitioner, will remain as one large lot due to shallow slope topographic constraints which limit septic tank suitability.
Floodplains: None.
Is the project in a protected water supply watershed? No.

TRANSPORTATION

Direct Access to Site: Tobaccoville Road.
Street Classification: Major thoroughfare.
Average Daily Traffic Count/Estimated Capacity at Level of Service D (Vehicles per Day):
   Tobaccoville Road - Ridge Road - Doral Drive 4,700/11,000
Trip Generation/Existing Zoning: AG/RS-20
   RS-20 - 2.23ac/20,000 = 4 lots x 9.55 trip rate = 38 trips
   AG - 35.22ac/40,000 = 38 lots x 9.55 trip rate = 363 trips
   total trips = 401 new trips
Trip Generation/Proposed Zoning: RS 20-S - 43 lots x 9.55 trip rate = 411 new trips
Planned Road Improvements: No.
Sight Distance: Adequate.
Interior Streets: Public street to NCDOT standards.
Traffic Impact Study recommended: No.
Connectivity of street network: Adequate.
Sidewalks: No.
Traffic Calming: No.
Transit: No.

HISTORY

Relevant Zoning Cases:

Note: The present AG and RS-20 zoning classifications became effective in January 1995 with the adoption of the Unified Development Ordinances (UDO) and the associated countywide zoning reclassification. Prior to adoption of the UDO, the former R-6 residential zoning classification permitted 20,000 square foot lots (comparable to the proposed RS-20 zoning).

1. F-1206; AG to RS-20; approved August 11, 1997; east side of Reid Road east of Tobaccoville Road (approximately one-half mile from current site); 5.68 acres; Planning Board and staff recommended approval.

2. F-1054; R-6 to R-3-S (Dwellings: Two Family); approved June 28, 1993; south side of Ridge Road, west of Tobaccoville Road; 0.92 acre; Planning Board and staff recommended approval.

CONFORMITY TO PLANS
GMP Area (Vision 2005): Area 3: Urban (RS-20 portion of the site); Area 4B: Long-range Growth Area (AG portion of the site).

Relevant Comprehensive Plan Recommendation(s): Staging of development with the provision of roads, sewers, and other services; clustered commercial service areas; provision of sewer service in an orderly fashion to serve development.

Area Plan/Development Guide: Village of Tobaccoville Strategic Plan for the Village; adopted by the Village in 1996. Planning staff did not assist in preparing the plan. The plan was not brought to the City-County Planning Board or the Board of County Commissioners for consideration or adoption.

Relevant Development Guide Recommendation(s): The Strategic Plan for the Village is a set of general policies for development. For residential development the plan policies are: (1) encourage developers to include sidewalks, street trees and parks in subdivisions; (2) require that subdivisions have green space prior to admission into the village.

Thoroughfare Plan: No proposed new roads in area.

Other (including plans of other agencies): The Village of Tobaccoville is currently working with staff from the regional office of the North Carolina Division of Community Assistance to produce a more detailed, geographically specific land use plan. The earliest expected completion date of this plan, which started in April of 2000, is October 2000, according to State and Town officials. Until then, the Tobaccoville Village Council has asked the Planning Board not to consider zoning requests either within the Tobaccoville Limits or within the Village's area of annexation consideration until such time as the land use plan is completed.

**GREENWAY/RECREATION/OPEN SPACE CONSIDERATIONS**

Greenway Plan: No.

**HISTORIC RESOURCES CONSIDERATIONS**

Known historic resources? Yes.
Forsyth County Architectural Inventory Number/Name: N/A.
Known Forsyth County Archaeological Site/Number: 31 FS 301.
Comments: Wake Forest University Archaeology Lab has been contacted about the site, and further testing of the site is recommended. Wake Forest believes that the site may have strong potential to yield significant information. Staff recommends the following condition: "The developer shall contract with a qualified archaeologist to conduct a limited archaeological investigation of the site. [Such investigation and on-site field work shall be completed within one week.] Any archaeological resources recovered shall become the property of an educational institution for research purposes."

**INCORPORATED AREA COMMENTS**

Incorporated Jurisdiction: Village of Tobaccoville.
Expressed Concern: The Village of Tobaccoville is currently working with staff from the regional office of the North Carolina Division of Community Assistance to produce a more detailed, geographically specific land use plan. The earliest expected completion
The date of this plan, which started in April of 2000, is October 2000, according to State and Town officials. Until then, The Tobaccoville Village Council has asked the Planning Board not to consider zoning requests either within the Tobaccoville Limits or within the Village's area of annexation consideration until such time as the land use plan is completed.

More recently, the Town has been working with the applicant regarding the site plan; the relatively low density and other provisions, inducing the dedication of land along the stream on its eastern boundary, has brought the project more in line with preliminary recommendations of the plan.

**ANALYSIS**

This zoning request consists of 37.5 acres of land located on the south side of Tobaccoville Road at the edge of the Tobaccoville Village limits. The property has direct access to Tobaccoville Road which is one of Tobaccoville's primary transportation corridors and is adjacent or proximate to several different types of residential development and zoning districts. The current property is located approximately one-half mile southeast of Tobaccoville's main crossroads near the Village Hall. Adjacent to the site and across Tobaccoville Road are properties developed on one-half acre lots and currently zoned RS-20. Four hundred feet south of the current site's entrance is property currently developed as multifamily quadrplexes in RM-8 zoning. Farther south is a conventional single family, residential subdivision on one half acre lots. Other areas east and south of the property are currently zoned AG and lie outside Tobaccoville's incorporated limits.

Prior to the UDO, adopted in 1995, land formerly zoned R-6 permitted the subdivision of 20,000 square foot or smaller lots, which is comparable in size to the smallest lot proposed under the current zoning request. In this context, the current special use district zoning petition, and associated site plan, is largely typical of the area's existing pattern of single family residential development.

Also with the adoption of the UDO, former R-6 properties located within Tobaccoville were reclassified to RS-20 in recognition of existing one-half acre residential subdivisions currently existing within the village. This reclassification took effect in anticipation of future development densities which signify economies of scale desirable for the customary and cost-effective delivery of fundamental urban services.

Undeveloped properties lying outside the Village Limits were similarly reclassified to AG where such properties either 1) participated in various farmland conservation programs or 2) lay proximate to other properties participating in farmland conservation programs. Under this assumption, staff anticipated that properties contiguous to primary thoroughfares would continue to petition to develop with development densities consistent with pre-existing patterns of conventional residential development.

Since the adoption of the UDO, the Village has taken a more active role in defining its image as rural community and asserting its desire to conserve open space and promote larger lot
subdivision development. First, with the adoption of the Tobaccoville Strategic Plan in 1996 (not considered by the Planning Board or Board of Commissioners); and more recently with the initiation of the Village=s land use plan, Tobaccoville has proclaimed its conservation intentions. Most recently, the Village asked the City-County Planning Board to delay action on all zoning requests within the Village=s area of annexation consideration, until the land use plan, currently under development with the assistance of the North Carolina Division of Community Assistance, is completed.

While staff endeavors to accommodate Tobaccoville=s wishes, staff must also consider additional factors in our deliberation and recommendations on matters pertinent to various zoning requests. In this context, the current site is only one of many undeveloped properties which lie outside of Tobaccoville=s incorporated limits and may wish a similar zoning classification. Specifically, staff must consider the existing character of development adjacent to, or near the current property; the history of relevant zoning requests; and the actual status of relevant area plans and development guidelines. Also staff recognizes that the AG zoning district as presently constituted does not prevent suburban sprawl or assume the retention of rural character. In this context, the largest portion of the property lies outside the Tobaccoville Village limits and is, therefore, less directly linked to actions or resolutions of Tobaccoville=s governing board. This is especially true, unless and until the City- County Planning Board and the Forsyth County Board of Commissioners review and potentially endorse land use plans and/or development guidelines for unincorporated areas of Forsyth County.

The Town and applicant have worked cooperatively to consider possible revision to the project=s site plan to possibly bring it into greater compliance with the preliminary recommendations of the land use plan study underway. The applicant has revised the plan in response to these discussions, including retention of low densities and donation of property along the stream at the eastern edge of the property for resource protection and open space purposes. With these changes, the Town has expressed its support of the project.

Given the various factors cited above staff considers the current request for RS-20-S zoning to be consistent with principles of fairness with respect to the rights of individual property owners to be afforded a development potential of their property consistent with the current character of the area and with the historical patterns of area development. Staff also recognizes the efforts of both the Town and the applicant in seeking a design compromise acceptable to both parties.

In addition to the above zoning considerations, the proposed site plan (subdivision plan) works substantially to accommodate natural terrain features so as to minimize disruption to the integrity of sensitive natural areas; staff therefore recommends approval of the proposed RS-20-S zoning classification.

**FINDINGS**

1. The property consists of 37 acres and is located on the south side of Tobaccoville Road which is one of the communities principal transportation corridors.

2. A portion of the property lies within the Village of Tobaccoville, although the majority of the property is contiguous to incorporated areas of Tobaccoville with good access to Tobaccoville Road.
3. The proposed pattern and overall density of development (1.15 units per acre) is consistent with the character and pattern of development in the area.

4. Although staff wishes to honor the Village of Tobaccoville’s wishes to postpone all zoning decisions within the Village’s area of annexation consideration until the land use plan currently under development is completed, staff also believes that the property interests of the petitioner must be recognized in context with the character of other development proximate to the site, the history of comparable zoning requests, and the incomplete status of the current land use study. With revisions to the site plan, including the donation of a portion of the site to the Town for open space and stream protection, the Town now supports the project.

5. Staff considers the associated subdivision/site plan showing overall development densities of 1.15 units per acre to be generally supportive of broader efforts to protect more sensitive terrain features.

**STAFF RECOMMENDATION**

Zoning: **APPROVAL.**

Site Plan: Staff certifies that the site plan meets all code requirements, and recommends the following conditions:

- **PRIOR TO THE ISSUANCE OF GRADING PERMITS**
  a. The developer shall contract with a qualified archaeologist to conduct a cursory archaeological investigation of documented archaeological site # FS 30131 and surrounding areas. The scope of contracted on-site field work shall consist of limited sampling of a scope that would not typically exceed one week in duration. Any archaeological resources recovered shall become the property of an educational institution for research purposes.
  b. The NCDOT shall approve the site distance for the new road (Village Trace Drive) on to Tobaccoville Road.

- **PRIOR TO THE SIGNING OF FINAL PLATS**
  a. Negative access easements shall be recorded for lot #2 contiguous to Tobaccoville Road.
  b. Square footage of each lot shall be shown on the final plats.
  c. If not currently existing, developer shall dedicate thirty (30) feet of right-of-way from the centerline of Tobaccoville Road.
  d. City-County Inspections Division fees for Special Use District Permits shall apply in addition to standard subdivision fees.
  e. Developer volunteers to donate a minimum of 175' from the eastern property
boundary (lots 4 - 15) to the Town of Tobaccoville.

- **PRIOR TO OCCUPANCY PERMITS**
  a. Public water and sewer shall be installed in accordance with the City-County Utilities Commission.
  b. Fire hydrants shall be installed in accordance with the Forsyth County Fire Department.
  c. Developer shall complete all roadway improvements as required and agreed to between the developer and the North Carolina Department of Transportation. Additional traffic from future development accessing through the project may require the installation of turn lanes at the project entrance on Tobaccoville Road in accordance with North Carolina Department of Transportation standards.

- **OTHER REQUIREMENTS**
  a. Developer may have one entrance sign at the main project entrance off Tobaccoville Road. Said signs shall be of the monument type with a maximum height of five (5) feet and a maximum copy area of eighteen (18) square feet.

[For information purposes only: The petitioner's site is located in the Future Growth Area of the Legacy growth management plan. The policies in the Legacy plan for this growth management area are similar to those for the long-range growth area in Vision 2005 stated above.]

**PUBLIC HEARING - May 11, 2000**

Glenn Simmons presented the staff report.

FOR:

Allen Johnson, 737 Cross Creek Drive, Mount Airy, NC  27030
   We're Town & Country Builders and would be building this proposal.
   This is a good place for this type of home.  We need beginner level housing and request your approval of this.

AGAINST:

Boyce Shore, Mayor of Tobaccoville, 3650 Rolling Hill Drive, Tobaccoville, NC  27050
   I ask you to give the citizens of Forsyth County and Tobaccoville a chance to have input in the issues which will impact their community.
   Planning Board's mission statement reads in part, A Creative community planning of the built environment and enhancement of the natural environment@.  Please allow our residents to do this for themselves and their children.
   We do not have an argument against the RS-20-S zoning, but are asking for input into zoning for our own community.
   This would give the developer the freedom to remove all the trees and place new ones back on the site - that's usually preferred because the new ones are cheaper than working around the existing ones.
   Showed pictures of housing in the area.
If we had known that our plan would carry more weight with the approval of the Planning Board and Commissioners, we would have done that when we adopted it. We are requesting you delay action on this request until we can get our comprehensive plan completed.

WORK SESSION

During discussion by the Planning Board, the following points were made:

1. Norman Williams stated that he thinks it is wrong to ask the Planning Board to be the decision makers regarding asking a petitioner to wait until Tobaccoville's plan is finished.

2. Mr. Johnson indicated they will remove as few trees as possible because of the cost of burying them.

MOTION: Terry Powell moved continuance of the zoning map amendment to August 10, 2000.
SECOND: James Rousseau
VOTE:  
FOR: King, Powell, Rousseau, Snelgrove, Williams
AGAINST: None
EXCUSED: None

PUBLIC HEARING - AUGUST 10, 2000
FOR: None
AGAINST: None

WORK SESSION

MOTION: Steve Johnson moved approval of the zoning map amendment.
SECOND: Avant
VOTE:  
FOR: Avant, Powell, King, Rousseau, Williams, Bost, Johnson, Schroeder, Snelgrove
AGAINST: None
EXCUSED: None
According to information furnished by the Office of the Tax Assessor, the subject property was in the name of Robert J. Lovill, III and Elizabeth J. Lovill as of February 29, 2000.

A. Paul Norby, AICP
Director of Planning